

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS  
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE  
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES  
SEPTEMBER 26, 2011**

**BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT**

Richard Callow, Chairman

Michael Killeen

David Richardson

Anthony Robinson

David Visintainer

**CULTURAL RESOURCES STAFF PRESENT**

Betsy H. Bradley, Director

Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator

Bob Bettis, Preservation Planner

Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner

Adona Buford, Administrative Assistant

Board Member David Visintainer moved to approve the August 22, 2011 minutes. Mr. Robinson seconded the motion. The minutes were approved.

Board Member Anthony Robinson moved to approve the current Agenda. Mr. Visintainer seconded the motion. The current Agenda was approved.

**PRELIMINARY REVIEW**

A.      2011.0000      3314-20 LEMP AVENUE      BENTON PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

---

Owner: Land Reutilization Authority (LRA) - Benton Park Housing Authority

Developer: Cohen Architecture Company-Tom Cohen

COMMERCIAL PLAN:              Preliminary review to construct two (2) commercial buildings and four (4) attached townhouses at the alley.

PROCEEDINGS:                      Jan Cameron presented a power-point presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. Ms. Cameron submitted a letter from the Benton Park Housing Corporation supporting the new construction. Ms. Cameron also recommended that the Preservation Board grant preliminary approval with the stipulation that final

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

September 26, 2011

Page 2 of 7

construction documents and exterior materials are reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office staff.

Ms. Marion Smith, Vice President of the Benton Park Housing Corporation testified in support of the project.

**FINDING OF FACTS:**

The Preservation Board found that the project was generally in compliance with the Benton Park Historic District Standards, with the exception of the rear flounder townhouses, which did not follow a prescribed Model Example. The Board also found that the Standards did not clearly address the construction of new alley buildings and that although the townhouses did not reflect a particular Model Example, their design referenced historic flounder houses that were once prevalent throughout the district.

**ACTION:**

Board Member David Richardson moved to grant a variance for preliminary approval of the construction project with the stipulation that the final construction documents and exterior materials are reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office staff. Mr. Visintainer seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

**NEW APPLICATION**

B. 2011.1617 1022 MISSISSIPPI AVENUE LAFAYETTE SQ. HISTORIC DISTRICT

---

Owner/Applicant: Jason Ermold

**RESIDENTIAL PLAN:**

Application for a second addendum to a building permit previously approved to construct a single family dwelling.

**PREVIOUS ACTION:**

On November 22, 2010, the Preservation Board voted to grant preliminary approval for new construction of a single family dwelling, including location and orientation of the garage, with the stipulation that the other concerns of the Staff were addressed and that the final drawings, details, finishes, and exterior materials be reviewed and approved by the Staff. The motion was made by Board Member David Richardson and seconded by Mr. Burse. Mr. Visintainer opposed the motion. The motion passed 6-1.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

September 26, 2011

Page 3 of 7

The Cultural Resources Office approved a building permit application based on that decision in May 2011. A building permit application for an addendum relating to the side elevations was approved in September 2011.

On September 16, 2011, the owner applied for a second addendum to the approved permit that would change the size and shape of the windows on the front bay, and hoped to use clad-wood windows instead of the painted wood windows specified in the approved plans. The owner also proposed to decrease the height of the first-story windows to eight feet (8') and the basement windows to 2-½ feet. The proposed windows would also be more narrow than originally proposed.

PROCEEDINGS:

Andrea Gagen presented a power-point presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. Ms. Gagen recommended that the Preservation Board grant preliminary approval to the project with the stipulation that the windows, in terms of proportions, details, opening shape, and window material fully meet the requirements of the Lafayette Square Historic District Standards.

Jason Ermold, the property owner testified on his own behalf. He stated that the proposed windows fit the outlay better than the windows first proposed, which he based on the adjacent buildings but that the adjacent buildings do not have a bay and therefore wouldn't fit his building's window openings. He stated that the proposed windows which are 96"x 36" for the first floor bay and 36"x 30" windows on the foundation of the bay, would replicate an existing new dwelling at 2013 Park Ave. in the Lafayette Square Historic District.

J. Watson Scott testified in opposition to the proposed changes of the bay windows dimensions.

FINDING OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that the windows previously approved by the Board were wood, although clad-wood windows are allowed under the current historic district standards;  
that the proposed windows on the first story of the front bay would be approximately one foot (1) shorter than those previously approved. The basement windows would

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

September 26, 2011

Page 4 of 7

be approximately six inches (6) shorter. The proposed windows would also be narrower to fit in the bay; that there are windows of similar height and shape on bays of other new construction within the Lafayette Square Historic District; and that the owner has agreed to create panels beneath the first story windows.

The Preservation Board determined that the change to the windows on the front bay would comply with the Lafayette Square Historic District standards if a segmental arch was retained at the basement windows and the proportions of the bay windows would match those at the 2013 Park building presented by the applicant as a guide for the design of the bay. Therefore, they conditionally approved the addendum.

**ACTION:**

Board Member David Richardson moved to grant conditional approval of the windows with the stipulation that the windows on the front bay comply with the Lafayette Square Historic District Standards in that a segmental arch be retained at the basement windows and that the proportion of the bay windows match those at the 2013 Park building presented by the applicant as a guide for the design of the bay. Mr. Robinson seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

**APPEALS OF STAFF DENIALS**

C. 2011.1031 3235 MISSOURI AVENUE BENTON PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

---

Owner/Applicant: Joseph Herbert

**RESIDENTIAL PLAN:**

Appeal of a staff denial of building permit application to retain and complete a retaining wall on a public façade, installed without a permit.

**PROCEEDINGS:**

Bob Bettis presented a power-point presentation illustrating the site and surrounding areas. He submitted into the record Enabling Ordinance #64689, Benton Park Historic District Ordinance #67175, and a letter from the Benton Park Neighborhood Association's Building Review Committee opposing the retaining wall. Mr. Bettis recommended that the Preservation Board uphold the

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

September 26, 2011

Page 5 of 7

staff's denial as the retaining wall does not meet the Benton Park Historic District Standards, which require retaining walls at public façades to be based on a Model Example.

Joseph Herbert, owner of the property, testified on his own behalf. He submitted photos of retaining walls he considered to be model examples in the surrounding area.

FINDING OF FACTS:

The Board found;  
that the work was completed without a permit and is not in compliance with the Benton Park Historic District Standards;  
that the Benton Park Neighborhood Association's Building Review Committee is in support of the staff's denial;  
The Board determined that the Model Examples of retaining walls submitted within Benton Park and surrounding Neighborhoods were not Model Examples due to their age and materials;  
that the owner had not sought any bids in order to make the wall compliant with the standards and did not provide any evidence that replacing the wall to meet the standards would cause an economic hardship; and  
that the appellant appeared to have made a good-faith effort to replicate a neighboring wall he thought had been approved.

ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the Staff's denial and grant a variance with the stipulations that the owner comply with all permitting and engineering requirements and that the owner work with the Cultural Resources Office staff to revise the design of the wall to replicate a historic wall more closely by re-pointing, adding a cap, and placing the proposed fence on top of the wall rather than behind it.

The motion was made by Board Member Michael Killeen and seconded by Mr. Visintainer. Board Member Anthony Robinson opposed the motion. The motion passed three to one.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

September 26, 2011

Page 6 of 7

D. 2011.1596 3928-30 CASTLEMAN AVENUE SHAW HISTORIC DISTRICT

---

Owner/Applicant: Paul Kraus

**RESIDENTIAL PLAN:** Appeal of a staff denial of a building permit application to retain fourteen (14) vinyl windows on a four-family dwelling installed without a permit.

**PROCEEDINGS:** Bob Bettis presented a power-point presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area including a photograph of the building prior to the replacement of the windows. Mr. Bettis submitted into the record Enabling Ordinance #64689, Shaw Historic District Ordinance #59400, and a letter signed by the residents of the 3900 block of Castleman in support of the existing windows. He recommended that the Preservation Board uphold the staff's denial as the installed vinyl windows do not meet the Shaw Neighborhood Historic District Standards.

Paul Kraus, the property owner, testified on his own behalf.

He stated that he would like to receive a variance from the Board to retain the fourteen (14) vinyl windows based on financial hardship. Mr. Kraus testified that the old windows were drafty and that he plans to restore the entire building. Mr. Kraus stated that he received an estimate to replace the windows from Marvin Wood Windows for a cost of \$25,616.00 and an estimate from Crown Industries for aluminum windows for \$61,715.00. Mr. Kraus submitted photos of the installed windows.

8<sup>th</sup> Ward Alderman Stephen Conway testified in support of granting Mr. Kraus a variance.

**FINDING OF FACTS:** The Preservation Board found that the completed work does not comply with the Shaw Historic District Standards; that the owner installed the windows without a permit; that Alderman Conway is in support of the project because

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

September 26, 2011

Page 7 of 7

the windows were close to complying with the standards and that the owner had greatly improved the property and made a significant investment on a troubled block; and that the Board found the owner had not provided sufficient evidence of economic hardship.

**ACTION:**

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to leave the hearing open until the October 24, 2011 meeting to allow the owner time submit further testimony on the cost of replacement windows that would meet the district standards and to provide more information to support the assertion that replacement of the non-compliant façade windows would constitute an economic hardship.

The motion was made by Board Member David Richardson, and seconded by Mr. Visintainer. Board Member Killeen opposed the motion. The motion passed three to one.

**SPECIAL AGENDA ITEM**

Board support and approval of a Cultural Resources Office application for a Historic Preservation Fund Grant for a survey of Modern Movement architecture in the city.

**PROCEEDINGS:**

Betsy Bradley requested that the Preservation Board grant approval of an application for a Historic Preservation Fund Grant to conduct a survey of Modern Movement architecture in the city.

**ACTION:**

The Preservation Board moved to grant approval of a grant application to conduct a survey of Modern Movement architecture in the city. The motion was made by Board Member David Richardson and seconded by Mr. Robinson. The motion passed unanimously.

Board Member David Richardson moved to adjourn the meeting. Hearing no objection the meeting was adjourned.