

CITY OF ST. LOUIS
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES
JANUARY 24TH, 2011

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT

Richard Callow, Chairman

David Visintainer

Ald. Phyllis Young

David Richardson

Melanie Fathman

Mike Killeen

Anthony Robinson

CULTURAL RESOURCES STAFF PRESENT

Betsy H. Bradley, Director

Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator

Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner

Bob Bettis, Preservation Planner

Adona Buford, Administrative Assistant

An announcement was made that Commissioner John Burse has resigned from the Preservation Board. Betsy H. Bradley, new Director of the Cultural Resources Office was introduced. A motion to approve the minutes of the December 20th, 2010 teleconference meeting was made by Commissioner David Visintainer and seconded by Mike Killeen.. The motion passed unanimously.

PRELIMINARY REVIEWS

1. 2011.0037 4228-34 MARYLAND CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DIST.

Owner/Applicant: Jeff Winslerling

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review of an application to construct four (4) new single family dwellings.

PROCEEDINGS: Bob Bettis presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. He recommended the Preservation Board approve the preliminary application subject to review of final drawings and materials by the Cultural Resources Office staff, as the proposed design of the buildings comply with the Central West End Design Guidelines,

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

JANUARY 24TH, 2011

Page 2 of 6

He submitted into the record a site plan, brick samples received from the owner and a letter from the Central West End Association approving the project as submitted.

Mr. Jeff Winslerling, owner and developer of the project testified on his own behalf. He submitted brick samples referred to as IronSpot Brick and site plans.

FINDINGS OF FACT: The Board found that the proposed new construction is in compliance with the Central West End Historic District Standards.

ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval to construct four (4) new single family dwellings with the stipulation that the Cultural Resources Office approve the final construction documents. The motion was made by Commissioner Melanie Fathman and seconded by Commissioner Anthony Robinson. The motion passed unanimously.

2. 2011.0038 4200 BLOCK OF McREE NORTH I-44 HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Botanical Heights Homes LLC - Brent Crittenden

Applicant: Garden District Commission

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review of an application to construct thirteen (13) homes on the 4200 Block of McRee Ave. between Tower Grove Ave. on the west and Klemm Ave. on the east.

PROCEEDINGS: Bob Bettis presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. He recommended the Preservation Board grant preliminary approval subject to the applicant submitting final construction documents to staff for review. The Cultural Resources Office staff feels that the concept generally complies with the North I-44 Local Historic District Standards. Mr. Bettis also submitted into the record a letter of support from the Garden District Commission.

Mr. Brent Crittenden, developer, architect and general contractor for Botanical Heights Homes LLC, testified on his own behalf. He submitted photos and elevations.

Mr. Tom Pickel, Director of the Garden District Commission, testified in support of the project.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

JANUARY 24TH, 2011

Page 3 of 6

FINDINGS OF FACT: The Board found that the proposed new construction is in compliance with the North I-44 Historic District Standards.

ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval for the new construction with the stipulation that the applicant work with Cultural Resources Office on the details prior to approving final construction documents. The motion was made by Commissioner Anthony Robinson, and seconded by Commissioner Melanie Fathman. The motion passed unanimously.

3. 2011.0036 150 VICTOR ST. PRESERVATION REVIEW DISTRICT

Owner: Rick Hampp

Applicant: R & R Contracting Services, Inc.

DEMOLITION PLAN: Preliminary review to demolish several industrial & commercial buildings.

PROCEEDINGS: Andrea Gagen presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. She recommended the Preservation Board approve the demolition of the complex, except for the historic three-story building on the north side of the block. The majority of the complex at 150 Victor is considered “Non-Contributing” under the Ordinance definition due to the alterations to most of the historic sections of the property and the lack of historic context.

Mr. Rick Hampp of ICON Contracting testified on behalf of the demolition. He stated that the interior of the building is unsafe and referred to the asbestos report he submitted into the record saying it would cost about \$200,000.00 just to remove the asbestos.

Mr. Dennis Orne of Lapeke & Orne Architects testified in support of the demolition. He stated the building is in quite disrepair.

Mr. Andrew Weil of Landmarks Association of St. Louis testified in opposition to the demolition.

FINDINGS OF FACT: The Board found that the property is located in a Preservation Review District; the project was reviewed under the criteria of Ordinances 64689 and 64832; the buildings are considered sound under definition of the ordinance; all but one of the historic buildings in the complex have been heavily altered; the buildings will require substantial asbestos removal and reuse of the remaining intact historic structure is infeasible as it is unlikely that

it or the complex could be listed in the National Register of Historic Places.

ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval of the entire complex for demolition. The motion was made by Commissioner Phyllis Young and seconded by Commissioner David Richardson. The motion passed unanimously.

NEW APPLICATION

4. 2011.0039 3958 RUSSELL BLVD. SHAW HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: James Graham & Dale Thomas

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: New application for a building permit to retain a second story door installed without a permit and a proposed conversion of paired front entry doors to a single door.

PROCEEDINGS: Bob Bettis presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. He recommended the Preservation Board deny the application as the installed second story door and the proposed entry alteration do not meet the Shaw Historic District standards. The door and transom alteration does not replicate the appearance of the original. The transom has been reduced in size, and the installed door has an overly ornate window that is not appropriate for the style of the house. At the front entry, the owner is proposing to remove the existing door, add sidelights and alter the transom.. The proposed door is contemporary and not compatible with the architectural vocabulary of the historic building.

Mr. James Graham, property owner, testified on his own behalf. He stated that he would work with the Cultural Resources Office to modify the door, transom and decorative glass on the second floor. Mr. Graham submitted photos of similar doors in the surrounding area and asked that the Board grant a variance for the front entry door.

FINDINGS OF FACT: The Board found that the installed door and transom modification was not in compliance with the Shaw District Design guidelines. In addition, the proposed front entry alteration is also not in compliance with the district standards. The Board found that the photographs of neighboring doors that the owner submitted were contemporary alterations and not original.

ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the Staff's denial as the finished and proposed work does not comply with the Shaw Historic District Standards. The motion was made by Commissioner David Visintainer and seconded by Commissioner Melanie Fathman. The motion passed unanimously.

APPEAL OF STAFF DENIAL

5. 2010.1944 3631 FLAD AVE. SHAW HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Randall & Wynne Moskop

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of the staff denial of an application for a building permit to construct a shed and modify a rear porch.

PROCEEDINGS: Bob Bettis presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the site and surrounding area. He entered into the record Ordinances #64689 and #59400; a sample of the material for the shed, a support letter from a neighbor and an explanatory narrative submitted by the owner. Mr. Bettis recommended that the Preservation Board uphold the staff's denial as the proposed work does not meet the Shaw Historic District standards. The proposed shed is contemporary and does not fit within the character of the home or the neighborhood. Its location on the east side of the house makes it highly visible. The only method of screening the shed is a six foot wooden fence which is not considered to be a permanent structure.

Mr. Randall Moskop, property owner and architect, testified on his own behalf and asked the Board for a variance.

FINDINGS OF FACT: The Board found that the shed is not prominently visible from the street. In addition, the alteration to the rear porch will not have a strong visual impact on the street. The Board found that the proposed shed and rear porch alterations are not incompatible with the Shaw Historic District Standards.

ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the Staff's denial and approve the application for a building permit to construct a shed and modify the rear porch as it is not prominently visible. The motion was made by Commissioner David Richardson and seconded by Commissioner David Visintainer. The motion passed unanimously.

SPECIAL AGENDA ITEMS

Nominations to the National Register of Historic Places

6. Hamilton Hotel – 956 Hamilton Street

ACTION: It was decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the State Historic Preservation Office that the Hamilton Hotel meets the requirements of National Register Criterion C in the area of Architecture. The motion was made by Commissioner Dave Richardson and seconded by Commissioner Mike Killeen. The motion passed unanimously.

7. Chamberlain Apartments – 5561 Chamberlain St.

ACTION: It was decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the State Historic Preservation Office that the Chamberlain Apartments meets the requirements of National Register Criterion C in the area of Architecture. The motion was made by Dave Richardson and seconded by Mike Killeen The motion passed unanimously.

Commissioner Anthony Robinson moved to adjourn the meeting. No second. Meeting adjourned.