

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES
OCTOBER 26TH, 2009**

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT

Richard Callow-Chairman
Mary Johnson-Vice Chairwoman
David Richardson
Melanie Fathman
Ald. Phyllis Young
Anthony Robinson
Dave Visintainer

CULTURAL RESOURCES STAFF PRESENT

Kate Shea, Director
Bob Bettis, Preservation Planner
Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner
Adona Buford, Administrative Assistant

Minutes from September 28th, 2009 were approved.

PRELIMINARY REVIEWS

1. 2009.2405 3959 N. 11TH ST. HYDE PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Jahi Adisa & Dana E. Bakari

DEMOLITION PLAN: Preliminary review to demolish a 2.5 story brick 2 family fire damaged dwelling.

PROCEEDINGS: Kate Shea presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. She stated that Alderman Bosley of the 3rd Ward telephoned staff to communicate his opposition to the proposed demolition. He stated that if the owners could not rehabilitate the building, they should donate it to the Land Reutilization Authority, which could then find a suitable buyer for the property. The Cultural Resources Office recommended that the Preservation Board deny the application for a demolition permit as no evidence has been submitted to support approval and the proposed demolition does not meet the Standards of the Hyde Park Certified Local Historic District.

Jacqueline Jones, representative of the owners, testified on behalf of the owners who reside out of town. The owners have stated that they currently live in Texas and cannot maintain the building, thus wanting to demolish it as it has suffered extensive fire damage. She stated that the fire in the building was the result of arson.

Jeff Mansel, Executive Director of the Landmarks Association of St. Louis testified opposing the demolition.

ACTION.

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to deny the proposed demolition on a Preliminary basis. No formal evidence in support of the proposed demolition has been submitted.

The motion was made by Commissioner Dave Richardson and 2nd by Dave Visintainer. The motion passed unanimously.

2. 2009.2412 728 LAFAYETTE AVE. SOULARD HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Geo & Co. LLC - Dan Poettgen

COMMERCIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct a service platform required by building code for a roof top ventilation system.

PROCEEDINGS: Bob Bettis presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. He also entered into the record a letter from the Soulard Restoration Group in support of the handrail & platform system. He testified that the owners were denied an occupancy permit when the City Department of Public Safety Mechanical Section stated that because of the slope of the roof, a service platform was required by city code. The owners submitted an initial design that will not meet the Soulard Local Historic Design Guidelines, but are willing to redesign it to minimize its appearance as much as possible

An email from the installer/contractor stating why the vent can't be moved was also entered into the record.

The Cultural Resources Office recommended that the Preservation Board grant a variance for the project as submitted due to the requirements of the mechanical code, with the stipulation that the owners work with Cultural Resources staff on a design for the platform.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

OCTOBER 26TH, 2009

Page 3 of 7

ACTION.

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant a variance due to the requirements of the mechanical code, and approve the proposal with the stipulation that the owners work with Cultural Resources staff on a design for the platform. The motion was made by Ald. Phyliss Young and 2nd by Melanie Fathman. The motion passed unanimously.

APPEALS OF STAFF DENIALS

3. 2009.2310 4457 WESTMINSTER PL. CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DIST.

Owner/Applicant: Joseph E. & Ethel Scoggin

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of a staff denial of a building permit to install a front porch on a contributing building in the Central West End Historic District which does not comply with the historic district design standards.

PROCEEDINGS: Bob Bettis presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. Enabling Ordinance #64689 and Central West End Ordinance #56768 were entered into the record. Mr. Bettis also submitted a letter from the Central West End Association and a letter from a neighbor opposing the design of the porch as proposed.

Staff recommended that the Preservation Board uphold the staff's denial of the application for a building permit as the proposed porch does not meet the Central West End Historic District Standards. Staff further recommends that the Board instruct the owner to repair the existing porch as originally designed. The proposed design of the porch is inappropriate and proposes to use materials such as wrought iron, brick, and split-face concrete block which do not fit the historic design and materials of the house.

Mr. Joseph Scoggin, owner of the property, testified on his own behalf and submitted photos of the porch and porches in the surrounding area. He stated that he cannot afford to repair the porch using original materials such as limestone. On this point, the owner did not provide any evidence of financial hardship or of actual project costs.

Tracy Mills, neighbor, testified opposing the proposed porch design and materials and submitted an old photo of the house showing the porch as it was historically.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

OCTOBER 26TH, 2009

Page 4 of 7

Bill Siebert, Central West End Association, testified and read into the record a letter from the Central West End Planning & Development Committee opposing the porch as proposed.

Michael Allen, Historian, testified opposing the porch as proposed.

ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the staff's denial of the application for a building permit as the proposed porch design does not meet the Central West End Historic District Standards. The motion was made by Dave Visintainer and simultaneously 2nd by Anthony Robinson and Dave Richardson. Commissioner Mary Johnson opposed the motion. The motion passed 5 to 1.

4. 2009.2178 1925-27 S. 10TH ST. SOULARD HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Rehab Girls LLC- Peggy Sheffold
Applicant: Bellon Wrecking Company-Don Bellon

DEMOLITION PLAN: Appeal of a staff denial of an application to demolish a 2 story two family brick building in the Soulard Certified Local Historic District.

PROCEEDINGS: Kate Shea testified that the she had spoken with Mr. Michael Schwartz, the owner's representative, before the Board meeting, and he had stated by telephone that he wanted to withdraw the appeal and that he no longer wished to have the appeal heard by the Preservation Board. She said that Mr. Schwartz stated that he wanted to work with the Alderwoman and the neighborhood to rehab the building but lacked financing.

ACTION: Appeal was withdrawn. Because the owner's representative withdrew the appeal by telephone, the Preservation Board did not vote on the matter.

5. 2009.2410 1910 SERBIAN DR. MCKINLEY HEIGHTS HIST. DISTRICT
2009.2311 & 2009.2368

Owner: Holy Trinity Serbian Eastern Orthodox Church – Pete Buha
Applicant: Landscape St. Louis-Ron Goedecker & Lawrence Fabric Structures – John Hinckley

COMMERCIAL PLAN: Appeal of a staff denial to keep a retaining wall installed without a building permit, install a non-compliant fence, and construct a non-compliant awning, on the Serbian Orthodox Church building and campus.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

OCTOBER 26TH, 2009

Page 5 of 7

PREVIOUS ACTION: On September 25th, 2009, a complaint was received in the Cultural Resources Office for construction of a retaining wall without a building permit.

On September 30th, a Certified violation letter was mailed to the applicant.

Upon receipt of the violation letter, the contractor applied for building permits for the previously constructed retaining wall, an awning and a fence with brick columns. These applications were denied by staff because the proposed designs of the three projects did not conform to the McKinley Heights Historic District Standards. All three denials were appealed by the owners.

PROCEEDINGS: Bob Bettis presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. Enabling Ordinance #64689 and Ordinance #67901 were entered into the record. Mr. Bettis recommended that the Preservation Board uphold the staff denial of the application for a building permit and not issue a variance, as the proposed projects do not conform to the McKinley Heights Historic District Design Standards.

Further, Mr. Bettis testified that despite the landscaping which was installed following the initial construction, the 'versa loc' wall and patio remain highly visible from Geyer Ave. and do not meet the "Model Example" rule embodied in the McKinley Heights Historic District Design Standards.

The proposed fence is nearly a foot taller than allowed under the Design Standards, and the proposed awning does not fit the door opening. The awning also contains commercial signage,

Although a Model Example of the fence at Sigel School may have been submitted by the applicants; the fence example was not followed by the applicants.

Peter Buha, a church member, testified in favor of the Board granting a variance from the Standards for the wall, patio, fence and awning.

Ron Goedeker, contractor testified in favor of the variances.

Dave Lekiech, a church member, testified in favor of variance.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

OCTOBER 26TH, 2009

Page 6 of 7

Victor Poncho, President of the McKinley Heights Neighborhood Association testified in opposition to the proposals and submitted an email from David Lekiech to Mark Reed of the Development Committee supporting the neighborhood opposition.

Pat Horack, a neighborhood resident, testified in opposition to variances for the proposed fence with columns, patio, wall and awning as proposed and constructed.

ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to:

1. uphold the staff denial of the proposed awning as it does not comply with the McKinley heights Historic District Standards.
The motion was made by Dave Richardson and 2nd by Ald. Phyllis Young. The motion passed unanimously.
2. to overturn the staff denial and approve a building permit application for the 5' wrought-iron fence without brick columns. The motion was made by Dave Visintainer and 2nd by Anthony Robinson. The motion passed unanimously
3. to uphold staff's denial of the application for a building permit for construction of the retaining wall as constructed. The Board members urged the applicant to work with staff on a design to bring the wall and patio into compliance with the McKinley Heights Historic District Standards. The motion was made by Phyllis Young and 2nd by Melanie Fathman. Mary Johnson opposed the motion. The motion passed 5 to 1.

SPECIAL AGENDA ITEMS

6. Wellston Loop Commercial District Historic District

(Bounded by the city limits, and the alley of M.L.K. to the north and south and Clara Ave. to the east.)

ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the State Historic Preservation Office that the Wellston Loop Commercial District Historic District meets the requirements of National Register Criterion A in the areas of Community Planning & Development. The motion was made by Melanie Fathman and 2nd by Mary Johnson. The motion passed unanimously.

7. Federal Cold Storage Company 1800-28 North Broadway

ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the State Historic Preservation Office that the Federal Cold Storage Company meets the requirements of National Register Criterion A for Industry and Criterion C for Architecture, with the recommendation

that the nomination be edited prior to submission to the Department of the Interior. The motion was made by Melanie Fathman and 2nd by Mary Johnson. The motion passed unanimously

8. Central Carondelet Historic District Boundary Increase III
(Roughly bounded by Bates St., I-55, South Broadway and Holly Hills)

ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the State Historic Preservation Office that the Central Carondelet Historic District Boundary Increase III meets the requirements of National Register Criterion A for Community Planning & Development and Criterion C for Architecture. The motion was made by Melanie Fathman and 2nd by Mary Johnson. The motion passed unanimously