

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

OCTOBER 24, 2011

Page 1 of 9

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES
OCTOBER 24, 2011**

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT

Richard Callow, Chairman

Michael Killeen

David Richardson

Anthony Robinson

Alderman Antonio French

CULTURAL RESOURCES STAFF PRESENT

Betsy H. Bradley, Director

Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator

Bob Bettis, Preservation Planner

Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner

Adona Buford, Administrative Assistant

Board Member David Richardson moved to approve the September 26, 2011 minutes. Mr. Robinson seconded the motion. The minutes were approved.

Board Member David Richardson moved to approve the current Agenda. Mr. Robinson seconded the motion. The current Agenda was approved.

PRELIMINARY REVIEWS

A. 2011.1604 1811 PESTALOZZI BENTON PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Frazier's-Cameron Frazier

Applicant: Killeen Studio Architect-Mike Killeen

COMMERCIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to install three (3) new slider windows on three (3) storefronts.

PROCEEDINGS: Board Member Mike Killeen recused himself from this portion of the Hearing.

Bob Bettis presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. He recommended that the Preservation Board withhold

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

OCTOBER 24, 2011

Page 2 of 9

approval as the proposed windows did not meet the Benton Park Historic District Standards. He stated that the slider windows were not based on a Model Example and were not consistent with the building's original character.

Mr. Cameron Frazier, property owner, testified on his own behalf. He stated that the seals in the current windows have failed and that the slider windows have a ten-year warranty and therefore he would avoid the replacement cost if they failed during that time.

Mr. Mike Killeen, architect for the project, testified that there is condensation between the window glazing. He stated that the location near I-55 and the vibration from traffic were the cause of this deterioration. He noted that the windows had been replaced before the neighborhood became a historic district and that the owners have recreated and maintained the historic configuration of the storefront bulkhead and transom. He asked that the Preservation Board grant a variance to install the operable windows.

FINDINGS OF FACT:

The Board found that:

- the proposed work is not based on a Model Example and therefore is not in compliance with the Benton Park Historic District Standards;
- the Benton Park Neighborhood Association and the Alderman have not commented on the project; and
- the project is a re-working of non-historic storefront components and would involve no loss of historic fabric.

ACTION:

Board Member David Richardson moved that the Preservation Board grant preliminary approval and a variance for the slider windows as proposed due to the proximity of the building to I-55 and because the owner had replaced faulty windows twice already. Alderman Antonio French seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

OCTOBER 24, 2011

Page 3 of 9

B. 2011.1410 3015 SALENA STREET BENTON PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Killeen Studio Architects-Mike Killeen

COMMERCIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to erect 2 (two) wall signs and 1 (one) projecting sign on a two-story warehouse converted to an office building.

PROCEEDINGS: Board Member Mike Killeen recused himself from this portion of the Hearing.

Jan Cameron presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. She recommended that the Preservation Board withhold preliminary approval of the location and design of the wall signs and recommended that the large individual letters be greatly reduced in size and spacing to conform to the Benton Park Historic District Standards. The size of the proposed wall sign is far beyond the 40 square foot limitation of the district standards. She also recommended that the small blade sign be approved. Ms. Cameron submitted letters into the record from 9th Ward Alderman Kenneth Ortmann and the Benton Park Neighborhood Association supporting the signs.

Mr. Mike Killeen testified as the owner and designer of the signs. He asked that the Preservation Board grant a variance because if each individual letter's square footage is calculated and added together, the lettering is less than 40 square feet, as required by the Benton Park Historic District Standards and that sign would be seen from Arsenal, which would help the business thrive in the Benton Park neighborhood.

FINDING OF FACTS:

The Board found that:

- the small blade sign to be erected on the front façade complies with the Benton Park Historic District Standards;
- the large wall sign does not comply with the Standards, which limit signs to 40 square feet as it is a total of 133.5 square feet;
- the location of the wall sign and the individual letters reference the large, painted wall signs that were often

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

OCTOBER 24, 2011

Page 4 of 9

used on similar large warehouse buildings in the 19th and early 20th century;

- a large decorative metal panel included on the south is considered art and not a sign; and
- the Benton Park Neighborhood and the Alderman are in support of the project.

ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval of the project. A motion was made by Board Member Richardson and seconded by Mr. Robinson to approve the blade sign. The motion passed unanimously. Mr. Richardson then made a second motion to approve the decorative metal panel; Alderman French seconded the motion, which passed unanimously. Mr. Richardson made a third motion to grant a variance from the Benton Park Historic District Standards to allow the larger wall sign. This motion was also seconded by Alderman French and passed unanimously.

APPEALS OF STAFF DENIALS

C. 2011.1596 3928-30 CASTLEMAN BENTON PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Paul & Linda Kraus

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

Continuation of an appeal of the Director of the Cultural Resources Office's denial of a building permit from the September 26, 2011 meeting to retain fourteen (14) windows on the front façade of a four-family dwelling installed without a permit.

PREVIOUS ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board at its meeting of September 26, 2011 to leave the hearing open until the October 24, 2011 meeting to allow the owner time to submit further testimony on the cost of replacement windows that would meet the district standards, and to provide more information to support the assertion that replacement of the non-compliant windows would constitute an economic hardship.

PROCEEDINGS:

Bob Bettis presented a short PowerPoint presentation that illustrated the situation. He submitted a letter from the Shaw Neighborhood Association in support of the windows. Mr. Bettis recommended again that the Preservation Board uphold the denial as the installed

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

OCTOBER 24, 2011

Page 5 of 9

windows do not meet the Shaw Neighborhood Historic District Standards.

Mr. Paul Kraus testified on his own behalf. He stated that the windows in the building at the time of purchase were defective and he didn't know he needed a permit to replace windows. He submitted financial statements and two quotes for windows into the record as requested by the Preservation Board.

FINDING OF FACTS:

The Board found that:

- the completed work is not in compliance with the Shaw Historic District Standards;
- the owner installed the windows soon after purchasing the building without the permit that he stated he did not know he needed;
- the property owner has the support of Alderman Stephen Conway of the 8th Ward, the Shaw Neighborhood Association and residents of the block; and
- that the owner provided sufficient evidence of economic hardship.

ACTION:

Board Member David Richardson moved to overturn the Director's denial and grant a variance to allow the owner to retain the windows as installed based on the financial information presented. Alderman Antonio French seconded the motion. Mr. Robinson opposed the motion. The motion passed 3 to 1.

D. 2011.1344 2844 LEMP AVENUE BENTON PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Billy Yee and Allen Yee

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

Appeal of the Director of the Cultural Resources Office's denial of a building permit by to install three (3) porches on a public façade of a three-unit alley building. The proposed porches include lower levels that project twelve feet and upper levels that are six feet wide.

PROCEEDINGS:

Bob Bettis presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. The presentation included a 1909 Sanborn Map showing a full length two-story porch on the building. He recommended that the Preservation Board uphold the denial as the proposed

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

OCTOBER 24, 2011

Page 6 of 9

porches do not meet the Benton Park Historic District Standards that require the use of a Model Example. He submitted into the record Ordinances #64689 and #67175. Mr. Bettis stated that he informed the applicant that the Cultural Resources Office could approve the permit if both stories of the porches project 6 feet because the three porches would approximate the historic configuration of one narrow porch across the entire façade since the spaces between the porches are relatively narrow

Mr. Allen Yee testified for the property owner, stating why the porches were designed as they were.

FINDINGS OF FACT:

The Board found that:

- the completed and proposed work is not in compliance with the Benton Park Historic District Standards that require a Model Example for new porches and appendages;
- that the owner began construction of the porches without a permit; and
- that there has been no comment from the Benton Park Neighborhood Association or the Alderman in regards to the project.

ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the Cultural Resource Office Director's denial as the proposed porches do not meet the Benton Park Historic District Standards. The motion was made by Alderman Antonio French and seconded by Mr. Killeen. The motion passed unanimously.

G. 2011.1614 1040 LAMI STREET SOULARD HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Douglas Weil

Applicant: Ladd Suydam

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

Appeal of the Director of the Cultural Resources Office's denial of a building permit to construct a non-compliant front porch on a public façade.

PROCEEDINGS:

Bob Bettis presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. He submitted Ordinances #64689, #62382 and #57708 into the record. Mr. Bettis recommended that the Preservation Board

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

OCTOBER 24, 2011

Page 7 of 9

uphold the denial as the front porch does not meet the Soulard Historic District Standards and the Model Example submitted could not be used as it was not a historic porch. He also submitted a letter from the Soulard Restoration Group supporting the project.

Douglas and Laura Weil, owners of the property testified on their own behalf. They submitted photos of similar porches in the neighborhood and asked the Board to grant a variance based on their attempt to keep a historical look for the property.

Mr. Ladd Suydam, contractor for the project, also asked for a variance. He stated that the photos show that there are other properties in the neighborhood with concrete stairs similar to those at 1040 Lami. He also stated that he had been working with the Soulard Restoration Group on the design of the porch and its members support the project because they believe it complies with the Soulard Historic District Standards.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Board found that:

- the porch construction project was started without a building permit;
- that it is not in compliance with the Soulard Historic District Standards that require a Model Example; and
- that the Soulard Restoration Group is in support of the project and that it believes that the porch complies with the district standards.

ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the Director's denial and grant a variance to approve the porch as proposed as the owners worked with the Soulard Restoration Group on the design of the porch. The motion was made by Board Member Mike Killeen and seconded by Mr. Richardson. Alderman Antonio French abstained. The motion passed 3 to 1.

SPECIAL AGENDA ITEMS:

Nominations to the National Register of Historic Places

- H. Addition to the National Register of Historic Places Multiple Property Documentation Form, The Ville

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

OCTOBER 24, 2011

Page 8 of 9

- I. Cote Brilliant Avenue in the Ville Historic District
4200 W. Block of Cote Brilliante Avenue & 1700 Block of Annie Malone Drive

ACTION: It was decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the State Historic Preservation Office that Cote Brilliante Avenue Historic District meets the requirements of National Register Criterion A. The motion was made by Board Member Richardson and seconded by Mr. Robinson. The motion passed unanimously.

- J. Marshall School in the Ville Historic District
Parts of the 4300 blocks of Aldine and Cote Brilliante Avenues and the 1500 and 1700 blocks of Billups Avenue

ACTION: It was decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the State Historic Preservation Office that Marshall School n Historic District meets the requirements of National Register Criterion A. The motion was made by Board Member Richardson and seconded by Mr. Robinson. The motion passed unanimously.

- K. St. Ferdinand Avenue in the Ville Historic District
4200 W. Block of St. Ferdinand Avenue (South Side

ACTION: It was decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the State Historic Preservation Office that St. Ferdinand Avenue Historic District meets the requirements of National Register Criterion A. The motion was made by Board Member Richardson and seconded by Mr. Robinson. The motion passed unanimously.

- L. Penrose Park Historic District
Roughly bounded by I-70, Newstead Ave., Natural Bridge Ave. & N. Kingshighway

ACTION: It was decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the State Historic Preservation Office that Penrose Park Historic District meets the requirements of National Register Criterion A. The motion was made by Board Member Antonio French and seconded By Mr. Richardson. The motion passed unanimously.

- M. Shaw's Garden Historic District

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

OCTOBER 24, 2011

Page 9 of 9

Bounded by DeTonty; Tower Grove; Shaw; Alfred and Magnolia Avenues;
Kingshighway Boulevard; and Vandeventer Avenue

ACTION: It was decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the State Historic Preservation Office that Shaw's Garden Historic District meets the requirements of National Register Criterion A. The motion was made by Board Member Killeen and seconded by Mr. Robinson. The motion passed unanimously.