

CITY OF ST. LOUIS
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES
OCTOBER 22, 2012

Board Members Present

Richard Callow, Chairman

Erin Wright

Alderman Craig Schmid

Michael Killeen

David Richardson

Nate Johnson

Melanie Fathman

Anthony Robinson

Cultural Resources Office Staff Present

Betsy H. Bradley, Director

Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator

Bob Bettis, Preservation Planner

Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner

Roll Called

Current Agenda approved.

The September 24, 2012 meeting minutes were not approved during this meeting.

PRELIMINARY REVIEWS

A. 2012.1659 4261-63 SHAW BOULEVARD SHAW HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Baer The Word At Shaw-Pastor Keith Scarborough

Applicant: Linda Kinsell-

COMMERCIAL PLAN: Preliminary review of an application to paint a mural at the northwest corner of the Word at Shaw Church.

PROCEEDINGS: Jan Cameron gave a PowerPoint presentation and an overview of the proposal illustrating the property and the project. The mural is to be painted directly on the western

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

OCTOBER 22, 2012

Page 2 of 7

brick wall of the church's ancillary wing, and will wrap slightly around the corner to the north facade. Ms. Cameron recommended that the Preservation Board grant preliminary approval of the project. There are currently no standards in the Shaw Historic District ordinance that address murals as art installations. The staff used the district sign standards as guidance and the project complies with those standards, with the exception that painted wall signs are prohibited.

Laura Kinsell-Baer, Vice President of the Shaw Neighborhood Improvement Association, testified in support of the project.

Rev. Keith Scarborough of The Word at Shaw church, owner of the property, testified in support of the project.

Alderman Conway appeared and testified in support of the mural project.

Eric Vineyard testified and submitted a letter of support for the project.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- review of public or private art is not addressed by the current Shaw Historic District Standards;
- the Shaw Neighborhood Improvement Association and Alderman Stephen Conway support the project, and there have been several neighborhood meetings to present the mural project to the neighborhood; and
- that the proposed mural design would not adversely affect the long-term condition of the church building.

ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval of the mural at the proposed location, to the extent that the Preservation Board has jurisdiction over the project. The motion was made by Board Member David Richardson and seconded by Alderman Schmid. The motion passed on a vote of 8 to zero.

B. *3001 MISSOURI AVENUE BENTON PARK HD. WITHDRAWN BY APPLICANT*

C. *3315 MISSOURI AVENUE BENTON PARK HD. WITHDRAWN BY APPLICANT*

APPEAL OF DENIALS

D. 2012.1104 3714 N. 21ST STREET HYDE PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Willie D. & Pearlene Green

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of the Director's denial of a building permit application to install five (5) segmentally arched windows with new vinyl replacement windows on the front façade.

PROCEEDINGS: Andrea Gagen gave a PowerPoint presentation and an overview of the property and the proposed windows. She submitted into the record the agenda item and certified copies of Ordinances #64689, #64925 and #57484. She recommended that the Preservation Board uphold the denial as the windows do not comply with the Hyde Park Historic District standards.

Ms. Gagen stated that there had not been any contact from any neighborhood group, or by the Alderman, regarding the project.

Mr. and Mrs. Willie D. Green, property owners, appeared in support of the project. The owners stated that replacing segmentally arched wood windows would be too costly.

FINDINGS OF FACTS: The Preservation Board found that:

- the windows do not meet the Hyde Park Historic District standards;
- the property is an income-producing property for the owner;
- wood historic replacement windows would be significantly more expensive;
- the owner had not looked into the cost of restoring the existing windows, and
- no comment regarding the proposal was received from the Alderman of the Ward.

ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the Director's denial of a building permit as the windows do not meet the Hyde Park Historic District standards under Ordinance 57484, Section I: Residential, 6. Details. The motion was made by Board Member Dave Visintainer and

seconded by Mr. Richardson. The motion passed unanimously.

E. 2012.1473 2405-07 INDIANA MCKINLEY HEIGHTS HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Longridge Trading LLC – John Carter

Applicant: Parouder Demolition – Andrew Hemphill

DEMOLITION PLAN: Appeal of the Director’s denial of a demolition permit to demolish a two-story four-family brick dwelling.

PROCEEDINGS: Director Betsy Bradley made a Power-Point presentation about the property and reviewed the criteria to be used to consider demolitions in the McKinley Heights Historic District and a Preservation Review District. She entered into the record certified copies of City Ordinances #64689, as amended by Ordinance #64925, #64832, and# 67175, the McKinley Heights Historic District Standards and the agenda. Ms. Bradley stated that the property is a sound, Merit building.

John Carter, owner of the property, submitted a letter from Roy Jennings, P.E., that notes the ways in which the brick building exhibits the need for stabilizing work. Mr. Carter stated that his long term plan was to acquire an adjacent parcel and create a fenced parking lot.

Andrew Hemphill, Carter’s demolition contractor, testified that he had removed the boards from the windows in the rear of the building recently, after receiving notice that the building had been cleared of asbestos.

Mark Reed, Vice-President and chair of the Development Committee of the McKinley-Heights Neighborhood Association, expressed opposition to demolition due to the salvageable condition of the building, the lack of plans for the site, and the belief that a neighborhood is not improved through the demolition of its built environment.

FINDINGS OF FACTS

The Preservation Board found that:

- as a contributing resource to the National Register district, the building is considered to be a Merit building and it meets the 75 years of age threshold for a historic resource as defined by the McKinley Heights

Historic District Standards and therefore is in the category of irreplaceable assets, the demolition of which is strictly limited;

- in terms of the ordinance definition of soundness, the building is sound, although it exhibits cracks and loss of brick that indicate that stabilizing work is needed;
- the rehabilitation potential for this building includes the conversion of the four-unit building into two residential units and would not require complete reconstruction, a situation identified in the McKinley Heights Historic District Standards as a criterion for approval of demolition;
- the owner has not provided evidence regarding the feasibility of public or private financing, the financial benefits of using state and federal historic tax credits, or other aspects of the economic situation for the rehabilitation of this property;
- there is no city-adopted redevelopment plan that includes this property;
- in terms of urban design, the loss of 2405-07 Indiana Avenue would negatively impact the existing historic continuity, rhythm and density of the block on which it stands;
- the proposed subsequent construction would be a parking lot on this property and eventually perhaps also the one to the south;
- the owner has not stated that he needs to reuse this parcel as part of commonly-controlled property to support his business at loss of 2400 S. Jefferson; and
- the building is not an accessory structure.

ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the Director's denial of a demolition permit as the property does not meet the criteria for demolition in the McKinley Heights Historic District, a National Register Historic District and a Preservation Review District. The motion was made by Alderman Craig Schmid and seconded by Mr. Visintainer. The motion carried with a unanimous vote.

SPECIAL AGENDA ITEMS

Director's Report – No Board Action Required

- F.** Betsy Bradley reported that copies of the Draft Solar Panels Standards are at each Board Member's seat, and that the standards would be distributed widely following the meeting. She is looking for comments on the draft standards from Board Members and residents of local historic districts.
- G.** Director Betsy Bradley reported on progress to date on the thematic Survey of Mid-Century Modern Non-residential Architecture in St. Louis City. She reported that Peter Meijer Architect, PC is under contract to complete the survey. This firm, located in Portland, Oregon, has specialized experience in documenting and evaluating mid-century modern buildings. She reviewed the work that the Cultural Resources Office has been completing: recording a basic level over 2300 non-residential buildings erected in the City between 1945 and 1975. She noted some patterns, presented some examples, and explained the next steps in the project.

Nominations to the National Register of Historic Places:

- H.** Tower Grove East Historic District [*roughly bounded by Nebraska(east), Gravois(south), Louisiana & south Grand(west) and the alley north of Shenandoah(north)*]
-

ACTION: It was decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the Missouri State Historic Preservation Office that the Tower Grove East Historic district is eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places under Criterion C for Architecture. The motion was made by Board Member Melanie Fathman and seconded by Alderman Schmid. The motion passed unanimously.

- I.** Lindell Park Historic District [*roughly bounded by Natural Bridge(north), Garrison Ave. (east), St. Louis Ave.(south), and N. Grand Blvd.(west)*]
-

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

OCTOBER 22, 2012

Page 7 of 7

ACTION: It was decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the Missouri State Historic Preservation Office that the Lindell Park Historic District is eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places under Criterion C for Architecture. The motion was made by Board Member Melanie Fathman and seconded by Alderman Schmid. The motion passed unanimously.

J. Alligator Oil Clothing Company Buildings, 4153-71 Bingham

ACTION: It was decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the Missouri State Historic Preservation Office that the Alligator Oil Clothing Company Buildings eligible for listing in the National Register. The motion was made by Board Member Melanie Fathman and seconded by Alderman Schmid. The motion passed unanimously.

K. Church of the Messiah, 5261 Enright Street

ACTION: It was decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the Missouri State Historic Preservation Office that the Church of the Messiah is eligible for listing in the National Register under Criterion, and is locally significant in the areas of Art and Architecture. The motion was made by Board Member Melanie Fathman and seconded by Mr. Johnson. The motion passed unanimously.

Chairman Richard Callow moved to adjourn the meeting. Hearing no objections, the meeting was adjourned.