

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES
OCTOBER 27, 2014**

Board Members Present

Richard Callow, Chairman
Mike Killeen
Alderman Craig Schmid
Anthony Robinson
David Visintainer
Melanie Fathman

Legal Counsel

Barbara Birkicht

Cultural Resources Office Staff Present

Betsy Bradley, Director
Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator
Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner
Bob Bettis, Preservation Planner
Adona Buford, Administrative Assistant

Chairman Richard Callow called the roll. Six (6) Board members were in attendance. Board member Anthony Robinson moved to approve the July 28, 2014 minutes. Melanie Fathman seconded the motion which passed. Board member Dave Visintainer moved to approve the September 22, 2014 minutes. Mr. Robinson seconded the motion, which passed. Alderman Craig Schmid moved to approve the October 27, 2014 Agenda. Hearing no objection, the Agenda was approved. The Board discussed December 15, 2014 as a possible December meeting date.

PRELIMINARY REVIEWS

A. 2014.1421 4167 McREE AVENUE NORTH I-44 HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Botanical Heights Homes (under contract)

Applicant: UIC – Sarah Gibson

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct new single family house.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

OCTOBER 27, 2014

Page 2 of 16

PROCEEDINGS:

On October 27, 2014, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code to consider a preliminary review application to construct a single-family residence at 4167 McRee located in the North I-44 Local Historic District. Botanical Heights Homes, LLC, the owner, submitted the application.

Board members Richard Callow (Chairman), David Visintainer, Alderman Craig Schmid, Melanie Fathman, Anthony Robinson, and Michael Killeen were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Betsy Bradley, Director of the Cultural Resources Office, presented images of the proposed construction and reviewed it in terms of the North I-44 Historic District Standards.

Brent Crittenden, representing UIC and Botanical Heights Homes LLC, explained some of the intentions of the design. He stated that he would be opposed to changing exterior materials from those proposed and would prefer not to place the house differently in terms of the setback line.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed site for construction, 4167 McRee, is located in the North I-44 Local Historic District. The design is proposed for only this location;
- the applicant proposes to construct one multi-story house in a contemporary design on a large property with a wide side yard to the east, a condition that makes the east side of the house highly visible;
- a dark red brick, the dominant material in the district, is proposed for approximately half of the street-facing portion of the house. This material and its color comply with the district standards;
- the proportion of cement board siding, comprising the other half of the front façade, is certainly greater than the standards suggest for wood to be used on visible elevations in the district. The highly-visible east side of the proposed house will be entirely sided. This expanse of siding does not comply with the district standards;

- the contemporary design of the building does not comply with most of the other standards or new construction and does not meet a “first glance” visual compatibility test that the standards are worded to support;
- the McRee Town West Redevelopment Corporation has not adopted any redevelopment plan that precludes jurisdiction of the historic district new construction standards;
- no minor changes can bring the house into compliance with the majority of the standards; and
- the lack of compliance is sufficient to support withholding preliminary approval of the project and consistent with the Preservation Board’s adherence to the use of compliant materials on new construction in this district and supporting historic district standards for new construction.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to withhold preliminary approval of the project until the applicant addresses the exterior materials, setback line and single slope roof. The motion was made by Board Member Anthony Robinson. Mr. Visintainer seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

B. 2014.1422

4056 RUSSELL BLVD.

SHAW HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Mel Brandt

Applicant: Bill and Maureen McCuen

COMMERCIAL PLAN:

Preliminary review to rehabilitate one-story commercial building.

PROCEEDINGS:

On October 27, 2014, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a preliminary review application for exterior redesign of a one-story vacant and derelict concrete block commercial building at 4056 Russell Avenue, located in the Shaw Certified Local Historic District.

Board members Richard Callow (Chairman), David Visintainer, Alderman Craig Schmid, Anthony Robinson, Melanie Fathman and

Michael Killeen were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office discussed the project, testifying that 4056 Russell is considered a non-contributing building to the historic district, being constructed in 1965, long after the district's period of significance; and that the building when constructed was a very modest example of Mid-century Modern design, and furthermore had been altered from its original appearance. Ms. Cameron stated that while some elements of the proposed redesign did not strictly comply with the historic district standards, the architect had attempted to relate the redesign to the existing historic fabric using a contemporary vocabulary that referenced historic materials and precedent. She testified that the same methodology had received previous Preservation Board approval for the applicant's redesign of the adjacent 1960 service station at 4066 Russell.

William McCuen, architect and owner, appeared in support of the project.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed site for construction, 4056 Russell Boulevard, is located in the Shaw Local Historic District but is a non-contributing resource in that district;
- the original Mid-century Modern design of the building was very minimal, and has since been inappropriately altered;
- the property will be developed together with the conversion of the adjacent service station at 4066 Russell, and will display similar design elements and exterior materials; the proposed exterior materials are generally in compliance with the Shaw Historic District Standards; and
- the proposed redesign of the building, while thoroughly contemporary, does to some extent reference historic details found within the historic district and the Standards do not prohibit contemporary design that is deemed compatible with historic buildings.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval to the project, with the stipulation that final drawings and exterior material finishes are reviewed and

approved by the Cultural Resources Office. The motion was made by Board Member David Visintainer. Ms. Fathman seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

C. 2014.1471 2851 GRAVOIS AVENUE FOX PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Quik Trip Corporation – Gwen Keen

DEMOLITION PLAN: Preliminary review to demolish a commercial building and new construction.

PROCEEDINGS: On October 27, 2014, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a preliminary review application to construct a gas station and convenience store building and pump canopy at 2851 Gravois Avenue, located in the Fox Park Certified Local Historic District.

Board members Richard Callow (Chairman), David Visintainer, Alderman Craig Schmid, Anthony Robinson, Melanie Fathman and Michael Killeen were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office discussed the project, testifying that although the proposed gas station at 2851 Gravois does not in general comply with the Fox Park standards, the Board should grant preliminary approval due to the fact that the standards for commercial buildings are not well addressed and the concept of a modern gas station is not easily reviewable.

FINDINGS OF FACTS: The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed site for construction, 2851 Gravois Boulevard, is located in the Fox Park Local Historic District; it is at the southern tip of the district;
- the proposal is to replace the existing facility with the latest prototype QuikTrip design;
- the new construction standards, and the requirement for a Model Example for proposed new construction, do not appear to have been adopted with the construction of a QuikTrip in mind. There is considerable rationale for the replacement QuikTrip facility, located on a primarily commercial street, to have the appearance of the standard QuikTrip;

- the facts that the facility is a replacement one and occupies the entirety of a small, irregularly-shaped block at the edge of the historic district were considered in the review of the design. In this case, placement of the building and pump canopy on the property, use of materials, and extent of landscaping and signage has been of concern even if the final proposal does not meet all standards for new construction; and
- the design, mass, scale, proportions, ratio of solid-to-void, and façade materials are that of a modern gas station and convenience market facility and partially comply with the Fox Park Historic District standards;
- the building is proposed to be set at the western edge of the lot where the relationship of the building wall to the sidewalk will be urban in character. Given the use and location within the district, the fact that it does not hold the building line with buildings on adjacent blocks is deemed appropriate;
- the monument sign is slightly taller than the original but will be the same design and in the same location as the existing; and
- the retaining wall, as originally proposed, does not meet the requirement for a Model Example. QuikTrip is working with staff to develop a wall design that comes closer to meeting the standards.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval to the project, with the stipulation that final drawings and exterior material finishes are reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office. The motion was made by Board Member Melanie Fathman. Mr. Visintainer seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

D. 2014.1472

624 SO. BROADWAY

CITY LANDMARK #4

Owner: Eugene Field House Foundation

Applicant: Dennis G. Tacchi

COMMERCIAL PLAN:

Preliminary review to construct an addition with a glazed bridge.

PROCEEDINGS:

On October 27, 2014, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a preliminary review application to construct an addition

to the Eugene Field House, City Landmark #4. The project includes a glazed bridge that would be located on the Landmark site. Architect Dennis G. Tacchi submitted the application on behalf of the Eugene Field House Foundation.

Board members Richard Callow (Chairman), David Visintainer, Alderman Craig Schmid, Melanie Fathman, Anthony Robinson, and Michael Killeen were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Betsy Bradley, Director of the Cultural Resources Office, presented images of the proposed construction and discussed the project. She noted that the design of the museum addition to the Field House, which is also a National Historic Landmark, involved a number of stakeholders as the project evolved.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the Eugene Field House at 634 S. Broadway is City Landmark #4;
- the designation of the City landmark and subsequent National Historic Landmark nomination emphasize the importance of the property's ability to convey what the Field family row house was like even though the rest of Walsh's Row is no longer extant;
- the proposed addition would increase the functionality and accessibility of the Field House as a museum and thereby supports the long-term preservation and use of the property in that capacity;
- only the bridge connecting the addition to the Field House is located on the Landmark Site. Cultural Resources Office staff members have participated as stakeholders in the review of the design and the conversations about the effect of the entire addition on the context of the Field House;
- the addition north of the Field House recalls the long group of row houses of Walsh's Row in that the modules of the S. Broadway façade echo the width and depth of the Field House. The brick walls of the one-story addition have windows and a series of stone lintels and sills that refer to the openings in the main floor of the Field House;
- the connecting bridge is raised above the grade of the yard to meet the main floor level and is set back from the street façade. The glazed passageway is minimal in presence and an

appropriate means to connect the addition to the row house while leaving the volume and form of the row house unaltered;

- the need to convert one window created in the north wall during the 1930s to a door for access from the bridge is a minimal change in an altered portion of the Landmark; and
- the design of the museum addition relates to and complements the Eugene Field House and establishes an appropriate physical context for the Landmark.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval to the project, with the condition that final exterior materials and finishes are approved by the Cultural Resources Office staff. The motion was made by Board Member David Visintainer. Alderman Schmid seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

E. 2014.1476 1923-25 SO. 10TH STREET SOULARD HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Renovations Unlimited

Applicant: Maureen McMillan

COMMERCIAL PLAN:

Preliminary review to rehab building and construct two additions.

PROCEEDINGS:

On October 27, 2014, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a preliminary review application for the rehabilitation of a two-story vacant and derelict multi-family building at 1923-25 S. 10th Street, located in the Soulard Local Historic District.

Board members Richard Callow (Chairman), David Visintainer, Alderman Craig Schmid, Anthony Robinson, Melanie Fathman and Michael Killeen were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office discussed the project, testifying that 1923-15 S. 10th Street was a significant historic building, dating from the mid-19th century and its very fragile condition made its rehabilitation as a single-family building infeasible; the developers therefore were proposing two additions to the building, on the north and south, both Semi-Public Facades, to accommodate its conversion to two semi-detached

townhouses. Ms. Cameron stated that the Soulard Historic District standards do not allow such additions except at the rear of Semi-Public Facades. However, the house's siting is unusual, being parallel to the side street and leaving little or no rear yard. She stated also that the developers had worked with the Cultural Resources Office to refine the design of the additions, which are to be placed at the building line on S. 10th Street to appear as separate attached buildings. Originally 1923-25 S. 10th Street had been flanked by similar historic structures. She also testified that the Soulard Restoration Group was in support of the project.

Maureen McMillan, historic preservation consultant, testified on behalf of the project. She stated that the developers would be applying for Historic Tax Credits, and that they had worked with the Soulard Restoration Group, which had made several suggestions that had been incorporated in the design of the additions.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed site for rehabilitation, 1923-25 S. 10th Street, is a contributing resource to the Soulard Local Historic District;
- the building is in very poor condition and its rehabilitation as a single-family is therefore not viable; its conversion to two semi-detached townhouses will require additions to the existing structure;
- the project is in compliance with the Soulard Historic District Standards, with the exception of the placement of additions on the building's Semi-Public Facades; and that
- placement of the additions at the side elevations is necessitated by the property having no rear yard.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval to the project based upon economic hardship relating to the difficulties of the property's rehabilitation with no rear yard; and with the stipulation that final drawings and exterior material finishes are reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office. The motion was made by Alderman Craig Schmid. Mr. Robinson seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

APPEALS OF DENIALS

F. 2014.0583 2225 CHIPPEWA STREET MARINE VILLA NATIONAL REGISTER DIST.

Owner: Abigail Young Willis

Applicant: Sultan Construction

DEMOLITION PLAN: Appeal of the Director's denial to demolish a single-family dwelling.

PROCEEDINGS: On October 27, 2014, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to resume consideration of an appeal of the Director's Denial of a demolition permit application for 2225 Chippewa Street located in the Marine Villa Neighborhood National Register District. At her request, the consideration of the appeal at the July 28, 2014 Preservation Board meeting was deferred for three months. Ms. Willis advised the Director of the Cultural Resources Office that she was ready to appear before the Board again at the October 27, 2014 meeting.

Board members Richard Callow, Alderman Craig Schmid, Mike Killeen, David Visintainer, Melanie Fathman and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Betsy Bradley, Director of the Cultural Resources Office, made a presentation that summarized preliminary findings from the July 28, 2014 meeting.

Attorney Erik Zorumski, representing the owner, requested that the Preservation Board overturn the denial and approve demolition based on several points. In support of an assertion of structural unsoundness, he submitted two engineering reports and a report from the owner's insurance company that it considers the building an entire loss. He reported that four real estate firms refused to list the property for sale due to the damage and cost of rehabilitation and noted that the two adjacent properties were vacant. He did not submit any evidence to support these statements. He stated that since the fire vandals had stripped the building of its metals, including copper wiring and the HVAC system. No police reports were filed and provided as evidence of the vandalism.

Kara Spencer, representing the Marine-Villa Neighborhood Association, reported on the owner's interactions with the group and the Association's opposition to demolition approval. She noted the highly visible location of the house and that the group had reviewed the engineering reports and stated that much of the deterioration had occurred before the fire due to years of neglect. Ms. Spencer stated that the Neighborhood Association's efforts to assist the owner in marketing the property were rebuffed, as well as their suggestion that insurance money be used to stabilize the property. She reported that the Neighborhood Association requests that the Preservation Board not approve demolition until there has been a legitimate effort to market the property.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 2225 Chippewa is a contributing resource to the Marine Villa Neighborhood National Register Historic District and is located in a Preservation Review District; it is a Merit building under the definition of Ordinance #64689;
- Ordinance #64689 states that the demolition of Merit or Qualifying Structures shall not be approved except in unusual circumstances;
- the lower story and brick walls of the second story portion of 2225 Chippewa appear to be in sound condition.
- the economic feasibility and hardship associated with this property must consider several factors, including costs, the likelihood of financing, and the availability of state and/or federal historic tax credits;
- the location of the building between two other historic, but vacant, buildings highlights its importance in the historic streetscape and district, but adds to the challenge of the economics of the recovery of the building;
- no subsequent construction is proposed; and that
- an insurance payment of \$296,000, \$74,000 of which is held by the city, is available for the stabilization of the building.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the Director's denial of the demolition application for 2225 Chippewa and requests that appropriate steps be taken to stabilize and preserve the building. The motion was made by Board Member Anthony Robinson. Alderman Schmid seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

G. 2014.0864 2861 MISSOURI AVENUE BENTON PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: STL Real Estate Properties LLC – Brett Johnson

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of the Director's denial to retain windows installed without a permit.

PROCEEDINGS: On October 27, 2014, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial of a building permit application to retain vinyl windows at 2861 Missouri in the Benton Park Local Historic District. The appellant, Brett Johnson of STL Real Estate Properties LLC, submitted the application and the appeal.

Board members Richard Callow, Alderman Craig Schmid, Melanie Fathman, Mike Killeen, David Visintainer and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Andrea Gagen of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #67175, which sets forth the standards for residential rehabilitation in the Benton Park Local Historic District. She testified that the project was not in compliance with the standards as the windows were located on a Semi-Public façade and they did not replicate the profiles of historic windows.

Ms. Gagen entered into the record certified copies of Ordinances #64689, as revised by #64925 and #67175; the Board agenda and the PowerPoint presentation for 2861 Missouri; and the building permit application.

Brett Johnson and Ryan Wessels from STL Real Estate Properties LLC, the appellants, testified on their own behalf, stating that they wished to keep the vinyl windows due to the cost of replacing them.

FINDINGS OF FACTS: The Preservation Board found that:

- 2861 Missouri is located in the Benton Park Historic District;
- the current vinyl windows were installed without a permit;
- the building is 16 ½ feet from the neighboring building, making it a Semi-Public façade under the historic district standards;

- the vinyl windows do not comply with the historic district standards;
- the front-facing windows have been replaced with compliant windows; and
- the replacement the eight side windows would be an additional cost to the project.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the Director's denial of the building permit because of the cost associated with replacing the eight windows. The motion was made by Alderman Schmid. Mr. Visintainer seconded the motion Board Members Mike Killeen and Anthony Robinson opposed the motion. The motion passed three to two.

H. 2014.1290 2123 ANN AVENUE MCKINLEY HEIGHTS HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Timothy W. Miles

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of the Director's denial to retain windows installed without a permit

PROCEEDINGS: On October 27, 2014, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial of a building permit application to retain non-conforming windows at 2123 Ann in the McKinley Heights Local Historic District. Timothy W. Miles, the appellant, submitted the application and the appeal.

Board members Richard Callow, Alderman Craig Schmid, Melanie Fathman Mike Killeen, David Visintainer and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Andrea Gagen of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #67901, which sets forth the standards for residential rehabilitation in the McKinley Heights Local Historic District. She testified that the project was not in compliance with the McKinley Heights Historic District Standards as the windows were located on a Semi-Public façade and they did not replicate the profiles of historic windows.

Ms. Gagen entered into the record certified copies of Ordinances #64689, as revised by #64925 and #67901; the Board agenda and

the PowerPoint presentation for 2123 Ann; and the building permit application.

Timothy W. Miles testified on his own behalf, stating that he wished to keep the non-compliant windows due to the cost of replacing them.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 2123 Ann is located in the McKinley Heights Historic District;
- the current vinyl windows were installed without a permit;
- the building is located on an alley and is more than 15 feet from the neighboring structure;
- the aluminum windows do not comply with the historic district standards;
- the wrapping and storm window frames have been removed;
- the front-facing windows have been replaced with compliant windows;
- the McKinley Heights Neighborhood Association supports the owner; and
- the replacement of the five side windows would be a major cost to the project.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the Director's denial of the building permit application due to financial considerations associated with replacing the five windows. The motion was made by Board Member Mike Killeen. Mr. Visintainer seconded the motion. Mr. Anthony Robinson opposed the motion. The motion passed four to one.

I. 2014.1342 1917 RUTGER LAFAYETTE SQUARE HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: JLSK Properties – Leonard Adewunmi

COMMERCIAL PLAN:

Appeal of the Director's denial to convert warehouse into residential and commercial.

PROCEEDINGS:

On October 27, 2014, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial of a building permit

application for exterior alterations at 1917 Rutger in the Lafayette Square Local Historic District. The appellant, Leonard Adewunmi of JLSK Properties LLC, submitted the application and the appeal.

Board members Richard Callow (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, Melanie Fathman Mike Killeen, David Visintainer and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Andrea Gagen of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #69112, which sets forth the standards for residential rehabilitation in the Lafayette Square Local Historic District. She testified that the project was not in compliance with the Lafayette Square Historic District Standards in regard to changes to the existing openings, infill of windows, and changes to the parking lot and fencing.

Ms. Gagen entered into the record certified copies of Ordinances #64689, as revised by #64925, and #69112; the Board agenda and the PowerPoint presentation for 1917 Rutger; and the building permit application.

Al Levine, architect for the appellant, testified on the owner's behalf, stating that they were willing to alter their plans for the Mississippi garage door and the infilled windows. Leonard Adewunmi or JLSK Properties LLC, the appellant, also testified on his own behalf.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 1917 Rutger is located in the Lafayette Square Historic District;
- the owner is willing to alter the proposed window infill to comply with the historic district standards;
- the owner is willing to change the method of infill below the windows on the Mississippi elevation;
- the windows to replace the infilled door openings on the alley elevation do not comply with the historic district standards;
- the windows to replace the garage door on the Rutger elevation do not comply with the historic district standards; and

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

OCTOBER 27, 2014

Page 16 of 16

- the fencing and trash enclosures on the proposed parking lot do not comply with the historic district standards.

BOARD DECISION:

Board member Mike Killeen made the motion, which was seconded by Mr. Visintainer. The motion passed with three Board Members voting in favor of the motion and one opposed. Board Member Robinson recused himself from this agenda item. Alderman Schmid cast the opposing vote.

Chairman Richard Callow moved to adjourn the meeting. Hearing no objection, the meeting was adjourned.