CITY OF ST. LOUIS
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES
DECEMBER 21ST, 2009

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT
Richard Callow-Chairman
Mary Johnson-Vice Chair
David Richardson
John Burse
Ald. Phyllis Young
Anthony Robinson
Dave Visintainer
Mike Killeen

CULTURAL RESOURCES STAFF PRESENT
Kate Shea, Director
Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator
Bob Bettis, Preservation Planner
Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner
Adona Buford, Administrative Assistant

Minutes from November 23rd, 2009 were approved.

PRELIMINARY REVIEWS

1. 2009.1324 4025 FLAD AVE. SHAW HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Shirley Klingbeil

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: A Preliminary Review to obtain a variance to install non-compliant aluminum windows on the front façade of a house in the Shaw Historic District.

PROCEEDINGS: Commissioner Dave Richardson recused himself.
Bob Bettis presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area and introduced photographs submitted by the owners illustrating the interior of the existing windows. Staff recommended that the Preservation Board deny the application on a

preliminary basis as the windows do not comply with the Shaw Historic District standards.

Owners Shirley Klingbeil and Robert Klingbeil testified, stating that it would be a hardship to use the correct type of window. The owner stated that she has paid for the windows and cannot afford to take the monetary loss and install the proper windows

ACTION: The Preservation Board moved to defer a decision for one month until the next regularly scheduled meeting because the applicant needed more time to provide evidence of economic hardship. The Board recommended that the owner explore the use of the Tax Credits for Historic Preservation and Energy Use reduction Tax Credit Programs and also recommended that the applicant contact the window company regarding State Tax Credits, and to find out if the contractor would take the windows back. The motion was made by Dave Visintainer and seconded by Mike Killeen. The motion passed unanimously.

2. 2009.2769 2248 NEBRASKA FOX PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Natalija Karich
Applicant: Maria Karich

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: A Preliminary Review to replace 5 windows with Quaker Historic "ERIC" windows on the front of a row house.

PROCEEDINGS: Andrea Gagen presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. She entered into the record a letter from the Fox Park Neighborhood Association opposing installation of the "ERIC" windows. She stated that although the Quaker Historic 'ERIC' windows are approved for use on public facades in the Fox Park Historic District, this four unit attached row house is a special case. The adjacent two houses in the row still retain their original wood windows. The Cultural Resources Office staff asked the Preservation Board's guidance in regard to the use of differing window materials on the front facade of a building.

Ms. Maria Karich, daughter of the owner testified and submitted a contract from Marvin Windows with a price summary for installation of Marvin wood historic replacement windows along with photographs of similar aluminum windows in the surrounding area. She stated that however, Quaker Windows do not qualify for the Historic Tax Credit Program.

ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to allow the applicant to install the "ERIC" aluminum windows on the front facade because the Fox Park Historic District Ordinance does allow aluminum windows on front façades. The motion was made by Board member Dave Richardson and seconded by Mary Johnson. The motion passed unanimously.

3. 2009.2816 3924 & 3930 S. BROADWAY PRESERVATION REVIEW DIST.

Owner/Applicant: KOBA, L.P. Ken Nuernberger

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: A Preliminary Review to demolish a 2 ½ story brick building for construction of a surface parking lot.

PREVIOUS ACTION: It was the Finding of the Chair that the matter was before the Board properly; no one appealed or objected to the Finding of the Chair In August, 2009 the Preservation Board reviewed the appeals of staff denials of applications for demolition permits for the proposed demolition of two buildings at 3924 and 3928-30 S Broadway. The Board voted to uphold the staff denials of the demolition permit applications and asked that the applicant return with a new presentation that addressed the development of 3924 S Broadway. That motion passed unanimously..

PROCEEDINGS: Kate Shea presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. She entered into the record a letter from Alderman Ken Ortmann in support of the project and a letter from the Chippewa-Broadway Business Association supporting the proposal. She also introduced five letters from residents in the community opposing the proposal. She introduced the plan submitted by the owner for the surface parking lot proposed for the site after demolition.

The owner, Mr. Nuernberger, had submitted architectural plans for rehabilitation of the facade of 3924 S. Broadway as proof that he intends to stabilize and market the building as required by the August, 2009 Board decision

Michael Allen testified in opposition to the demolition.

ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to approve demolition of 3928-30 S. Broadway with the condition that the owner apply for a building permit to restore the facade of 3924 S Broadway before

the application for a demolition permit for 3928-30 S. Broadway is approved. The motion was made by Commissioner Mike Killeen and 2nd by Anthony Robinson. The motion passed unanimously.

APPEALS OF STAFF DENIALS

4. 2009.2595 5062 WATERMAN CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DIST.

Owner: Central Reform Congregation
Applicant: Rex Beckham

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of a staff denial of an application for a building permit application to replace a French clay tile roof with artificial slate, on a building located within the Central West End Historic District.

PROCEEDINGS: Bob Bettis presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. He also entered into the record the Cultural Resources Office Enabling Ordinance #64689, Ordinance #56768, and a letter from the Central West End Association opposing replacement of the clay tile with artificial slate. Staff requested that the Preservation Board uphold the staff's denial as the proposed work does not meet the Central West End Historic District Standards. The Ordinance only allows only allows the installation of artificial slate on a roof when replacing original slate. The replacement roof material must match the exact dimensions and color of the original material. In this instance, the proposed artificial slate does not fit that criterion.

Contractor Rex Beckham represented the owner, Central Reform Congregation. He presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating various roofs on houses throughout the city which had artificial slate as a roof material. He asked that the Board overturn the staff denial and approve the proposed roof.

ACTION: The Board found that the proposed roof replacement:

1. is not in compliance with the Central West End Historic District Standards.
2. The Board found that the Central West End Neighborhood Association was in support of the staff recommendation.
3. The Board found that the owner did not provide sufficient evidence of economic hardship to grant a variance from the ordinance.

The Preservation Board upheld the staff denial as the proposed roof replacement is not in compliance with the Central West End Historic District Standards.

The motion was made by Board Member Dave Richardson and seconded by Mary Johnson. The motion passed unanimously.

5. 2009.2673 1201 DOLMAN ST. LAFAYETTE SQUARE HISTORIC DIST.

Owners/Applicants: Mark R. Kalk & Mark C. Lammert

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of a staff denial to construct a 2-story single-family building on three corner lots.

PROCEEDINGS: Jan Cameron presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. She entered into the record Cultural Resources Office enabling Ordinance #64689 and Ordinance. #63327. Also entered into the record were letters from the Lafayette Square Restoration Committee recommending approval of the project and from 6th Ward Alderwoman Kacie Starr Triplett supporting the project. The staff recommended that approval be granted with the condition that the proportions of two windows on the Hickory Street elevation are revised, and that final approval is subject to staff approval of exterior materials and final construction drawings.

Owners Mark Kalk & Mark C. Lammert testified on behalf of their project.

Architect Jeff Day testified on behalf of the project.

Jason Walters of StyleCraft Homes testified on behalf of the project.

Tom Benignus, representing the Lafayette Square Restoration Committee, testified in support of the project.

ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant approval of the proposal with the condition that the proportions of two windows on the Hickory elevation are revised to reflect a minimum proportion of 1:2 and subject to staff approval of exterior materials and final construction drawings. The motion was made by Commissioner Dave Visintainer and seconded by Mary Johnson. The motion passed unanimously.