

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES
MARCH 22ND, 2010**

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT

Richard Callow-Chairman
Mary Johnson – Vice Chair
David Richardson
Anthony Robinson
Mike Killeen
Melanie Fathman
Ald. Phyliss Young

CULTURAL RESOURCES STAFF PRESENT

Kate Shea, Director
Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator
Bob Bettis, Preservation Planner
Adona Buford, Administrative Assistant

Minutes from February 22nd, 2010 were approved.

PRELIMINARY REVIEWS

1. 2010.0262 1913 CALIFORNIA FOX PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Aubrey Morrison

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct a 3 car attached garage.

PROCEEDINGS: Bob Bettis presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. He recommended the Board deny the application as the proposed garage does not comply with the Fox Park Historic District standards. He stated that The Fox Park Neighborhood Association supports the owner's proposal with the following conditions: 1) The owners of both of the properties on either side of the double lot must consent to the construction; and 2) the owner must install privacy fencing along the back of the property as the neighboring property owner directs.

Mr. Aubrey Morrison, property owner testified on his own behalf.

Kate Shea, Director of the Cultural Resources Office testified that the garage is too out of scale and that granting a variance would set a bad precedent.

BOARD ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to deny the application as the proposed garage would be highly visible from the street due to a large side lot, that the proposed garage doors do not face the alley as required by the standards and therefore does not meet the Fox Park Historic District Standards. The motion was made by Commissioner John Burse and 2nd by Dave Richardson. The motion passed unanimously.

2. 2010.0268 2745 ACCOMAC ST. FOX PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Brett Factory

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: :Preliminary review seeking approval to retain modifications to front doors and transoms constructed without a permit.

PROCEEDINGS: Bob Bettis presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. He recommended the Board again deny the application as the proposed door configuration does not comply with the Fox Park Historic District standards. He reminded the Board that this application had previously been denied at the November 23rd, 2009 Preservation Board meeting. The new proposal does not meet the criteria set forth in the design guidelines as a Model Example and was not provided as a basis for the new design. The additional trim is not sufficient in replicating the original appearance and the proposed transoms are too narrow and do not replicate the original appearance.

Mr. Brett Factory testified on his own behalf and submitted 3 photos of model examples of doors in the surrounding areas that were submitted to his contractor. He stated he was willing to do whatever the staff recommends.

BOARD ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the staff's denial. The motion was made by Ald. Phyliss Young and 2nd by Commissioners Mike Killeen and Dave Richardson. Mary Johnson opposed the motion. The motion passed 5 to 1.

NEW APPLICATION

3. 2010.0329 6169R PERSHING AVE. SKINKER-DeBALIVIERE HIST. DIST

Owner: Washington University Quadrangle Housing Co.
Applicant: Aalco Wrecking Company

DEMOLITION PLAN: To approve a demolition permit application to demolish a 1 story six car brick garage demolished without a permit.

PROCEEDINGS: Commissioner John Burse recused himself from this portion of the hearing.
Jan Cameron presented a PowerPoint presentation of the site and surrounding area. She recommended that the Preservation Board deny the application for demolition and refer the owner to Housing Court. Based on photographs supplied with the application, the garage appeared to be in sound condition and remarkably intact, with its original multi-light windows and paneled doors. It is also one of the few unaltered examples of early 20th century garages left in the historic district. She stated that the demolition violates the intent of both Title 24 and the Skinker-DeBaliviere Historic District designation ordinance.

Ms. Mary Campbell, Assistant Vice Chancellor of Washington University, testified on behalf of the project explaining that the demolition of the structure was a matter of security issues.

BOARD ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the staff's denial of the demolition permit application. The Board found that prior to its demolition the garage appeared to have been a contributing resource to the local historic district. The Board also found that proper procedures were not followed and the garage was demolished without a permit. The motion was made by Commissioner Dave Richardson and 2nd by Anthony Robinson. Mary Johnson opposed the motion. The motion passed 5 to 1.

APPEALS OF STAFF DENIALS

4. 2009.2456 2407 S. 13TH ST. SOULARD HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Robert Cox

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of a staff denial to remove/alter chimneys and dormers.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

MARCH 22ND, 2010

Page 4 of 7

PROCEEDINGS:

Jan Cameron presented a PowerPoint presentation of the site and surrounding area. She entered into the record Enabling Ordinance #64689 and Ord.#57078 for Soulard. Ms. Cameron recommended the Preservation Board uphold the staff denial as the proposed work does not conform to the Soulard Historic District design guidelines. The owner was cited by the Building Division for alterations to the rear dormer and removal of a rear chimney, work which was not included on his approved permit. He also proposed to remove four large chimneys on the south side of the house.

Mr. Robert Cox testified on his own behalf. He submitted into the record informational letters with photos included, explaining his proposal. He stated that the chimneys are not repairable, and that the materials proposed to use on the dormers is appropriate.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the staff's denial as the proposed project does not comply with the Soulard Historic District Standards, which require that dormers shall not be removed or altered. The motion was made by Ald Phyliss Young, and 2nd by Dave Richardson. Commissioners Mary Johnson, John Burse and Anthony Robinson opposed the motion. The motion passed 4 to 3.

5. 2010.0025 4260 WESTMINSTER PL. CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DIST.

Owner: Core Holdings LLC-Ryan Kirby

Applicant: Bellon Wrecking & Salvage Co.

DEMOLITION PLAN:

Appeal of a staff denial to demolish a brick commercial building.

PROCEEDINGS:

Bob Bettis presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. He also entered into the record Enabling Ordinance #64689 & Central West End Ord. #56768. He recommended that the Preservation Board uphold the staff denial of the application for demolition, as it does not meet the criteria for approval under the ordinance. The application was denied by the Cultural Resources Office as the building is a contributing resource to the Central West End Historic District and because no plan for redevelopment of the site was submitted. The building had not been condemned by the Department of Public Safety.

Testifying in support of the demolition were:

Ryan Kirby-Core Holdings LLC c/o Champion Bank

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

MARCH 22ND, 2010

Page 5 of 7

Darryl Scott-Representative of Champion Bank
Kent McPeck- Structural Engineer
Steven Willman, neighborhood resident
Colleen Peters, neighborhood resident
Matt Rustidge, neighborhood resident

Testifying in opposition of the demolition were:
Andrew Weil of Landmarks Association of St. Louis
Jeff Vines, neighborhood resident

Kate Shea, Director of the Cultural Resources Office testified explaining Enabling Ordinance #64689.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the staff's denial as the demolition did not meet the requirements of the Central West End Historic District or Enabling Ordinance #64689. The motion was made by Dave Richardson and 2nd by Mary Johnson. Anthony Robinson abstained. The motion passed 5 to 1.

6. 2010.0054 6102 MICHIGAN AVE. PRESERVATION REVIEW DIST

Owner: James B. Fritz
Applicant: Flexton Contracting

DEMOLITION PLAN: Appeal of a staff denial to demolish a 2 story two family brick dwelling located in the 3rd extension of the Carondelet National Register District.

PROCEEDINGS: Kate Shea presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. She entered into the record a write up of a proposed garden submitted by the owner, Title 24 and the agenda . She stated that a visual inspection of the building showed no structural defects and is in sound condition under the ordinance and that no redevelopment plan exists for the site. Ms. Shea recommended the Board uphold the staff's denial as the demolition does not meet the ordinance criteria for demolition.

Mr. James B. Fritz, property owner testified on his own behalf. He entered into the record photos of the interior & exterior showing that the building is heavily fire damaged and is deteriorated and falling. He stated the building is unsound.

Andrew Weil of the Landmarks Association of St. Louis testified opposing the demolition.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

MARCH 22ND, 2010

Page 6 of 7

BOARD ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the staff's denial. The Board found that the property is a contributing resource to the Carondelet National Register District and that the use of Tax Credits could assist in the renovation of the property. The motion was made by Ald. Phyliss Young and 2nd by John Burse. The motion passed unanimously.

7. 2010.0189 5759 WATERMAN BLVD. SKINKER-DeBALIVIERE HIST. DIST.

Owner: Robert Simpson

Applicant: Unitherm Window Sales-Jeff Greenburg

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of a staff denial to retain 3 vinyl windows installed without a permit.

PROCEEDINGS: Bob Bettis presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surround area. He entered into the record Enabling Ordinance #64689 and Ord.#57688 and the agenda. Mr. Bettis recommended that the Preservation Board uphold the staff's denial as the installed vinyl windows do not meet the Skinker-DeBaliviere Historic District Standards. On the main facade, the owner should be instructed to install appropriate replacement windows, and to remove all wrapping on sills, brickmold, and mullions.

Robert Simpson, owner of the property testified on his own behalf and ask that the Board grant a variance due to economic hardship.

Ms. Gail Simpson Brown, daughter of the owner testified on behalf of the project.

BOARD ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to defer a decision until April to afford the owners a chance to work out a compromise with the contractor.

The Board found that:

- 1) the windows were installed without a permit and do not replicate the appearance of the originals.
- 2) that there was evidence of economic hardship.
- 3) And that the installed vinyl windows do not comply with the Skinker-DeBaliviere Historic District Standards.

The motion was made by Commissioner John Burse, and 2nd by Mike Killeen. The motion passed unanimously.

8. 2010.0190 1801 PARK AVE. LAFAYETTE SQ. HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: 1801 Park Associates LLC

Applicant: Lafayette Fire Company No. 1-Charles Hoffmann

COMMERCIAL PLAN: Appeal of a staff denial to retain 3 wall signs & one non-illuminated projecting sign on a commercial building installed without a permit.

PROCEEDINGS: Jan Cameron presented a PowerPoint presentation of the site and surrounding area. She entered into the record Enabling Ordinance #64689 and the Lafayette Square Ord.#63327, the St. Louis City revised Code Chapter 26.68 sign Ordinance along with photos submitted by the applicant. Ms. Cameron stated that the property is zoned F, and based on precedence she recommended that the applicant/owner be allowed one (1) sign be placed wherever the applicant wished and that the blade sign be approved and that the two (2) other signs be removed.

Charles Hoffman, representative for property owner testified on behalf of the owner.

J. Watson Scott, Chairman of the Development Committee of the Lafayette Square Restoration Committee testified in support of the signs.

BOARD ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the staff's denial and grant a variance to allow the three (3) window signs and the blade sign to remain based on the economic hardship in making the business successful. The motion was made by Commissioner Dave Richardson and 2nd by Mike Killeen. The motion passed unanimously.