

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES
NOVEMBER 23, 2015**

Board Members Present

Richard Callow - Chairman

Alderman Terry Kennedy

Mike Killeen

Erin Wright

David Visintainer

Legal Counsel

Barbara Birkicht

Cultural Resources Office Staff Present

Betsy Bradley, Director

Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator

Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner

Bob Bettis, Preservation Planner

Adona Buford, Administrative Assistant

SPECIAL AGENDA ITEM

- A.** Allocation of the Haven of Grace gift of \$25,000 to the Preservation Board, in a 2009 Planning Commission decision.

PROCEEDINGS:

On November 23, 2015, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a special agenda item, allocation of the Haven of Grace gift of \$25,000 to the Preservation Board for a specific project in the Murphy-Blair National Register Historic District. Board members Richard Callow, Erin Wright, David Visintainer and Mike Killeen were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Betsy Bradley provided a summary of the Planning Commission's decision of March 4, 2009, in the matter of the review of the Preservation Board's denial of the demolition permit for 2619-2621 Hadley Street, a contributing resource in the Murphy-Blair National Register District. The Commission's deliberations

resulted in a conditional reversal of the decision of the Preservation Board that allowed for the demolition of the building and required its owner, Haven of Grace, to make a gift in the amount of \$25,000 to the Preservation Board with the stipulation that the Preservation Board use such gift for the purpose of stabilizing other deteriorated historic buildings located in the National Register Historic District in which the Haven of Grace facilities are located.

Ms. Bradley noted that the Old North St. Louis Restoration Group (Old North) has been working in the neighborhood that encompasses this historic district for some years and requested that the fund be allocated to 1316 North Market. Old North considers the building to be important in the North Market Place Redevelopment Area, in which 20 new homes and a dozen historic rehabilitation projects have been completed. A recent partial collapse of a side wall and the fact that the building stands between two owner occupied houses makes this building the most urgent property to address at this time.

Old North has been working on 1316 North Market since 2013 after acquiring the building from LRA in 2009 and has invested at least \$40,000 in the building to date. Old North proposes to use the \$25,000 to purchase materials and with donated labor stabilize the building by removing all rotten framing and installing new beams and floor framing; repairing brick parapet walls; framing a new roof and installing a single-ply membrane roofing system; installing gutters and downspouts; installing newly framed structural walls enclosed with sheathing and house wrap; installing brick veneer where needed and tuck-pointing the rest of the brick walls; and securing all door and window openings.

Ms. Bradley reported that she had received letters from Andrew Weil representing the Landmarks Association of St. Louis in support of the allocation and also a letter in support from Michael Allen. Sean Thomas was present to answer any questions the Board might have.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 1316 North Market is in the same historic district as 2619-2621 Hadley Street, the Murphy-Blair Historic District, listed in

the National Register of Historic Places and therefore is eligible for the allocation of the stabilization fund;

- Old North St. Louis is a community development corporation that has been actively working in the district and neighborhood for many years and has a program to stabilize buildings so that they may be rehabilitated at a later date;
- Old North has been working to keep 1316 North Market stable since October 2013, after acquiring it from LRA in 2009 and has already invested considerable resources in the building;
- a recent collapse of a side wall has caused the need for another stabilization effort for the house which is quite close to occupied flanking structures; and
- an estimate of the work needed and its costs, which Old North can leverage with volunteer labor, would make full use of the \$25,000 fund.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to allocate the \$25,000 to Old North St. Louis for the purpose of stabilizing 1316 North Market. The motion was made by Board Member Mike Killeen which was seconded by Erin Wright. The motion carried with three board members voting in favor.

PRELIMINARY REVIEWS

B. 2015.1408 2716 INDIANA AVENUE BENTON PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: City Life Development LLC – Nicholas Shapiro

Applicant: UIC – Sarah Gibson

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

Preliminary review to construct three single family houses.

PROCEEDINGS:

On November 23, 2015, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a preliminary review application for the construction of a two-story residence at 2716 Indiana Avenue, located in the Benton Park Local Historic District.

Board members Richard Callow, Erin Wright, David Visintainer, Alderman Terry Kennedy and Mike Killeen were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office discussed the project, testifying that the proposed building would be a two-story single-family house of contemporary design; and while some elements of the design did not strictly comply with the historic district standards, the scale and massing of the building itself and its brick façade were compatible with the district's historic buildings. She noted, however, that the design of the front façade entry bay, which terminates in a large wall dormer, did not follow any historic precedent. She also stated that the applicant had met with the Benton Park Neighborhood Association and the Benton Park Community Housing Corporation, both of which had input into the final design. She submitted letters of support for the project from Alderman Ken Ortmann and the Benton Park Neighborhood.

Nick Shapiro, applicant, testified in support of the project. He stated that he had worked closely with the Cultural Resources Office and the neighborhood. He had wanted a contemporary design so the building would appear a product of 2015, not a replica; that he understood that blending contemporary infill into historic neighborhoods was a challenge but he felt they had succeeded.

Mark Silver, President of the Benton Park Community Housing Corporation, spoke in support of the project. He confirmed that the applicant had consulted with the neighborhood and that the consensus of those reviewing the project was that new buildings should reflect a contemporary design compatible with the historic district by complementary massing and scale, but not necessarily by replicating historic components.

Sarah Gibson of U.I.C., project architect, spoke in support of the project, stating that U.I.C. was excited to work in Benton Park, and she believed that while the project might push the boundaries of the district design standards, the project would be compatible with the historic fabric.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed site for construction, 2716 Indiana, is located in the Benton Park Local Historic District;
- the Benton Park Standards specifically do not discourage contemporary design for infill buildings;

- the design for the new building uses the Model Example as a basis for “comparison and as a source of ideas for ... new construction” and introduces contemporary design for some of the smaller elements of the building;
- materials and exterior colors are used to establish compatibility of the contemporary design within the historic district as the design has a brick front façade and substantial brick returns; the siding will be painted to be consistent with the brick and maintain a consistency of color value on all elevations;
- the proposed massing, scale, and proportions of the building are appropriate for its site and compatible with adjacent buildings. Despite a good deal of deviation from elements of the submitted Model Example, the design fits acceptably within the context of the block and district;
- the scale of several elements of the front façade has been reduced in the latest drawings and they are more compatible with those of the surrounding buildings.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval to the project, Preservation Board grant preliminary approval for the new construction, with the stipulation that final drawings, materials and colors be reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office. The motion was made by Board Member Wright and seconded by Alderman Kennedy. The motion carried three to one, with Board Member Visintainer opposing the motion.

C. 2015.1407 2858 INDIANA AVENUE BENTON PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: City Life Development LLC – Nicholas Shapiro

Applicant: UIC – Sarah Gibson

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

Preliminary review to construct a single family house.

PROCEEDINGS:

On November 23, 2015, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a preliminary review application for the construction of three two-story residences at 2856-62 Indiana Avenue, located in the Benton Park Local Historic District.

Board members Richard Callow, Erin Wright, David Visintainer, Alderman Terry Kennedy and Mike Killeen were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office discussed the project, testifying that the proposed buildings would be two-story single-family houses of contemporary design; and while some elements of the design did not strictly comply with the historic district standards, the scale and massing of the buildings and their brick façades were compatible with the district's historic buildings. However, a gray brick was proposed to be used on at least one of the buildings and buildings in the Benton Park neighborhood were almost exclusively red brick. She noted also that the design of the front façade entry bay, which terminates in a large wall dormer, did not follow any historic precedent. Ms. Cameron indicated that the applicant had met with the Benton Park Neighborhood Association and the Benton Park Community Housing Corporation, both of which had input into the final design. She submitted letters of support for the project from Alderman Ken Ortmann and the Benton Park Neighborhood.

Nick Shapiro, applicant, testified in support of the project. He stated that he had worked closely with the Cultural Resources Office and the neighborhood. He had wanted a contemporary design so the building would appear a product of 2015, not a replica; that he understood that blending contemporary infill into historic neighborhoods was a challenge but he felt they had succeeded.

Mark Silver, President of the Benton Park Community Housing Corporation, spoke in support of the project. He confirmed that the applicant had consulted with the neighborhood and that the consensus of those reviewing the project was that new buildings should reflect a contemporary design compatible with the historic district by complementary massing and scale, but not necessarily by replicating historic components.

Sarah Gibson of U.I.C., project architect, spoke in support of the project, stating that U.I.C. was excited to work in Benton Park, and she believed that while the project might push the boundaries of the district design standards, the project would be compatible with the historic fabric.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed site for construction, 2858-62 Indiana, is located in the Benton Park Local Historic District;
- the Benton Park Standards specifically do not discourage contemporary design for infill buildings;
- the design for the new building uses the Model Example as a basis for “comparison and as a source of ideas for ... new construction” and introduces contemporary design for some of the smaller elements of the building;
- materials and exterior colors are used to establish compatibility of the contemporary design within the historic district as the design has a brick front façade and substantial brick returns; painted siding will maintain a consistency of color value on visible elevations;
- all three buildings will be identical in design and materials, although the brick color of each building may alter;
- the Benton Park Neighborhood is composed of mid- to late-19th century buildings, which are almost exclusively red brick; the introduction of a gray brick would not be compatible;
- the proposed massing, scale, and proportions of the buildings are appropriate for its site and compatible with adjacent buildings. Despite a good deal of deviation from elements of the submitted Model Example, the design fits acceptably within the context of the block and district; and
- the scale of several elements of the front façade has been reduced in the latest drawings and is now more compatible with the scale of surrounding buildings.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval to the project/new construction, with the stipulation that final drawings, materials and colors be reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office. The motion was made by Board Member Erin Wright and seconded by Alderman Kennedy. The motion carried three to one, with Board Member Visintainer opposing the motion.

D. 2015.1952

4104-58 DETONTY

NORTH I-44 HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: DeTonty Street Apartments, LLC

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

Preliminary review to construct a thirty-six unit multi-family building.

PROCEEDINGS:

On November 23, 2015, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a preliminary review application for the construction of two apartment buildings and four two-family buildings on fourteen vacant parcels at 4104-4158 DeTonty Street, located in the Shaw Neighborhood Certified Local Historic District.

Board members Richard Callow, Erin Wright, David Visintainer, Alderman Terry Kennedy and Mike Killeen were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office discussed the project, testifying that this was the fourth proposal for this site, located at the northern edge of the Shaw district, directly opposite Interstate 44. She discussed the project's compliance with the district standards, stating that while the four two-family buildings would be two-stories in height, the apartment buildings would be three stories and much larger in scale than existing buildings on the block, although attempts had been made to mitigate its scale with recessed entries and a material change at the third story. She submitted a letter from Alderman Steven Conway in support of the project.

Brent Crittenden of U.I.C., project architect and developer spoke in support, stating that he had been unable to market an earlier proposal for single-family houses, given the difficulties of the site, and believed that high-quality rental units could be successful marketed and would support the for-sale units. He stated that brick on the first two stories of the apartments replicated the scale of adjacent buildings and the change of material at the third story was intended to reduce its visual scale. In response to a suggestion from the Board, he agreed to modify the pitch of the gables on the rear elevation of the apartments.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed site for construction, 4104-56 DeTonty, is located in the Shaw Local Historic District;
- while the large site is currently vacant, the remainder of DeTonty Avenue has a consistent and intact streetscape;
- the site fronts on Interstate Highway 44, a location that has made redevelopment of the property difficult. Four previous

projects proposed by different companies, including the present developer, have not succeeded;

- the proposed development site incorporates 14 vacant parcels for new construction; an adjacent four-family building to be rehabilitated in the future; and another vacant parcel to the west, incorporating more than three-quarters of the block; therefore to some degree the project creates its own neighborhood context;
- while the proposed new construction does replicate the setback and to some degree the arrangement of buildings in the historic district, the introduction of two large apartment buildings of three stories introduces a new scale to the block: all other properties on DeTonty are two stories, and the largest are four-family buildings, none approaching the scale of the proposed apartment buildings. The effect of the apartments' scale on the block is somewhat mitigated by the introduction of open stairs at each entrance and a change in material and color at the third story; and
- the proposal does not comply with the standards for roof shape and only partially complies with the standard for the height of new buildings; yet as it complies with the standards in most other ways, these aspects of the design may be considered acceptable, given the conditions and location of the site.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval to the site plan and design of both building types, subject to the rear gables being revised to a steeper pitch, and review of final documents and materials by the Cultural Resources Office. The motion was made by Board Member David Visintainer and seconded by Alderman Kennedy. The motion carried with none opposing.

E. 2015.1866 4300 McPHERSON AVENUE CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DIST.

Owner/Applicant: Mark and Joyce Mathis

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct a new two-family dwelling.

PROCEEDINGS: On November 23, 2015, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a preliminary review application to construct a two

family house at 4300 McPherson Avenue, in the Central West End Local Historic District. The application was submitted the owners, Joyce and Mark Mathis.

Board members Richard Callow, Alderman Terry Kennedy, Mike Killeen, Erin Wright and David Visintainer were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #69423, which sets forth the standards for residential new construction in Central West End. He testified that the project complied with the standards and recommended that the Board grant preliminary approval to the proposal. He stated that the Central West End Planning & Development Committee was in support of the recommendation of the Cultural Resources Office.

Joyce and Mark Mathis, the owners, were present to speak on behalf of the project.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed site for construction, 4300 McPherson Avenue, is located in the Central West End Local Historic District;
- the siting, scale, proportions, fenestration, details and exterior materials comply with the Standards; and
- the setback along North Boyle cannot be followed due to the shape of the parcel.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval for the proposed new construction, with the stipulation that final documents, exterior details and materials will be reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office to ensure compliance with the standards. The motion was made by Board Member Visintainer and seconded by Board Member Kennedy. The motion passed with none opposed.

APPEALS OF DENIALS

F.	2015.1709	2023 GEYER AVENUE	McKINLEY HEIGHTS HISTORIC DIST.
-----------	------------------	--------------------------	--

Owner/Applicant: Nanette Baker

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

NOVEMBER 23, 2015

Page 11 of 13

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of a denial of a building permit application to retain brick painted yellow without a permit.

PROCEEDINGS: On November 23, 2015, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial of a building permit application to retain paint on a previously unpainted brick building, at 2023 Geyer Avenue in the McKinley Heights Local Historic District. The owner submitted the appeal.

Board members Richard Callow, Erin Wright, Mike Killeen, David Visintainer, and Alderman Terry Kennedy were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #67901, which sets forth the standards for residential rehabilitation in the McKinley Heights Local Historic District. He testified that the project was not in compliance as painting of unpainted masonry is not allowed under the Standards.

Mr. Bettis entered into the record certified copies of Ordinances #64689, as revised by #64925, and #67901; the Board agenda and the PowerPoint presentation for 2023 Geyer Av.; and the building permit application.

Nanette Baker, the owner, testified on her own behalf, stating that she wanted to keep the new paint as it unifies the two buildings into one cohesive unit, and it would cause an economic hardship to have to repaint the building red.

Alderman Jack Coatar, representing himself and the McKinley Heights Neighborhood Association, testified in support of the applicant.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 2023 Geyer Avenue is located in the McKinley Heights Local Historic District;
- the two houses are combined. The house on the west which was painted yellow prior to purchase; and
- the unpainted portion of the property was painted without a permit.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

NOVEMBER 23, 2015

Page **12** of **13**

BOARD ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the Director's Denial of the building permit application due to the economic hardship of repainting the house red and the fact that the painting of the smaller building unifies the two houses that are used as a single unit. The motion was made by Board Member Terry Kennedy and seconded by Board Member Killeen. The motion passed three to one with Board Member Visintainer voting against.

G. 2015.1792 4615 PERSHING PLACE CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DIST.

Owner/Applicant: William and Janice C. Forsyth

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of a denial of a building permit application to install a retaining wall and landscaping.

PROCEEDINGS: On November 23, 2015, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial of a building permit application to construct a retaining wall, at 4615 Pershing Place in the Central West End Local Historic District. The contractor submitted the appeal.

Board members Richard Callow, Alderman Terry Kennedy, Erin Wright, Mike Killeen and David Visintainer, and were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #69423, which sets forth the standards for residential property rehabilitation in the Central West End Local Historic District. He testified that the project was not in compliance as the introduction of a new retaining wall is prohibited under the Standards.

Mr. Bettis entered into the record certified copies of Ordinances #64689, as revised by #64925, and #69423; the Board agenda and the PowerPoint presentation for 4615 Pershing Place. A letter from the Central West End Association Planning and Development Committee in support of the Director's denial was submitted into the record as well as letters from Patti Teper and Jane Burton in support of staff's recommendation.

William Forsyth, the owner, testified on his own behalf, stating that the new retaining wall would increase his property value and would be more aesthetically pleasing than the original slope. In addition, since excavation work began for water line replacement he felt it was the appropriate time to install a retaining wall. He made a presentation that included five letters of support for his project from neighbors on the street and requested that the presentation be part of the record of the appeal.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 4615 Pershing Place is located in the Central West End Local Historic District;
- the original slope of the front terrace was not altered previously;
- excavation was started as part of a water line replacement and was extended as part of the proposed new design for the front yard terrace area of the property without a permit;
- the standards do not allow for a new retaining wall to replace an earth terrace; and
- the removal of the terrace slope and proposed retaining wall are part of an overall design that would replace the earth terrace and front portion of the yard with a non-historic landscape element.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to Board upheld the Director's Denial of the building permit because the introduction of a retaining wall where there was no prior wall is prohibited under the Central West End historic district standards. Board Member Wright made the motion, which was seconded by Board Member Visintainer. The motion passed three to one with Board Member Killeen voting against the motion.