

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES
OCTOBER 28TH, 2019**

Board Members Present

Richard Callow – Chairman
Randy Vines
Mike Killeen
Ald. Joe Vaccaro
Anthony Robinson
David Richardson

Cultural Resources Office Staff Present

Dan Krasnoff, Director
Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator
Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner
Bethany Moore, Preservation Planner
Adona Buford, Adm. Assistant

Legal Counsel

Barbara Birkicht

PRELIMINARY REVIEWS

A. 2019.1459 1025 DOLMAN STREET LAFAYETTE SQ. HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Dolman Street Townhomes - Jason Ermold

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Construct a two-story single family house.

PROCEEDINGS: On October 28, 2019, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a Preliminary Review to construct a single family house at 1025 Dolman Avenue, in the Lafayette Square Local Historic District. Board members Richard Callow (Chair), Randy Vines, David Richardson, Mike Killeen, Alderman Joe Vaccaro, and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #69112, which sets forth the standards for the Lafayette Square Local Historic District. Ms. Cameron showed the design and photos of the site. She noted that the design is based upon a model example—2123 Albion Street and that the proposed design complies with most aspects of the standards. The staff concern is that the fenestration should follow a regular pattern. The staff recommendation was in support of the project with the

stipulation that the window pattern for the side elevation be revised and that final details and exterior materials be approved by the Cultural Resources Office.

David Richardson asked if the Model Example was close enough in proximity to the site to comply with the ordinance. Jan Cameron said the new ordinance does not require close proximity to the site.

It was noted that the staff report did not reflect the update to the ordinance regarding the requirements for a Model example, including the proximity of the Model Example to the site of the new building.

Jason Ermold, the developer of the project, testified in support. He agreed with the staff recommendation except for the requirement regarding the arrangement of windows on the side facades. He supplied pictures of buildings within the district that have irregular window patterns.

Alderman Vaccaro asked why the applicant was uncomfortable with the staff recommendation, since it called for preliminary approval. Jason Ermold said he did not think the arrangement of the windows was a problem.

Jan Cameron explained that in historic buildings that facades that face the street typically have windows that are arranged in "bays".

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed site for construction, 1025 Dolman Street, is located in the Lafayette Square Local Historic District;
- the applicant has proposed a Historic Model Example for the new house which has been approved by the Cultural Resources Office;
- the proposed design complies with the majority of requirements for new residential construction, with the exception of the fenestration of the side elevations.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval of the design as currently presented with the condition that the fenestration of the side elevations be revised; and that final

plans and details and exterior materials are reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office staff. The motion was made by Commissioner Randy Vines. Alderman Joe Vaccaro seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

B. 2019.1461 2201-45 HICKORY STREET LAFAYETTE SQ. HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: LSNW Hickory, LLC

Applicant: Lafayette Reserve, LLC

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Construct fourteen (14) single family townhouses.

PROCEEDINGS: On October 28, 2019, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a Preliminary Review to construct 14 single family houses at 2201-45 Hickory Street, in the Lafayette Square Local Historic District. Board members Richard Callow (Chair), Randy Vines, Mike Killeen and Alderman Joe Vaccaro were present for the testimony for this agenda item. David Richardson recused himself and left the meeting.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #69112, which sets forth the standards for the Lafayette Square Local Historic District. Two letters of support for the project and four letters of opposition to the project were distributed to the Board, as well as paper copies of the Lafayette Square Restoration Committee presentation in opposition to the project. Ms. Cameron showed the design and photos of the site. She noted that the designs are based upon a model examples: 1405-07 Missouri, 1825-27 Rutger, 1903 Rutger, 1906 Hickory and the Harris Row. She noted there is limited historic context with buildings dating from the 1980's directly across the street. There are historic structures at the Missouri Avenue and MacKay Place corners.

Ms. Cameron said the proposal was in general compliance with the standards of Section 305 of the Standards, which allows for new construction based on a model example, but which does not require replication. Besides the usual requirement for the final design details to be approved by CRO, Ms. Cameron said approval should require that no side elevation has exposed siding—that all

such facades will be brick.

Chairman Richard Callow asked if Alderwoman Ingrassia had expressed an opinion regarding the project. Dan Krasnoff, CRO Director, said she is aware of the project and was not taking a position in favor or in opposition.

Jeff Winzerling is the developer of the project and spoke in favor. The site will have fourteen lots and he will offer a variety of designs among which buyers will choose. The design of the house at the corner of Hickory and MacKay is still being developed due to the location of a sewer easement. Mr. Winzerling committed that some of the designs will only be built in the center of the block to minimize the visibility of siding clad facades that extend deep into the rear yards.

Bill Odell spoke in favor of the project.

Suzanne Sessions, representing the Lafayette Square Restoration Committee, spoke in opposition to the project. She said the staff is misapplying the Standards and that the project should be reviewed based upon Section 303—New Residential Construction Based on a historic Model Example, not Section 305—Residential, Commercial and Mixed-Use Construction with Historic Context. She said this misinterpretation is allowing for the placement of cementitious panels/siding on the rear of the houses, where only brick should be allowed.

Linda Pallman spoke in opposition to the project.

Tom Dahm spoke in opposition to the project.

Phil Lamczyk, representing the Lafayette Square Restoration Committee, spoke in opposition to the project. He said the development is suburban and allows Hardie Board, which is not allowed in the Standards. He identified alternative solutions other than using cementitious siding and panels.

Matt Negre spoke in opposition to the project.

Gerald Farrell spoke in opposition to the project.

Jay Vines spoke in opposition to the project.

Dan Krasnoff, CRO Director, said CRO will coordinate with the Building Division to ensure there are no exposed facades with cementitious siding or panels. He also reiterated the lack of historic context adjacent to the site of the development. He also said the west façade of the building at the corner of Missouri and Hickory will require a heightened level of design to relate to the historic structure at the northwest corner of Hickory and Missouri.

Randy Vines asked Jeff Winzerling what the impact on the project would be if all facades had to be faced in brick. Jeff Winzerling said the houses would have to be built in attached groups of three or more houses. Randy Vines asked if the requirement for brick on all sides would kill the project. Jeff Winzerling replied that the lower price for a middle unit with groups of three buildings could jeopardize the project.

Suzanne Sessions explained why the Lafayette Square Restoration Committee believes the CRO staff was misapplying the Standards by using Section 305 of the Standards to review the project. Mike Killeen asked if there is ambiguity in the Standards. Suzanne Sessions said she thinks there is ambiguity.

Mike Killeen asked Dan Krasnoff if there is ambiguity in the Standards. Dan Krasnoff said there is ambiguity but the staff understanding when the Standards were being created was that the site under consideration by the Board would require a Historic Model Example, but that the design standards would be somewhat less stringent than what is required in areas of the district with greater historic context.

Jan Cameron read the staff recommendation to the Board.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed site for construction, 2201-45 Hickory Street, is located in the Lafayette Square Local Historic District and in an area designated in the Standards as “Residential, Commercial & Mixed-Use New Construction with Historic Context.”
- the property is located in the Northwest Quadrant and in one of two sites that are identified as “Residential, Commercial & Mixed-Use New Construction with Historic Context” in the Standards.

- across Hickory Street from this development there is no historic context. The only historic buildings that this development will have a design relationship with are buildings that front on MacKay Place and Missouri Avenue.
- the applicant has proposed five Historic Model Examples for the proposed project that has been approved by the Cultural Resources Office.
- the proposed design complies with the majority of requirements of the Standards, with the exception of the material for secondary elevations that do not face a street.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval of the design as currently presented with the condition that the fenestration of the side elevations be revised; and that final plans and details and exterior materials are reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office staff. The motion was made by Commissioner Mike Killeen. Alderman Vaccaro seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

C. 2019.1664 3315 & 27 MISSOURI AVENUE BENTON PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Mark Bult and Velma Gentszch

Applicant: UIC – Sarah Gibson

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

Construct a two-story single family house, add porch, openings & garage to adjacent house under rehabilitation.

PROCEEDINGS:

On October 28, 2019, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a Preliminary Review to construct 2-story single-family house; complete alterations to adjacent single-family; construct various site improvements including garage and parking pad between the properties at 3315 and 3327 Missouri Avenue in the Benton Park Local Historic District. Board members Richard Callow (Chair), Randy Vines, David Richardson, Mike Killeen, Alderman Joe Vaccaro, and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #67175, which sets forth the standards for the Benton Park Local Historic District. Ms. Cameron showed the designs and photos of the site. Although

the rehabilitation at 3327 Missouri had largely been approved a deck on the north elevation do not comply with the standards. In addition, the open area to the north of the rehabilitation will include a garage and parking pad. Ms. Cameron said the site line study submitted by the applicant showed that the garage would not have high visibility from the street.

The design of a new construction house at the north end of the site was also evaluated. Model examples were submitted. The design was evaluated based upon the Contemporary New Construction Policy. The applicant worked with the staff to revise the design. It had two deviations, which is allowed by the Policy—fenestration and decorative elements.

Ms. Cameron expressed concern regarding the openness of the first story of the “ell” section of the new construction building at the north end of the site.

She said the staff recommends approval of the project in general, with the stipulations that:

- a more substantial enclosure is built on the first floor ell part of the house 3315 Missouri
- a more pronounced vertical plane break where the false mansard roof terminates on the side facades would make the new design more like the model example
- the deck be denied as it is not in compliance with the standards

Mike Killeen asked if Benton Park had adopted the standards for the Contemporary New Construction Policy. Dan Krasnoff said that the policy was adopted by the Preservation Board but that the historic district standards supersede the standards which were adopted by ordinance. Dan Krasnoff said Alderman Guenther told him that if the CRO staff was comfortable with the design he would support it.

Sarah Gibson, the architect for the project, from UIC, spoke in favor. She gave a PowerPoint presentation about the history of the project.

Mark Bult, the owner of the property spoke in favor of the project.

Chairman Richard Callow asked Mr. Bult for his reaction to the staff recommendations. He answered that most of the comments were dealt with in Sarah Gibson's presentation.

Dan Krasnoff said a mock-up of the garage would be useful if Preliminary Approval was granted. He also provided background information regarding the review of the project and the recent history of contemporary design in Benton Park.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 3315 and 3327 Missouri are located in the Benton Park Local Historic District;
- the deck proposed at 3327 Missouri does not comply with the Benton Park Standards, which do not allow a deck at a Semi-Public Façade;
- for the new construction proposed at 3315 Missouri, the applicant has requested review under the Preservation Board's Compatible New Construction Policy and all required steps under that Policy are completed;
- the design of 3315 Missouri complies with most Compatibility requirements of the Policy with the exception of Massing, in regard to the projection on the south elevation. Due to the distance between buildings, this façade will be prominently visible from the street and the Cultural Resources Office staff feels an unenclosed first story will be a disruptive element;
- a stronger vertical break at the termination of the false mansard at each side façade would heighten the design's connection with the proposed Model Examples.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval for 3315 Missouri with the stipulation that the design of the southern ell be reconsidered and worked out to the satisfaction of staff and that a stronger vertical break be created at the termination of the mansard. Also, that the deck at 3327 Missouri be reduced in size. Finally, that exterior materials and colors should be reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office. The motion was made by Commissioner David Richardson. Alderman Vaccaro seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

APPEALS OF DENIALS

D. 2019.1456 2864 LEMP AVENUE

BENTON PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: John F. Cameron

Applicant: Tony Duncan Architects

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Construct a two-story two-family building.

PROCEEDINGS: On October 28, 2019, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an Appeal of the Administrative Denial to construct a two story, two-family building at 2964 Lemp Avenue, in the Benton Park Local Historic District. Board members Richard Callow (Chair), Randy Vines, David Richardson, Mike Killeen, Alderman Joe Vaccaro, and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Andrea Gagen of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #67175, which sets forth the standards for the Benton Park Local Historic District. She entered into the record ordinances #64689 as amended by #64925, and ordinance #67175. She also entered into the record the PowerPoint and the agenda. She showed pictures of the building, the site, the area and the plans.

Mike Killeen asked if the new building would face the Venice Café parking lot. Andrea Gagen said it would. Mike Killeen asked if the façade would be a blank wall—and face the Venice Café parking lot. He asked if the staff sought a redesign of that façade with windows. Andrea Gagen said that was suggested, but the developer did not wish to put windows on the façade facing the Venice Café parking lot. When asked, Andrea Gagen said the model example is a contemporary building, not an historic model example.

FINDINGS OF FACTS: The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed site for construction, 2864 Lemp Avenue, is located in the Benton Park Local Historic District.
- the design does not conform to the standards and does not have an appropriate model example.

BOARD DECISION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to deny the appeal because the design was not in conformity with the Benton Park Historic District Standards. Board Member Killeen made the motion, which was seconded by Board Member, Alderman Vaccaro. The motion passed with all Board Members voting in favor and none opposed.

E. 2019.1466 4622 MARYLAND AVENUE CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DIST.

Owner: George Knapp and Elizabeth Barnes

Applicant: Innovative Construction & Roofing – Dehn Cass

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Replace historic slate roof on house and garage.

PROCEEDINGS: On October 28, 2019, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an Appeal of the Director’s Denial to replace roofing on a house & garage, at 4622 Maryland Avenue, in the Central West End Local Historic District. Board members Richard Callow (Chair), Randy Vines, David Richardson, Mike Killeen, Alderman Joe Vaccaro, and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Andrea Gagen of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #69423, which sets forth the standards for the Central West End Local Historic District. She entered into the record ordinances #64689 as amended by #64925, and ordinance #69423. She also entered into the record the PowerPoint and the agenda. She stated that the historic district standards required the visible portions of the roof to be replaced with slate to match the existing material.

George Knapp & Elizabeth Barnes, the owners, testified on their own behalf. A PowerPoint presentation was submitted into evidence.

Paul Mittlestadt, of Coldwell Banker Gundaker and Central West End resident, also testified on behalf of the project.

FINDINGS OF FACTS: The Preservation Board found that:

- 4622 Maryland Avenue is located within the Central West End Local Historic District;
- the roofing on the house is currently slate.
- the owners propose to replace it with architectural shingles or Slateline;
- only a portion of the roof is visible from the street.
- the owners have submitted information in regard to financial hardship.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the Director's denial of the roofing replacement, due to financial hardship. The motion was made by Commissioner Mike Killeen Commissioner David Richardson seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

F. 2019.1503 4619 McPHERSON AVENUE CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DIST.

Owner/Applicant: Eric Galburt and Ana Ruiz Manzano

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

Retain one front window and two back windows installed without a permit.

PROCEEDINGS:

On October 28, 2019, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an Appeal of the Director's Denial to retain a window on the primary façade that was replaced without a permit at 4619 McPherson Avenue in the Central West End Local Historic District. Board members Richard Callow (Chair); Randy Vines, Michael Killeen, David Richardson, Alderman Joe Vaccaro and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bethany Moore of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #56768, which sets forth the standards for windows in the Central West End Local Historic District. She stated that the applicants had installed three replacement windows without a permit. Two of the windows were in the rear and complied with the standards. One of the windows was on the front and did not comply with the standards.

Ms. Moore noted that the non-compliant window installed without a permit was a fixed single pane picture window that

replaced a double hung window. She explained that the Central West End standards state “Replacement windows shall duplicate the original, and meet the requirements for replication of height, width, depth, profile, shape, geometric pattern, and installation. Glass size in replacement windows shall be the same as that of the original sash.” Ms. Moore stated that it was the recommendation of the Cultural Resources Office that the Preservation Board uphold the Director’s denial as the replacement window on the primary façade did not meet the Central West End Local Historic District Standards.

The applicant, Ana Ruiz Manzano, gave a presentation examining the improvements to the property that she had done. She explained that she was not aware that a permit was required to replace the windows since the size of the window opening was not adjusted. She also showed images of different types of replacement windows that had been installed throughout the years in the Central West End. Ms. Ruiz Manzano also stated that she felt that the denial of her application was arbitrary and capricious because they did a lot of improvements to the house in good faith. She asked the Preservation Board to allow her to either keep the replacement window or make modifications to it that would make it look like a double hung window.

In response to a question from Board Member Robinson Ms. Ruiz Manzano answered that she understood that the windows in the Central West End that did not comply with the Standards were not original and were done outside the timeframe of when the Standards were in place.

In response to a question from Board Member Killeen she stated that she did not apply for a permit for the three windows because she did not realize she would need a permit.

In response to a question from Board Member Richardson she stated that the window on the front facing façade cost \$1,500.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the site of the alterations is within the boundaries of the Central West End Local Historic District;
- the replacement window on the front façade does not duplicate the original window.

BOARD DECISION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the Director's denial to retain the non-compliant window on the front façade replaced without a permit as it does not meet the Standards for the Central West End Local Historic District. The motion was made by Commissioner David Richardson. Mr. Robinson seconded the motion. The motion passed with four Board Members voting in favor and Alderman Vaccaro opposed.

G. 2019.1533 5257 LINDELL BOULEVARD CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DIST.

Owner: Anthony V. Salvati

Applicant: Ferguson Roofing Co. – Justin Lisson

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Replace right side of historic slate roof w/composite shingles.

PROCEEDINGS: On October 28, 2019, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an Appeal of the Director's Denial to replace slate roof with DiVinci Bellaforte faux slate material at 5257 Lindell Boulevard in the Central West End Local Historic District. Board members Richard Callow (Chair); Randy Vines, Michael Killeen, David Richardson, Alderman Joe Vaccaro and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bethany Moore of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #56768, which sets forth the standards for roofs in the Central West End Local Historic District. She stated that the applicant currently had a slate roof and was proposing to replace large street-visible sections of it with the DiVinci product. The shape of the roof and the wide side yards make a majority of the roofing material visible from the street. She explained that the Central West End Local Historic District Standards require that visible portions of a roof, where the original material is known, be replaced with the original historic material.

Ms. Moore noted that the color of the original slate was easily matched by the DiVinci product and that the dimensions of the DiVinci product were also similar to that of slate. She stated that it was the recommendation of the Cultural Resources Office that the Preservation Board uphold the Director's denial as the replacement material did not meet the Central West End Local Historic District Standards for visible portions of a roof.

The owner, Anthony Salvati, briefly addressed the Board stating that in the past he had replaced sections of the roof with slate but that slate has become costly. He also stated that his roof had started to leak and he was looking for a solution that would allow him to stop the leaks and also keep with the aesthetic value of the house. He brought slate samples from his roof to show the Board along with a sample board of the DiVinci product and stated that by using the DiVinci product instead of slate he would save \$50,000.

In response to a question from Board Member Killeen Mr. Salvati stated that he would have to try to finance the cost of the slate roof by taking out a second mortgage and that he was retiring in December.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the site of the alterations is within the boundaries of the Central West End Local Historic District;
- the roof is largely visible from the street;
- DiVinci Bellaforte faux slate is not the original or historic roofing material for 5257 Lindell Boulevard.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the Director's denial to replace the slate roof with DiVinci Bellaforte faux slate and allowed the material to be used as a replacement roofing material in a slate gray color due to financial hardship. The motion was made by Commissioner Anthony Robinson. Alderman Joe Vacarro seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

SPECIAL AGENDA ITEMS

Nominations to the National Register of Historic Places

H.

ACTION:

Standard Stamping Company Factory - 2000 N. Broadway

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the Missouri State Historic Preservation Office that the Standard Stamping Company Factory meets National Register Criterion A for Industry. The motion was made by Board member Anthony Robinson and seconded by Ms. Hamilton. The motion passed unanimously.

I.

United Railway Substation/Trouble Station
2423 N. Spring Avenue

ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the Missouri State Historic Preservation Office that the United Railway Substation/Trouble Station meets National Register Criterion A for Transportation. The motion was made by Board member Anthony Robinson and seconded by Ms. Hamilton. The motion passed unanimously.