

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES
JANUARY 26, 2014**

Board Members Present

Richard Callow, Chairman
Alderman Craig Schmid
Erin Wright
Mike Killeen
Anthony Robinson
David Richardson
Melanie Fathman

Legal Counsel

Barbara Birkicht

Cultural Resources Office Staff Present

Betsy Bradley, Director
Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator
Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner
Bob Bettis, Preservation Planner
Adona Buford, Administrative Assistant

PRELIMINARY REVIEWS

A. 2014.1584 3972 SHAW BOULEVARD SHAW HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: St. Margaret of Scotland School

Applicant: The Lawrence Group – Jim Shearer

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct a new classroom building.

PROCEEDINGS: On January 26, 2015, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a preliminary review application to construct a new classroom building at 3972 Shaw Boulevard, in the Shaw Neighborhood Certified Local Historic District. The application was submitted by the architect on behalf of the school.

Board members Richard Callow, (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, Melanie Fathman, David Richardson, Erin Wright and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

JANUARY 26, 2015

Page 2 of 8

item. Board Member Mike Killeen recused himself from the item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #59400 that sets forth the standards for residential new construction in the Shaw Neighborhood Local Historic District. He testified that the project appeared generally to comply with the standards and recommended that the Board grant preliminary approval to the proposal. He stated that the Shaw neighborhood association and the Alderman were in support of the project.

Jim Shearer, Paul Hubberman and Craig Heller were all present to speak on behalf of the project.

FINDINGS OF FACTS: The Preservation Board found that:

- 3972 Shaw is located in the Shaw Local Historic District;
- the proposed project generally complies with the historic district standards;
- the building will be clad in red brick, a common historic material in the district;
- the proposed building will be one story in height to meet the programmatic needs of the school and will be perceived as part of the school campus; and that
- as the design meets all the standards for new construction except height, it will not detract from the historic streetscape.

BOARD DECISION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval for the proposed new construction, with the stipulation that final plans and exterior details will be reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office to ensure compliance with the standards. The motion was made by Board Member Craig Schmid and seconded by Board Member Fathman. The motion passed with none opposed and recused Board Member Killeen abstaining from voting.

B. 2015. 2739 ALLEN AVENUE FOX PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Dana Mills

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct an addition to a house.

PROCEEDINGS: On January 26, 2015, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a preliminary review application to construct an addition at 2739 Allen Avenue, in the Fox Park Certified Local Historic District. The application was

submitted by the property owner.

Board members Richard Callow, (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, Melanie Fathman, David Richardson, Mike Killeen, Erin Wright and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #66098, which sets forth the standards for additions to residential buildings in the Fox Park Local Historic District. He noted that many of the standards are difficult to apply to this project as the small frame house is quite different from most of the building stock in the district. He recommended that the Board grant preliminary approval to the proposal based on the unusual site specific conditions .

Dana Mills, the property owner, testified on his own behalf.

FINDINGS OF FACTS: The Preservation Board found that:

- 2739 Allen is located in the Fox Park Local Historic District;
- the very small house does not meet contemporary standards for most
most would-be occupants of a single-family dwelling and therefore the concept of an addition and the provision of a garage on the property are acceptable;
- many of the standards for an addition are difficult to apply to the small wood-frame house that is quite different in scale and other factors from most of the buildings in the historic district;
- the positioning of the addition at the rear of the Semi-Public façade would maintain the perception of the historic house and the addition would be perceived as an addition;
- the location of the addition so far back on the lot would make it visible only from directly in front of the property and would not significantly alter the perception of the siting and setback of the historic house or buildings in the streetscape; and that
- the project does not meet all of the Fox Park Historic District standards, some of which are difficult to apply to this property. Given the small size of the original house and difficulty in applying all standards, the review focused on the scale, position, design and materials of the addition in relationship to the house.

BOARD DECISION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval for the project due to the fact that the owner would not be able to be put the property to reasonable beneficial use without the proposed addition. The motion included the stipulation that final plans and exterior details will be reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources

Office. The motion was made by Board Member Erin Wright and seconded by Board Member Mike Killeen. The motion passed with none opposed.

C. 2014.1745 1219 DOLMAN STREET LAFAYETTE SQUARE HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Michael Quinn

Applicant: Diversified Real Estate Group – John Muller

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Second submission: Preliminary review to construct a single family house.

PROCEEDINGS: On January 26, 2015, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a revised preliminary review application to construct a two-story, single-family building at 1219 Dolman Street, in the Lafayette Square Local Historic District. The application was submitted by the developer on behalf of the homeowner. The Board reviewed a prior proposal for this project at its December 15, 2014 meeting and had withheld preliminary approval of the same, as it was determined that the building design did not sufficiently follow a Historic Model Example.

Board members Richard Callow, (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, Melanie Fathman, David Richardson, Mike Killeen, Erin Wright and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the pertinent sections of City Ordinance #69112, and the new proposal consisting of a revised submitted by the developer for review. She stated that the present project had addressed the previous objections and now complied with the standards. She noted also that the Lafayette Square Restoration Committee was in support of the revised design.

John Muller of Diversified Reinvestment, the developer, testified on his own behalf.

FINDINGS OF FACTS: The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed site for construction, 1219 Dolman Street, is located within the boundaries of the Lafayette Square Historic District;
- the applicant has proposed a Historic Model Example for the new house, which has been approved by the Cultural Resources Office; and that
- the revisions submitted at the meeting have resolved the deviations of the original proposal at the front entry, front steps, front

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

JANUARY 26, 2015

Page 5 of 8

foundation and cornice and the project now complies with the Historic Model Example.

BOARD DECISION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval to the new construction as the revised drawings meet the Lafayette Square Historic District Standards. The motion was made by Board Member Richardson and seconded by Alderman Schmid. The motion passed with none opposed.

D. 2015.0059 2617 SHENANDOAH AVENUE FOX PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Emmaus Evangelical Lutheran Church

Applicant: Matthew A. Mano for Eagle Preparatory Schools

COMMERCIAL PLAN: Preliminary review for rehabilitation of the Emmaus Lutheran School.

PROCEEDINGS: On January 26, 2015, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a preliminary review application for the school building at 2617 Shenandoah, located in the Fox Park Local Historic District.

Board members Richard Callow (Chairman), David Richardson, Alderman Craig Schmid, Anthony Robinson, Melanie Fathman, Erin Wright and Michael Killeen were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Andrea Gagen of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #66098, which sets forth the standards for rehabilitation of buildings in the district. She discussed the project, testifying that many of the proposed changes to the building did not comply with the Fox Park Historic District standards. The windows on the front façade and two-bay returns, and the front entry were of particular concern. The staff was requesting that the front façade and return windows be replaced with more historically appropriate windows and that the front entry should remain a more open, simplified design. She testified that although the proposed accessibility ramp did not comply with the historic district standards, accessibility must be provided. The front façade appeared to be the only usable location. She also testified that because the owner was concerned about maintenance, security and cost, the staff suggested that some flexibility be allowed on the Semi-Public side façades behind the two-bay returns.

Matthew Mano, applicant and project architect; John Davis, Paric Corporation; Matt Hoehner, Eagle Schools Representative; and Andy Reahm, Eagle Preparatory Schools all testified on behalf of the project as presented.

FINDINGS OF FACTS: The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed site for rehabilitation, 2617 Shenandoah, is a contributing resource to the Fox Park Local Historic District.;
- the front façade windows are important to the historic character of the Emmaus Lutheran School;
- concerns over the safety of using double-hung windows could be relieved by using limiters, to limit the amount the windows that could be raised;
- the proposed changes to the front entry create a false history and do not meet the intent of the historic district ordinance;
- the proposed location and design of the accessibility ramp is appropriate; and that
- the side façades of the building are not as prominent and are of secondary concern.

BOARD ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval to the project with the stipulation that the front façade windows and entry meet the Fox Park Historic District standards. The motion was made by Board Member Anthony Robinson. Ms. Wright seconded the motion. The motion carried 5-1 with Board Member Mike Killeen in opposition.

NEW APPLICATION

E. 2014.1454 245 UNION BOULEVARD CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: City Apartments @ West End

COMMERCIAL PLAN: New application to erect one monument sign.

PROCEEDINGS: On January 26, 2015, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a new application to erect a 16-foot tall monument sign at 245 Union Boulevard, in the Central West End Historic District.

Board members Richard Callow, (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, Melanie Fathman, David Richardson, Mike Killeen, Erin Wright and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item. Board Member Richardson recused himself from participation in discussion or vote for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the pertinent sections of City Ordinance #69423. She stated that the requirements of the Central West End Historic District Standards

regarding commercial signs were based upon the Zoning Code, which limited the height and size of the sign, but that the applicant had received a variance from the Board of Adjustment for the sign as proposed. However, given the location of the sign near sidewalks and where pedestrians would enter the parking lot, the Cultural Resource Office staff recommended that the height of the sign be reduced to a maximum of 10 feet above grade. She noted that the Development Committee of the Central West End Association was not in support of the current proposal.

Jennifer Roth of Village Green Associates, representative of the property owner, testified on her own behalf. She stated that many mock-ups of the sign had been set up and that the 16-foot height had appeared to be the most appropriate, given the scale of the apartment buildings along Union Boulevard and the complex's 700-foot street frontage.

William Seibert, of the Central West End Association Development Committee, testified against the sign, and read into the record a letter from James Dwyer, Committee Chair, that stated that the Committee objected to the sign on the basis of its modern design, letter fonts and backlighting.

Hon. Lyda Krewson, Alderwoman of the 28th Ward, testified in support of the sign as proposed, stating that the complex of apartment buildings occupied a 4 acre site and were only requesting a single sign to identify four buildings.

FINDINGS OF FACTS: The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed site, 245 Union Boulevard, is located within the boundaries of the Central West End Historic District;
- the standards require adherence to the Zoning Code, and the sign was granted a variance in size and height at the Board of Adjustment;
- the sign will be located close to the public right of way and have an impact upon the pedestrian environment; and that
- the backlighting of the sign lettering is not compatible with the historic character of the district and site.

BOARD ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant approval to the sign application, with the condition that the sign not be backlit. The motion was made by Alderman Craig Schmid and seconded by Ms. Wright. The motion passed with none opposed and recused Board Member Richardson abstaining from voting.

APPEAL OF DIRECTOR'S DENIAL

F. 2014.1682 2215-17 INDIANA AVENUE MCKINLEY HEIGHTS HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Donald and Virginia Graham – Deferred per Owners' request.

SPECIAL AGENDA ITEMS:

Nominations to the National Register of Historic Places

G. Shriners' Hospital - 700-28 South Euclid Ave.

ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the Missouri State Historic Preservation Office that the Shriner's Hospital meets the requirements for listing on the National Register under Criterion A. The motion was made by Board member Melanie Fathman. Mr. Richardson seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

H. The Shell Building – 1221 Locust Street

ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the Missouri State Historic Preservation Office that the Shell Building meets the requirements for listing on the National Register under Criterion A and C. The motion was made by Board member Melanie Fathman. Mr. Richardson seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

Introduction to the Compatible Contemporary Design Standards project.

Betsy Bradley presented an overview of her study of the challenge of deciding if contemporary design is compatible in historic district locations. She reviewed some studies of the topic and provided a set of principles based on the characteristics of the historic districts in St. Louis, which have very comparable buildings rather than a variety of building ages and styles. She reported that she is working on both a scorecard to evaluate proposed construction as well as standards that would articulate what is considered to be compatible design.