

CITY OF ST. LOUIS
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES
MARCH 28TH, 2011

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT

Richard Callow, Chairman

David Richardson

Mike Killeen

Anthony Robinson

Dave Visintainer

Ald. Phyllis Young

CULTURAL RESOURCES STAFF PRESENT

Betsy H. Bradley, Director

Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator

Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner

Bob Bettis, Preservation Planner

Adona Buford, Administrative Assistant

A motion to approve the minutes of the February 28, 2011 meeting was made by Board Member David Visintainer and seconded by Mr. Richardson. The motion passed unanimously.

PRELIMINARY REVIEWS

1. 2011.0351 4231 McPHERSON CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Invaluable Solutions- Becky Mumma

Applicant: Thompson Design Group

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review of an application to remove a chimney.

PROCEEDINGS: Betsy Bradley presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. She recommended that the Preservation Board deny the application as the removal of the chimney would not comply with the Central West End Historic District Standards. The chimney rises near the front of the house and is a character-defining feature highly visible from the street. Ms. Bradley also provided an overview of the

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

MARCH 28 2011

Page 2 of 6

rehabilitation project as planned by the current property owner. Since this work requires new roof framing and sheathing, the owner has been working with Cultural Resources Office staff on a roof design that will maintain the existing roof's complex hipped form at the street end and be a gable roof at the north end in order to provide more living space on the third floor.

Ms. Becky Mumma, property owner testified on her own behalf. She asked that the Preservation Board grant a variance to allow her to tear down the chimney and rebuild the wall. Ms. Mumma presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating severe fire damage, and bowing in the chimney which is pulling away from the house. She stated the chimney was not part of the original historic design, and that the chimney was an obstruction to the driveway.

Mr. John Boerdeaua, a neighbor, testified in support of a variance for the chimney.

FINDINGS OF FACT:

The Board found that:
the property had been recently damaged by fire and needs an extensive rehabilitation project as planned by the current property owner;
the Central West End Association Planning and Development Committee supports the proposed changes to the roof due to the fire damage and need for reconstruction; and
the chimney projects into the narrow existing driveway on the 4231 lot in the area where the adjacent dwelling makes the passageway only 91 inches wide.

ACTION:

Board Member David Richardson moved to grant a variance and give preliminary approval to remove the chimney due to the need to reconstruct the wall along which the chimney rises and narrow width of the driveway. Mr. Killeen seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

MARCH 28 2011

Page 3 of 6

2. 2011.0357 1111-13 DOLMAN LAFAYETTE SQUARE HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Land Reutilization Authority (LRA)

Applicant: Whalen Custom Homes

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review of an application to construct a new 2-story detached single-family dwelling.

PROCEEDINGS: Jan Cameron presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. She recommended that the Preservation Board grant preliminary approval subject to the details/modifications being worked out with Staff, and that three sides be brick.

Mr. Michael Whalen, owner and President of Whalen Homes testified on his own behalf. He stated that he has agreed to make all of the recommended modifications to the proposal and will submit it for final approval.

Mr. Ryan Weis stated under oath that he is the property owner.

FINDINGS OF FACT: The Board found that:
the proposal complies with the Lafayette Square Historic District Standards in the requirements of scale, exterior design and detailing; however, window proportions, floor-to-ceiling heights and exterior materials indicated on the drawings presented at the meeting do not comply with the Standards;
Because of the width of the side yard between this building and the house under construction at 1117 Dolman Street, the north elevation will be visible and is considered an Intermediate Façade under the definition of the Standards; and
the contractor has agreed to conform to all requirements not currently represented on the drawings.

ACTION: Board Member David Visintainer moved to grant preliminary approval to construct a new single family

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

MARCH 28, 2011

Page 4 of 6

dwelling subject to the details/modifications being worked out with Staff. Mr. Richardson seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

APPEALS OF STAFF DENIALS

3. 2011.0209 1847 S. 10TH ST. SOULARD HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: James W. & Lorene A. Mazdra

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of a staff denial of an application for a building permit to retain a front door installed without a permit.

PROCEEDINGS: Andrea Gagen presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. She submitted into the record Enabling Ordinance #64689 and Soulard Ordinance #62832. Ms. Gagen recommended that the Preservation Board deny the Building permit application of the front door installation as it did not meet the Soulard Historic District Standards. It is likely that the original door on the building was a four-panel door without glass.

Mr. James Mazdra, owner of the property, testified on his own behalf. He submitted pages of photos illustrating doors in the neighborhood that were not four-panel wood units. Mr. Mazdra stated the door was installed in June 2009 and that he wasn't cited until November of 2010.

Mr. Bob Bettis testified that he the owner was cited in November 2010 but that Mr. Mazdra hadn't applied for a permit until February 23, 2011, which was then denied.

FINDINGS OF FACT: The Board found that:
the property is located in the Soulard Historic District;
the project was reviewed under the criteria of Ordinance #62382, 204.1 Doors at Public and Intermediate Facades;
the door was installed without a permit, and
the door does not meet the Soulard Historic District Standards as it does not replicate the existing door and no Model Example had been provided.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

MARCH 28 2011

Page 5 of 6

ACTION:

Board Member Anthony Robinson moved to overturn the staff's denial and allow the installed door because the owner wasn't cited for more than a year. Mr. David Richardson seconded the motion. The vote was unfavorable and the motion failed.

Board Member David Visintainer moved to deny the installed door as it does not meet the Souldard Historic District Standards. Mr. Killeen seconded the motion. Board Members Anthony Robinson and Dave Richardson opposed the motion. The motion passed 3 to 2.

4. 2011.0195 3843 SHENANDOAH SHAW HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: David Bassler

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of a staff denial of an application for a building permit to replace windows.

PROCEEDINGS: Bob Bettis presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. He submitted into the record Enabling Ordinance #64689 and Shaw Ordinance #59400. Mr. Bettis recommended that the Preservation Board uphold the staff's denial as the installed windows did not comply with the Shaw Historic District Standards. He stated that the change from a large double-hung window to a fixed light on the first floor is especially noticeable as an alteration. The replacement windows have adversely affected the building's historic character.

Mr. David Bassler, property owner testified on his own behalf. He submitted photos of similar windows in the area as well as an image of the first floor window with a horizontal muntin installed to simulate a meeting rail. He also produced three years of tax returns to verify economic hardship.

FINDINGS OF FACT: The Board found that the installed windows are vinyl and do not comply with the Shaw Historic District Standards. The Board also found that the owner provided sufficient evidence of economic hardship.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

MARCH 28 2011

Page 6 of 6

ACTION:

Board Member David Richardson moved to overturn the staff's denial and grant a variance to allow the installed windows to remain, due to economic hardship. Mr. Visintainer seconded the motion. Board Members Anthony Robinson and Phyllis Young opposed the motion. The motion passed 3 to 2.