

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES
JANUARY 23, 2012**

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT

Richard Callow, Chairman
Mary Johnson, Vice Chairwoman
Melanie Fathman
Michael Killeen
David Richardson
Anthony Robinson
Alderman Antonio French

CULTURAL RESOURCES STAFF PRESENT

Betsy H. Bradley, Director
Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator
Bob Bettis, Preservation Planner
Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner
Adona Buford, Administrative Assistant

Board Member David Richardson moved to approve the December 19, 2011 minutes. Ms. Fathman seconded the motion. The minutes were approved.

Board Member David Richardson moved to approve the current agenda. Ms. Fathman seconded the motion. The agenda was approved.

PRELIMINARY REVIEWS

A. 2012.0029 3600 S. JEFFERSON AVE. PRESERVATION REVIEW DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Jeff Enderle

DEMOLITION PLAN: Preliminary review to demolish a 2.5 story brick commercial/residential building.

PROCEEDINGS: Betsy Bradley presented a PowerPoint presentation about the property and addressed the criteria to be considered for demolition of structures listed in the National Register of Historic Places and in a Preservation Review District. She entered into the record a letter from Mr. Jeff Enderle

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

JANUARY 23, 2012

Page 2 of 7

supporting his request for demolition. Ms. Bradley recommended that the Preservation Board deny the application for demolition of the property. The property is a Merit building in the Benton Park National Register Historic District and for various reasons, the current owner has not corrected the work that was done and has not indicated that he made attempts to stabilize the building.

Jonathan Schultz, Vice President and Corporate Counsel, and Anthony Shimkus, Director of Facilities, of Concordia Publishing House testified about Concordia's plan to acquire the property from Mr. Enderle, on the condition that a demolition permit would be approved.

Ryan Reed, representing the Landmarks Association of St. Louis, spoke in opposition to the demolition.

James McKee, representing the Marine Villa Neighborhood Association, spoke in opposition to the demolition.

Alderman Craig Schmid addressed the issues of this property and expressed a preference that the building remain standing.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Board found that:

- the building at 3600 S. Jefferson is a contributing property in the Benton Park Historic District listed in the National Register of Historic Places in 1985 and therefore a Merit property;
- that the property is located in a Preservation Review District;
- that the property is not in an area included in a redevelopment plan approved by ordinance;
- that the property built circa 1885 consists of two three-story portions, a commercial block at the corner with residential spaces above a commercial one, and three levels of flats in the southern portion,
- that upon inspection from the street, the property appears to be in sound condition, in terms of the definition in Ordinance 64689;

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

JANUARY 23, 2012

Page 3 of 7

- that the neighborhood conditions offer no deterrent to rehabilitation of the property;
- that the two building types, a commercial block and flats, have often been rehabilitated successfully throughout the City;
- that the economic feasibility of rehabilitation has been complicated by the damage done to the building during and since the termination in 2006 of a renovation project and that now a rehabilitation will cost more than a typical project;
- that it is not infeasible to rehabilitate the building as there is enough potential in both the building and the neighborhood;
- that the applicant presented information that indicated that the cost of rehabilitation added to the list price did not result in a sale of the building since 2006;
- that the loss of the property would adversely affect the integrity of the intersection of S. Jefferson and Miami by removing the corner property and one in an intact grouping of contributing buildings in the historic district;
- that since no new construction would occur, the loss of the building would not be compensated for by a new building in the streetscape that would maintain the setback, scale, and architectural character of the block front; and
- that Concordia Publishing House is not seeking to expand its operation or parking onto this neighboring parcel.

ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to concur with the Cultural Resources Office Director's recommendation that preliminary approval of demolition of the property be denied as the building could be stabilized and eventually rehabilitated. The motion was made by Board Member Michael Killeen and seconded by Alderman French. The motion passed with all votes in favor.

B. 2012.0052 6322 S. GRAND BLVD.

Withdrawn by applicant.

APPEALS OF DENIALS

C. 2012.0061 3337 MISSOURI AVENUE BENTON PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Askins Development Group LLC/Orlando Askins

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of a denial of a building permit to retain five (5) vinyl windows installed in the front façade without a permit.

PROCEEDINGS: Bob Bettis presented a PowerPoint presentation and presented an overview of the building and the work in question.

He submitted into the record Enabling Ordinance #64689 and Benton Park Ordinance #67175. Mr. Bettis recommended that the Preservation Board uphold the denial for a building permit as the completed work is not in compliance with the Benton Park Local Historic District Standards. The installed windows do not replicate the proportion, profiles or dimensions of historic windows.

Mr. Orlando Askins, property owner, testified on his own behalf. He submitted photos showing fire damage to the house. He acknowledged that the approved plans referred only to the side wall windows. He asked that he be able to retain the windows that were installed without a permit.

FINDINGS OF FACTS: The Board found that;

- the completed work is not in compliance with the Benton Park Historic District Standards that require replacement windows in front façades be of wood or aluminum and match the dimensions and details of historic wood windows;
- the owner applied for a permit for total rehabilitation of the house following a fire;
- the approved plans did not include front façade window replacement;

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

JANUARY 23, 2012

Page 5 of 7

- following a violation notice, the owner applied for a separate permit for the five front façade windows that was denied by the Cultural Resources Office as the windows did not comply with the Benton Park Historic District Standards;
- the cost to replace the windows would be around \$5,000;
- the owner did not provide evidence of economic hardship that would result from replacement of the windows; and
- there was no comment from the ward alderman or the Benton Park Neighborhood Association regarding the project.

ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the denial of a building permit to retain five (5) vinyl windows installed in the front façade without a permit, as the windows do not meet the Benton Park Historic District Standards. The motion was made by Board member Anthony Robinson and seconded by Alderman French. Vice Chairwoman Mary Johnson opposed the motion. The motion passed 5 to 1.

D. 2011.2080 4224 FLAD AVENUE SHAW HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Roosevelt Chambers

RESIDENTIAL PLANS:

Appeal of a denial of a building permit to retain exterior alterations at the parapet and front porch columns completed without a permit.

PROCEEDINGS:

Bob Bettis presented a PowerPoint presentation and an overview of the building and the work in question.

He submitted into the record Enabling Ordinance #64689 and Shaw Historic District Ordinance #59400. Mr. Bettis recommended that the Preservation Board uphold the denial of a building permit as the completed and proposed work is not in compliance with the Shaw Local Historic District Standards. Although the parapet and columns were not in their original condition, the installed artificial stone is not compatible with the architecture of this house

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

JANUARY 23, 2012

Page 6 of 7

or those in the neighborhood, which have brick parapets or false mansards. The porch columns would have been wood or brick, rather than the proposed imitative stone.

Mr. Roosevelt Chambers, property owner, testified on his own behalf. He submitted photos of neighboring homes with similar parapets and porch columns. He stated he wasn't aware that a permit was required for masonry work. Mr. Chambers asked that the Board grant a variance.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Board found that:

- the owner began exterior stonework at the parapet and porch without a permit;
- following a violation notice, the owner applied for a permit to retain the completed work;
- the permit was denied by the Cultural Resources Office because the work did not comply with the Shaw Historic District Standards;
- the owner used non-compliant alterations within the Shaw neighborhood as the models for his projects;
- the alterations made to the cornice and porch are not in compliance with the Shaw Historic District Standards, which require that new materials be compatible with the predominant historic material of the building;
- the owner did not provide any evidence of economic hardship that would be incurred by the owner if the violation was corrected to meet the neighborhood standards; and
- there was no comment from the ward alderman or the Shaw Neighborhood Association regarding the project.

ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the denial of a building permit as the proposed and completed work does not comply with the Shaw Historic District Standards. The motion was made by Board Member David Richardson and seconded by Alderman French. Vice-Chairwoman Mary Johnson opposed the motion. The motion passed 5 to 1.

SPECIAL AGENDA ITEMS

Nominations to the National Register of Historic Places

F. 3942-62 Laclede Avenue – Scudder Motor Truck Company Building

ACTION: It was decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the Missouri State Historic Preservation Office that the Scudder Motor Truck Company Building meets the requirements of National Register Criterion A for Commerce. Board Member Melanie Fathman made the motion that was seconded by Ms. Johnson. The motion passed unanimously.

G. Yeatman Square Historic District
(Parts of Glasgow, Leffingwell, Madison, Magazine and N. Market Streets.)

ACTION: It was decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the Missouri State Historic Preservation Office that the Yeatman Square Historic District meets the requirements of National Register Criterion C for Community Planning and Development. Board Member Melanie Fathman made the motion that was seconded by Ms. Johnson. The motion passed unanimously.

Vice-Chairwoman Mary Johnson moved to adjourn the meeting. Hearing no objection, the meeting was adjourned.