PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES NOVEMBER 27, 2017 Page **1** of **12**

CITY OF ST. LOUIS CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES NOVEMBER 27, 2017

Board Members Present

Richard Callow – Chairman

Anthony Robinson
David Richardson
Randy Vines
David Visintainer
Tiffany Hamilton

<u>Cultural Resources Office Staff Present</u>

Dan Krasnoff, Director

Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner Bob Bettis, Preservation Planner

Adona Buford, Administrative Assistant

Legal Counsel
Barbara Birkicht

PRELIMINARY REVIEWS

A. 2017.0799 16 WESTMORELAND CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Andy & Peasy Love

Applicant: Mitchell Wall & Associates – Greg Garrett

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct a glass and steel conservatory on

rear façade.

PROCEEDINGS: On November 27, 2017, the Preservation Board of the City of St.

Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a Preliminary Application to construct a 1-1/2-story conservatory addition to a 2-1/2 story house at 16 Westmoreland

Place, in the Central West End Local Historic District. The application was submitted by Mitchell Wall/Greg Garrett on

behalf of the owners, Andy and Peasey Love.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair); David Visintainer; Michael Killeen; Randy Vines; Tiffany Hamilton and Anthony Robinson

were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #69423, which sets forth the standards for additions and new

construction in the Central West End Local District. She testified that while the conservatory would be constructed at the rear southeast corner of the house, it would extend beyond the house's east façade and will be visible from Westmoreland Place; that its 1-1/2 story height did not fully comply with the Central West End Standards requiring additions to historic buildings be compatible in height, scale, mass and material to the fabric of the building.

Ms Cameron stated, however, that the design had been revised substantially from the first submission in consideration of comments from the Cultural Resources Office staff, and, although still clearly contemporary, was now lighter in scale and feeling. She also noted that the addition would impact the house in only two small places and would be removable without significant damage to the historic structure. Ms Cameron added that the Central West End Association had decided not to comment on the project.

Andy Love, owner, appeared in support of the project but did not testify.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 16 Westmoreland Place is located in the Central West End Local Historic District.
- The proposed addition does not fully comply with the requirements of the Central West End Standards that require that additions to historic buildings be compatible in height, scale, mass and material to the fabric of the building.
- Revisions have been made to the original submission that have lightened the scale of the addition and increased its compatibility with the house.
- Further revisions presented at the meeting indicate that the addition will now extend less than a foot beyond the house wall.
- The addition will be self-supporting and will have little impact upon the house itself, and could be removed with little damage in the future.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant Preliminary approval for the construction of the addition, with the stipulation it extend no more than 8 inches beyond the east wall of the house

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES NOVEMBER 27, 2017 Page **3** of **12**

and that final drawings, materials and colors be reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office. The motion was made by Board Member Randy Vines and seconded by Ms. Tiffany Hamilton. The motion passed unanimously.

B. 2017.1084 1001-03 RUSSELL BLVD. SOULARD HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: 1001 Russell LLC

Applicant: Ebersoldt & Associates – Dustin Bopp

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct three-story mixed-use building.

PROCEEDINGS: On November 27, 2017, the Preservation Board of the City of St.

Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a preliminary review application to construct a 4-story mixed-use building at 1001-03 Russell Boulevard, located in the Soulard Neighborhood Local Historic District. The application was

submitted by the project developer.

At its July 24, 2017 meeting, the Preservation Board had granted preliminary approval to this proposal, with the condition that brick on the side elevations extend to the rear of each façade; and that exterior details and materials be reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office. The applicant has submitted an addendum to his building permit as granted by the Building Commissioner. In the addendum presently submitted and before this Board for consideration, the applicant is requesting that the Board allow a material other than brick be used on the side elevations.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair); Randy Vines; Michael Killeen; David Visintainer; Tiffany Hamilton; and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #57978, which sets forth the standards for demolition and new construction in the Soulard Historic District. She indicated that the project was generally in compliance with the historic district standards for new construction and that the Development Committee of the Soulard Restoration Group was in support of the exception for brick on the side elevations.

Charlie Closser, of 1001 Russell LLC, the project developer, spoke in support of the exception. He submitted letters of support from 7th Ward Alderman Jack Coatar and from the Soulard Restoration Group. Mr. Closser explained the financial constraints of this relatively small building that made the additional brick costprohibitive and submitted letters of support for the change from 9th Ward Alderman Jack Coatar and from the Soulard Restoration Group, signed by President Wade Weistreich. Mr. Closser submitted additional plans that included a new rendering of the proposed building and revised elevations for the secondary façades: that of the western facade now shows a brick massing placed at the junction of brick and siding, replicating a chimney. Mr. Closser stated that given the relatedly small size of the building, with only 16 units, the cost of the additional brick would be difficult to sustain; and that lobby space and amenities had already been scaled back substantially. In response to a question from Board Member Killeen, Mr. Closser testified that he could not add a setback to the east elevation, as the building could not encroach upon the neighboring garage, sited at the property line and which had no foundation.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- The proposed new construction is a three-story mixed-use building. The building responds to the intent of the New Construction section of the Soulard Historic District Standards, while not meeting every standard.
- The street façade material will be brick, and meets the standards for façade materials. The lap siding proposed for the side elevations generally meets the standards for semi-public facades.
- The developer has agreed to place a brick "chimney" at the transition from brick to siding on the west elevation, which will be the most street-visible. A similar treatment cannot be used on the east elevation because of a neighboring structure that is sited on the property line.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval to the proposal, with the condition that final plans and exterior details and materials be reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office. The motion was made by Board Member Michael Killeen. Mr. Anthony Robinson seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

C. 2017.1278 3001 MISSOURI AVE. BENTON PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Prime Property Investments

Applicant: Dan Kammerer

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct a new single family house.

PROCEEDINGS: On November 27, 2017 the Preservation Board of the City of St.

Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a Preliminary Review for a proposal to construct a one-and-a-half-story single family building with attached garage at 3001 Missouri Ave, in the Benton Park Neighborhood Local

Historic District. Dan Kamerer, the property owner, submitted the

application.

Board members, Richard Callow (Chairman), Tiffany Hamilton, David Visintainer, Michael Killeen and Randy Vines were present

for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the section of City Ordinance #67175, which sets forth the standards for new residential construction in the Benton Park Neighborhood Local Historic District. He indicated that the project generally complied with the Design Standards.

Dan Kamerer, applicant, was present but did not testify.

FINDINGS OF FACTS: The Preservation Board found that:

• The proposed site for construction, 3001 Missouri Avenue, is located in the Benton Park Local Historic District.

• The proposed design for the new building follows an appropriate Model Example.

 As there is no alley, any required parking would necessitate a curb-cut either on Crittenden

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval of the proposed new construction, with the stipulation that final plans and exterior materials are reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office. The motion was made by Board

member David Visintainer. Ms. Tiffany Hamilton seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

D. 2017.1544 2266/2268 MISSOURI AVE. McKINLEY HEIGHTS HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Martino, LLC

Applicant: Bradley Collins Architects

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct two new single-family houses.

PROCEEDINGS: On November 27, 2017 the Preservation Board of the City of St.

Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a Preliminary Review for a proposal to construct two, two-story, single family buildings with detached garages at 2266 & 2268 Missouri Avenue, in the McKinley Heights Neighborhood Local Historic District. Bradley Peterson, architect for the project,

submitted the application.

Board members, Richard Callow (Chairman), Randy Vines, David Visintainer, Anthony Robinson, Michael Killeen and Tiffany Hamilton were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the section of City Ordinance #67901, which sets forth the standards for new residential construction in the McKinley Heights Neighborhood Local Historic District. He indicated that the project generally complied with the Design

Bradley Peterson, applicant and architect, was present but did not

testify.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- The proposed site for construction, 2266-68 Missouri Avenue, is located in the McKinley Heights Local Historic District.
- The design for the new building uses an appropriate Model Example.
- The massing, scale, and proportions of the buildings are appropriate for their site and compatible with adjacent buildings.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES NOVEMBER 27, 2017 Page **7** of **12**

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval of the proposed new construction, with the stipulation that the basement windows on 2268 Missouri not be arched and that the final plans and exterior materials are reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office. The motion was made by Board Member Mike Killeen. Mr. Randy Vines seconded the

motion. The motion passed unanimously.

E. 2017.1776 215 YORK AVE.

CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Andy Holloran

Applicant: JNS Designs - Kay Galligan

DEFERRED UNTIL NEXT BOARD MEETING, SCHEDULED FOR DECEMBER 18th, 2017

F. 2017.1777 1900 LAFAYETTE AVE. LAFAYETTE SQUARE HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Historic Lafayette Church, LLC

Applicant: UIC Brent Crittenden

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct multi-purpose room addition to

existing building.

PROCEEDINGS: On November 27, 2017, the Preservation Board of the City of St.

Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a preliminary application for the construction of additions to the Lafayette Preparatory Academy, located in the Lafayette Square Local Historic District. The project will add two stories above an existing one-story school at Lafayette Avenue

and a two-story addition facing Mississippi Avenue. The

application was submitted by the property owner and developer,

Brent Crittenden of Historic Lafayette Church, LLC.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), David Visintainer, Mike Killeen, Anthony Robinson, Tiffany Hamilton and Randy Vines

were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office, made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #69112, which sets forth the standards for non-residential new construction in the Lafayette Square Local Historic District. A letter in general support of the project with conditions from

Suzanne Sessions, Co-Vice President of the Lafayette Square Development Committee, was submitted into the record. Ms Cameron summarized the proposal and showed images of the development site and the surrounding area. She testified that the project had been revised in accordance with comments by the Cultural Resources Office and appeared now more compatible with adjacent historic buildings in mass, scale and exterior materials. She noted two areas still of concern: the design of main stair on the Mississippi elevation and the location of an HVAC screen at the southeast corner of the Preston Place elevation; beyond these elements, the project appears to comply with Lafayette Square Historic District Standards.

Brent Crittenden, of Historic Lafayette Church LLC, the property owner and project developer, testified on his own behalf and presented copies of additional drawings to the Board. He made a brief summary of the project's history and the proposed new construction.

The Chairman then called Suzanne Sessions, Co-Vice President of the Lafayette Square Development Committee, and requested that she state the Committee's concerns. Ms. Sessions said the Committee remained concerned about three areas: The trim on the gable of the Mississippi building; the screen on the Preston Place elevation; and the stair design on the Lafayette Avenue elevation.

In response to a question from Board Member Randy Vines about these three elements, Mr. Crittenden said he was willing to consider additional stone trim and the relocation of the HVAC and screen, but he felt that the stair railing design was a critical element that made the composition work.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- The proposed site for construction, 1900 Lafayette Avenue, is located in the Lafayette Square Local Historic District.
- The applicant has presented his design to the Cultural Resources Office and the Lafayette Square Development Committee and has been responsive to their concerns, resulting in increased visual compatibility with surrounding historic buildings.

- The design complies with most of the requirements for new non-residential construction in the Lafayette Square Historic District; however, concerns regarding the impact of the proposed stair rail, metal screen and additional stone trim on the Mississippi façade have been noted.
- The architect has indicated that he is willing to work with the Cultural Resources Office staff and the Lafayette Square Committee to address their concerns about the amount of stone trim and the HVAC screen, but contends that the stair element is critical to his design.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval to the proposed design, with the stipulation that screen location be relocated to be less visible and with the stipulation the stair rail location be re-evaluated and approved by staff, and that exterior materials be reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office.

The motion was made by Board Member David Visintainer. Ms Tiffany Hamilton seconded the motion. A roll was called. The motion failed 3 to 2.

Board member Anthony Robinson moved to grant preliminary approval to the proposed design with the stipulations that the screen location be reconsidered and final plans are reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office. Mr. Vines seconded the motion. A roll was called. The motion passed 3-2 with Board Members Robinson, Vines and Michael Killeen voting in favor of the motion and Board Members David Visintainer and Tiffany Hamilton opposed.

APPEALS OF DENIALS

G. 2017.1778 1930 VIRGINIA AVE. COMPTON HILL HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Sidney Holding Group, LLC

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of Preservation Board's conditions.

PROCEEDINGS: On November 27, 2017 the Preservation Board of the City of St.

Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to

consider an appeal of a Director's Denial of addendum to a permit to construct a two-family residence at 1930 Virginia Avenue.

Board members Richard Callow (Chairman), Anthony Robinson, Tiffany Hamilton, Randy Vines, David Visintainer, and Mike Killeen were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Andrea Gagen of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #57702, which sets forth standards for new construction in the Compton Hill Historic District. She entered into the record the ordinances, agenda item and the PowerPoint presentation, as well as feedback from a neighbor, the Compton Hill Reservoir Square Residents Association & 6th Ward Alderwoman Christine Ingrassia.

Orlando Askins, owner, spoke on his own behalf.

Frank Absher, Daron Smith, John Maxwell and Cathy Greminger, neighborhood residents, spoke in opposition to the addendum.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- The proposed site for the new two-family building is within the boundaries of the Compton Hill Certified Local Historic District.
- The south side of the building is visible due to the one-story building to the south, and the north elevation will be partially visible.
- The cement board siding proposed for the sides and rear of the building are not compatible in type and texture with the predominant original building materials used in the neighborhood.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the Director's denial of the addendum. The motion was made by Board member David Visintainer. Mr. Randy Vines seconded the motion while Mr. Anthony Robinson opposed the motion. The motion passed 4-1.

H. 2017.1425 816 ALLEN AVE.

SOULARD HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Archbishop of St. Louis – Ron Hampp Applicant: Dalco Industries – Brian Dickerson

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of a denial of a building permit application to replace

eighteen windows.

PROCEEDINGS: On November 27, 2017 the Preservation Board of the City of St.

Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial of a building permit to retain windows and trim installed on a building at 816 Allen Avenue, in the Soulard Neighborhood Local Historic District. The

applicant submitted the appeal.

Board members Richard Callow, Mike Killeen, Anthony Robinson, Randy Vines, Tiffany Hamilton and David Visintainer were present

for the testimony for this agenda item.

Andrea Gagen of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #62382, which sets forth the standards for windows in the Soulard Neighborhood Local Historic District.

Ms. Gagen entered into the record certified copies of Ordinances #64689, as amended by #64925, and #62382; the Board agenda and the PowerPoint presentation for 816 Allen.

Brian Dickerson, of Dalco Industries, spoke on the owner's behalf.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 816 Allen Avenue is located in the Soulard Neighborhood Local Historic District.
- The front of the building is considered to be a Public Façade under the Soulard Historic District standards.
- The installed double-hung windows, although historic replacement windows, do not replicate the dimensions and profiles of the original wood windows, resulting in a reduction of glass size.
- The brick-mold and mullions have been covered or replaced with extruded aluminum pieces that do not replicate the originals.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES NOVEMBER 27, 2017 Page **12** of **12**

BOARD DECISION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the

Director's Denial of the building permit, as the proposed windows do not comply with the Soulard Historic District Standards. The motion was made by Board member Mike Killeen. Mr. Randy Vines seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

SPECIAL AGENDA ITEM

Skinker - DeBaliviere Historic District Standards

BOARD ACTION: Ms. Nancy Hohmann, Chairman of the Skinker-DeBaliviere

Historic District Committee, made a presentation regarding the revisions of the Historic District Ordinance which started in 2015. She stated that the Ordinance has been updated to bring it in line with modern construction techniques and to make it more

applicable to the Preservation Board. Ms. Hohmann stated that the Skinker-DeBaliviere Committee received public comments on

the Ordinance and that both 26th Ward and 28th Ward representatives were in support of the revised Ordinance.

Dan Krasnoff, Director of the Cultural Resources Office, asked that the Preservation Board recommend the revised Ordinance to the Planning Commission and to the Board of Aldermen for review, so that it may be prepared as a Board Bill.

Board member Tiffany Hamilton moved that the Preservation Board direct the staff to prepare a report that recommends to the Planning Commission and to the Board of Aldermen the adoption of the revised Skinker-DeBaliviere Historic District Standards.