

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES
NOVEMBER 23RD, 2009**

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT

Richard Callow-Chairman
David Richardson
John Burse
Ald. Phyllis Young
Anthony Robinson
Dave Visintainer

CULTURAL RESOURCES STAFF PRESENT

Bob Bettis, Preservation Planner
Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner
Adona Buford, Administrative Assistant

Minutes from October 26th, 2009 were approved.

PRELIMINARY REVIEWS

1. 2009.2203 6133 WESTMINSTER PL. SKINKER-DeBALIVIERE HISTORIC DIST.

Owner: Peter Lukaseiwicz & Shirley Bissen
Applicant: Heine & Croghan Architects-Ed Heine

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to add a room addition, replace a front porch & replace windows.

PROCEEDINGS: Jan Cameron presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. She stated the Board should grant preliminary approval with the stipulation that the brick corner posts be deleted and a historically appropriate wrought-iron railing be installed. Ed Heine of Heine & Croghan Architects testified on behalf of the project explaining the deterioration and the proposed renovation of the porch and railing.

ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval of the design as submitted by the applicant. The motion was

made by Commissioner John Burse and seconded by Anthony Robinson.
The motion passed unanimously.

APPEALS OF STAFF DENIALS

2. 2009.2741 3959 N. 11TH ST. HYDE PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Dane E. & Jahi Adisa Bakari
Applicant: Z & L Wrecking Company-Zak Little

DEMOLITION PLAN: Appeal of a staff denial of a an application for a demolition permit to demolish a 2.5 story brick house in the Hyde Parl Certified Local Historic District.

PREVIOUS ACTION: October 26th, 2009, the Preservation Board heard a Preliminary Review regarding the proposed demolition. The Board heard testimony and reviewed exhibits from staff and heard testimony from a representative of the owners, who currently live in Dallas, Texas. The Board denied the demolition on a preliminary basis as no evidence in support of the proposed demolition had been submitted

PROCEEDINGS: Jan Cameron presented a PowerPoint presentation of the site and surrounding areas. She also submitted certified copies of Ordinance #64689 and Ordinance #57584 and the Minutes of the October 26, 2009 Preservation Board Meeting into the record. She recommended that the Board uphold the staff's denial of the demolition, as no evidence has been submitted to support approval and the proposed demolition does not meet the Standards of the Hyde Park Certified Local Historic District

Jahi Adia Bakari and Dana E. Bakari, the owners of the property, testified on their own behalf. They submitted copies of documents relating to the insurance claim on the property. They testified that it was financially infeasible to rehabilitate the house.

Andrew Weil, Assistant Director of the Landmarks Association of St. Louis, Inc., testified in opposition of the demolition.

ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the staff's previous denial of an application for a demolition permit as the proposed demolition does not meet the Standards of the Hyde Park Certified Local Historic District. The motion was made by Commissioner Dave Visintainer and seconded by John Burse. The motion passed unanimously.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

NOVEMBER 23RD, 2009

Page 4 of 6

Fox Park Historic District Standards. The new doors are too tall and out of scale with the original building and the original transoms have been removed to accommodate the taller doors. The owner has not provided any evidence of economic hardship.

Mr. Brett Factory, property owner testified on his own behalf and submitted photos and a petition signed by neighbors supporting the door and transom and asked that the Board grant him a variance. Mr. Brett did not provided any evidence of economic hardship.

ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the staff's denial as the windows do not comply with the Fox Park Historic District standards. The motion was made by Commissioner Phyllis Young and seconded by John Burse. Commissioner Dave Richardson opposed the motion. The motion passed 4 to 1.

5. 2009.2451 1900-02 WITHNELL ST. BENTON PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Richard Schramm

PLAN: Appeal of a staff denial of an application for a building permit to replace three (3) vinyl windows and wrap the wood trim.

PROCEEDINGS: Bob Bettis presented a PowerPoint presentation of the site and surrounding area. He entered into the record Ordinance #64689 and #67175. He stated that the vinyl windows proposed by the owner will seriously affect the building's historic character and integrity. The proposed windows are flat and contemporary in appearance; the lift and meeting rails are narrower, and the jambs are wider than the original window. Staff recommended that Board uphold the staff's denial as the proposed windows and covering of wood trim do not comply with Benton Park Local Historic district standards.

Mr. Schramm, property owner testified on his own behalf and asked that the Board approve his proposal and stated that the proposed work is the final phase of a multi-year project that began thirteen years ago prior to the installation of the local historic district

ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant a variance and allow the three remaining windows to be installed. The motion was made by Commissioner Anthony Robinson and seconded by Dave Richardson. The motion passed unanimously.

6. 2009.2455 2610 WHITTIER AVE. VILLE HISTORIC DISTRICT

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of a staff denial of an application for a building permit to construct a 24' x 36' frame garage with vertical metal siding and a metal roof at the rear of the side yard.

PROCEEDINGS: Andrea Gagen presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. She also entered into the record Ordinance #64689 and #60326, a photo of the garage material and a letter of support from 4th Ward Alderman Sam Moore. Staff recommended that the Preservation Board uphold the staff's denial as the garage does not meet the Ville Historic District Standards. The proposed garage is not compatible with the surrounding structures, and therefore does not comply with the Ville Historic District standards. The garage will be approximately the same width as the house in front, with nearly as much square footage. The single garage door is proposed to face Whittier, which is incompatible with a neighborhood where garage entries are from the alley. No driveway had been proposed at this time, although under Building Code one is required for access.

Levester Mullins, property owner, testified on his own behalf and submitted photos into the record of similar garage materials in the surrounding areas. He stated that however, he would comply with whatever the Board could suggest.

ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to approve a garage with the stipulation that the garage door face the Kennerly Street side and that the siding not be metal siding but a material appropriate to the Ville Historic District. The motion was made by John Burse and seconded by Dave Richardson. The motion passed unanimously.

7. 2009.2569 5026 WASHINGTON AVE.SKINKER-DEBALIVIERE HISTORIC DIST.

Owner/Applicant: Robert Bynum

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of a staff denial of an application for a building permit to retain a retaining wall constructed without a permit.

PROCEEDINGS: Bob Bettis presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. He entered into the record Ordinance #64689 and #57688. Mr. Bettis stated that the owner did not respond to correspondence from the Cultural Resources Office and was referred to Housing Court. Upon receipt of a court summons, the owner made application for the non-compliant work on October 29, 2009, which was

denied. Staff recommended that the Preservation Board uphold the staff denial as the installed retaining wall does not comply with the Skinker-DeBaliviere Historic District Standards.

Robert Bynum, owner of the property testified on his own behalf and submitted photos into the record of similar retaining walls in the surrounding area.

ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the staff's denial as the retaining wall does not comply with the Skinker-DeBaliviere Historic District Standards. The motion was made by Commissioner John Burse and seconded by Anthony Robinson. The motion passed unanimously.

8. 2009.2641 1819 RUSSELL BLVD. MCKINLEY HEIGHTS HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Scott Jenny

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of a staff denial of an application for a building permit to retain brown paint applied to a white glazed masonry wall without a permit.

PROCEEDINGS: Bob Bettis presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding areas. He entered into the record Ordinance #64689 and #67901. Mr. Bettis also submitted a photograph of the house before it was painted. Staff is not aware of a method to remove the paint without damaging the underlying glaze. Simply repainting the masonry white as the owner suggests, would not reverse the damage that has been done to the building façade. The Cultural Resources Office recommends that the Preservation Board uphold the staff denial of the application as the completed work does not meet the McKinley Heights Historic District Standards. Since the Cultural Resources Office believes the situation is irreversible, the owner should be referred to Housing Court.

Mr. Frederick Scott Jenny testified on his own behalf and asked the Board to grant a variance for the painted masonry.

ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the staff's denial and directed the owner to work with staff to repaint the masonry a compatible white. The motion was made by Commissioner Phyllis Young and seconded by Dave Richardson. Anthony Robinson opposed the motion. The motion passed 4 to 1.