

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES
NOVEMBER 25, 2013**

Board Members Present

Richard Callow, Chairman

Nate Johnson

Mike Killeen

Alderman Craig Schmid

Anthony Robinson

Melanie Fathman

Erin Wright

David Richardson

Cultural Resources Office Staff Present

Betsy H. Bradley, Director

Bob Bettis, Preservation Planner

Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator

Adona Buford, Administrative Assistant

Chairman Richard Callow called the roll. The Board did not approve the October 28, 2013 minutes or the current Agenda. Agenda Item E was moved to the beginning of the meeting.

**E. 2013.1971 5885 DR. M.L. KING WELLSTON LOOP COMMERCIAL NATIONAL
REGISTER HISTORIC DISTRICT**

Owner: Johnny L. Parker

Applicant: Signature Demolition & Trucking – Charles Jones

DEMOLITION PLAN: Appeal of a staff denial of a demolition permit to demolish a two-story commercial building.

PROCEEDINGS: On November 25, 2013, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the denial of a demolition permit application for 5885 Dr. Martin Luther King Drive. Board members Richard Callow (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, Nate Johnson, David Richardson, Erin Wright, Melanie Fathman, and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this

agenda item.

Cultural Resources Office Director Betsy H. Bradley submitted City Ordinances #64689, as amended by Ordinance #64925, #64832 and #69164 and reviewed the criteria for demolition of a property located in a Preservation Review District and the Wellston Loop Commercial National Register District. She testified that the Landmarks Association expressed opposition to the overturning of the denial of the demolition permit.

Alderman Jeffrey Boyd, of the 22nd Ward, described how he supported the revitalization of the Wellston Loop area of Dr. Martin Luther King Drive through the purchase and rehabilitation of 5879 Dr. Martin Luther King Drive, the Historic District nomination, and the support of other rehabilitation projects. He urged the Preservation Board to uphold the denial as the property owner has the options to ask for insurance money to repair the damage and sell the property. He stated that the building was fixable. Johnny Parker, the property owner, testified that he wished to demolish the building and follow through with his arrangement with Charles Jones of Signature Demolition & Trucking.

Charles Jones affirmed that at the time of the demolition of the adjacent property, some brick hit the bottom of the west wall of 5885 and caused the brick above to drop, creating the hole. He stated that, although he has insurance and a claim could cover the repair of the hole, the overall condition of the building would not be stabilized. He also stated that he entered into a contract with Mr. Parker soon after the accident to demolish the building in exchange for the salvaged brick.

FINDINGS OF FACTS

The Preservation Board found that:

- 5885 Dr. Martin Luther King, is a contributing building in a National Register Historic District and therefore a Merit building, and is located in a Preservation Review District;
- the building, though of a common building type, contributes to a largely intact block front in the historic district;
- the demolition of the adjacent building damaged the west wall of 5885, yet since Mr. Parker entered into an arrangement with Mr. Jones for demolition of the building, no insurance claim was filed to repair it;

- some of the nearby buildings on the block face are occupied and exhibit the range of uses that are possible in the buildings in the Wellston Loop Commercial historic district;
- the building can be stabilized and rehabilitated as the damage caused by the demolition accident, the repair of the roof and tuck pointing of the walls, are repairable; the reconstruction of collapsed interior floors is also a common rehabilitation project;
- the loss of the building would have a detrimental effect on the mostly intact long block in the heart of the Wellston Loop Commercial historic district; and
- the fact that no new construction is proposed at this time and other criteria were considered, as applicable, to this proposed demolition.

BOARD ACTION:

The Preservation Board upheld the Director's denial of the application to demolish the building. Alderman Craig Schmid made the motion, which Nate Johnson seconded. The motion passed with five of the six Board Members voting for the motion; Mr. Robinson abstained.

LANDMARK DESIGNATION

A. 3141 LASALLE STREET WARD 6

PROCEEDINGS:

On November 25, 2013, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a proposed City Landmark Designation.

Board members, Richard Callow (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, Melanie Fathman, Nate Johnson, David Richardson, Erin Wright, Anthony Robinson and Mike Killeen were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Chairman Richard Callow moved to convene as a public hearing to hear a presentation to designate the Compton Hill Missionary Baptist Church as a Landmark. Nate Johnson seconded the motion. The hearing was open.

Ms. Betsy Bradley, Director of the Cultural Resources Office presented a PowerPoint presentation and the petition, which provided detailed information about the Church to the Preservation Board. She asked that the Board approve the

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

NOVEMBER 25, 2013

Page 4 of 8

petition to designate the Compton Hill Missionary Baptist Church as a City Landmark.

Reverend Steven Vasser, pastor of the Church, spoke on behalf of the Compton Hill Missionary Baptist Church and in favor of the proposed City Landmark. The hearing was closed.

BOARD ACTION:

Board member Melanie Fathman moved to approve the Petition to designate the Compton Hill Missionary Baptist Church as a Landmark. Alderman Craig Schmid seconded the motion, which passed with seven Board members voting in favor of the motion.

Alderman Craig Schmid moved that a Board Bill be prepared to send to the Board of Aldermen. Mr. Johnson seconded the motion. The motion passed with seven Board members voting in favor of the motion.

PRELIMINARY REVIEWS

B. 2013.2018 3015 McNAIR AVENUE BENTON PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Amy T. Mintner

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct a two-story single-family house.

PROCEEDINGS: On November 25, 2013, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a Preliminary Review for a proposal for a new two-story single-family house at 3015 McNair Avenue, in the Benton Park Local Historic District. The developer, Amy Mintner submitted the application.

Board members, Richard Callow (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, Melanie Fathman, Nate Johnson, David Richardson, Erin Wright, Anthony Robinson and Mike Killeen were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the section of City Ordinance #67175, which sets forth the standards for new residential construction in the Benton Park Local Historic District. She testified that the design presented at the meeting had been revised from an earlier design to address the staff's concerns and that the project was generally in

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

NOVEMBER 25, 2013

Page 5 of 8

compliance with the Standards. A letter was presented from the Benton Park Housing Corporation in support of the project.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 2830-36 McNair Avenue is located in the Benton Park Local Historic District;
- the revised design complies with all standards for new construction, with the exception of the attached rear garage; and
- that the garage is placed so far back on the property that its visual effect upon the street will be slight.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant approval of the proposed new construction, with the condition that final drawings and exterior materials will be submitted to the Cultural Resources Office for approval. The motion was made by Board member Erin and to grant approval. Alderman Craig Schmid seconded the motion. The motion passed with seven members voting to approve and none opposing.

C. 2013.2019 2716 INDIANA AVENUE BENTON PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Amy T. Mintner

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

Preliminary review to construct a two-story single-family house.

PROCEEDINGS:

On November 25, 2013, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a Preliminary Review for a proposal for a new two-story single-family house at 2716 Indiana Avenue, in the Benton Park Local Historic District. The developer, Amy Mintner submitted the application.

Board members, Richard Callow (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, Melanie Fathman, Nate Johnson, David Richardson, Erin Wright, Anthony Robinson and Mike Killeen were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the section of City Ordinance #67175, which sets forth the standards for new residential construction in the Benton Park Local Historic District. Ms. Cameron testified that the design presented at the meeting had been revised from an earlier design

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

NOVEMBER 25, 2013

Page 6 of 8

to address the staff's concerns, and that the project was generally in compliance with the Standards. She presented a letter from the Benton Park Housing Corporation in support of the project.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 2716 Indiana Avenue is located in the Benton Park Local Historic District;
- the revised design complies with all standards for new construction, with the exception of the attached rear garage; and
- that the garage is placed so far back on the property that its visual effect upon the street will be slight.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant approval of the proposed new construction, with the condition that final drawings and exterior materials will be submitted to the Cultural Resources Office for approval. The motion was made by Board member Erin Wright to grant approval. Alderman Craig Schmid seconded the motion. The motion passed with seven members voting to approve and none opposing

APPEALS OF DENIALS

D. 2013.1890 4380 OLIVE STREET CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Taylor Burks

Applicant: Will Wright Architect

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

Appeal of a denial of a building permit application to construct a 2 1/2 story, three-family dwelling

PROCEEDINGS:

On November 25, 2013, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an Appeal of the Director's Administrative Denial of an application to construct a three-family home at 4380 Olive Street, located in the Central West End Certified Local Historic District.

Board members Richard Callow (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, David Richardson, Anthony Robinson, Melanie Fathman, Erin Wright, Mike Killeen, and Nate Johnson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office submitted into the record certified copies of City Ordinances #64689, as amended by Ordinance #64925, #64832 and the Central West End Historic District Ordinance, #69423. Mr. Bettis detailed how the proposed new construction was not in compliance with the Central West End Historic District Standards. He recommended that the Board overturn the Director's denial with stipulations that the setback, front porch and stair, front basement entry be redesigned.

Will Wright, architect, testified on behalf of the owner, asking that the Director's denial be overturned and that the porch and front basement entry be approved as submitted.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 4380 Olive is located in the Central West End Certified Local Historic District;
- the 4300 block of Olive has lost most of its historic context and later buildings on the block vary in scale, massing and exterior materials;
- the owner and architect have worked with staff to redesign the project in order to get it closer into compliance with neighborhood rules;
- the floor levels, setbacks and massing remain inconsistent with adjacent buildings;
- the setback of the building does not conform to the building line of the block and its modification is included in the stipulation;
- the artificial stone proposed for the front and west foundations is not permitted under the standards and the use of brick, of the same or a different color from that of the main building, is included in the stipulation;
- the enclosed vestibule is not characteristic of other buildings in the historic district and its modification is included in the stipulation;
- the location of the basement entry on the front facade is not typical of other buildings in the district and its redesign is included in the stipulation; and
- that the Central West End Neighborhood Association indicated their support of the staff recommendation.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the Director's denial of a building permit application to construct the

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

NOVEMBER 25, 2013

Page 8 of 8

new house, with the stipulation that the setback be adjusted; the foundation material on the exposed elevations be brick; and the front porch and stairs and the basement front entry be redesigned to be more compatible with the neighborhood and meet the Central West End Historic District standards. The motion was made by Board member David Richardson and seconded by Mr. Killeen. Board members Nate Johnson, Anthony Robinson and Erin Wright opposed the motion. The motion passed four to three.

Alderman Craig Schmid moved to adjourn the meeting. Hearing no objection, the meeting was adjourned.