

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES
JANUARY 27TH, 2020**

Board Members Present

Richard Callow – Chairman
Randy Vines
Mike Killeen
Ald. Joe Vaccaro
Anthony Robinson
David Richardson

Cultural Resources Office Staff Present

Dan Krasnoff, Director
Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator
Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner
Bethany Moore, Preservation Planner
Adona Buford, Adm. Assistant

Legal Counsel

Barbara Birkicht

PRELIMINARY REVIEWS

A. 2020.0045 5206 WASHINGTON BLVD. CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DIST

Owner: Bill and Denise Willers

Applicant: Killeen Studio Architects – Adam Davenport

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct new detached 2-story carriage house.

PROCEEDINGS: On January 27th, 2020, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a Preliminary Review application to construct a two-story carriage house in the Central West End Local Historic District.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), Randy Vines, Michael Killeen, David Richardson and Alderman Joe Vaccaro were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Daniel Krasnoff of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that reviewed the plans for the proposed carriage house. He indicated that the proposed building is largely in conformity with the Standards. He did note concern of the staff that the second story porch design was worthy of refinement.

FINDINGS OF FACTS: The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed site for construction, 5206 Washington Place, is located in the Central West End Local Historic District;
- the siting, scale, proportions, roof shape, and exterior materials comply with the Standards;
- the design of the second-story deck should be altered since it will be visible from the street.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval to the carriage house design with the condition that second story porch design is revised and subject to review of final documents, details and materials by the Cultural Resources Office. The motion was made by Commissioner Randy Vines. Commissioner David Richardson seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously

APPEALS OF DENIALS

B. 2019.1341 1722-30 S. 9TH STREET SOULARD HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: BKM Development – Scott Kemper

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

Appeal of a building permit application to retain two garage doors installed without a permit.

PROCEEDINGS:

On January 27, 2020, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an Appeal of the Director’s Denial to retain two (2) garage doors installed without a permit, at 1722-30 S. 9th Street, in the Soulard Local Historic District. Board members Richard Callow (Chair), Randy Vines, David Richardson, Mike Killeen, Alderman Joe Vaccaro, and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Andrea Gagen of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #62382, which sets forth the standards for the Soulard Local Historic District. She entered into the record ordinances #64689 as amended by #64925, and ordinance #62382. She stated that the two garage doors were installed without a permit. The historic district standards require existing storefronts to be replaced with storefronts. In addition, the garage doors installed do not replicate historic garage doors. Ms. Gagen also submitted into the record an email from 7th Ward Alderman Jack Coatar in support of the garage doors.

Scott Kemper of BKM Development, the owner, testified on his own behalf. A PowerPoint presentation was submitted into evidence.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 1722-30 S. 9th Street is located within the Soulard Local Historic District;
- the garage doors were installed without a permit;
- the installed garage doors do not comply with the Soulard Historic District Standards;
- the building is considered to have little or no architectural value.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the Director's denial of the garage door installation contingent on the owner obtaining a letter of support from the Soulard Restoration Group. The motion was made by Alderman Vaccaro. Commissioner David Richardson seconded the motion. Commissioners Michael Killeen and Anthony Robinson opposed the motion. The motion passed 3-2.

C. 2019.1871 2647 SHENANDOAH AVE. FOX PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Christopher Rico

Applicant: EFS Energy – Rick Ehrlinger

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

Appeal of a building permit application to Install 33 solar panels on roof.

PROCEEDINGS:

On January 27, 2020, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an Appeal of the Director's Denial install 33 solar panels, at 2647 Shenandoah Avenue, in the Fox Park Certified Local Historic District. Board members Richard Callow (Chair), Randy Vines, David Richardson, Mike Killeen, Alderman Joe Vaccaro, and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Andrea Gagen of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #66098, which sets forth the standards for the Fox Park Local Historic District. She entered into the record ordinances #64689 as amended by #64925, and ordinance #66098. She stated that the owner applied to install 33 solar panels, and the panels on the east side of the garage roof would be visible from the street. The historic district standards require that solar panels not be visible from the street. Ms. Gagen

also submitted into the record an email from 7th Ward Alderman Jack Coatar in support of the solar panels.

Todd Hulbert of EFS Energy, the applicant, testified in support of the project. A PowerPoint presentation was submitted into evidence.

Christopher Rico, the owner, testified on his own behalf.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 2647 Shenandoah Avenue is located within the Fox Park Certified Local Historic District;
- the Fox Park Historic District standards do not allow visible solar panels;
- the panels will be on the garage, which is not highly visible;
- recent City and State legislation has encouraged the use of solar energy.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the Director's denial of solar panel installation. The motion was made by Commissioner David Richardson. Commissioners Randy Vines and Alderman Joe Vaccaro seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

D. 2019.1912 5260 WESTMINSTER PL. CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Mark Wade and Darlene Blair

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

Appeal of a building permit application to replace front porch roof shingles and copper flashing.

PROCEEDINGS:

On January 27, 2020, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial to retain a front porch roof replaced without a permit, at 5260 Westminster Place, in the Central West End Local Historic District. The application was submitted by the contractor, Jarek Zarzycki.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), Randy Vines, Mike Killeen, David Richardson, Anthony Robinson, and Alderman Joe Vaccaro were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bethany Moore of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #56768 which sets forth the standards for roofs in the Central West End Local Historic District.

She entered into the record Ordinance #64689, as revised by City Ordinance #64925, the enabling legislation; and Ordinance #56768, the Central West End Local Historic District Ordinance, the Preservation Board Agenda and PowerPoint. Ms. Moore stated that the work that was done without a permit did not meet the Standards because the Standards state that original or historic roofing material shall be used wherever the roof is visible but materials that replicate the original may be used if the original or historic material is unavailable and the substitute material is approved by the Cultural Resources Office. She explained that had the applicant applied for a permit before the work was done they would have been told that the approved substitute material was GAF Slateline in a medium gray color to replicate the original slate material and that the shingle that was used, GAF Timberline in Hickory, was not an approved substitute material as it replicate wood-shake shingles and not slate shingles. Based upon the standards, Ms. Moore recommended that the Board uphold the Director's denial of the application.

Mark Wade, owner of the property, spoke on his own behalf. He stated that work to his gutters had damaged his roof and he needed to replace the whole roof on the front porch to stop water from leaking around the gutters. Mr. Wade stated that it was his understanding of the district standards that the replaced materials should match what was existing so he gave his contractor the green light to use the GAF Timberline shingles in a brown color to match the previous shingles. He stated it was his understanding that the contractor would get the permit. He also stated that there were layers of brown shingles underneath the previous roofing material.

In response to a question from Chairman Callow about permits Mr. Wade answered that he thought the contractor would handle the permit and once we received a letter from the Cultural Resources Office he sent the contractor to City Hall to get a permit. He then submitted before and after photos of the front porch roof to the Preservation Board. Mr. Wade stated that the house next door to him also had Timberline shingles on their roof.

In response to a question from Board Member Killeen Mr. Wade stated that he didn't think to get a letter from the neighborhood association but that he was sure he could get a letter of support from them.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the site of the work done without a permit, 5260 Westminster Place, is located in the Central West End Local Historic District.

- the Central West End standards for Roofs require historic or
- original roofing material or an approved substitute material to be used on visible roof sections.
- the front porch roof is a visible roof section.
- GAF Timberline in Hickory is not a substitute material approved by the Cultural Resources Office.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the Director's Denial with the stipulation that the appellant produce a letter of support from the neighborhood association. The motion was made by Commissioner Mike Killeen. Alderman Joe Vaccaro seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

E. 2019.1985 2743 GRAVOIS AVENUE FOX PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Amir M. Saqi

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

Appeal of a building permit application to Garage/workshop structure constructed without a permit.

PROCEEDINGS:

On January 27, 2020, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial to retain a commercial building built without a permit, at 2743 Gravois Avenue, in the Fox Park Local Historic District. The application was submitted by the owner, Amir Saqi.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), Randy Vines, Mike Killeen, David Richardson, Anthony Robinson, and Alderman Joe Vaccaro were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bethany Moore of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #66098 which sets forth the standards for new construction in the Fox Park Local Historic District. She entered into the record Ordinance #64689, as revised by City Ordinance #64925, the enabling legislation; and Ordinance #66098, the Fox Park Local Historic District Ordinance, the Preservation Board Agenda and PowerPoint.

Ms. Moore stated that the work that was done without a permit did not meet the specific criteria for new construction outline in Article 3 of the Fox Park Standards. She stated that Article 3 first calls for a Historic Model Example, for which the design of the new construction

must be based on, and then lists further specifications for site, mass, scale, proportion, ratio of solid to void, and Façade material and material color. Ms. Moore stated that the building did not comply with any of the criteria outlined in Article 3. Based upon the standards, Ms. Moore recommended that the Board uphold the Director's denial of the application. She also stated that the owner had expressed a willingness to work with the Cultural Resources Office to make changes to the façade in order to make it blend in better to the historic district.

In response to a question from Chairman Callow Ms. Moore stated that the suggested changes to the façade could include adding windows, trim boards, a cornice and paint.

In response to a question from Alderman Vaccaro Dan Krasnoff, Cultural Resources Director, stated that the Preservation Board could make any decision they saw fit and the Cultural Resources Office staff would uphold it.

In response to a question from Board Member Vines Mr. Krasnoff stated that the Cultural Resources Office was not the only city office that would need to approve a permit for the building and that it was an unusual situation to have a building built without any permits.

The owner, Amir Saqi, spoke on his own behalf. He stated that he needed the building so that he could wash cars in a place that was not exposed to the elements in order to avoid dangerous slippery conditions when the water froze, he wanted to store car batteries in the building to prevent theft and to park cars in when he got cars that had parts that were highly sought after targets of theft. Mr. Saqi also stated that since building the building he had gone through a zoning hearing and his building was approved in that process. He stated that when the building was built the design for it was intended to replicate the existing building on the parcel that his business operated out of. He asked the Preservation Board to grant him a variance as he stated that the building did not negatively impact any neighbors, detract from the neighborhood, effect traffic, or effect the public safety of the neighborhood. Mr. Saqi told the Board he also submitted a letter from the neighboring business in support of his building.

In response to a question from Chairman Callow Mr. Saqi answered he was seeking the variance because he could not meet the standards for new construction and was willing to work with the Cultural Resources Office to make façade changes.

In response to a follow up question from Chairman Callow Mr. Saqi answered he thought since he was not bringing water or electricity to

the building and considered it a shed he would not need a permit for the construction. He also stated that was advice given to him by a customer. Mr. Saqi then submitted documents into the record for the Board to view.

In response to a question from Alderman Vacarro Mr. Saqi stated that he had called his Alderman on two occasions before his Zoning hearing and did not hear back from them.

Judy McGrath then spoke on behalf of Mr. Saqi in support of his building.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the site of the building built without a permit, 2743 Gravois, is located in the Fox Park Local Historic District;
- tabling the item until the next month's meeting was not prejudicial to the appellant.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to table the item until the next Board meeting. The motion was made by Commissioner Mike Killeen. Randy Vines seconded the motion. Commissioner Robinson opposed the motion. The motion passed with 4-1.

SPECIAL AGENDA ITEMS

Nominations to the National Register of Historic Places

F.

KINGSHIGHWAY HILLS COMMERCIAL DISTRICT
3701-3835 S. Kingshighway Boulevard

ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the Missouri State Historic Preservation Office that the Kingshighway Hills Commercial District meets National Register Criterion A for Architecture. The motion was made by Commissioner David Richardson and seconded by Randy Vines and Mike Killeen. The motion passed unanimously.

G.

SAVINGS TRUST COMPANY OF ST. LOUIS - 4915 Delmar Boulevard

ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to Direct the staff to prepare a report for the Missouri State Historic Preservation Office that the Savings Trust Company of St. Louis meets National Register Criterion C for Architecture. The motion was made by Commissioner David Richardson and seconded by Randy Vines and Mike Killeen. The motion passed unanimously.

H.

ACTION:

ST. LOUIS METROPOLITAN POLICE GARAGE - 3919 Laclede Avenue

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the Missouri State Historic Preservation Office that the St. Louis Metropolitan Police Garage meets National Register Criterion A for Community Planning & Development. The motion was made by Commissioner David Richardson and seconded by Randy Vines and Mike Killeen. The motion passed unanimously.

I.

ACTION:

EUCLID SCHOOL aka WASHINGTON SCHOOL- 1131 N. Euclid Ave.

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the Missouri State Historic Preservation Office that the Euclid School meets National Register Criterion A for Education. The motion was made by Commissioner David Richardson and seconded by Randy Vines and Mike Killeen. The motion passed unanimously.