

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES
OCTOBER 26, 2015**

Board Members Present

Alderman Terry Kennedy (acting Chairman)

David Richardson

Mike Killeen

Nate Johnson

Melanie Fathman

Legal Counsel

Barbara Birkicht

Cultural Resources Office Staff Present

Betsy Bradley, Director

Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator

Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner

Bob Bettis, Preservation Planner

Adona Buford, Administrative Assistant

PRELIMINARY REVIEWS

A. 2015.1678 4172 BLAINE AVENUE SHAW HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Botanical Heights Homes, LLC

Applicant: UIC – Sarah Gibson

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct a single family house.

PROCEEDINGS: On September 26, 2015, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a preliminary review application for the construction of a two-story residence at 4172 Blaine Avenue, located in the North I-44 Local Historic District.

Board members Alderman Terry Kennedy (Acting Chairman), Nathaniel Johnson, David Richardson, Melanie Fathman and Michael Killeen were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office discussed the project, testifying that the proposed building would be two stories with a shed roof, constructed on the third lot east on the southeast corner of Blaine and Klemm Avenues. She testified that while some elements of the proposed design did not strictly comply with the historic district standards, the scale and massing of the building and its brick façade were appropriate and compatible with the district's historic buildings. She noted, however, that the unusual fenestration at the front façade did not follow any historic precedent and detracted from the compatibility of the design. She also stated that on the east and west facades, cement panels — which have been accepted in this district as a substitute for brick on side elevations — are proposed to be set in an irregular pattern of varied size; this pattern will diminish the appearance of a flat wall surface, and counter the standards' requirement for consistency of exterior materials.

Sarah Gibson of U.I.C., architect for the project, spoke in support, stating that there was a variety of window types and proportions in the neighborhood, and that the fenestration had been designed to take advantage of the north light and highlight the design of the building's interior.

John McAllister, the prospective owner of the building, spoke in support of the project.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed site is located in the North I-44 Local Historic District. The design is proposed for only this location;
- the applicant intends to construct a two-story house in a contemporary design on two adjoining parcels;
- while the developer intends to construct additional 2-story townhouses on the parcels to the west of the site, the east facade of the proposed building will face a wide side yard and be permanently exposed to view;
- the style of the building is not in compliance with some of the district standards for new construction, which do not address contemporary design. Recent buildings erected in the district have established a new architectural vocabulary and therefore it appears appropriate to support some exceptions to the existing standards. The unusual fenestration pattern of the front façade, however, creates a disparate element which counters other compatible aspects of the building design;

- a dark red brick, the dominant material in the district, is proposed for the front façade, which complies with the district standards; and
- the highly-visible sides of the house will present a considerable amount of cement siding arranged in a mosaic-like pattern of cement panels of varying height and width, which will detract from the compatibility of the design.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board grant preliminary approval to the project, with the conditions that the front fenestration and the cement panel arrangement be revised and final plans, exterior materials and colors are reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office. Board Member Mike Killeen made the motion, which was seconded by Board Member Nate Johnson. The motion carried with none opposing.

B. 2015.1680 4490/4494 LINDELL BLVD. CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DIST.

Owner: Optimist International

Applicant: The Koman Group – Mark Venturella

COMMERCIAL PLAN:

Preliminary review to rehabilitate two office buildings.

PROCEEDINGS:

On October 26, 2015, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a Preliminary Review for a proposal to rehabilitate two office buildings. The properties are located in the Central West End Historic District in Ward 17. The Koman Group, which has an option to purchase the building, was the applicant; Optimist International is the owner of the property.

Board members Alderman Terry Kennedy (acting Chairman) , David Richardson, Nate Johnson, Melanie Fathman, and Mike Killeen were present for the testimony. David Richardson recused himself from the consideration of this agenda item.

Betsy Bradley of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the standards for repairs and rehabilitation of Historic Commercial Buildings in the Central West End Historic District. She presented letters of support for the project from Alderman Joseph Roddy, the Washington University Medical Center Redevelopment Corporation, and Andrew Weil of the Landmarks Association.

Stacey Wehe, architect, Christner, Inc., reviewed the architecture of the buildings, construction assemblies, and existing conditions of the exterior walls.

Josh Udelhofen, representing the Koman Group, testified that the proposal respects and improves the architecture of the buildings, which he stated are not viable for any use in their current state.

Brooks Geddeger, representing Park Central, reported that the project received unanimous support from the Development Committee. He considers the project to be a nice rehabilitation that keeps the integrity of the building and Class A office space is very welcome in the neighborhood.

Connie Pellock, representing the Optimist International Organization, reported that the members of the organization prefer the current proposal to the possible demolition of the buildings.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- this proposal does not meet the intent of the historic district standards for maintaining the historic materials and character of the exterior walls and windows;
- the travertine tile exterior of the walls of the pavilion is applied directly to material behind it in an atypical construction method. The applicant's architect describes it as a "tiled interior partition wall" placed to perform as a "mass wall;"
- the windows of the pavilion are units field-glazed to stone frames. The glazing consists of panes of glass joined only by caulk in each opening;
- the applicant submits evidence that the exterior envelope of the pavilion – the travertine veneer and the field-glazed windows – comprise a poorly-performing building envelope and asserts that it cannot be repaired. Submitted materials do not point to any area that requires repair at this time, but there is concern regarding long-term performance;
- the applicant has not submitted an analysis of the technical requirements or costs for reconstructing the walls of new materials so that they have an in-kind appearance, although constructed of standard methods;

- as an alternative to retaining or reconstructing the exterior walls to appear as originally designed, the applicant proposes to install a glazed wall with the former bay rhythms indicated in the treatment of the glass;
- the other character-defining architectural elements of the pavilion – the exterior structural columns, the masonry piers framing the entrance, the set of horizontal slabs that connect with the piers and columns: the terrace, cantilevered second floor, and roof soffits – would remain intact;
- the creation of an accessible main entrance is proposed by excavating down to provide an at-grade main entrance into the lower story in the Lindell façade;
- the proposal meets all of the Site Work standards in the historic district standards;
- at the request of the Cultural Resources Office, the applicant provided the typical range for the ratio of glazing to solid walls for Class A commercial office space, which is reported to be 35-40 percent. The overall percentage for the 1962 building is 24.6 percent;
- suggestions to increase the lighting into the interior in ways other than through the exterior walls have been described by the applicants as unworkable options due to the configuration of the site and building code requirements;
- as the International Energy Conservation Code requires that all “additions, alterations or repairs” to existing buildings must comply with current energy standards, and as the Optimist Buildings are not “listed or certified” as historic buildings, the buildings are not exempt from these requirements;
- there are building-specific conditions and building code requirements that would need to be addressed by any future owner. Yet rehabilitation solutions, which range from retention of some of the original wall design to reconstruction of the wall and windows to perform better and meet modern energy codes, are not proposed; and
- the project presents a mix of honoring the past and providing a future as a compromise solution.

BOARD DECISION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval of the rehabilitation of the two buildings as presented with the condition that final plans be reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office. The motion was made by Board member Mike Killeen, which was seconded by Board member Nate Johnson. The motion passed with three board members voting in favor of it.

APPEALS OF DENIALS

C. 2015.1142 2017 ARSENAL STREET BENTON PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Benton Park LLC – Dan Kelly

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of a denial of a building permit to install a non-compliant handrail.

PROCEEDINGS: On October 26, 2015, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial of a building permit application to install handrails at 2017 Arsenal Street in the Benton Park Local Historic District. The applicant submitted the appeal.

Board members Alderman Terry Kennedy (acting Chairman), David Richardson, Mike Killeen, Nate Johnson and Melanie Fathman were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Andrea Gagen of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #67175, which sets forth the standards for existing buildings in the Benton Park Local Historic District.

Ms. Gagen entered into the record certified copies of Ordinances #64689, as revised by #64925, and #67175; the Board agenda and the PowerPoint presentation for 2017 Arsenal Street; and the building permit application. She also entered into the record letters of support for the project from the Benton Park Neighborhood Association and 9th Ward Alderman Kenneth Ortmann.

Dan Kelly, the owner, testified on his own behalf.

FINDINGS OF FACTS: The Preservation Board found that:

- 2017 Arsenal St. is located in the Benton Park Local Historic District;
- the proposed handrail is not based on an Historic Model Example (HME); and
- the handrails have already been fabricated.

BOARD DECISION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the Director's Denial of the building permit due to the acceptable design of the handrail and neighborhood support of the project. Board Member Killeen made the motion, which was seconded by Board Member Richardson. The motion passed unanimously

D. 2015.1479 4308 DR. MARTIN L. KING THE VILLE HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Russco Properties LLC – Ed Russco
Applicant: Miller Construction – John Miller

COMMERCIAL PLAN: Appeal of a denial of a building permit to construct a laundromat and business center.

PROCEEDINGS: On October 26, 2015, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial of a building permit application to construct a commercial building, at 4308 Dr. Martin Luther King Drive in the The Ville Local Historic District. The applicant submitted the appeal.

Board members Alderman Terry Kennedy (acting Chairman), David Richardson, Mike Killeen, Nate Johnson and Melanie Fathman were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Andrea Gagen of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #60236, which sets forth the standards for commercial and non-residential buildings in The Ville Local Historic District.

Ms. Gagen entered into the record certified copies of Ordinances #64689, as revised by #64925, and #60236; the Board agenda and the PowerPoint presentation for 4308 Dr. Martin Luther King Drive; and the building permit application.

Joe Wiedemeier, architect for the project, spoke on behalf of the project and submitted revised drawings. Ed Shalabi, the owner, also testified on his own behalf and submitted a letter of support from 4th Ward Alderman Samuel Moore.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 4308 Dr. Martin Luther King Drive is located in The Ville Local Historic District;
- the original proposal submitted did not comply with the historic standards for new construction regarding exterior materials;
- the owner agreed to make changes to the materials and add landscape screening to the parking lot; and
- the revisions submitted by the architect at the meeting comply with the standards in regard to materials.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the Director's Denial of the building permit depicted in the original design and approved the revised design presented at the meeting, on the condition that the owner submits revised drawings with the changes to materials and parking lot screening. Board Member Killeen made the motion, which was seconded by Board Member Fathman. The motion passed unanimously.

E. 2015.1485 5052 WESTMINSTER PLACE CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DIST.

Owner: Aaron Biala and Iskra Pusic

Applicant: Patrick Moore Construction Company

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

Appeal of a denial of a building permit to construct a retaining wall.

PROCEEDINGS:

On October 26, 2015, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial of a building permit application to construct a retaining wall, at 5052 Westminster Place in the Central West End Local Historic District. The contractor submitted the appeal.

Board members Alderman Terry Kennedy (acting Chairman), Nate Johnson, David Richardson, Mike Killeen and Melanie

Fathman, and were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #69423, which sets forth the standards for residential property rehabilitation in the Central West End Local Historic District. He testified that the project was not in compliance as the introduction of a new retaining wall is prohibited under the Standards.

Mr. Bettis entered into the record certified copies of Ordinances #64689, as revised by #64925, and #69423; the Board agenda and the PowerPoint presentation for 4632 Maryland Avenue. A letter from the Central West End Association Planning and Development Committee in support of the Director's denial was submitted into the record.

Anne Moore, the contractor, testified on behalf of the owners, stating that the new retaining wall was needed to stop erosion. The contractor claimed as reasons for requesting an exception to the Central West End Standards that there were no other solutions to the erosion issue of the front slope and that there are other non-compliant walls on the street and in the neighborhood. She entered into the record a letter of support from block captain Daniel Laudiss, and photographs of non-compliant walls in the neighborhood.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 5052 Westminster Place is located in the Central West End Local Historic District;
- excavation for the retaining wall construction began without a permit;
- the original slope of the front terrace was not altered previously. Bricks had been laid at the sidewalk line to help retain the soil;
- the retaining wall would be a new structure; and
- the proposed wall would be semi-circular and constructed of natural limestone.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the Director's Denial of the building permit because the introduction of a retaining wall where there was no prior wall is prohibited

under the Central West End historic district standards. Board Member Killeen made the motion, which was seconded by Board Member Richardson. The motion passed with all five Board Members voting in favor.

F. 2015.1527 4387 WESTMINSTER PLACE CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DIST.

Owner/Applicant: Joseph E. Scoggin, Jr.

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of a denial of a building permit to install new fascia, soffit and frieze board.

PROCEEDINGS: On October 26, 2015, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial of a building permit application to replace wooden soffits and crown moldings with fiber cement board at 4387 Westminster Avenue in the Central West End Local Historic District. The owner submitted the appeal.

Board members Alderman Terry Kennedy (acting Chairman) Nate Johnson David Richardson, Mike Killeen, and Melanie Fathman were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #69423, which sets forth the standards for residential rehabilitation in the Central West End Local Historic District. He testified that the project was not in compliance as the proposed material cannot replicate the original appearance of the details to be replaced.

Mr. Bettis entered into the record certified copies of Ordinances #64689, as revised by #64925, and #69423; the Board agenda and the PowerPoint presentation for 4632 Maryland Avenue. A letter from the Central West End Association Planning and Development Committee in support of the applicant's proposal was presented into the record.

Joseph Scoggin, the owner, testified on his own behalf, stating that he wanted to replace the wood with a durable maintenance free product. Andy Young, the contractor from Lakeside Exteriors, testified in support of the project.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 4387 Westminster Place is located in the Central West End Local Historic District;
- the soffit and other detailing could be replicated in wood but at the additional cost;
- the proposed work will not replicate the original appearance of the soffit although the fiber cement board could be cut in curved sections and installed.; and
- the crown molding will be replicated in a cast material.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the Director's Denial of the building permit for the use of fiber cement board for the soffit with the condition that ventilation holes will not be visible from street and that the crown molding be replicated in another material. The motion was made by Board member Nate Johnson, which was seconded by Board Member Fathman. Board member Richardson voted against the motion which passed four to one.

G. 2015.1480

2245-47 GRAND BOULEVARD

SHAW HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: L'Origine Commons LLC – Lynda Rasmussen

COMMERCIAL PLAN:

Appeal of a denial of a building permit to install non-compliant fencing.

PROCEEDINGS:

On October 26, 2015, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial of a building permit application to erect a 10-foot high perimeter fence, at 2245-55 S. Grand Boulevard in the Shaw Neighborhood Local Historic District. The applicant submitted the appeal.

Board members Alderman Terry Kennedy (acting Chairman), David Richardson, Mike Killeen, Nate Johnson and Melanie Fathman were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Andrea Gagen of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #59400, which sets forth the standards for commercial and non-residential buildings in the Shaw Neighborhood Local Historic District.

Ms. Gagen entered into the record certified copies of Ordinances #64689, as revised by #64925, and #594006; the Board agenda and the PowerPoint presentation for 2245-55 S. Grand Boulevard; and the building permit application. She also submitted into the record letters of support for the project from the Shaw Neighborhood Improvement Association and 8th Ward Alderman Stephen Conway.

Cevin Lee spoke on the owner's behalf and submitted an informational packet.

Kore Wilbert testified in support of the project.

Alderman Stephen Conway, Ward 8, testified in support of the project if modifications to the height and materials were made.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 2245-55 S. Grand Boulevard is located in the Shaw Neighborhood Local Historic District;
- the proposed fence would be 10 foot high, 4 foot above the maximum height allowed under the historic district standards;
- the vinyl-sided panels on the back of the fence do not comply with the historic district standards; and
- the fence is of a contemporary design.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the Director's denial of the building permit, but approved an 8-foot high fence of the same design without the vinyl-sided panels. The motion was made by Board Member Richardson made the motion, which was seconded by Board Member Johnson. The motion passed unanimously.

SPECIAL AGENDA ITEMS

Nominations to the National Register of Historic Places

H.

ACTION:

Welfare Finance Company Building – 1027-29 N. Grand Blvd.

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the Missouri State Historic Preservation Office that the Welfare Finance Company Building meets the requirements for listing on the National Register. The motion was made by Board member David Richardson and seconded by Nate Johnson. The motion passed unanimously.

I. Holly Hills Historic District

ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the Missouri State Historic Preservation Office that the Holly Hills Historic District meets the requirement for listing on the National Register. The motion was made by Board member David Richardson and seconded by Nate Johnson. The motion passed unanimously.

**J. St. Louis Post Dispatch Rotogravure Printing Plant
4340-50 Duncan Avenue**

ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the Missouri State Historic Preservation Office that the St. Louis Post Dispatch Rotogravure Printing Plant meets the requirement for listing on the National Register. The motion was made by Board member David Richardson and seconded by Nate Johnson. The motion passed unanimously.

**K. Gravois-Jefferson Streetcar Suburb Boundary Increase I
2648-54 Gravois Avenue**

ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the Missouri State Historic Preservation Office that the Gravois-Jefferson Streetcar Suburb Boundary Increase I meets the requirements for listing on the National Register. The motion was made by Board member David Richardson and seconded by Nate Johnson. The motion passed unanimously.

L. Alexander M.W. Residence – 3965 Westminster Place

PROCEEDINGS: Betsy Bradley, Director of the Cultural Resources Office reviewed the building and stated reasons why she did not recommend it as eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places. She presented letters in support of the nomination from Board of Aldermen President Lewis E. Reed, City Comptroller Darlene Green, Paul M. Sheldon, and Laura Rand Orthwein.

Michael Allen, the preparer of the nomination, stated reasons why he felt the property was eligible for listing. Tom Braford, representing the owner of the property, requested that the Board support the nomination with a vote that supports its eligibility.

ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the Missouri State Historic Preservation Office that the Alexander M.W. Residence meets the requirements for

listing on the National Register. The motion was made by Board member Mike Killeen and seconded by Nate Johnson. The motion passed with David Richardson voting against it.