

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES
JANUARY 25TH, 2010**

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT

Richard Callow-Chairman
David Richardson
John Burse
Ald. Phyllis Young
Anthony Robinson
Dave Visintainer
Mike Killeen
Melanie Fathman

CULTURAL RESOURCES STAFF PRESENT

Kate Shea, Director
Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator
Bob Bettis, Preservation Planner
Adona Buford, Administrative Assistant

Minutes from December 22, 2009 were approved.

PRELIMINARY REVIEWS

1. 2009.1324 4025 FLAD AVE. SHAW HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Shirley Klingbeil

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary Review to obtain a variance to retain non-compliant aluminum windows on the front façade of a house in the Shaw Historic District.

PREVIOUS ACTION: At the December 22, 2009 Preservation Board meeting, the owner stated that she had already paid for the windows and could not afford to take the monetary loss and install the proper windows. The Board voted to defer a decision until its next regularly scheduled meeting so that the owner could provide evidence of financial hardship. The motion was made by Dave Visintainer and seconded by Mike Killeen. The motion passed unanimously.

PROCEEDINGS: Bob Bettis presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area and entered into the record a letter of support from 8th Ward Alderman Stephen Conway on behalf of the owner. Owners Shirley Klingbeil and Robert Klingbeil testified on their own behalf and submitted a statement of income proving financial hardship and a bid from Marvin Windows estimating the cost to replace the windows. Staff recommended that the Preservation Board deny the application on a preliminary basis as the windows do not meet the Shaw Historic District standards.

ACTION: The Preservation Board agreed that the owners submitted sufficient evidence to show that repairing the original windows or installing compliant wood windows would cause an economic hardship. It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval to retain the windows. The motion was made by Dave Visintainer and Seconded by John Burse. The motion passed unanimously.

2. 2010.0056 4397 WESTMINSTER PL. CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DIST.

Owner/Applicant: Carl Dotson

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to replace a cornice with an unarticulated aluminum and vinyl covering in the Central West End Historic Dist.

PREVIOUS ACTION: The owner applied for a building permit for the proposed work in August, 2009. The staff denied the application as the work did not comply with the Central West End Historic District Design Standards. The applicant failed to appeal in a timely manner, so he has filed a Preliminary Review Application for the proposed work.

PROCEEDINGS: Bob Bettis presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. He also entered into the record as Exhibit One, a letter submitted by Jim Dwyer of the Central West End Assoc. Planning & Development Committee supporting the Cultural Resources Office's recommendation that the Preservation Board deny the project as the proposed work does not meet the Central West End Historic District Standards.

Carl Dotson, owner of the property testified on behalf of the Board approving the project as presented.

ACTION: The Preservation Board agreed that the proposed wrapping of the wood cornice and installation of vinyl dentils were not in compliance with the CWE Historic District Standards and that the owner had not explored other options in regard to repairing the existing wood

cornice. It was the decision of the Preservation Board to deny the project as proposed. The motion was made by John Burse and seconded by Dave Visintainer. The motion passed unanimously.

3. 2009.2882 308-14 CLARA AVE. CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Clara Properties LLC – Steve Anrod

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary Review to construct seven attached townhouses, rehabilitation of two existing three-story apartment buildings and expansion of an existing parking lot with new parking structures.

PROCEEDINGS: Jan Cameron presented a PowerPoint illustrating the site and surrounding areas. She also entered into the Record as Exhibit One, a letter from the DeBaliviere Place Association supporting the proposed new construction. Ms. Cameron recommended approval with the stipulation that only a single parking structure be constructed and located at the rear of the property; and that the final design details are reviewed and approved by staff.

Bill Kuehling, attorney for the owners testified on behalf of the project.

Steve Anrod, property owner & developer testified on behalf of the project. The owner stated that he is in agreement with the conditional approval recommended by the Cultural Resources Office staff.

ACTION: The Preservation Board agreed that the proposed project complies with the Central West End Historic District Standards. It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval with the stipulation that only a single parking structure be constructed and located at the rear of the property; and that the final design details are reviewed and approved by staff. The lot will be properly screened with landscaping and an ornamental metal fence. The motion was made by Commissioner Mike Killeen and seconded by Alderwoman Phyllis Young. The motion passed unanimously.

4. 2009.0137 5594 BARTMER AVE. PRESERVATION REVIEW DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: City of St. Louis Land Reutilization Authority (LRA)

DEMOLITION PLAN: Preliminary Review to demolish a 2 story frame house

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

JANUARY 25TH, 2010

Page 4 of 8

PROCEEDINGS:

Kate Shea presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. Ms. Shea stated that the house was a rare (or St. Louis) Shingle-Style building and that all efforts should be made to save the structure. She submitted into the record a letter supporting the demolition from 26th Ward Alderman Frank Williamson. She also submitted reports from previous reviews of the proposed demolition including a 2007 Report on the building's condition and suitability for rehabilitation. Finally, she submitted previous decisions by the Preservation Board denying the demolition. Staff recommended that the Preservation Board deny the proposed demolition and urge the Alderman and the LRA to work with CRO and CDA staff to save the house.

26th Ward Alderman Frank Williamson testified in support of the demolition and submitted recent photos showing further damage to the house.

Ms. Teresa Sterns, a resident testified in support of the demolition and urged the Board to approve the demolition.

Walter Taylor, a resident testified in support of the demolition and urged the Board to approve the demolition.

Ms. Laura Costello, Director of the Land Reutilization Authority, testified in support of the demolition citing numerous complaints from area residents and urged the Board to approve the demolition.

ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval for demolition. The Preservation Board found that the house had suffered further damage and is a severe detriment to the neighborhood. The motion was made by Ald. Phyllis Young and seconded by Commissioner John Burse. The motion passed unanimously.

APPEALS OF STAFF DENIALS

5. 2009.2767 4125 TURNER AVE. PRESERVATION REVIEW DISTRICT

Owner: Xtreme Properties, LLC – Brant Davis & Cal McCline

Applicant: B & D Wrecking Company

DEMOLITION PLAN:

Appeal of a staff denial to demolish a 2 story brick single family dwelling.

PROCEEDINGS:

Kate Shea presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. She also entered into the record Enabling Ordinance #64689 and #64925 and submitted an insurance settlement letter from the

owner along with a cost estimate to rehabilitate the building. Ms. Shea recommended that the Preservation Board uphold the staff's denial of the application for a demolition permit, as none of the Ordinance criteria for approval have been met by the current owner.

Mr. Cal McCline, owner of the property, testified in favor of his appeal. He explained that the building is in such poor condition that it cannot be feasibly rehabilitated with the funds he has available and urged the Board to approve the demolition.

21st Ward Alderman Antonio French testified in opposition to the appeal. He urged the Board to deny the demolition and suggested the owner donate the building to the LRA or a neighborhood association in the 21st Ward so the building could be rehabilitated and put back into productive use.

Ald. French stated that he had recently allocated funds for a National Register Survey and Nomination of the O'Fallon Neighborhood. This designation will allow the owner of the property to use both the State and Federal Tax Credits for Historic Preservation Programs to rehabilitate the house.

ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the staff's denial as none of the Ordinance criteria for approval of the demolition have been met by the current owner. The motion was made by Commissioner Anthony Robinson and seconded by John Burse. The motion passed unanimously.

6. 2009.2587 2127 LYNCH ST. BENTON PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: James Koeltzow

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of a staff denial to retain and modify a storefront on a two-story corner commercial building.

PROCEEDINGS: Bob Bettis presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. He entered into the record Enabling Ordinance #64689, 64925 and Benton Park Ordinance #67175. A letter from the Benton Park Neighborhood Association opposing the proposal was entered into the record. Mr. Bettis urged the Preservation Board to uphold the staff denial as the completed and proposed work does not comply with historic district standards. The proposal is not based on a proper Model Example.

He further stated that the owner had not submitted any evidence that the installation of a proper storefront would result in an economic hardship.

Mr. James Koeltzow testified on his own behalf and presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating buildings in the surrounding area with similar storefronts.

ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the staff's denial as the proposed storefront and installed bulkhead are not in compliance with the Benton Park Historic District Standards. The Board found that the owner did not provide a Model Example as the Historic District standards require. The motion was made by Commissioner Melanie Fathman and seconded by John Burse. The motion passed unanimously.

7. 2009.2806 4035 RUSSELL BLVD. SHAW HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Ruby Wicks

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

Appeal of a staff denial to retain a non-compliant vinyl fence at a residential building installed without a permit.

PROCEEDINGS:

Bob Bettis presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. He entered into the record Enabling Ordinance #64689, 64925 and Shaw Historic District Ordinance #59400. He urged the Preservation Board to uphold the staff's denial as the fence does not comply with the Historic District Standards. He also stated that 8th Ward Alderman Stephen Conway, who was in attendance, was in support of a variance to retain the fence.

ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the staff's denial and grant a variance for the fence. The Board found that the installed vinyl fence is not prominently visible from the street and is in compliance with the Shaw Historic District Standards and that Ald. Stephen Conway was in support of a variance. The motion was made by Commissioner John Burse and seconded by Dave Richardson. The motion passed unanimously.

8. 2009.2679 2831 SHENANDOAH AVE. FOX PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: MB Investments Investments LLC & Huong Nguyen
c/o John S. Drochelman & Matt Bradford

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of a staff denial to retain a 2' high concrete retaining wall constructed without a permit and erect a 6' wood privacy fence.

PROCEEDINGS: Bob Bettis presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. He entered into the record Enabling Ordinances #64689 and 64925 and Fox Park Historic District Ordinance #66098. He stated that the owner was previously issued a permit in July 2009 for interior and exterior alterations to the building, but the retaining wall and fence were not included in those plans.

He urged the Preservation Board to deny the retaining wall and fence as they do not meet the Fox Park Historic District.

Mr. John Drochelman & Matt Bradford, owners of the property testified on their own behalf and asked that the Board grant a variance to retain the wall and erect the fence. They entered into the record photos and examples of similar retaining walls in the surrounding neighborhood. They testified that all other work done with a permit was in keeping with the Historic District Standards.

ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the staff's denial as the retaining wall and fence do not meet the Fox Park Historic District standards. The motion was made by Commissioner Dave Visintainer and seconded by John Burse. The motion passed unanimously.

SPECIAL AGENDA ITEMS

NOMINATIONS TO THE NATIONAL REGISTER OF HISTORIC PLACES

9. North Broadway Wholesale & Warehouse District
1400-1600 & 1609-29 N. Broadway

ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the State Historic Preservation Office that the North Broadway Wholesale and Warehouse District meets the requirements of National Register Criterion A in the areas of Community Planning & Development. The motion was made by Ald. Phyllis Young and seconded by Dave Richardson. The motion passed unanimously.

10. **Sligo Iron Store Company – 1301 N. 6th St.**

ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the State Historic Preservation Office that the Sligo Iron Store Company meets the requirements of National Register Criterion A in the areas of Commerce.. The motion was made by Dave Richardson and seconded by Melanie Fathman. The motion passed unanimously.

11. **S. Pfeiffer Manufacturing Company - 3965 Laclede Ave.**

ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the State Historic Preservation Office that the S. Pfeiffer Manufacturing Company Headquarters Building meets the requirements of National Register Criterion C in for Architecture with the recommendation that the nomination be edited prior to submission to the Department of the Interior. The motion was made by Mike Killeen and seconded by Dave Visintainer. The motion passed unanimously.