

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES
MAY 23, 2011**

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT

Richard Callow, Chairman

Mary Johnson, Vice Chairwoman

Mike Killeen

David Richardson

Alderman Antonio French, (designated by Chairman of the Committee of Public Safety of the Board of Aldermen, as authorized by Ordinance 64689, Part II, Sect. 5.A)

CULTURAL RESOURCES STAFF PRESENT

Betsy H. Bradley, Director

Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator

Bob Bettis, Preservation Planner

Adona Buford, Administrative Assistant

A motion to approve the minutes of the April 25, 2011 meeting was made by Board Member David Richardson and seconded by Alderman French. The motion passed.

PRELIMINARY REVIEWS

A. 2011.0879 6199 WATERMAN SKINKER-DeBALIVIERE HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Grace Methodist Episcopal Church

Applicant: HKW Architects – Kevin Kerwin

COMMERCIAL PLAN: Preliminary Review to demolish a 2-story brick dwelling at 6177 Waterman and alterations to the Waterman façade of church.

PROCEEDINGS: Betsy Bradley presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area which included an aerial photo of the church. She recommended that the Preservation Board approve the preliminary application for alterations to the main church building and approve the

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

MAY 23, 2011

Page 2 of 7

demolition of the contributing residential building as part of the larger project. She stated that the proposed Waterman entrance seems to be carefully designed to maintain the overall character of the stone wall in which it will be placed and that the loss of the residential building at the end of the row of such buildings on Waterman does not have an especially negative effect on the block front.

Ms. Bradley also stated she had received an e-mail from the Chair of the Skinker-DeBaliviere Historic District Committee indicating that most of the Committee members are in favor of the project, including the demolition of 6177 Waterman, and that Alderwoman Lyda Krewson had also expressed support for the project.

Kevin Kerwin and Kristin Moomey of HKW Architects and Theodore Dearing, representing Grace Methodist Episcopal Church, testified in favor of the project.

FINDINGS OF FACT:

The Board Found that:

the Grace Methodist Episcopal Church is a High Merit building and that the changes proposed would not alter its significant architectural character;

the proposed demolition of 6177 Waterman would remove a contributing building from the historic district;

the proposed alterations to the church property are part of a project to increase accessibility to the church and;

the final design of the proposed entry door alterations will avoid a security grill appearance and be appropriate for the church.

ACTION:

Board Member Richardson made a motion to approve the preliminary proposal for the changes to the church building subject to review of final designs for the vestibule doors and final plans by the Cultural Resources Office staff. Mr. Killeen seconded the motion. The motion carried.

Mr. Richardson then moved to deny the demolition of 6177 Waterman. Vice Chairman Mary Johnson seconded the motion. Mr. Killeen, Alderman French and Chairman

Richard Callow opposed the motion; the motion failed 3 to 2.

Mr. Richardson then moved to grant preliminary approval for the demolition of 6177 Waterman subject to review of the parking, landscaping and final project design by the Cultural Resources Office staff. Alderman French seconded the motion. Vice Chairman Mary Johnson opposed the motion. The motion carried 3 to 1.

B. 2011.0356 2221 LYNCH STREET BENTON PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Tara Zaffe & Peter Rocque

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to install glass block in basement windows on the public and semi-public facades.

PROCEEDINGS: Bob Bettis presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding areas. He recommended that the Preservation Board deny the preliminary application as the glass block windows do not meet the Benton Park Historic District Standards. He stated that the owners have tried several different solutions to rectify the water infiltration problem. The basement and windows have been sealed.

Mr. Bettis submitted into the record a letter from the Benton Park Neighborhood Association opposing the glass block windows.

Ms. Tara Zaffe and Mr. Peter Rocque, property owners were in attendance but were not asked to testify.

FINDINGS OF FACT: The Board found that:
the proposed glass block does not comply with the Benton Park Historic District Standards;

the building in question was constructed in 2008 and is not a contributing building to the historic district and;

a hardship exists due to water infiltration through the existing windows.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

MAY 23, 2011

Page 4 of 7

ACTION: Board Member Richardson made a motion to grant a variance to allow the glass-block windows to be installed on the front façade based on the water hardship faced by the owners. Ms. Johnson seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

NEW APPLICATIONS

C.	2011.0662	2612-30 CHOUTEAU	PRESERVATION REVIEW DISTRICT
D.	2011.0663	2614-16 CHOUTEAU	PRESERVATION REVIEW DISTRICT
E.	2011.0664	2618-22 CHOUTEAU	PRESERVATION REVIEW DISTRICT
F.	2011.0665	2626-30 CHOUTEAU	PRESERVATION REVIEW DISTRICT

Owner: Crown 40 Inc.

Applicant: Chucks' Brick & Demo

DEMOLITION PLAN: New applications to demolish four (4) commercial/ industrial brick buildings, previously denied by the Preservation Board on April 26, 2010.

PREVIOUS ACTION: The Preservation Board upheld the Cultural Resources Office staff's denial of permits to demolish four (4) commercial/industrial brick buildings as there was no redevelopment plan that addressed the property and the Buildings were considered Merit structures under the definition of Ordinance #64689.

PROCEEDINGS: Jan Cameron presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding areas. She recommended that the Preservation Board deny the demolition applications as the properties do not meet the Criteria for Demolition of Ordinance #64689. She stated that the buildings were sound and that there was little likelihood of the buildings being nominated to the National Register of Historic Places.

Submitted into the record were letters from Mary Rosenthal, the President of the Gate District East Association and Dr. Byron Duvall of Mid City Dental Services, an adjacent property owner, in support of the demolitions.

Charles Mace of Chuck's Brick and Demo, testified in support of the demolitions. He submitted photos into the record of the condition of the exterior walls.

Steve Zeiger & Mary Sue Rosenthal of the Gate District Association testified in support of the demolitions.

Ward 6 Alderwoman Kacie Starr-Triplett testified in support of the demolitions.

FINDINGS OF FACT:

The Board found that:

the buildings do not qualify for individual listing in the National Register of Historic Places, nor is there sufficient existing context for a historic district in the area;

without the use of historic tax credits, rehabilitation of the properties is not viable;

the condition of the buildings have deteriorated in the last year; and

their demolition would have little affect upon the Chouteau streetscape, which is already quite varied.

ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to approve the demolition of all four buildings on the condition that the site be fenced and landscaped; and that an appropriate plan for the fence and landscaping be submitted to the Cultural Resources Office staff for approval. The motion was made by Vice Chairman Mary Johnson and seconded by Mr. Richardson. The motion passed unanimously

APPEALS OF STAFF DENIALS

G. 2909 S. 18TH STREET BENTON PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Dennis Thorpe

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of a staff denial of a building permit application to construct a driveway at the public facade.

PROCEEDINGS: Jan Cameron presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding areas. She recommended that the Preservation Board uphold the staff's denial as the proposed parking pad and retaining wall do not comply with the Benton Park Historic District

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

MAY 23, 2011

Page 6 of 7

Standards. She submitted into the record Ordinances #64689 and #67175.

She stated that the proposed parking pad is in violation of the intent of the Benton Park Historic District ordinance and its installation would have an adverse effect on the character of the historic district, and that the Standards do not allow curb cuts or paving stones in the tree lawns.

Board Member Mike Killeen left the meeting. Mr. Thorpe did not want a continuance and instead waived his right to a quorum and proceeded with the hearing. Mr. Thorpe stated that his neighbors to the north currently have a curb cut and that the reason he wanted the parking pad was to deter abandoned vehicles from being left in front of his property.

FINDINGS OF FACT:

The Board found that:

the curb cut and stone pavers do not comply with the Benton Park Historic District Standards.

ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the staff's denial of an application for a building permit for a curb cut and retaining wall on the public façade, as it violates the intent of the Benton Park Local Historic District ordinance. The motion was made by Board Member David Richardson. Ms. Johnson seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

H. 2011.0634 2322 ALBION STREET LAFAYETTE SQUARE HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Christina Levison

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

Appeal of a staff denial of a building permit application to repair a sandstone stringcourse on the front façade, being installed without a permit.

PROCEEDINGS:

Bob Bettis presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding areas. He recommended that the Preservation Board uphold the staff's denial as the proposed stone replacement does not meet the Lafayette Square Historic District Standards. He submitted into the record Ordinances #64689 and #63327.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

MAY 23, 2011

Page 7 of 7

Ms. Christina Levison the property owner, and Mark Levison, property owners, testified on behalf of the completed work. They submitted photos of similar squared-off sandstone stringcourse and sills in the surrounding neighborhood.

Ward 6 Alderwoman Kacie Starr-Triplett testified in support of the project.

FINDINGS OF FACT:

The Board found that:
the completed and proposed work is not in compliance with the Lafayette Square Historic District Standards;

the owner sought a second bid for the work in order to make the changes in compliance with the Lafayette Square Historic District Guidelines and that bid was nearly \$3,000 more than the current work being completed;

the proposed shape of the stone string course does not replicate the appearance of the original;

the proposed material meets the district standards and;

the Alderwoman is in support of the owner's project.

ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the staff's denial and grant approval of the application for a building permit, with the stipulation that the work is modified to resemble the historic appearance of the stringcourse. The motion was made by Board Member Mary Johnson and seconded by Mr. Richardson. The motion passed unanimously.