

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES
NOVEMBER 26, 2018**

Board Members Present

Richard Callow – Chairman
Randy Vines
Mike Killeen
David Richardson
Melanie Fathman
Ald. Terry Kennedy
Tiffany Hamilton - ***Absent***
Anthony Robinson-***Absent***
David Visintainer-***Absent***

Cultural Resources Office Staff Present

Dan Krasnoff, Director
Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator
Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner
Bethany Moore, Preservation Planner
Adona Buford, Adm. Assistant

Legal Counsel

Barbara Birkicht

PRELIMINARY REVIEWS

A. 2018.1460 #7 LENOX PLACE CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Jesus and Elizabeth Ituarte
Applicant: Killeen Studio Architects – Mike Killeen

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Replace entry porch with porch with a roof.

PROCEEDINGS: On November 26, 2018 the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a preliminary review application to construct a front entry porch on the primary façade at 7 Lenox Place, located in the Central West End Local Historic District. The application was submitted by Mike Killeen, the architect for the project.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), Melanie Fathman, Randy Vines, and David Richardson were present for the testimony for this agenda item and Board Member Michael Killeen recused himself, left the podium and sat with the audience.

Bethany Moore of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the Central West End Local Historic District Standards in how they relate to the construction of porches on historic buildings. Ms. Moore stated that, according to

the standards, if there was evidence of an historic porch that had been removed, the porch could be replaced based on evidence of what was previously there and proposed exceptions were subject to review by the Cultural Resources Office staff.

Ms. Moore gave evidence for the existence of an historic porch in the form of possible visible clues on the exterior of 7 Lenox Place that a porch had been removed from the primary facade as well as the 1909 Sanborn map showing 7 Lenox Place appearing to have documentation of a 1-story frame porch at the entrance. She stated that the proposed design for the front entry porch was appropriate for the style of the building with changes recommended by the Cultural Resources Office staff to include removal of exterior lamp and address plate and the addition of more substantial design elements to the pediment. Ms. Moore recommended that the Preservation Board grant preliminary approval to the proposed design, including suggested changes, with the stipulation that final plans and exterior materials are reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office.

Jesus and Elizabeth Ituarte, property owners and architect Mike Killeen, spoke to the Board on their desire for the porch. The Board also heard from Bill Siebert of the Central West End Association in opposition to the porch on the basis that it would set a precedent for the construction of non-historic entry porches that will alter the historic facades in the Central West End Local Historic District.

Ralph Wafer, retired architect and member of the Central West End Planning and Development Committee spoke in opposition of the porch due to the precedent setting nature of the project. He stated that any evidence of a previous front porch was very difficult to find, and that the CWE standards are very clear on this issue.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 7 Lenox Place is located in the Central West End Local Historic District;
- the Central West End Local Historic District Standards allow for the construction of front entry porches on historic facades when evidence of their previous existence is shown;

- evidence of an historic front entrance porch at 7 Lenox Place was provided through the 1909 Sanborn map showing a 1-story frame porch at the entrance;
- the proposed design met the requirements outlined in the standards.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval of the construction of the front entry porch at 7 Lenox Place with the stipulations that final plans and materials be approved by the Cultural Resources Office. The motion was made by Board Member Melanie Fathman and seconded by Mr. Vines. Commissioner David Richardson opposed the motion. The motion passed two to one (2-1).

B. 2018.1467 1921 OREGON AVENUE FOX PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Gregg and Elaine Bauer

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Construct 2-story single family & one-story two-car garage.

PROCEEDINGS: On November 26, 2018 the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider Preliminary Review request to construct a two-story, detached single-family house at 1921 Oregon Avenue, located in the Fox Park Local Historic District. The application was submitted by Anthony Duncan of AD Arch, the project architect.

Board members Richard Callow (Chairman), Mike Killeen, David Richardson, Randy Vines and Melanie Fathman were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #66098, the Fox Park Historic District Ordinance. She presented the plans for the proposed house, which follow a Model Example approved by the Cultural Resources Office, and noted that while the front elevation complied completely with requirements, both side elevations are to be predominantly sided and will be highly visible from the street. She recommended that the brick returns be extended on both elevations. Ms. Cameron also presented photographs of the surrounding area, and noted the presence of a number of infill buildings opposite the site that were constructed in the 1990s

and had significant amounts of siding exposed at their secondary facades. She noted that the Cultural Resources Office had received no communication from the Fox Park Neighborhood Association regarding the project.

Greg and Elaine Bauer, owners of the property, testified on their own behalf. Mr. Bauer stated that they had presented the project to the neighborhood and had its support, but had not brought a copy of the approval to the meeting. He mentioned the consistency of their design with the buildings across the street which have only 3-foot brick returns on side elevations; and stated that they had already increased the amount of brick from their original design and adding still more would entail an economic hardship. Mrs. Bauer stated that they wanted to stay in the City and loved the neighborhood; and that her husband would be general contractor on the project and did quality work. Upon inquiry from Board Member Killeen, the Bauers stated that to delay consideration of the project for a month in order to hear from the neighborhood would be difficult for them.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed site, 1921 Oregon Avenue, is located in the Fox park Local Historic District;
- an appropriate Model Example, at 2111 Nebraska, has been submitted;
- the distance between adjacent structures is slightly than 15 feet, so the side elevations must be considered to be Private Façades.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant Preliminary Approval to the project as submitted, with the condition that final design and exterior materials be reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office staff. Commissioner Richardson made the motion, which was seconded by Commissioner Vines. The motion passed with none opposed.

C. 2018.1468 5522 DELMAR BOULEVARD CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Tanjers One LLC

Applicant: Klitzing Welsch Associates – Joe Klitzing

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

Seal and tint exterior brick & concrete for restoration.

PROCEEDINGS:

On November 26, 2018 the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a preliminary review application to seal and tint the exterior brick and concrete at 5522 Delmar Avenue, located in the Central West End Local Historic District.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), Melanie Fathman, Michael Killeen, Randy Vines, and David Richardson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bethany Moore of the Cultural Resources Office gave a presentation that examined the Central West End Local Historic District Standards in how they relate to the sealing and tinting of exterior masonry. Ms. Moore stated that, according to the standards, previously unpainted brick or stone shall not be painted, waterproof coatings on historic masonry are not permitted, and cleaning and paint removal techniques require a permit and review by the Cultural Resources Office.

Ms. Moore noted that the product chosen to seal and tint the masonry was a Breathable Masonry Coating (BMC) II, a PROSOCO paint product. She also noted that the reason the owners wanted to seal and tint the exterior masonry was in order to conceal the results of an apparent chemical cleaning that had been done previously without a permit and review by the Cultural Resources Office. Ms. Moore recommended that the Preservation Board deny preliminary approval for the sealing and tinting of exterior masonry due to the Central West End Local Historic District Standards' prohibition of painting previously unpainted brick or stone and prohibition of the application of waterproof coatings on historic masonry.

Joe Klitzing, architect for the project, testified in favor of the project. He explained that the building does not fit into the historic context with the rest of the buildings on the block due to its more recent age of construction and different design to the rest of the buildings on the block and that the solution would be a breathable, tinted stain to cover up the ills of the building as it is today.

Sumi Chakraverty, property owner testified that she's previously used heavy duty restoration cleaners that didn't work. She stated

that the new tint and stain/seal would cover up any oxidation and environmental impact left on the building.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 5522 Delmar Avenue is located within the Central West End Local Historic District;
- due to its younger age of construction and design that varies from the rest of the buildings on the block, is not a contributing resource to the Central West End Local Historic District, and, therefore, sealing and tinting of the exterior masonry will not have an adverse effect to the Central West End Local Historic District.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of The Preservation Board to overturn the staff's denial and approve the sealing and tinting of the exterior masonry at 5522 Delmar Boulevard as there would be no downside to allowing the building to be tinted and sealed. The motion was made by Board Member Randy Vines and seconded by Mr. Richardson. The motion carried.

D. 2018.1469 2856-58 LEMP AVENUE BENTON PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: HEH Investments – Hank Hart

Applicant: Red Dot Studio – Lisa Selligman

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

Construct two single family townhouses.

PROCEEDINGS:

On November 26, 2018, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a Preliminary Application to construct a two-story, two-family building at 2856-58 Lemp Avenue, in the Benton Park Local Historic District. The Preliminary Review Application was submitted by the project architect, Lisa Selligman.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), Mike Killeen, David Richardson, Melanie Fathman and Randy Vines were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Andrea Gagen of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #67175, which sets forth the standards for new construction in the Benton Park Local Historic District. She also stated that an

appropriate Model Example (ME) had been chosen by the applicants, a two-story, two-family house at 2860-62 Lemp Avenue and that the Cultural Resources Office agreed was an appropriate ME. Ms. Gagen testified that while the proposed building adhered generally to the ME's setback, scale, massing, and form, it deviated in a few instances — most noticeably in the cornice material. She also mentioned that the building width and window proportions differed slightly.

No one appeared on behalf or in opposition to the project.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed site for construction, 2856-58 Lemp Avenue, is located in the Benton Park Local Historic District;
- the proposed design for the new building follows an appropriate Model Example;
- the submitted design complies with most requirements for new construction in the Lafayette Square Historic District although there are some minor variations from the HME, in the cornice design, building width and window proportions.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval for the new construction, with the condition that cornice and windows be redesigned to match the Model Example, and that final design details and exterior materials be reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office. The motion was made by Board member Michael Killeen. Ms. Fathman seconded the motion. The motion passed.

NEW APPLICATION

E. 2018.1223 4143 MANCHESTER AVE FOREST PARK SE NATIONAL REGISTER DIST

Owner: Forest Park Southeast Restoration LLC – Amy Gill

Applicant: Bellon Salvage & Rehabbing Co., - Don Bellon

DEMOLITION PLAN:

Demolish a one story one-family brick house for expansion.

PROCEEDINGS:

On November 26, 2018 the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a Preliminary Review for demolition of a house at 4143 Manchester Avenue. The proposal was to

replace these buildings with the construction of a mixed use, three story building.

Board members Richard Callow (Chairman), Melanie Fathman, Mike Killeen, David Richardson and Randy Vines were present for the testimony for this agenda item. Daniel Krasnoff of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #64689, as revised by City Ordinance #64925 and City Ordinance #64832 which delineates criteria for the review of demolition proposals for properties in National Register Historic Districts. He submitted the ordinances into the record along with a letter of from Park Central Development and the owner of the Everest restaurant, who desires to expand their existing business into the first floor of the new building, if constructed. He said the staff recommendation is to support the proposal without design stipulations because the site is within the Forest Park Southeast Form-Based District

Mr. Krasnoff said the building proposed for demolition is a “shaped parapet” style house which has been diminished in architectural value due to inappropriate alterations. He also said that houses are no longer desirable on this busy commercial corridor. He noted the language in Section G of ordinance 64832 regarding Commonly Controlled property and the expansion of existing businesses. The expansion of the Everest restaurant was cited as conforming to this section of the ordinance.

Board member Randy Vines asked if there was a need to require the applicant to obtain a building permit. Mr. Krasnoff said there was not.

Board member Richardson asked if it was common practice for CRO staff to require a building permit be issued before approval of the demolition. Mr. Krasnoff said the difficulty in this case is the application for a demolition permit, and not a preliminary review.

Chris Johnson, of Checkmate Design spoke in favor of the proposal. He said the new construction will allow for more residential units on Manchester and expansion of the Everest Restaurant.

Laura Rebbe, of Restoration St. Louis spoke in favor of the project.

Board Member David Richardson asked about the project timeline. She said the goal is to begin construction in the first quarter of 2019. She said the developer is ok with the requirement to obtain a building permit before getting a demolition permit.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 4143 Manchester Avenue is within a Preservation Review District and contributing resources to a National Register Historic District;
- the building is “Sound”;
- the building is a Merit structure;
- the building has lost some of its original design elements;
- the proposed new construction will be evaluated under the Forest Park Southeast Form-Based Code;
- there is Commonly Controlled Property and the use is an appropriate expansion of an existing commercial business.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval for demolition of 4143 Manchester with the stipulation that a building permit be approved prior to approval of the demolition permit. The motion was made by Board Member Mike Killeen and seconded by Mr. Randy Vines. The motion passed.

APPEALS OF DENIALS

F. 2018.0437 2907 McNAIR AVENUE BENTON PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Modern Living LLC – Brandon Dempsey

Deferred until the December 2018 meeting per applicant .

G. 2018.1222 2100-02 ANN AVENUE MCKINLEY HEIGHTS HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Ralph Cebulske

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Construct rear porch deck.

PROCEEDINGS: On November 26, 2018, the Preservation Board of the City of St.

Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of a Director's Denial to construct a rear deck on a building at 2100-02 Ann Avenue, in the McKinley Heights Local Historic District. The appeal was submitted by the owner, Ralph Cebulske.

Board members Chairman Richard Callow, Michael Killeen, Randy Vines, David Richardson and Melanie Fathman were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Andrea Gagen of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #67901, which sets forth the standards for new appendages in the McKinley Heights Local Historic District. Ms. Gagen stated that the McKinley Heights standards require new appendages on Semi-Public Facades to be based on a Model Example; and that ME was not submitted.

Ms. Gagen introduced into the record Ordinances #64689, #64925 and #67901, the PowerPoint and the agenda item.

Ralph Cebulske, owner of 2100-02 Ann Ave., testified on behalf of the project.

Rocco Danna, representative of the Development Committee for the McKinley Heights Neighborhood Association, testified that the neighborhood was in support of the project with some changes to the structure.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 2100-02 Ann Avenue is located in the McKinley Heights Local Historic District;
- the proposed porch will not be visually dominant from the street;
- the one-story addition makes it difficult to build a porch with less depth.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the Director's Denial of the deck due to its minimal visibility from the street, but that the details and material of the deck be reviewed by the Cultural Resources staff. The motion was made by Board Member Randy Vines. Mr. Killeen seconded the motion. David Richardson opposed the motion. The motion passed 3 to 1.

H. 2018.1335 5000 WASHINGTON AVE CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: 5000 Washington Blvd. Development LLC

COMMERCIAL PLAN: Re-roof former chapel building with asphalt shingles.

PROCEEDINGS: On November 26, 2018, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an Appeal of the Cultural Resources Director's Denial of an application to install an asphalt shingle roof, in the Central West End Certified Local Historic District. The appeal was submitted by the owner.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), Melanie Fathman, Randy Vines, David Richardson and Mike Killeen were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Andrea Gagen of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #69423, which sets forth the standards for exterior alterations in the Central West End Local Historic District. She entered into the record the enabling legislations, Ordinance #57078 as amended by #64689; the meeting agenda; and the PowerPoint presentation.

Ms. Gagen said that replacing historic slate with Slateline architectural shingles did not comply with the district Standards and recommended that the Preservation Board deny the appeal.

Steve Brinkman, owner of 5000 Washington Ave., the appellant, and Patrick McNichols, of Innovative Construction & Roofing, testified on behalf of the project. They both stated that it would be a financial hardship to require slate roofing as there were many additional costs in repairing the building.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 5000 Washington Avenue is located in the Central West End Certified Local Historic District;
- the slate on the western roof was the only remaining slate on the building;
- the owners were making a substantial investment to maintain the building;
- the cost of installing slate would cause a financial hardship.

BOARD DECISION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the Director's denial due to financial hardship. The motion was made by Board Member Richardson and seconded by Board Member Vines. The motion passed unanimously.

SPECIAL AGENDA ITEMS:

I. LAFAYETTE SQUARE HISTORIC DISTRICT STANDARDS
ACTION: On November 26, 2018 the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a petition to revise the existing Standards for Rehabilitation and New Construction for the Lafayette Square Local Historic District. The petition was submitted by the Planning and Development Committee of the Lafayette Square Restoration Committee (LSRC).

Board members Richard Callow (Chairman), Mike Killeen, David Richardson, Randy Vines and Melanie Fathman were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that outlined the proposed changes to the ordinance, noting that at its last meeting, the Board had deferred consideration of the revised standards at the request of several Board members who wished for more time to review the document.

Ms. Cameron indicated that revisions to the rehabilitation portion of the Standards were minor and primarily devoted to clarification of existing requirements. For new construction, the revised standards will address large parking lots within the district, instituting size limitations and landscaping requirements. Ms. Cameron stated that the principal change was the creation of a three-tier review for new construction: small infill sites will still require a Historic Model Example (HME), although the example may be taken from outside Lafayette Square, with the condition that the building's date of construction is after 1898. Larger infill sites with some historic context will require the use of a Historic Model Example as a basis for the design, but need not replicate the HME; and very large development sites without historic context, such as the Praxair property, are allowed more latitude in design, exterior materials and scale. Ms. Cameron stated that the Cultural

Resources Office staff had been working with the LSRC for a year to refine the Standards and recommended that the Board approve the proposed revisions.

Alderwoman Ingrassia of Ward 6 indicated her support of the revised standards but did not testify.

Board member Killen made a motion to approve the revised standards as presented; Board member Vines seconded the motion. The motion passed with none opposed.

J.
ACTION:

NEW CONSTRUCTION POLICY STANDARDS

Dan Krasnoff presented an overview of the proposed Compatible New Construction Policy. He explained the genesis of the proposal and the process for consideration of it as it evolved. A primary goal of the policy is to provide balance between allowing interesting contemporary design elements and ensuring compatibility with the adjacent buildings that comprise the district.

Mr. Krasnoff said the policy has two components—process and standards. He explained the steps in the review of proposals. In regards to standards, he said the standard requires that massing and scale must be compatible. Then applicants are allowed up to two differentiated features but no more. This will ensure a measure of differentiation and compatibility, too. Mr. Krasnoff concluded by saying that this policy should not be used in Lafayette Square and Soulard, due to the way the Historic Model Example is interpreted in those neighborhoods. Additionally, he said the Board should require an update on the Policy within a year to evaluate its effectiveness.

Board Member Mike Killeen asked if the standards allowed contemporary design in the cities that were used as models for evaluation of the proposals. Mr. Krasnoff said his only contact was with staff in Washington D.C. There he said neighborhoods that welcome contemporary design have it and neighborhoods that prefer core contextual design don't have many contemporary buildings.

Barbara Birkicht asked if the new proposed policy sought to override existing ordinances. Mr. Krasnoff said it could not. It was clarified this policy could not amend any existing ordinance.

Jay Reeves spoke in favor of the proposal though he expressed concern that the policy may be restrictive and blunt neighborhood involvement.

Rocco Dana expressed concern that there is not enough input from architects as is found in other cities that use Architectural Review Boards when considering contemporary design.

Chairman Richard Callow made a motion to adopt the Contemporary New Construction Policy. Randy Vines seconded the motion. Board members Callow, Fathman, Richardson and Vines voted in favor. None were opposed and Board member Killeen abstained.

The Board unanimously agreed that there should be a report on the Cultural Resources Office's activities at each Board meeting by the Director.

The Board agreed that the staff of CRO would identify speakers to address the Board regarding ongoing Preservation-related concerns on a regular basis.

K.
ACTION:

TOWER GROVE EAST HISTORIC DISTRICT

Dan Krasnoff provided a report on the proposed Tower Grove East Local Historic District. He said the process of creating the district was community-driven and that the CRO staff had been working with community representatives for more than a year as the form of the proposed district took shape. He also said that the driving factor in the district's creation were inappropriately designed new buildings. The proposed boundary is Grand on the west, Gravois on the east/south and the border of the Compton Hill local district on the north. Mr. Krasnoff emphasized that the standards are for new construction and additions, not the rehabilitation of existing buildings.

Chairman Richard Callow asked if the public would have other opportunities to give input regarding their desire for this proposed district. Mr. Krasnoff said the Preservation Board meeting, and the public hearing on this Agenda item as part of this duly posted meeting of the Preservation Board, was well publicized and that the Board of Aldermen would also hold a hearing regarding the proposed district.

Board Member David Richardson asked the Schnucks site at Grand and Gravois was included. Mr. Krasnoff said the inclusion of the Grand/Gravois site made for a logical boundary and would ensure that future development there would be compatible with the historic neighborhood to the north and east.

Kathryn Hendrickson spoke against the proposal. She expressed concerns about the impact on low-income people and that it could make it difficult for owners to improve their properties.

Jan Simons spoke against the proposal. She said she supports the proposal but was disappointed because she was not aware of the proposal before seeing placards created for the Preservation Board public hearing.

Christin Ingrassia, the 6th Ward Alderwoman, spoke in favor of the proposal. She noted that the proposal will only impact new construction or large-scale building rehabilitation. She also said that the Preservation Board is in place when there is a compelling need for variance from the standards.

Chairman Richard Callow asked CRO staff if written notice was sent to property owners as was required in Ordinance 64689. Staff answered that such notice was sent. He also asked if the public notice was published in a newspaper of daily circulation. CRO staff said it was.

David Rodgers, of the Tower Grove East Association, spoke in favor of the proposal. He said the proposal was created with concerns about maintaining the neighborhood mix, both economically and racially.

David Richardson made motion for the Preservation Board to recommend approval of the Tower Grove East Historic District. Board Member Randy Vines seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously.