

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES
JANUARY 28, 2013**

Board Members Present

Richard Callow, Chairman
Alderman Craig Schmid
Nate Johnson
Anthony Robinson
David Richardson

Cultural Resources Office Staff Present

Betsy H. Bradley, Director
Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator
Bob Bettis, Preservation Planner
Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner
Adona Buford, Administrative Assistant

The Chairman called the roll. The Board approved the current agenda.

PRELIMINARY REVIEWS

A. 2012.2094 1824 KENNETT PL. LAFAYETTE SQUARE HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Scott and Susan Jones

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to erect a decorative metal fence in the front of building.

PROCEEDINGS: Bob Bettis, Preservation Planner, representing the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the criteria for new fences in City Ordinances #69112 . He reported that he had not heard from the Ward 6 Alderwoman, and that the Lafayette Square Restoration Committee was in support of a variance for the project. No other testimony was presented.

FINDINGS OF FACTS: The Preservation Board found that:

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

JANUARY 28, 2013

Page 2 of 6

- the building is located in the Lafayette Square Local Historic District;
- the proposed fence will be constructed out of stock metal parts in the attempt to replicate the design of the historic fence at this property;
- in an attempt to replicate the design of the historic fence, the original gate will be restored; and
- that the short run of the fence between the gate and the end post would also deviate from the historic condition and would be replaced with a simple configuration of metal bars

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval as the proposed new fence does comply with the Lafayette Square Local Historic Standards. The motion was made by Board member Nate Johnson and seconded by Mr. Robinson. The motion passed unanimously.

APPEALS OF DENIALS

B. 2012.1781 1218 S. JEFFERSON AVENUE LAFAYETTE SQ. HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Dubman Realty, LLC/Brook Dubman

Applicant: Piros Signs, Inc./Joe Phillips

COMMERCIAL PLAN:

Appeals of the Director's denials of two building permit applications to 1) install one illuminated ground sign, and 2) erect wall signs and awnings with signage. Deferred from the November 2012 meeting.

PROCEEDINGS:

Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner, representing the Cultural Resources Office submitted a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the property, certified copies of Ordinance #64689 and #69112 and the agenda into the record. She recommended that the Preservation Board overturn the denial of the murals and awnings if the lettering is altered and uphold the denial of the monument sign, which does not comply with the Lafayette Square Historic District Standards.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

JANUARY 28, 2013

Page 3 of 6

No one was in attendance for the owner or applicant. Ms. Gagen explained that she understood that personal matters kept the applicant from attending the meeting.

Mary Dahms, Katie Anderson and Tim Delahanty testified in opposition to the awning lettering.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 1218 S. Jefferson, is located in the Lafayette Square Local Historic District; and
- that the proposed sign did not meet the Lafayette Square Historic District standards in terms of lighting, size and placement.
- 1218 S. Jefferson, is located in the Lafayette Square Local Historic District;
- the awnings and murals were installed without a permit;
- that the murals are not counter to the intent of the historic district standards; and
- that the lettering on the awnings exceeds 6 inches, the requirement in the standards, and is not consistent from awning to awning.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the Director's denial of the application for the awnings, while overturning the denial of the application for the murals. There were two separate motions. For the awnings, Alderman Schmid made the motion, which Mr. Robinson seconded. The motion passed unanimously. For the windows, Alderman Schmid made the motion which was seconded by Mr. Johnson. The motion passed unanimously. As only a portion of the application was overturned, the permit remains denied.

C. 2012.1934 2746 UTAH STREET PRESERVATION REVIEW/NAT'L REGISTER DISTRICT

Owner: Kham Phao and Wandee Charenunsap

Applicant: Hughes Wrecking

DEMOLITION PLAN:

Appeal of the Director's denial of a demolition permit application to demolish a two-story 2 family brick dwelling.

PROCEEDINGS:

Cultural Resources Office Director Betsy H. Bradley submitted City Ordinances #64689, as amended by Ordinance #64925, and #64832 and reviewed the criteria for demolition of a property located in a Preservation Review District and the Gravois Jefferson Streetcar Suburb National Register District. She testified that Alderman Kenneth Ortmann wrote a letter in opposition to demolition of the residence, and that the Benton Park West Neighborhood submitted a letter also opposing the demolition.

Scott Brink and Pone Siharaj testified in favor of the Appeal, explaining the current physical state of the building and why demolition is proposed. The Appellant submitted documents that included his Power of Attorney obtained from the property owners, who are his parents-in-law, St. Louis City Fire Department reports on the two fires that occurred in the building, and estimates for work on the building.

The following statements were made at the January 28, 2013 meeting:

- 2746 Utah, a contributing building in a National Register Historic District and therefore a Merit building, is located in a Preservation Review District;
- The building does not have any individual architectural distinction as it represents a common residential building type;
- A fire has damaged the interior, charred some of the exterior brick, likely made some of the building's mortar friable, and since the fire, additional damage has occurred that includes a void caused by the loss of a window and surrounding brick and a smaller area of loss of the brick wall;
- The surrounding buildings on the block face indicate that there is below-grade subsidence and the fact that a quarry was located on the site of the buildings appears to be the cause of the destabilizing of some of the foundations on the block;
- Due to the below-grade conditions, the immediate setting and reuse of the potential for this building do not strongly support rehabilitation;

- The economic feasibility of the extensive required repairs may diminish the reuse potential of the building and would include stabilizing the foundation.
- The loss of the building would have some effect on urban design;
- The owner had a fire insurance policy that covered the current market value of the property that was determined to be \$40,000, not its replacement cost, and the contents of the house;
- The cost of rehabilitation would be considerably more than the current value of the property, even with the use of rehabilitation tax credits;
- The property has not been placed on the market for sale to determine if a developer would acquire it and rehabilitate the building;
- The applicant had not consulted directly with the Benton Park West Neighborhood Association and provided it with the information that it presented to the Board; and
- The fact that no new construction is proposed at this time and other criteria were considered, as applicable, to this proposed demolition.

The Board decided to table the appeal for 90 (ninety) days and asked the applicant to both list the property for sale and consult with the Alderman and Benton Park West Neighborhood Association further. Both the applicant and the Cultural Resources Office waived the time requirements for decisions on appeals required in Ordinance #64689. Board Member Anthony Robinson made the motion to table the appeal, which was seconded by David Richardson. The motion passed with four Board Members voting for the motion.

SPECIAL AGENDA ITEMS

Adoption of Solar Panel Installation Policy and Standards

- D. Betsy Bradley presented the proposed Solar Panel Installation Policy, describing how it is authorized in the Preservation Board powers and duties in Section Seven of St. Louis city Ordinance #64689, and how it would be implemented. She also reported on comments she had

received from resident organizations in two local historic districts.

During the discussion, Board Member David Richardson indicated that a provision for using the "Visual Compatibility Required" Policy for guidance when the "No Visibility Required" policy cannot be met may indicate that there is a choice that can be made, when in fact the standards adopted by ordinance indicate which approach must be followed. Staff was asked to review the statement for revision or deletion.

The Chair asked the Cultural Resources Office director to bring back the policy in February for consideration.

Director's Report, Mid-Century Modern Survey

Nominations to the National Register of Historic Places

E. Biddle Street Market, 1211-19 North Tucker Boulevard

ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to direct staff to prepare a report for the Missouri State Historic Preservation Office that the Biddle Street Market is eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places under Criterion A in the area of Commerce. The motion was made by Board member David Richardson and seconded by Alderman Schmid. The motion passed unanimously.

F. Walnut Park School, 5314 Riverview Blvd./5814 Thekla Avenue

ACTION: The Preservation Board did not address this nomination and the City will not be submitting comments on it to the Missouri State Historic Preservation Office.