

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS  
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE  
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES  
AUGUST 24<sup>TH</sup>, 2009**

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT

Richard Callow-Chairman  
Mary Johnson- Vice Chairman  
John Burse  
Melanie Fathman  
Ald. Phyllis Young  
Anthony Robinson  
Mike Killeen  
Dave Visintainer

CULTURAL RESOURCES STAFF PRESENT

Kate Shea, Director  
Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator  
Bob Bettis, Preservation Planner  
Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner  
Adona Buford, Administrative Assistant

Minutes from July 27<sup>th</sup>, 2009 were approved.

**PRELIMINARY REVIEWS**

**1.      2009.2079      1620-24 DOLMAN ST.      LAFAYETTE SQ. HISTORIC DISTRICT**

Owner: Zumwalt Corporation  
Applicant :Phil Durham/Studio Durham Architects

COMMERCIAL PLAN:      Preliminary review to demolish an attached row house and construct new exterior wall; rehabilitate remaining 2 row houses for rental units; expand and improve existing commercial parking lot.

PROCEEDINGS:      Jan Cameron presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. She submitted a letter from the Lafayette Square Restoration Committee opposing the demolition.  
Phil Durham, architect for the project spoke on behalf of the proposal.  
Gail Zumwalt, owner testified on behalf of the project.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

AUGUST 24<sup>TH</sup>, 2009

Page 2 of 8

Lynn Keay spoke in opposition to the proposal.  
J. Watson Scott of the Lafayette Square Restoration Development Committee spoke in opposition to the proposal.  
Terry Lindhard spoke in opposition to the proposal.  
Tom Benignus spoke in opposition to the proposal.

**STAFF COMMENTS:** Staff recommends that the Preservation Board deny the proposal to demolish 1624 Dolman, and also withhold preliminary approval of the rehabilitation project as currently proposed. The staff recommends that the owner reconstruct the front and south facades as required to restore the building to its original appearance. Removal of the addition at 1622 and 1624 Dolman would be acceptable.

**ACTION:** It was the decision of the Preservation Board to deny the project as submitted and also withhold preliminary approval of the rehabilitation project as currently proposed as it does not comply with the Lafayette Square District Standards. The motion was made by Ald. Phyllis Young and 2<sup>nd</sup> by Mary Johnson. The motion passed unanimously.

**2. 2009.1580 808-16 GEYER AVE. SOULARD HISTORIC DISTRICT**

---

Owner: 816 Geyer LLC d/b/a Molly's Restaurant  
Applicant: Klitzing Welsch Associates Inc.

**COMMERCIAL PLAN:** Preliminary review to retain 4 cabanas and a covered deck constructed without a permit in 2005.

**PROCEEDINGS:** Jan Cameron presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area.  
Joe Klitzing of Klitzing Welsch & Associates spoke on behalf of the project.

**STAFF COMMENTS:** Staff recommends that the Preservation Board withhold preliminary approval as the structures do not meet the requirements of the Soulard Historic District Standards. Mass and scale of the cabanas are excessive for the site and placed in a haphazard arrangement. As an additional mitigation, the applicant proposes the construction of an 8-foot tall fence on the west property line, to obscure the buildings from view along 9<sup>th</sup> Street. They will still be seen from Geyer Ave, although they are somewhat screened by a wrought-iron fence and landscaping.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

AUGUST 24<sup>TH</sup>, 2009

Page 3 of 8

**ACTION:** It was the decision of the Preservation Board to deny preliminary approval of the cabanas and covered deck as the project does not comply with the Historic District standards. The motion was made by Ald. Phyllis and 2<sup>nd</sup> by John Burse. Commissioners Mary Johnson and Mike Killeen opposed the motion. The motion passed 5 to 2.

---

**3. 2009.1833 1513 VAIL PL. LAFAYETTE SQ. HISTORIC DISTRICT**

---

Owner: Timothy Delahanty  
Applicant: Garen Miller, AIA

**RESIDENTIAL PLAN:** Preliminary review to reconstruct the front facade of a building.

**PROCEEDINGS:** Andrea Gagen presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. A letter of support for the project from the Lafayette Square Restoration Group Development Committee was entered into the record along with site plans. Tim Delahanty, owner of the property testified on behalf of the proposal. Tom Keay, a resident, testified in support of the project.

**STAFF COMMENTS:** Staff recommended that the Preservation Board deny the preliminary review as submitted as it does not meet the Lafayette Square Historic District Standards. Staff suggested that the rebuilt front facade be similar in detailing to the connected building and possibly mimic the two-story section of the building at the other end of the attached row.

**ACTION:** It was the decision of the Preservation to deny the project as proposed. The Board recommended that the applicant and owner work with the Cultural Resources Office staff to come up with a more compatible design. The motion was made by Commissioner John Burse and 2<sup>nd</sup> by Mike Killeen. The motion passed unanimously.

**APPEALS OF STAFF DENIALS**

---

**4. 2009.1485 3924 S. BROADWAY PRESERVATION REVIEW DISTRICT**  
**2009.1486 3926 S. BROADWAY PRESERVATION REVIEW DISTRICT**

---

Owner: KOBA, LP-Ken Neurenberger  
Applicant: Gaines Wrecking Company-Charles Gaines

**DEMOLITION PLAN:** Appeal of the denial of two applications for permits to demolish two buildings in a Preservation Review District.

**PROCEEDINGS:** Kate Shea presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. Ordinances #64925, 66609, 64689& 64832 were entered into the record. Letters from Alderman Ken Ortmann, Alderman Craig Schmid and the Chippewa-Broadway Business Association were entered into the record opposing the demolitions. Ken Nuerenberger, owner of the property testified on behalf of the project. He submitted a site plan with photos. Bill O'Leary testified in support of the demolition. Karen Bode Baxter submitted a letter stating that in her opinion, the buildings could not be listed in the National Register.

**STAFF COMMENTS:** Staff recommends that the Preservation Board uphold the staff's denial of the application for demolition permits. No evidence has been submitted that shows that the buildings could not be feasibly rehabilitated. No evidence of economic hardship has been submitted by the applicant. The redevelopment plan for the site at 3924 S. Broadway with a row of parking stalls entered from a continuous curb cut is inappropriate and should not be approved.

**ACTION:** Based upon the materials submitted into evidence, it was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the staff's denial of the two applications for demolition permits. In addition, the Board asked the applicant to return with a new application that addresses the redevelopment of the property at 3924 S. Broadway. The motion was made Commissioner Mike Killeen. John Burse 2<sup>nd</sup> the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

---

**5. 2009.1573                      2101 E. ALICE                      PRESERVATION REVIEW DISTRICT**

---

Owner: Citizen's for Community Improvement-Jeffrey Hardin  
Applicant: Parouder Demolition Company

**DEMOLITION PLAN:** Appeal of a staff denial of an application for a demolition permit to demolish a 2 story 2 family brick dwelling in a Preservation Review District.

**PROCEEDINGS:** Kate Shea presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. She also entered into the record Title 24, Ordinances #64925, 66609 and 64832. Mr. Jeffery Hardin of Citizen's for Community Improvement, testified in support of the demolition. Michael Allen formerly of the Landmarks Association of St. Louis testified in opposition.

**STAFF COMMENTS:** Despite the photographs submitted by the owner, no evidence has been submitted that shows the building to be unsound under the Ordinance. Indeed, given the fact that it has been vacant for 18 years, it is in remarkably good condition. The building is a Qualifying structure because of its exterior condition, materials, style and contribution to a potential National Register Historic District. The owner has stated that he cannot feasibly rehabilitate the house. He has submitted no cost analysis to support this assertion.

**ACTION:** Based upon all submissions into the record, it was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the staff's denial of an application for a demolition permit. The motion was made by Commissioner Dave Visintainer and 2<sup>nd</sup> by John Burse. The motion passed unanimously.

<b>6.</b>	<b>2009.1380</b>	<b>4386 MARYLAND AV.</b>	<b>CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DIST.</b>
	<b>2009.1379</b>	<b>4388 MARYLAND AV.</b>	<b>CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DIST.</b>

---

Owners: Peter Best, Mary Dzuback & Karen Strobach  
Applicant: Renewal By Andersen-Jim Neal

**RESIDENTIAL PLAN:** Appeal of a staff denial of applications for building permits to install clad wood windows on the front façade.

**PROCEEDINGS:** Andrea Gagen presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. Ordinances #56768 & #64689 were introduced into record along with drawings of window details. Jim Neal of Renewal by Andersen testified on behalf of the project and presented a sample window. Mary Dzuback, Peter Best and Karen Strobach, owners of the properties, testified on behalf of the project.

**STAFF COMMENTS:** Staff recommended that the Preservation Board deny the proposed insert windows as they do not meet the Central West End Historic District Standards. The reduction of the glass size by 5/8" on each side of the window (1 1/4" total) will make a noticeable difference in the appearance of these windows. In addition, the installation will also shorten the windows approximately 2", with additional framing at the head and the creation of a double sill. Staff thinks an alternate installation, such as sash packs, would be a better solution.

**ACTION:** It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the staff's denial of the applications for building permits as the proposed plan does not meet the Historic District Standards. The motion was made by Mike Killeen and 2<sup>nd</sup> by John Burse. Chairwoman Mary Johnson opposed the motion. The motion passed 6 to 1.

**NEW APPLICATIONS**

**7. 2009.1677 4520 FOREST PARK PRESERVATION REVIEW DISTRICT**

Owner: St. Louis College of Pharmacy  
Applicant: Spirtas Wrecking Company

DEMOLITION PLAN: Demolition permit application to demolish a commercial building for a surface parking lot.

PROCEEDINGS: Kate Shea presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. Commissioner John Burse recused himself from this portion of the hearing.

STAFF COMMENTS: Staff recommends that the Preservation Board grant approval of the application for a demolition permit. Because of prior demolitions, the east end of this block has only one building, the one proposed for demolition. The current and prospective owners have collaborated to submit a landscaping plan to screen the parking lots created by the demolition. Staff received no communication from Alderman Roddy or any neighborhood organization concerning the proposed demolition or re-use of the site.

ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to approve an application for a demolition permit for the proposed project. The motion was made by Commissioner Mike Killeen and 2<sup>nd</sup> by Dave Visintainer. The motion passed 5 to 0.

**8. 2009.1791 3117 LONGFELLOW COMPTON HILL HISTORIC DISTRICT**

Owners: James & Jane McNeil  
Applicant: Core 10 Architecture-Brian Wheeler

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Application for a building permit to construct an enclosed rear deck visible from the street. The proposal also includes construction of a large concrete patio and a concrete walk extending out to the front sidewalk.

PROCEEDINGS: Andrea Gagen presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. Ordinances #64689 and #57702 were entered into the record. James McNeil, owner testified on behalf of the project. Tyler Stevens of Core 10 Architects testified on behalf of the project. William Bush Sr. & William Bush Jr., of the Compton Heights Betterment Association, both testified in support of the project and submitted photos to the Board.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

AUGUST 24<sup>TH</sup>, 2009

Page 7 of 8

**STAFF COMMENTS:** Staff recommended that the Preservation Board deny the enclosed deck visible from the street, as it does not meet the Compton Hill Historic District Standards. If the proposed deck is constructed, the patio would be more appropriate if done in brick. The staff also recommends against approval of the addition of a walkway to the front sidewalk since there is currently a set of large front entry stairs and a front entry driveway on the opposite side of the house.

**ACTION:** Due to the support of the Compton Hill Neighborhood Group, it was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant a variance and approve the large enclosed deck. The motion was made by Phyllis Young and 2<sup>nd</sup> by Melanie Fathman. The motion passed unanimously.

**9. 2009.1754 2000 SIDNEY ST. COMPTON HILL HISTORIC DISTRICT**

---

Owner: Sidney Street Café

Applicant: Brick & Mortar LLC-Mina Nashan

**COMMERCIAL PLAN:** Application for a building permit to replace seven (7) storefront windows.

**PROCEEDINGS:** Bob Bettis presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. Mina Nashan, owner testified on behalf of the project.

**STAFF COMMENTS:** Staff Recommends that the Preservation Board deny the application as the proposed windows do not comply with historic district standards. Although the transom and bulkhead arrangement may be close to the original configuration, the storefront casement windows are not compatible. The divided lights are a contemporary change and do not reflect the open appearance that would have appeared historically.

**ACTION:** It was the decision of the Preservation Board to approve the application for a building permit for the windows with the condition that the design is modified to remove the muntins, and that the storefront design is modified into a tripartite appearance to match the bulkhead and transom. The above motion was made by Commissioner John Burse, and 2<sup>nd</sup> by Melanie Fathman. Commissioners John Burse, Melanie Fathman, Phyllis Young and Anthony Robinson voted for the motion. Commissioners Mike Killeen and Dave Visintainer opposed the motion. The motion passed four to two.

**10. 2009.1807 4130-44 DR. M. L. KING VILLE HISTORIC DISTRICT**

---

Owner: Habitat for Neighborhood Business-Terry Donohue  
Applicant: Dale Sign Company

COMMERCIAL PLAN: Application for a building permit to install eight (8) illuminated wall signs.

PROCEEDINGS: Kate Shea presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. Terry Donohue, representative for Habitat testified on behalf of the project and submitted an example of Lexan and a new rendering showing signs on the building.

STAFF COMMENTS: Staff recommended that the Preservation Board require the owner to allow only externally lit board signs or awnings as required in other City historic districts.

ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to approve the signs with the condition that all the graphic elements be white against a black background as suggested by Mr. Donohue. The motion was made by Commissioner Anthony Robinson and 2<sup>nd</sup> by John Burse. The motion passed unanimously.