

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES
APRIL 26TH, 2010**

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT

Richard Callow-Chairman

David Richardson

Anthony Robinson

Mike Killeen

Ald. Phyliss Young

John Burse

Dave Visintainer

CULTURAL RESOURCES STAFF PRESENT

Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator

Bob Bettis, Preservation Planner

Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner

Adona Buford, Administrative Assistant

Minutes from March 22nd, 2010 were approved.

SPECIAL AGENDA ITEMS

Nominations to the National Register of Historic Places

- ACTION:** It was the decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the State Historic Preservation Office that the:
1. St. Louis News Company Building at 1008-10 Locust St., meets the requirements of National Register Criterion C for Architecture.
 2. Chippewa Trust Company Bldg. at 3801-05 Chippewa St., meets the requirements of National Register Criterion A and C.
 3. Father Dunne's News Boys Home & Protectorate at 3010 Washington Ave., meets the requirements of National Register Criterion A for Architecture
 4. Berry Motor Car Service Bldg. at 2220 Washington Ave., meets the requirements of National Register Criterion A and C and
 5. Oak Hill Historic District -(Roughly bounded by Gustine, Arsenal, alley west of Portis Ave. and Humphrey St.) meets the requirement of criterion A in the areas of Community Planning & Development, and C for Architecture.
- The motion was made by Commissioner John Burse and seconded by Dave Visintainer. The motion passed.

PRELIMINARY REVIEW

6. 2010.0315 1800 S. 8TH ST. SOULARD HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Choendal Martin
Applicant: Quinton Richardson

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct an attached garage with roof deck and new curb cut.

PROCEEDINGS: Andrea Gagen presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. Ms. Gagen recommended the Preservation Board deny the garage and roof deck as they do not comply with the Soulard Historic District Standards She stated that the roof deck is not located over a private facade and would be highly visible from the street. The proposed railings are not appropriate due to the scroll work on the balusters, and a model example had not been submitted.

Mr. Quinton Richardson, representative for the owner testified on behalf of the project.

BOARD ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to deny preliminary approval as proposed as the project does not comply with the Soulard Historic District Standards and a model example had not been submitted. The motion was made by Ald. Phyliss Young and seconded by John Burse. The motion passed.

APPEALS OF STAFF DENIALS

7. 2010.0189 5759 WATERMAN BLVD. CENTRAL WEST END H.D.

Owner: Robert Simpson
Applicant: Unitherm Window Sales- Jeff Greenburg

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Continuance of an appeal of a staff denial to retain 3 vinyl windows installed without a permit.

PREVIOUS ACTION: On March 22nd, 2010, after hearing testimony from the owners, the Cultural Resource's staff and the window contractor, the Preservation Board voted to defer a decision until the April meeting to afford the owners a chance to work out a compromise with the contractor.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

APRIL 26TH, 2010

Page 3 of 7

PROCEEDINGS: Bob Bettis presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. Mr. Bettis recommended the Preservation Board again uphold the staff's denial as the installed vinyl windows do not meet the Skinker-DeBaliviere Historic District Standards and that the owner be instructed to install appropriate replacement windows, and to remove all wrapping on sills, brick mold and mullions on the front façade.

Mr. Robert Simpson, owner of the property testified on his own behalf and submitted financial statements into the record demonstrating financial hardship.

City Attorney Barbara Birkicht reviewed the financial statements submitted by the owner pertaining to economic hardship.

BOARD ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the staff's denial and grant a variance so that the owner may retain the installed windows. The Board determined that there was sufficient evidence that the cost of installing the new windows would constitute an economic hardship for the owner. The motion was made by John Burse and seconded by Dave Visintainer. The motion passed unanimously.

8. 2010.0358 3840 CLEVELAND AVE. SHAW HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Veronica & Dennis A. Ware

Applicant: Bob Taylor

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of a staff denial to replace a front door.

PROCEEDINGS: Andrea Gagen presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. She submitted into the record Ordinances #64689 and #59400. Ms. Gagen recommended the Preservation Board uphold the staff's denial as the entry door/transom does not comply with the Shaw Historic District Standards. In addition to the narrow transom glass, the proportions of the transom to the door height is not what it would have been historically.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

APRIL 26TH, 2010

Page 4 of 7

Mr. Dennis Ware, owner of the property testified on behalf of the project. He stated he didn't know the property is located in a historic district.

Mr. Robert Taylor, contractor for the owner testified on behalf of the project.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the staff's denial as the work does not comply with the Shaw Historic District standards. The Board did instruct the applicant/owner to work with the staff to come up with a solution. The motion was made by Commissioner Mike Killeen and seconded by Dave Visintainer. The motion passed unanimously.

9. 2010.0239 6169R PERSHING AVE. SKINKER-DeBALIVIERE H.D.

Owner: Washington University Quadrangle Housing

Applicant: Aalco Wrecking Company

DEMOLITION PLAN:

Appeal of a staff denial to demolish a 1 story six car brick garage demolished without a permit.

PREVIOUS ACTION:

At its March 22nd, 2010 regular hearing, the Preservation Board voted to uphold the staff's denial of the demolition permit application. The Board found that prior to its demolition the garage appeared to have been a contributing resource to the local historic district. The Board also found that proper procedures were not followed and the garage was demolished without a permit.

PROCEEDINGS:

Commissioner John Burse recused himself from this portion of the hearing.

Jan Cameron presented a Powerpoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. She recommended that the Preservation Board grant the owner's appeal and approve the demolition subject to landscaping as proposed. She entered into the record Ordinances #64689 and #57688. She also presented a new site plan, a photo of a landscape wall submitted by the owner and a letter from Ald. Lyda Krewson concurring with the Cultural

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

APRIL 26TH, 2010

Page 5 of 7

Resources Office’s decision to issue a demolition permit as the building had already been demolished.

Mary Campbell, Assistant Vice Chancellor for Real Estate for Washington University, testified on behalf of the demolition. She submitted into the record a letter of support from the Historic District Committee of the Skinker-DeBaliviere Neighborhood Association, signed by Katie Kurtz and Nancy Holmann.

Kent Allen, of the Washington University Quadrangle Housing Corporation, testified on behalf of the demolition.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to rescind its’ original denial of the demolition of the garage. The motion was made by Commissioner Dave Richardson and seconded by Ald. Phyliss Young. The motion was passed with Commissioner John Burse abstaining.

Secondly it was the decision of the Preservation Board to approve demolition of the garage, subject to the landscape plan submitted. This motion was made by Commissioner Dave Richardson and seconded by Dave Visintainer. The motion passed Commissioner John Burse abstaining.

- | | | | |
|-----|-----------|------------------|---------------------------|
| 10. | 2010.0263 | 2612 CHOUTEAU | PRESERVATION REVIEW DIST. |
| 11. | 2010.0264 | 2614-16 CHOUTEAU | PRESERVATION REVIEW DIST. |
| 12. | 2010.0265 | 2618-22 CHOUTEAU | PRESERVATION REVIEW DIST. |
| 13. | 2010.0275 | 2626-30 CHOUTEAU | PRESERVATION REVIEW DIST. |

Owner: Crown 40 Inc.

Applicant: Chuck’s Brick & Demo – Charles Mace

DEMOLITION PLAN: Appeal of a staff denial to wreck four (4) commercial - industrial brick buildings.

PROCEEDINGS: Jan Cameron presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding areas. She entered into the record Ordinances #64689, #64832 and several letters from concerned neighbors and citizens opposing the demolitions. Ms. Cameron recommended the Preservation Board uphold the staff’s denial of the demolition of these four commercial/industrial buildings as the owner had not met the Ordinance standards for approval.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

APRIL 26TH, 2010

Page 6 of 7

She stated the loss of these buildings should not be considered until or unless there was a firm development plan that the Preservation Board could review.

Mr. Charles Mace, the applicant and demolition contractor, testified on behalf of the demolition.

Mr. John Anselmo, representative for Crown 40 Inc., owner of the property, testified on behalf of the demolition.

Mr. Andrew Weil, Assistant Director of the Landmarks Association of St. Louis, Inc., testified in opposition to the appeal.

Jason Stokes testified in opposition to the appeal.

Michael Allen testified in opposition to the appeal.

BOARD ACTION:

It is the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the staff's denial of the application for a demolition permit as there was no redevelopment plan that addresses the property and the building is considered a Merit structure under the definition of Ordinance #64689. The motion was made by Commissioner John Burse and seconded by Commissioner David Richardson. The motion passed unanimously.

14. 2010.0280 2400 S. JEFFERSON AVE. McKINLEY HEIGHTS H. D.

Owner/Applicant: Longridge Trading LLC – John Carter

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of a staff denial to construct a large roof top deck.

PROCEEDINGS: Commissioner Mike Killeen recused himself from this portion of the hearing.

Bob Bettis presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding areas. He entered into the record Ordinances #64689 and #67901. Ms. Bettis recommended that the Preservation Board uphold the staff's denial as the design is incompatible with the existing historic building and is highly visible from the street when the street trees are not leafed-out. Mr. Bettis acknowledged that the work was constructed prior to the establishment of the local historic district.

Mr. Mark Reed, concerned citizen/neighbor testified in opposition of the proposed deck.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

APRIL 26TH, 2010

Page 7 of 7

Mr. John Carter the owner, testified on behalf of the project.

Mr. Mike Killeen, the architect for the project testified on behalf of the project.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the staff's denial and grant a variance for the project as the work was completed before McKinley Heights became a historic district. The motion was made by Commissioner John Burse and seconded by Dave Richardson. The motion passed unanimously.