

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES
SEPTEMBER 28TH, 2009**

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT

Richard Callow-Chairman
David Richardson
John Burse
Melanie Fathman
Ald. Phyllis Young
Anthony Robinson
Dave Visintainer

CULTURAL RESOURCES STAFF PRESENT

Kate Shea, Director
Bob Bettis, Preservation Planner
Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner
Adona Buford, Administrative Assistant

Minutes from August 24th, 2009 were approved.

APPEALS OF STAFF DENIALS

1. 2009.1593 3127 LONGFELLOW COMPTON HILL HISTORIC DIST.

Owner/Applicant: Jeffrey & Stacey Hill

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of a staff denial of an application for a building permit for a building permit to install aluminum windows.

PROCEEDINGS: Bob Bettis presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. Ordinance #57702 was entered into the record. He submitted three letters of support from surrounding neighbors for the project as designed into the record.

Jeffrey Hill, owner spoke on behalf of the project and submitted a PowerPoint presentation illustrating windows similar to those he wished to use, along with copies of two letters of support from the surrounding neighbors for the project which were previously entered into the record by Bob Bettis.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

SEPTEMBER 28TH, 2009

Page 2 of 8

William Bush Sr. testified in support of the project and submitted another two copies of the previously entered letters of support.

STAFF COMMENTS:

Staff recommended that the Preservation Board uphold the staff's denial of the project as designed, as the proposed work does not comply with the Compton Hill Historic District Standards. The replacement windows being proposed are aluminum and not consistent with other wood windows on the house on street visible facades.

ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the staff's denial and grant a variance to allow the aluminum windows with the condition that all the replacement windows are the correct size for the openings..

The motion was made by Dave Visintainer, and seconded by Melanie Fathman. Commissioners Dave Richardson and John Burse opposed the motion. The motion passed 3 to 2.

2. 2009.1678 3949 RUSSELL BLVD. SHAW HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Jennifer Taylor

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

Appeal of a staff denial of an application for a building permit for a building permit to retain non-compliant plumbing pipe handrails installed without a permit.

PROCEEDINGS:

Bob Bettis presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. He entered Ordinance #59400 and Enabling Ordinance #64689 into the record.

Jennifer Taylor, property owner, testified on behalf of the project and submitted a financial hardship letter to the Board along with several photos of similar railings in the surrounding area.

STAFF COMMENTS:

Staff recommended that the Preservation Board uphold the staff denial as the handrails do not comply with the Shaw Historic District Standards. Staff stated that plumbing pipe handrails are not compatible with the architectural vocabulary of the house. The owner would prefer to retain the pipe rail due to its cost and prevalence throughout the neighborhood.

ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn staff's denial and grant a variance that the owner may keep the installed railings based on economic hardship.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

SEPTEMBER 28TH, 2009

Page 3 of 8

The motion was made by Dave Richardson and seconded by Melanie Fathman. The motion passed unanimously.

3. 2009.1621 2734-36 ARMAND PL. FOX PARK HISTORIC DIST.

Owner/Applicant: Daniel Williams

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of a staff denial of an application for a building permit for a building permit to retain a non-compliant handrail installed without a permit.

PREVIOUS ACTION: On December 13, 2008, the Cultural Resources Office received a Citizens Service Bureau Complaint regarding the construction of wooden handrails without a permit at 2734-36 Armand Pl.

The owners were contacted by staff, using a certified mail. The letter informed the owners that a building permit was required for construction of the handrail, however owners failed to respond or apply for a building permit. The owners were subsequently referred to Housing Court for failure to respond to the violation.

On July 10, 2009, the owner submitted an application for a building permit for a building permit for the non-compliant handrails. Staff was required to deny the application for a building permit as the handrail did not comply with the historic district design standards and the owners refused to change the design of their project.

The owners have subsequently appealed the denial.

PROCEEDINGS: Bob Bettis presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. He entered Ordinance #66098 into the record.

Daniel Williams and Stephanie Miles, property owners, testified and submitted photos of similar handrails in the surrounding area.

STAFF COMMENTS: Staff recommended that the Preservation Board uphold the staff denial of the application for a building permit for a building permit, as the installed handrail does not comply with Fox Park Historic District Standards.

ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the staff's denial as the handrails do not comply with the Fox Park District Standards.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

SEPTEMBER 28TH, 2009

Page 4 of 8

The motion was made by Melanie Fathman and seconded by Anthony Robinson. Commissioner Dave Richardson opposed the motion. Roll was called. The motion passed 4 to 1.

4. 2009.1752 2805 McNAIR BENTON PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: JD Gillenwater

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of a staff denial of an application for a building permit for a building permit to retain a 6ft. chain link fence installed without a permit

PREVIOUS ACTION: On August 25, 2006 the chain link fence at the corner of the property at 2805 McNair was struck by a car damaging a portion of the Lynch St. and McNair Ave. fencing.

On July 2008, the Cultural Resources Office received a complaint that a chain link fence had been replaced without a permit. The owners were contacted by staff, using a certified mail. The letter informed the owners that a building permit was required for construction of the fence, however owners failed to respond or apply for a building permit.

On October 2008, the matter was referred to Housing Court for failure to respond to the violation.

July 2009, the owner made a application for a building permit for a building permit for the non-compliant chain link fence. The application for a building permit was denied because of the historic design standards. The owner appealed the denial.

PROCEEDINGS: Andrea Gagen presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. She also entered Ordinances #64689 and #67175 into the record.

Mike Gillenwater, property owner's son, testified on behalf of the project.

STAFF COMMENTS: Staff recommended that the Preservation Board uphold the staff's denial of the application for a building permit for a building permit for the chain link fence as chain link is not an approved material for high fences within the Benton Park historic district. The chain link fence is highly visible, as it sits on a large corner lot and extends along both McNair Ave. and Lynch St.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

SEPTEMBER 28TH, 2009

Page 5 of 8

ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn staff's denial and grant a variance to allow the fence due to the nature of the car accident and the vagueness of the language regarding repair vs. replacement in the Historic District Ordinance.

The motion was made by John Burse and seconded by Melanie Fathman. The motion passed unanimously.

5. 2009.1680 1516 MISSISSIPPI AVE. LAFAYETTE SQ. HISTORIC DIST

Owner: Rolf & Eileen Behrents

Applicant: Steve Coffey

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

Appeal of a staff denial of an application for a building permit to install casement windows on front façade of a building in the Lafayette Square Historic District.

PROCEEDINGS:

Bob Bettis presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. He entered Ordinance #63327 into the record.

Ms. Marty Martchink, construction manager of the project testified on behalf of the project. Rolf Behrents property owner, testified on behalf of the project.

STAFF COMMENTS:

Staff recommended that the Preservation Board uphold the staff denial and not issue a variance as the proposed windows do not conform to the Lafayette Square Historic District Standards. The owner is requesting a variance from the Preservation Board in order to install the casement windows because the owners wish to use the room as a bedroom and the existing windows sizes do not comply with Building Division egress requirements.

ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the staff's denial as the proposed casement windows do not comply with the Lafayette Square design guidelines.

The above motion was made John Burse and seconded by Dave Richardson. Anthony Robinson opposed the motion. The motion passed 5 to 1.

6. 2009.1941 4316, 4322 & 4328 McRee NORTH I-44 HISTORIC DIST.

Owner/Applicant: Fred Quitmeyer

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of a staff denial of an application for a building permit to install a 48 inch chain link fence with a gate in front yard of three buildings.

PROCEEDINGS: Bob Bettis presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area and a site plan from the owner indicating where the fence will be placed.

Fred Quitmeyer, property owner testified on behalf of the project.

STAFF COMMENTS: Staff recommended that the Preservation Board uphold the staff denial as fencing in the front of buildings is strictly prohibited per the North I-44 design guidelines. Staff stated that although here are several instances of existing fencing throughout the district these fences were either in place prior to the establishment of the Historic District or installed without a permit.

ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the staff's denial of the application for a building permit as the proposal does not meet the Historic District Standards.

The motion was made by Dave Visintainer and seconded by Melanie Fathman. The motion passed unanimously.

NEW APPLICATION FOR A BUILDING PERMIT

7. 2009.2204 2819 INDIANA ST. BENTON PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Dennis Farrow

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: New application for a building permit to retain a non-compliant door and sidelight installed without a permit.

PREVIOUS ACTION: On December 17, 2008, the Cultural Resources Office received a Citizens Service Bureau complaint for a front door installed without a permit at 2819 Indiana.

The owner of the property did not respond to correspondence from the Cultural Resources Office and was referred to Housing Court. Upon receipt of a court summons, the owner made application for a building permit for the non-compliant work on September 8, 2009.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

SEPTEMBER 28TH, 2009

Page 7 of 8

PROCEEDINGS: Bob Bettis presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. He entered Ordinance #67175 and 64689 into the record.

Dennis Farrow, property owner submitted photos of doors in the surrounding neighborhood and a financial hardship letter to the Board.

STAFF COMMENTS: Staff recommended that the Preservation Board uphold the staff denial, as the installed door system is not in compliance with Benton Park Local Historic District Standards. The contemporary door and side light are too elaborate and not appropriate for the simple Federal style building. The door is also too small for the opening and the larger transom bar is out of scale with the original fabric.

ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the staff's denial as the door and transom do not comply with the Benton Park Historic District Standards. It was the recommendation of the Preservation Board that staff ask the court division to wave all fines and fees attached to the case given the owner's financial situations. in return for installation of the appropriate door and transom by the owner

The motion was made by Dave Visintainer and seconded by Melanie Fathman. The motion passed unanimously.

RESOLUTIONS FOR BOARD APPROVAL

8. Resolution No. One

Presented to The Preservation Board and Mr. Richard Callow, Chairman

From: Kate Shea, Director, Cultural Resources Office
City Of St. Louis Planning and Urban Design Agency

Re: Resolution ratifying acceptance of a grant from the Missouri Department Of Natural Resources State Historic Preservation Office to the St. Louis Development Corporation in a project to conduct a National Register Survey of between 300 and 750 buildings in the Ville Local Historic District.

The grant amount will not exceed ten thousand dollars (\$10,000),

Decision: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to adopt Resolutions 1,2 and 3. The motion was made by Dave Richardson and seconded by Melanie Fathman. The vote passed unanimously.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

SEPTEMBER 28TH, 2009

Page 8 of 8

9. Resolution No. Two

Presented to The Preservation Board and Mr. Richard Callow, Chairman

From: Kate Shea, Director, Cultural Resources Office
City Of St. Louis Planning and Urban Design Agency

Re: Resolution authorizing the submission of an application for a grant from the Missouri Department of Natural Resources State Historic Preservation Office for staff to work with the St. Louis Development Corporation in a project to create at least one national register historic district in the Ville Local Historic District; the grant amount will not exceed ten thousand dollars (\$10,000).

Decision: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to adopt Resolutions 1,2 and 3. The motion was made by Dave Richardson and seconded by Melanie Fathman. The vote passed unanimously.

10. Resolution No. Three

Presented To The Preservation Board September 28, 2009

To: Preservation Board and Mr. Richard Callow, Chairman

From: Kate Shea, Director
Cultural Resources Office
City Of St. Louis Planning and Urban Design Agency

Re: Resolution authorizing the submission of an application for a grant from the Missouri Department of Natural Resources State Historic Preservation Office for staff to work with the St. Louis Development Corporation in a project to obtain a professional consultant to work with the City Of St. Louis and the Osage Nation to develop a Preservation Plan for the 'sugarloaf' Mound; the grant funds not to exceed ten thousand dollars (\$10,000).

Decision: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to adopt Resolutions 1,2 and 3. The motion was made by Dave Richardson and seconded by Melanie Fathman. The vote passed unanimously.

6:13 pm. Vote in open session to hold a closed meeting pursuant to the following: Proceedings involving legal actions, causes of actions or litigation or confidential or privileged communications with attorneys or auditors as provided by Section 610.021 (1)RSMo. And/or Section 610.021 (17)RSMo.

Dave Richardson motioned to go into closed session, Ald Phyliss Young 2nd the motion.

6:24 p.m. Dave Visintainer motioned to end closed session. Melanie Fathman 2nd.