

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES
JANUARY 28, 2019**

Board Members Present

Richard Callow – Chairman
Randy Vines
Mike Killeen
Tiffany Hamilton
Anthony Robinson

Cultural Resources Office Staff Present

Dan Krasnoff, Director
Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator
Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner
Bethany Moore, Preservation Planner
Adona Buford, Adm. Assistant

Legal Counsel

Barbara Birkicht

PRELIMINARY REVIEWS

A. 2019.0067 2639-43 SHENANDOAH AVENUE FOX PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: LRA – C/O Garcia Properties
Applicant: Tony Duncan Architecture

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct a new two-family building.

PROCEEDINGS: On January 28, 2019, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a Preliminary Review application to construct two attached townhouses at 2639-43 Shenandoah Avenue, in the Fox Park Local Historic District.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), Randy Vines, Tiffany Hamilton, Michael Killeen and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Andrea Gagen of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that reviewed the plans of the proposed building and showed photographs of the site and surrounding area. She indicated that the design was based upon an appropriate Model Example located on the same block and generally complied with the Soulard Historic District Standards for New Construction. The Cultural Resources Office asked that the brick on the west elevation be extended the full length of the façade and the

windows on that elevation be revised. Ms Gagen recommended that the Preservation Board grant Preliminary Approval to the project, with the stipulations regarding the west elevation.

Berto Garcia, owner, and Anthony Duncan, the project architect, testified on behalf of the project.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 2639-43 Shenandoah Avenue is located in the Fox Park Local Historic District;
- the proposal is to construct two attached townhouses.
- the design generally complies with the Soulard requirements for new construction and follows a Model Example;
- the brick on the exposed west elevation should continue the length of the façade;
- the windows on the west elevation should more closely follow the Model Example.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant Preliminary Approval to the project, with the stipulation that the brick on the west elevation extend the length of that façade and that the windows on that elevation more closely follow the Model Example building, and subject to review of final drawings and exterior materials by the Cultural Resources Office. The motion was made by Board Member Killeen and seconded by Board Member Robinson. The motion passed unanimously.

B. 2018.1291 1224-26 ANN AVENUE

SOULARD HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Frank E. McGuire

Applicant: Engine House No. 1 – Marian Smith

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

Preliminary review to construct a two-story alley building.

PROCEEDINGS:

On January 28, 2019, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a Preliminary Review application to construct a two-story carriage house at 1224-26 Rear Ann Avenue, in the Soulard Local Historic District.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), Randy Vines, Tiffany Hamilton, Michael Killeen and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that reviewed the plans of the proposed building and showed photographs of the site and surrounding area. She indicated that the design was based upon an appropriate Model Example at 1040 Russell and complied with the Souldard Historic District Standards for New Construction. Ms. Cameron recommended that the Preservation Board grant Preliminary Approval to the project.

Marion Smith of Engine House # 1 P.C., the project architect, was present but did not testify.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 1224-26 Ann Avenue is located in the Souldard Neighborhood Local Historic District;
- the proposal is to construct a 2-story carriage house with first floor garage and living quarters above;
- the design complies with the Souldard requirements for new construction and follows a Model Example.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant Preliminary Approval to the project, subject to review of final drawings and exterior materials by the Cultural Resources Office. The motion was made by Board Member Hamilton and seconded by Board Member Vines. The motion passed unanimously.

APPEALS OF DENIALS

C. 2018.1555 3918-20 SHENANDOAH AVENUE SHAW HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Cheng Hsiao Wu

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

Appeal of a denial of a building permit application to replace front porch steps.

PROCEEDINGS:

On January 28, 2019, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial to replace steps, at 3918-20 Shenandoah Avenue, in the Shaw Neighborhood Historic

District. The application was submitted by the owner, Cheng Hsiao Wu.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), Mike Killeen, Randy Vines, Tiffany Hamilton, and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Andrea Gagen of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #59400 which sets forth the standards for architectural details in the Shaw Neighborhood Local Historic District. She entered into the record certified copies of Ordinance #64689, as revised by City Ordinance #64925, the enabling legislation; and Ordinance #59400, the Shaw Neighborhood Historic District, the Preservation Board Agenda and PowerPoint. Ms. Gagen stated that the proposed concrete steps and handrail did not comply with the historic district standards due to the material. Based upon the standards, Ms. Gagen recommended that the Board uphold the Director's denial of the application. Cheng Hsiao Wu, owner of the property, spoke on his own behalf. He noted that there were other concrete steps in the neighborhood. He stated that he would not be opposed to using a wood handrail.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed site 3918-20 Shenandoah Ave., is located in the Shaw Neighborhood Local Historic District;
- the district standards do not allow changes to the original form of porches;
- changing the material of the steps would not have a noticeable impact on the character of the building if painted.
- the wood-patterned stamping does not replicate the look of wood steps;
- the handrail material should be maintained as existing.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the Director's Denial and allow the installation of the concrete with the stipulation that the handrail be an historic wood handrail, no stamping be done, and the steps be painted per Cultural Resources Staff's recommendation.

The motion was made by Board Member Mike Killeen and seconded by both Randy Vines and Tiffany Hamilton. Mr. Robinson opposed the motion. The motion passed, 3-1.

D. 2018.1563 6154 DELMAR BOULEVARD SKINKER-DeBALIVIERE HIST. DISTRICT

Owner: Church Building LLC – Joe Edwards
Applicant: Neon Time LLC – David Hutson

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of a denial of a building permit application to erect one projecting neon sign and one illuminated marquee sign.

PROCEEDINGS: On January 28, 2019, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an Appeal from the Director’s Administrative Denial to erect two signs for the front of a proposed new building at 6154 Delmar Boulevard, located in the Skinker-DeBaliviere/Catlin Tract/Parkview Local Historic District.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), Randy Vines, Tiffany Hamilton, Michael Killeen and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that reviewed the sign designs and their locations on the proposed building. She entered into the record certified copies of Ordinance #64689 as amended by Ordinance 64925; Ordinance #57688, the Skinker-DeBaliviere/Catlin Tract/Parkview Historic District ordinance, amended by Ordinance 70821, the new historic standards, as well as the Board’s agenda and her PowerPoint presentation. Ms. Cameron stated that 6154 Delmar will be located in an entertainment area and the proposed signs would not be out of character with other developments in the vicinity. While the signs did not comply with the district sign standards in their number, lighting and size, the Cultural Resources Office was in support of an exception to the standards. She therefore recommended that the Preservation Board overturn the Director’s Administrative Denial and approve the signs as proposed.

Ms. Cameron submitted into the record a letter in support of the project from Heather Navarro, the 28th Ward Alderwoman, Joe Edwards, the owner of the proposed facility, testified that the design of the signs were carefully designed to be compatible with signs already approved for other buildings on Delmar and that they were of high quality. He submitted letters in support of the signs from the Delmar Community Committee and the East Loop Commercial Improvement District.

- FINDINGS OF FACTS:** The Preservation Board found that:
- 6154 Delmar is located in the Skinker-DeBaliviere Local Historic District;
 - the proposed signs are not in compliance with the Sign Standards in number, size, lighting and moving elements;
 - this area of Delmar is characterized by innovative business enterprises and inventive building design. The signs are compatible with other signs in the Loop and with decorative elements of the streetscape.

BOARD DECISION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the Director’s administrative denial and to approve the signs as submitted by the appellant. The motion was made by Board Member Randy Vines. Mr. Killeen seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

E. 2019.0002 4142 BLAINE AVENUE NORTH I-44 HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Lynn & Rachel Deffenbaugh
Applicant: Bolt Construction – Matthew Pointer

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of a denial of a building permit application to construct a deck on front facade.

PROCEEDINGS: On November 26, 2018, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of a Director’s Denial to construct a front deck on a building at 4142 Blaine Avenue, in the North I-44 Local Historic District. The appeal was submitted by the applicant, Matthew Pointer of Bolt Construction.

Board members Chairman Richard Callow, Michael Killeen, Randy Vines, Tiffany Hamilton, and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Andrea Gagen of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #60370, which sets forth the standards for architectural details in the North I-44 Local Historic District. Ms. Gagen stated that the proposed deck was not compatible with the existing historic character or the contemporary architecture.

Ms. Gagen introduced into the record certified copies of Ordinances #64689 as amended by Ordinance #64925, the Enabling Ordinance; and #60370, the North I-44 Historic District; the PowerPoint and the agenda item.

Lynn Deffenbaugh, owner of 4142 Blaine Ave., testified on behalf of the project.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 4142 Blaine Avenue is located in the North I-44 Local Historic District;
- the proposed deck is not comply with the historic district standards as it is not compatible;
- a screened patio or porch could be possible at that location.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to Board upheld the Director's Denial of the front deck as it was not compatible. Board Member Killeen made the motion, which was seconded by Board Member Robinson. The motion passed unanimously, 4 to 0.

SPECIAL AGENDA ITEMS

Nominations to the National Register of Historic Places

F.

Columbia Oil Company Building – 3419 Papin

ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the Missouri State Historic Preservation Office that the Columbia Oil Company Building meets National Register Criterion A for Commerce. The motion was made by Board member Anthony Robinson and seconded by Ms. Hamilton. The motion passed unanimously.

G.

IBEW – 5850 Elizabeth Avenue

ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the Missouri State Historic Preservation Office that the International Brotherhood of Electrical Workers meets National Register Criterion C for Architecture. The motion was made by Board member Anthony Robinson and seconded by Ms. Hamilton. The motion passed unanimously.

H.

St. Louis Globe Democrat Building – 900 N. Tucker Blvd.

ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the Missouri State Historic Preservation Office that the St. Louis Globe Democrat Building meets National Register Criterion C for Architecture. The motion was made by Board member

Anthony Robinson and seconded by Ms. Hamilton. The motion passed unanimously.