

CITY OF ST. LOUIS
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES
APRIL 23, 2012

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT

Richard Callow, Chairman
Anthony Robinson
Melanie Fathman
David Visintainer
Michael Killeen
Nathaniel Johnson
Erin Wright

CULTURAL RESOURCES STAFF PRESENT

Betsy H. Bradley, Director
Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator
Bob Bettis, Preservation Planner
Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner
Adona Buford, Administrative Assistant

Board Member Michael Killeen moved to approve the March 26, 2012 minutes.
Mr. Johnson seconded the motion. The minutes were approved.

PRELIMINARY REVIEWS

A. 2012.0488 2127 UTAH ST. BENTON PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Erlinda Villamayor

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to replace a part of the rear brick wall of a two-story commercial/residential building with E.F.I.S., an exterior finish installation system.

PROCEEDINGS: Bob Bettis presented a PowerPoint presentation that illustrated the property and the proposed repair. He recommended that the Preservation Board deny the Preliminary Review application as the proposed work is not in compliance with the Benton Park Local Historic District Standards. Mr. Bettis stated that because the

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

APRIL 23, 2012

Page 2 of 8

property is a corner building, the section of the rear wall to be reconstructed is quite visible from the street and is only a few feet from the sidewalk, a distance at which materials are readily identifiable.

Erlinda Villamayor, the owner, testified on her own behalf. She submitted photographs of various stone-fronted buildings as model examples, work estimates and a statement of economic hardship.

Architect Peter Hammond testified in support of the owner.

FINDINGS OF FACT:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed work is not in compliance with the Benton Park Historic District Standards which require that reconstructed masonry wall shall be solid brick masonry, concrete block back-up with masonry exterior, or masonry veneer on metal or wood studs, and that masonry thickness and coursing shall match the original;
- the owner applied for a permit in 2010 to repair a bulge in the rear wall but never completed the work once the brick was removed;
- the owner submitted an estimate of \$4,000 to relay the center of the wall in brick and an estimate to install E.I.F.S. to be around \$1,800;
- the owner had not explored the use of siding in place of E.I.F.S.;
- the applicant made a claim of evidence of economic hardship and submitted evidence on her behalf;
- that there was no comment from the Ward Alderman or the Benton Park Neighborhood Association regarding the project; and
- that use of other traditional and more compatible materials could be used to face the center of the rear wall, at a cost maybe less than E.F.I.S.

ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to deny preliminary approval to the Applicant. The motion was made by Board Member Mike Killeen and seconded by

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

APRIL 23, 2012

Page 3 of 8

Ms. Fathman. The motion passed four to one with Board Member David Richardson opposing the motion.

B. 2012.0489 4274 FLAD AVENUE SHAW HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: L.R.A. (Land Reutilization Authority)

Applicant: Paramount Properties – Kyle Miller

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct a two-story single family house with attached rear garage on a vacant lot

PROCEEDINGS: Jan Cameron presented a PowerPoint presentation that included the proposed site plan and drawings of the new building. She recommended that the Preservation Board grant preliminary approval of the general design with the stipulations that an entrance porch be added to the façade, that additional aspects of the design be altered, and that final details and materials be approved by the Cultural Resources Office. Ms. Cameron stated that the Cultural Resources Office had not received any comments on the project from the Alderman or any neighborhood group.

Kyle Miller, the developer of the project, testified on his own behalf and noted the presence of houses with recessed entrances in the Shaw Neighborhood.

Craig Shields, Shaw Neighborhood Housing Corporation, testified in support of the project, but requested that the window sizes on the front elevation be adjusted.

Stephanie Naecker, also with the Shaw Neighborhood Housing Corporation, testified in support of the project.

FINDINGS OF FACT: The Preservation Board found that:

- the existing house at 4274 Flad Avenue has been declared an emergency condemnation by the Building Division and is in the process of being demolished;
- the proposed new house conforms with the requirements of the Shaw Neighborhood historic district standards in height, location, and exterior materials;
- the design does not conform with the standards in the sizes of openings on the front elevation; a proposed

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

APRIL 23, 2012

Page 4 of 8

basement egress on the west façade; and in the fact that house will have a recessed entry and not a projecting porch as is characteristic of adjacent buildings;

- there are some examples of recessed entries on the street and elsewhere in the Shaw Neighborhood; and
- that the Shaw Neighborhood Housing Corporation is in support of the project.

ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval to the project with the recessed entry as proposed, with the stipulation that the front façade windows are increased in size and the basement egress window be relocated to the rear of the house. The motion was made by Board Member Erin Wright and seconded by Ms. Fathman. The motion passed six to zero.

C. 2012.0498 1017-19 GEYER AVENUE SOULARD HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Mohammed Orthman

Applicant: William H. Watkins

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

Preliminary review to rehabilitate two attached one-story houses.

PROCEEDINGS:

Jan Cameron presented a PowerPoint presentation that included evidence of the condition of the buildings, the proposed site plan and drawings of the new roof. She recommended that the Preservation Board grant preliminary approval to the project with the condition that the front dormer be replicated. Ms. Cameron stated that the current proposal represents a compromise between the requirements of the standards and the necessary replacement of the roofs.

The Cultural Resources Office had not received any comments concerning the project from any neighborhood group or from the Alderman.

Applicant William H. Watkins, the architect for the project, testified on his own behalf.

FINDINGS OF FACT:

The Preservation Board found that:

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

APRIL 23, 2012

Page 5 of 8

- the buildings at 1017-19 Geyer Avenue are contributing buildings to the Soulard Neighborhood Local and National Register Districts;
- both buildings are in extremely deteriorated condition, requiring total replacement of the existing roof structures;
- the rehabilitation generally complies with the Soulard Historic District standards, except for replacement of the existing roof structures;
- the proposed truss roof, which will alter the existing compound roof slopes does not comply with the Standards;
- the architect has agreed to replicate the original dormer in design and location; and that
- there had been no comments received about the project from any neighborhood group or from the Alderman.

ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval to the project by a variance to the Standards to allow the alterations to the roofs, with the stipulation that the existing dormer be replicated. The motion was made by Board Member Melanie Fathman and seconded by Mr. Robinson. The motion passed six to zero.

APPEALS OF DENIALS

D. 2011.2136 4032 N. 22ND STREET HYDE PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: House of God Church of the Living God Pentecostal of Missouri

Applicant: Quinton Richardson

COMMERCIAL PLAN:

Appeal of a denial to construct an accessible handicap ramp on the front façade of a church.

PROCEEDINGS:

Andrea Gagen presented a PowerPoint presentation that included images of the church, the proposed site plan and drawings of the proposed ramp. She submitted into the record Enabling Ordinance #64689 and Hyde Park Ordinance #57484. Ms. Gagen recommended that the Preservation Board uphold the Director's denial of the project as currently proposed. The plan would destroy paired lancet windows and their decorative terra-cotta

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

APRIL 23, 2012

Page 6 of 8

arches on the front façade where the new door and ramp would be placed.

Testifying in support of the owner was Quinton Richardson, applicant/architect for the project, Bishop James A. Stewart, Sheldon Henderson, Deacon Cyrus Wea, Bishop Danny Taylor, Deacon David Taylor, Elder Beatrice Horton and Elder Carmen Kepyra.

FINDINGS OF FACT:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed design would destroy important architectural details of the building;
- there may be other options that would have less of an impact on the building;
- the Director of the Office of the Disabled was identified as an important resource, who could be involved in commenting on the project; and that
- no comment regarding the proposal was received from the Alderman of the Ward.

ACTION:

The Preservation Board continued the hearing on this Agenda item and it will appear on next month's agenda so that, in the interim, the Applicant has the opportunity to explore its options. The applicant agreed to waive the time limits for his appeal to be heard. The motion was made by Board Member Anthony Robinson and seconded by Mr. Richardson. The motion passed six to zero.

E. 2012.0080 3000-02 LEMP AVENUE BENTON PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Paul Christopher Beyer

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

Appeal of the Director's denial to construct a 1 ½-story garage/carriage house in the side yard.

PROCEEDINGS:

Board Member Michael Killeen recused himself from this portion of the hearing.

Jan Cameron presented a PowerPoint presentation that included images of the property, the proposed site plan and drawings of the proposed building. She submitted into the record Ordinance #64689 and Benton Park Ordinance#

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

APRIL 23, 2012

Page 7 of 8

67175 and submitted a letter in support of the project from 9th Ward Alderman Kenneth Ortmann. Ms. Cameron recommended that the Preservation Board uphold the Director's denial until either the proposed garage is repositioned or until a Model Example is submitted to comply with the Benton Park Historic District Standards for new construction. She stated that the scale of the proposed building is much larger than is typical of garages and even carriage houses in the neighborhood.

Chris Beyer, owner, testified on his own behalf. He submitted a letter in support of the project from 9th Ward Alderman Kenneth Ortmann and a petition in support of the project, signed by five immediate neighbors.

Ray Simon, the architect for the project, testified on behalf of the applicant.

FINDINGS OF FACT:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed building is located in the center of the side yard, not behind the main building or at the rear of the property, as is characteristic of historic garages in the district;
- the design of the garage does not replicate any model example, particularly in its scale and its steeply-pitched roof and over-scaled dormers;
- the model examples submitted on behalf of the project do not qualify as model examples under the definition of the ordinance; however, the photos prove that there are a number of ancillary buildings in the district that are located in side yards;
- the Benton Park standards do not specifically require that a garage be directly behind the main building; and
- that the Alderman and several neighbors have indicated their support for the project.

ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the Director's denial and allow the garage to be placed on the site as proposed and directed the applicant to work with the Cultural Resources Office to revise the roof slope, dormer and other aspects to conform to a model example. The motion was made by Board Member David Richardson

and seconded by Ms. Fathman. The motion passed five to zero.

SPECIAL AGENDA ITEMS

Nominations to the National Register of Historic Places

F. 3207 Washington Boulevard – Central States Life Insurance Company Building

ACTION: It was decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the Missouri State Historic Preservation Office that the Central States Life Insurance Company Building meets the requirements of National Register Criterion C for Architecture. The motion was made by Board Member Melanie Fathman and seconded by Mr. Killeen. The motion passed six to zero.

G. 1218-24 N. 15th Street - Star Bucket Pump Company Building

ACTION: It was decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the Missouri State Historic Preservation Office that the Star Bucket Pump Company Building meets the requirements of National Register Criterion A for Industry and Invention. The motion was made by Board Member Erin Wright and seconded by Ms. Fathman. The motion passed six to zero.

H. 2500- 2614 N. Broadway – N. Broadway Glass and Plow Warehouse District

ACTION: It was decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the Missouri State Historic Preservation Office that the – No. Broadway Glass and Plow Warehouse District meets the requirements of National Register Criterion A in the area of Commerce. The motion was made by Board Member Michael Killeen and seconded by Mr. Johnson. Board Member Anthony Robinson abstained from the vote. The motion passed with five members voting in favor.