

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

MARCH 26, 2012

Page 1 of 7

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES
MARCH 26, 2012**

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT

Richard Callow, Chairman
Anthony Robinson
Alderman Antonio French
David Visintainer
Michael Killeen
Nathaniel Johnson

CULTURAL RESOURCES STAFF PRESENT

Betsy H. Bradley, Director
Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator
Bob Bettis, Preservation Planner
Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner
Adona Buford, Administrative Assistant

Board Member David Visintainer moved to approve the February 27, 2012 minutes. Mr. Killeen seconded. The minutes were approved.

Mr. Visintainer then moved to approve the current agenda. Mr. Killeen seconded the motion. The current agenda was approved.

PRELIMINARY REVIEWS

A. - C. Preliminary Reviews of eight (8) demolition applications and redevelopment in a Preservation Review District.

Owner: Medline Corporation
Applicant: David McGuire-Saint Louis Zoo

2012.0233	6161 BERTHOLD AVENUE	Gerhold Hall School of Nursing
2012.0234	6216 OAKLAND AVENUE	Centennial Pavilion
2012.0236	6150 OAKLAND AVENUE	Boiler House
2012.0237	6150 OAKLAND AVENUE	Hampton/Oakland Garage
2012.0238	6150 OAKLAND AVENUE	Chapel
2012.0239	6150 OAKLAND AVENUE	The Sisters' Home
2012.0240	6150 OAKLAND AVENUE	South Building
2012.0241	6150 OAKLAND AVENUE	Main Building

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

MARCH 26, 2012

Page 2 of 7

PROCEEDINGS:

Cultural Resources Office Director Betsy H. Bradley made a presentation about the property and the proposed redevelopment.

Win Reed, representing the Saint Louis Zoo, described the Zoo's interest in the property and plans for its redevelopment.

Alderman Scott Ogilvie reported on Medline's unsuccessful attempts to find a hospital tenant for the property and the reasons he supports the Saint Louis Zoo's acquisition and use of the property. He expressed interest in the retention and reuse of the Gerhold Hall School of Nursing building at 6161 Berthold.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Board found that:

- the buildings that comprise the former Forest Park Hospital complex, which were built over the period of time of 1929 to 1996, are located in a Preservation Review District and therefore the criteria in City Ordinance #64832 apply to the proposed demolition;
- the Hospital, Boiler House, Sisters' Home, Gerhold Hall School of Nursing, South Wing of the Hospital, and Chapel comprise the historic core of the facility developed by the Deaconess Society affiliated with the German United Church of Christ denomination, the local chapter of which was organized in 1889;
- the period of significance for the facility on Oakland Avenue is from 1930 through 1956, the period of time that the first purpose-built facility was developed and expanded to include a School of Nursing;
- the construction of an addition between the wings of the original hospital building; a library addition to the Sisters' Home; the Medical Office Building and Centennial Building additions to the main hospital complex; as well as the façade redesign introduced during the 1980s to the original Hospital and the South Wing, have given the complex the character of a modern hospital complex and one that can no longer convey the character and scope of the historic period;

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

MARCH 26, 2012

Page 3 of 7

- the complex as an entity would not be eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places and is not a High-Merit property;
- the buildings that comprise the complex are Sound in terms of the ordinance although the Hampton–Oakland Garage, proposed for demolition, has been condemned and has not been in use;
- the hospital complex does not have potential for re-use through a historic rehabilitation project as it is a property determined not to be eligible for listing in the National Register and therefore no owner would have the opportunity to use National and State Historic Tax Credits in a rehabilitation project;
- the complex has a stand-alone quality due to its size and location, and therefore the demolition of most of its buildings would not affect a discreet block-front although the character of the complex would be significantly altered;
- in the immediate future, the Saint Louis Zoo plans to use the property to locate some of its research functions in the Medical Office Building and to use the parking garage south of Berthold to relieve the demand for parking in the Zoo parking lot and in adjacent areas of Forest Park and the Zoo states that it will work with neighbors and stakeholders to develop a long-term redevelopment plan for the parcel;
- although it is not commonly controlled property, the hospital complex is the only large, already assembled parcel in close proximity to the Zoo; and
- the buildings proposed for demolition are not accessory structures.

ACTION:

The Preservation Board concluded that the eight buildings proposed for demolition: the Main Hospital, South Hospital Building, Sisters' Home, Chapel, Boiler House, Hampton Oakland Garage, and Centennial Pavilion, and Gerhold Hall School of Nursing are not High Merit Buildings in terms of the Ordinance and that the proposed demolition of these buildings would not have an undesired effect on the neighborhood and its urban design.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

MARCH 26, 2012

Page 4 of 7

The Board also concluded that the redevelopment plan would make use of two buildings on the site and would be based on collaborative planning to meet the needs of the Saint Louis Zoo and that the Gerhold Hall School of Nursing is a building that should receive additional study to determine its potential for reuse in the redevelopment plan as a way to acknowledge the long history of the Deaconess Society on the site.

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to approve the eight buildings proposed for demolition with the request that the applicant further consider the potential reuse of the Gerhold Hall School of Nursing. The motion was made by Board member Michael Killeen and seconded by Mr. Visintainer. The motion passed with five Board Members voting in favor of the motion.

D. 2012.0203 2380-36 McNAIR BENTON PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Joel & Stephanie Steele

Architect: Jeff Day and Associates

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct a two-story single-family house on two vacant parcels.

PROCEEDINGS: Jan Cameron presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. She recommended that the Preservation Board grant preliminary approval with the stipulation that the final design details and full architectural drawings be submitted for staff review.

Ms. Cameron stated that the proposed building is generally in compliance with the Benton Park Historic District standards, with some revisions to exterior detailing:

- the foundation stone veneer and water table should return on each side elevation the same distance as the cornice/parapet;
- the brick railing at the front porch should carry a stone or pre-cast cap in place of the rowlocks indicated on the elevation;

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

MARCH 26, 2012

Page 5 of 7

- that the second story entry to the front balcony should be similar in detail to the front façade windows, with a segmental arch in place of the flat soldier arch; over the main entry the form is acceptable, as most historic buildings had similar flat arches or lintels under a porch roof; and
- that the windows of the side elevations should have flat soldier arches and limestone or pre-cast sills. Pre-cast or stone lintels as shown on the south elevation are not appropriate.

Joel Steele, property owner, testified on his own behalf and submitted photos of elevations and model examples.

FINDINGS OF FACT:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed new building conforms to the requirements of the Benton Park Historic District Standards;
- the project design is preliminary and details regarding railings, windows and door details have not yet been finalized;
- the applicant has agreed to work with the Cultural Resources Office to further refine elements of the design and;
- that no comment regarding the proposal was received from the Alderwoman of the ward.

ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval to the project concept. The Board directed the applicant to continue to work with the Cultural Resources Office to refine elements and details of the final design. The motion was made by Board Member David Visintainer and seconded by Mr. Killeen. The motion passed with five Board Members voting in favor of the motion.

E. 2012.0352 1300-02 DOLMAN LAFAYETTE SQUARE HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Jeff Winzerling

Applicant/Architect: Paul Hohmann

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

MARCH 26, 2012

Page 6 of 7

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct two attached townhouses.

PROCEEDINGS: Andrea Gagen presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. She recommended that the Preservation Board grant preliminary approval to the project concept, with the condition that the Cultural Resources Office staff approve final drawings, details, finishes and exterior materials.

Ms. Gagen stated that the proposal generally complies with the existing Lafayette Square Historic District Standards and adheres to the proposed revised standards as well. There are some details of the proposal, such as foundation materials, cornice details and brick color, which will be submitted for review by the Cultural Resources prior to final construction documents. She also submitted into the record a letter in support of the project from the Lafayette Square Development Committee.

Paul Hohmann, the architect for the project, testified on the owner's behalf.

FINDINGS OF FACTS: The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed design substantially conforms to the requirements of the Lafayette Square Historic District Standards;
- that the Design Example used as a basis for the proposed design is appropriate for the site;
- the project design is preliminary and details regarding the cornice, foundation and other elements have not yet been finalized;
- plans have been submitted to the Development Committee of the Lafayette Square Restoration Committee, which has indicated their support for the project; and
- that no comment regarding the proposal was received from the Alderman of the ward.

ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

MARCH 26, 2012

Page 7 of 7

preliminary approval to the project, with the stipulation that the final design, details, finishes and exterior materials be reviewed by the Cultural Resources Office. The motion was made by Board Member Anthony Robinson and seconded by Mr. Visintainer. The motion passed with five Board Members voting in favor of the motion.

SPECIAL AGENDA ITEMS

F. Proposed Preservation Review District in Wards 14, 18 and 22.

ACTION: The Preservation Board determined that the report of the Cultural Resources Office surveys of the areas, completed at the request of the aldermen, indicated that the proposed new districts met the criteria to become Preservation Review Districts. The Director of the Cultural Resources Office was directed to report such findings to the Planning Commission and to the Board of Aldermen in the form of a draft ordinance. The motion was made by Board Member Mike Killeen and seconded by Mr. Robinson. The motion passed with five Board Members voting in favor of the motion.

G. Expansion of the Hyde Park Certified Local Historic District in Ward 3

ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board that the areas proposed to be added to the Hyde Park Certified Local Historic District meet the criteria for designation and that the Director of the Cultural Resources Office should forward the petition to the Planning Commission and to the Board of Public Service for their review. The motion was made by Board Member David Visintainer and seconded by Mr. Robinson. The motion passed five Board Members voting in favor of the motion.

A motion to adjourn was made by Mr. Robinson and seconded by Mr. Visintainer.
Meeting adjourned.