

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES
JUNE 22, 2009**

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT

Richard Callow-Chairman
Melanie Fathman
David Richardson
Ald. Phyllis Young
Anthony Robinson

CULTURAL RESOURCES STAFF PRESENT

Kate Shea, Director
Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator
Bob Bettis, Preservation Planner
Adona Buford, Administrative Assistant

Minutes from May 27th, 2009 were not reviewed or approved.

PRELIMINARY REVIEW

1. 2007.0957 3501-09 N. GRAND PRESERVATION REVIEW DISTRICT

Owner: Darryl & Deborah Mitchell
Applicant: Hon. Freeman Bosley Sr. Alderman 3rd Ward

DEMOLITION PLAN: Demolish a three story brick commercial corner building.

PREVIOUS ACTION: In May, 2009, the Hon Freeman Bosley, Sr. Alderman, 3rd Ward, filed a Preliminary Review application for demolition of the building at 3501-09 N. Grand. At that May 27, 2009 meeting of the Preservation Board, the Board deferred the matter because neither applicant, Mr. Bosley, nor the owner appeared before the Board. That motion was made by David Richardson and seconded by Mary Johnson. The motion passed unanimously.

PROCEEDINGS: Kate Shea gave a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. Ald. Freeman Bosley Sr. testified in favor of the demolition. Darryl Mitchell, owner of the property testified that he also wanted the demolition approved.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

JUNE 22, 2009

Page 2 of 8

Michael Allen of the Landmarks Association testified in opposition and on behalf of the staff's recommendation. Barbara Manzara testified in opposition and on behalf of the staff's recommendation.

STAFF COMMENTS:

Approval of the demolition of a building of this size and prominence, located on a major commercial street, will have a serious effect on the urban design of the neighborhood, not only will the building be gone, leaving a large, potentially un-maintained series of vacant lots, but also the building still retains architectural value. The building has not been maintained or even boarded-up. City records indicate at least 39 complaints about conditions at the building since 1998.

ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval for demolition of the property. The motion was made by David Richardson and seconded by Ald. Phyllis Young. The motion passed by a vote of 4-0.

APPEAL OF STAFF DENIAL

2. 2009.0520 #38 BENTON PL. LAFAYETTE SQ. HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Donald Little

Applicant: Brush-Ups Inc.

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

An appeal of a staff denial of an application for a building permit for construction of a 7ft. non-compliant wooden privacy fence originally built without a permit. at 38 Benton Place. The application was denied by staff because the fence would require a variance from the Lafayette Square Historic District Design and Construction Standards.

PROCEEDINGS:

Bob Bettis gave a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area, and entered into the Record Ordinances #64689 and #63327, a letter from the Lafayette Square Restoration Committee opposing the approval of the fence as constructed, and a letter from a neighbor requesting approval of the fence as constructed.

Mr. Donald Little, owner, testified and asked for variance to retain the fence. He gave a letter from a neighbor, and photos of other non-compliant fences in the neighborhood. Mr. Little also gave a bill for the fence.

Mr. Watson Scott testified on behalf of the Development & Code Committee of the Lafayette Square Restoration Group, in opposition to the approval of a variance for the fence. Terry Linhardt, member to the

Lafayette Square Restoration Committee testified in opposition to the variance also.

STAFF COMMENTS:

Staff recommended that the Preservation Board uphold the Staff denial of the application as the proposed fence does not meet the Lafayette Square Historic District Standards which require that:

- privacy fences be only 6' in height; and
- portions of the fence were constructed incorrectly.

Staff further recommended that the owner should be instructed to lower the entire fence to 6' and finish the fencing along Hickory and the alley. Mr. Bettis testified that prior to installation of the fence, the owner of the property met with staff to discuss the project. At that time it was explained to the owner what was allowed under the Lafayette Square Standards.

ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the staff's denial of the application for a building permit in that the fence does not comply with the Historic District Standards. The motion was made by David Richardson and seconded by Ald. Phyliss Young. The motion passed by a vote of 4-0.

PRELIMINARY REVIEWS

3. 2008.2450 3020 CALIFORNIA AVE. PRESERVATION REVIEW DISTRICT

Owner: CSM Ventures Inc.

Applicant: City of St. Louis-Dept. of Public Safety

DEMOLITION PLAN:

Preliminary Review of the proposed demolition of the building at 3020 California, a 2 ½ story brick house located in a Preservation Review District.

PREVIOUS ACTION:

On October 31, 2008, the Building Division issued a Notice of Condemnation for Demolition for 3020 California Avenue, a building located within the Gravois-Jefferson Streetcar Suburb National Register Historic District. The Office denied the Condemnation on November 3, because the building was sound under the Ordinance standards and is a contributing building in the National Register Historic District. Subsequently, the Building Division requested that the denial be reconsidered. As the time had lapsed for an appeal of the original decision, a Preliminary Review of the proposed demolition was scheduled for the Preservation Board.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

JUNE 22, 2009

Page 4 of 8

PROCEEDINGS: Jan Cameron gave a PowerPoint presentation with photos of the site and surrounding area. Kate Shea, Director of the Cultural Resources Office testified, explaining how buildings are evaluated for structural soundness and about which walls are “structural walls” on historic brick buildings.

STAFF COMMENTS: Staff recommended that the Preservation Board withhold approval of the demolition as the structure is a contributing building in the Jefferson-Gravois Streetcar Suburb National Register District.

It is considered a “Merit” building under the definition of the Ordinance. While not unique in its architectural style or detailing, it is consistent and compatible with the resources of the National Register District; its brick detailing, slate mansard roof and decorative dormers contribute to the character of the district,

ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to deny the proposed demolition of the building. The motion was made by Ald. Phyllis Young and seconded by David Richardson. The motion passed 4-0.

4. 2008.2163 2213 SO. 10TH ST. SOULARD HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Melissa Whitson & Sara Irkbeck

Applicant: Piper Properties-John Muller

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary Review of a proposal to retain a non-conforming retaining wall constructed without a permit in a City historic district.

PREVIOUS ACTION: In September, 2008, the Cultural Resources Office determined that a retaining wall and fence had been constructed without a permit, and cited the developer, John Muller of Piper Properties. The project was tentatively scheduled before the Preservation Board at its September 2008 meeting; however, Mr. Muller agreed with the Cultural Resources Office staff that he would remove the wall and Board review was deferred.

In May of this year, the staff received another complaint about the wall, re-inspected the site, and found that the wall had not been removed. When Mr. Muller was notified that the Office was referring the case to Housing Court, he requested a Preliminary Review before the Preservation Board to present a revised retaining wall design.

PROCEEDINGS: Jan Cameron gave a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site, surrounding area and elevation drawings. John Muller of Piper Properties testified on his own behalf asking for a variance to the

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

JUNE 22, 2009

Page 5 of 8

standards and entered a new proposal/model example for the wall, into the record.

STAFF COMMENTS: Staff recommended that the Preservation Board withhold preliminary approval and instruct the applicant to remove the retaining wall, or replace it with a new wall based on a Model Example.

ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to deny the proposal and not grant preliminary approval. The existing and proposed plans for the site do not comply with the Souldard Historic District Standards. The Board also instructed the applicant to work with the Cultural Resources Office to come up with a design to bring the wall into compliance. The motion was made by Ald. Phyliss Young and seconded by Melanie Fathman. The motion passed 4-0.

5. 2009.1325 2713 SHENANDOAH AVE. FOX PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Brian Dunn

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary Review of a proposal to retain non-compliant windows on the front façade of a building in a historic district. The windows were installed without a permit.

PREVIOUS ACTION: In May, 2009, the Cultural Resources Office received a Preliminary Review Application to retain windows installed without a permit on the front façade at 2713 Shenandoah Avenue. The owner has stated that replacing the windows would be too expensive and wants to keep them.

PROCEEDINGS: Bob Bettis gave a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the property and surrounding area.

Brian Dunn, owner, testified on his own behalf and entered a written statement into the record along with photos of the windows, and a written financial statement to reflect his statement that it would be a financial burden to replace the windows..

STAFF COMMENTS: Staff recommends that the Preservation Board deny preliminary approval as the windows are not compliant with the Fox Park Historic District. Design Standards. The windows do not replicate the proportions and appearance of the original windows. The original windows had an arched upper sash, while the new window has a standard double-hung configuration with a half round elliptical transom. Also, the transom is not in the same plane as the upper sash distorting the overall appearance of the windows.

ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to deny the work as proposed as the windows are not appropriate for the design of the house and do not replicate the original windows. The motion was made by Phyllis Young and seconded by David Richardson. The motion passed unanimously.

6. 2009.1326 4483 LINDELL BLVD. CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DIST.

Owner: Archdiocese of St. Louis
Applicant: Christner Inc. –Daniel Jay

DEMOLITION PLAN: Preliminary Review of an application for a demolition permit to demolish a multi-story residential building and garage for construction of a surface parking lot.

PREVIOUS ACTION None

PROCEEDINGS: Kate Shea, Director of the Cultural Resources Office gave a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. She discussed the ownership and use history of the building and the owner's assessment that the building could not be feasibly rehabilitated. She also talked about the architect and the development of International Style buildings in the City and in the Central West End. Finally, she analyzed the proposed demolition in terms of the stipulations of St. Louis City Ordinance 64689 and

Day Jay of Christner, Inc, architect for the project, testified on behalf of the proposed demolition and surface parking lot and passed out handbooks of the Archdiocese of St. Louis.

Monsignor Joseph Penn, Director of the Basilica Cathedral and Pastor of the Cathedral Parish Community, spoke in favor of the demolition.

Sister Joan Ander, Principal of Rosati Kain High School testified in favor of the demolition.

Ret. Major Linus F. Pottebaur testified in favor of demolition.
Toby Weiss testified in opposition to the demolition

Mr. Jeff Mansell, Director of Landmarks Association testified in opposition.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

JUNE 22, 2009

Page 7 of 8

Michael Allen, Assistant Director of Landmarks Association of St. Louis testified in opposition to the demolition.

Karen Bode Baxter, President of Missouri Preservation, testified asking that the demo be deferred. Ms. Baxter entered into the record a letter from the National Trust for Historic Preservation opposing the demolition.

Andrew Weil, Researcher of Landmarks Association of St. Louis testified opposed to demolition.

Lindsey Derrington, Researcher for the Landmarks Association of St. Louis testified opposed to demolition.

Jeff Vines testified in opposition to the demolition.

Randy Vines testified in opposition to the demolition.

Anthony Coffins testified in opposition to the demolition.

Doug Duckworth testified in opposition to the demolition.

Emily Beck testified in opposition to the demolition.

Paul Hohmann testified in opposition to the demolition.

Lynn Josse testified in opposition to the demolition.

Kara Holland testified in opposition to the demolition.

Andrew Faulkner testified in opposition to the demolition.

Steve Anrod with Grace Associates testified in opposition to the demolition.

Jonathan Snyder testified in opposition to the demolition.

Jim Dwyer Vice President of the Planning & Development Committee for the Central West End Association, testified in opposition to the demolition.

Chris Naffziger testified in opposition to the demolition.

Angelo Stege testified in opposition to the demolition.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

JUNE 22, 2009

Page 8 of 8

Dan Jay of Christner, Inc. and architect for the project, testified on behalf of the demolition

Alderwoman Lyda Krewson testified in favor of the demolition and surface parking lot.

STAFF COMMENTS:

The building is one of six adjoined parcels in the 4300 and 4400 block of Lindell and Maryland. It is directly adjacent to the Roman Catholic Archdiocese Headquarters. The proposed parking lot would serve not only the Headquarters building, but also the Cathedral Basilica, Rosati Kain High School and the Cathedral School. It is unclear if the building at 4483 Lindell possesses sufficient merit to be listed in the National Register of Historic Places as a single site, or as part of a small International Style District at Lindell and Taylor.

What is clear is that rehabilitation of the structure will exceed its assessed value, and that being a religious institution, the Archdiocese would be unable to use the various tax incentive programs available to developers of rehabilitated property.

The redevelopment of the site as a surface parking lot is in staff's opinion, not the highest and best use for the site, even though the owner has proposed construction of a "sustainable" lot with considerable green space. While the adjacent campus of the Archdiocese Headquarters, Cathedral Basilica and two schools undoubtedly requires additional on site parking, it is hoped that the owner will consider long term use of the site to include an additional structure that would add to the rich streetscape along Lindell Blvd

ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval to demolish the building at 4483 Lindell for a surface parking lot and to approve the construction of a surface parking lot at that location. The motion was made by Alderwoman Phyliss Young and seconded by David Richardson. On a roll call vote Commissioners Anthony Robinson and Melanie Fathman voted no on the motion, Commissioners Richardson and Young voted yes. Chairman Richard Callow voted in support of the motion for demolition. The motion passed 3-2.

ADJOURNMENT

Having no other business before the Preservation Board, Chairman Callow called for a motion to adjourn the meeting. Commissioner Richardson made the motion, it was seconded by Commissioner Young with all members voting in favor of the motion. The meeting was adjourned.