

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES
DECEMBER 16, 2013**

Board Members Present

Richard Callow, Chairman
Alderman Craig Schmid
Anthony Robinson
Erin Wright
David Richardson

Cultural Resources Office Staff Present

Betsy H. Bradley, Director
Bob Bettis, Preservation Planner
Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner
Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator
Adona Buford, Administrative Assistant

Chairman Richard Callow called the roll. Erin Wright moved to approve the October and November 2013 minutes, and the current Agenda. Alderman Craig Schmid seconded the motion. The minutes and the current Agenda were approved.

PRELIMINARY REVIEWS

A. 2013.2114 4643 LINDELL BLVD. CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Opus Development Company, LLC – Joseph Downs

DEMOLITION PLAN: Preliminary review to demolish a building and construct a 12-story residential building.

PROCEEDINGS: Board members, Richard Callow (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, Anthony Robinson, Erin Wright, and David Richardson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Cultural Resources Office Director Betsy Bradley made a presentation that examined criteria for demolition in the Central West End Historic District Standards, City Ordinance # 69423 (enacted 2013), and in Preservation Review Districts, as stated in Ordinances #64689 and #64832, as well as the standards for new construction of residential buildings in the Central West End

Historic District Standards. Ms. Bradley recommended that the Preservation Board grant preliminary approval to the demolition of the Heart Association Building and, due to the prominent location and scale of the project, provide comments on the design and consider the project again as a second Preliminary Review.

Joe Downs and Dean Newins spoke on behalf of Opus. Mr. Newins presented some additional views of the proposed building, including a more detailed rendering of the plaza area. He indicated that Opus had taken account of the suggestions from stakeholders and was in the process of making revisions to the exterior design.

John McPheeters presented remarks on the project on behalf of the Central West End Association Planning & Development Committee. His testimony, a written copy of which was entered into the record, noted the importance of the property and need to have a first-class building on the site. His remarks addressed several specific aspects of the design.

Mike Murray stated that he sees three important aspects to consider in making a decision regarding this property: the demolition, the development decisions for return on investment and the related design and materials of the project. Suzanne Zorn echoed some of Mr. McPheeters' statements and noted the importance of the highly visible north elevation. Paul Mittelstadt urged that the highest quality materials be used. Ralph Wafer questioned the possibility for the success of a new building based on the traditional tripartite formula for a tall building and urged consideration of a more straightforward contemporary design.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 4643 Lindell, the Heart Association Building, is a sound, Merit property located in the Central West End Certified Local Historic District and is in a Preservation Review District;
- there is no Redevelopment Plan adopted by ordinance, although one is being developed;
- while the surrounding area would support rehabilitation of the office building, the site was identified as one for redevelopment in 2005 when it was sold by the Heart Association;
- and a subsequent proposal for a tall residential building was considered at that time;
- the commonly-controlled property and accessory structure criteria are not applicable for this review; and

- that the owner is proposing new construction: a twelve-story apartment building with commercial use on the ground floor.

Ms. Bradley made the following statements regarding the proposed new construction:

- The proposed new Opus Building is not compliant with the CWE historic district standards because it is not compatible in important ways with the buildings of the Central West End. As the site is prominent and the building is large in scale for the area, its design sophistication and use of materials are of particular concern.
- Ms. Bradley has been following the development of this project closely. She met with Opus project principals at a meeting about the FBZ District standards, attended meetings at which the design was presented to the CWE Planning & Development Committee and to the public at a CWE Association sponsored meeting and heard firsthand the reactions to the design.
- Ms. Bradley has received 8 email messages from residents of the Central West End subsequent to the last public meeting. One message expressed support for the project. The others expressed concern about the quality of the design, the quality of the materials, and the effects of the project on parking in the immediate vicinity. These same concerns were expressed at each meeting.
- While the standards address specific aspects of the design, an overall intent statement at the beginning of the new construction section states: "Visual compliance shall be judged on massing and detail in addition to size and scale." The various aspects of the design must combine to provide visual compliance. While the design meets *in part* various standards, the cumulative effect of that partial compliance and overall lack of visual compatibility result in a determination that the building does not meet the historic district standards.
- The historic district standards refer to coordination with the Form Based Zoning District architectural development standards and the agenda notes some of the ways that the design does not meet either of those standards. The fact that the proposed materials do not meet the standards of either – in allowable material or pattern of use – is critical. The two sets of standards clearly convey the type of building the

residents of the Central West End, the members of the CWE Planning & Development Committee and the Cultural Resources Office staff expect to see at this prominent location.

- One of the major features of the building exterior is not integrated into the design: approximately 200 balconies. As proposed, the balconies do not meet the test of visual compliance, as those on other tall residential buildings are integrated into their architectural design, read as masonry portions of the building, and most are recessed; and doors to balconies are less overtly part of the fenestration pattern. The numerous balconies on the Euclid façade that extend over the public sidewalk are also a concern. If balconies are a critical amenity to provide, the provision of them should be integrated into the design.
- The standards clearly state that contemporary design that is compatible and that meets the standards is not discouraged. Imitative designs are clearly not encouraged. Opus has described its design as having a foot in two camps: based on the standard tripartite tall building design and providing a fresh, contemporary feeling. Yet the design does not present as overtly contemporary.
- While the lack of compliance of the proposed materials is easily pointed to, the upgrading of materials cannot alone make this design compatible with the high-quality buildings in the Central West End Historic District. Some more complicated massing with vertical plane breaks, the integration of balconies, an architecturally appropriate termination for the building, and a design for the plaza that compensates for the loss of the landscaped terrace must be addressed in order for the building to be compliant.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to defer the matter of the Preliminary Review to allow further consideration of revisions to the building design. The motion was made by Board member David Richardson. Alderman Craig Schmid seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously with four members voting.

B. 2013.2116 4243 MARYLAND AVE. CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Akiko Takeda
Applicant: Paul Fendler

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct a new alley house.

PROCEEDINGS: Board members, Richard Callow (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, Anthony Robinson, Erin Wright, and David Richardson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the section of City Ordinance #69423, which sets forth the standards for new residential construction in the Central West End Historic District.

She testified that the project was not in compliance with the Standards as the house was proposed to be sited at the rear of the property, and its fenestration and other design elements also did not follow the requirements of the Standards. She also stated that, because the house would be constructed at the rear of a long, narrow lot, these deviations from the Standards would not have a significant effect upon the historic streetscape.

Paul Fendler, project architect, testified on behalf of the project.

FINDINGS OF FACTS: The Preservation Board found that:

- 4243 Maryland Avenue is located in the Central West End Local Historic District;
- the building deviates from the Standards in its location, fenestration, roof shape and other details;
- the front of the building is proposed to be cast stone veneer; while several stone facades are extant on the block, they are ashlar, coursed stone with a more formal appearance than the stone proposed; and
- that the building will be sited at the rear of the property, approximately 170 feet from the street and its effect upon the streetscape will be minimal.

BOARD ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant approval of the Preliminary Review of the proposed new construction, subject to review of final documents and materials by the Cultural Resources Office, and with the stipulation that an appropriate fence and/or landscaping be installed to continue the building line

of the block. The motion was made by Board member Anthony Robinson. Ms. Wright seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously with four members voting.

C. 2013.2117 3011 McNAIR STREET BENTON PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Amy Mintner

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct a single family house.

PROCEEDINGS: Board members, Richard Callow (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, Anthony Robinson, Erin Wright, and David Richardson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the section of City Ordinance #67175, which sets forth the standards for new residential construction in the Benton Park Local Historic District. She testified that the project was generally in compliance with the Standards with the exception of the north wall, which will be a combination of brick and siding.

Amy Mintner, project developer and Stacy Clear, project architect, testified on behalf of the project.

FINDINGS OF FACTS: The Preservation Board found that:

- 3011 McNair Avenue is located in the Benton Park Local Historic District;
- the building will be sited close to the infill house to be constructed at 3015 McNair and the south elevation will not be street-visible;
- the north elevation will be partly visible, due to the width of the side yard to the north;
- approximately one-third of the north elevation is proposed to be veneered in brick, with the remainder of the wall sided, a condition that does not follow the Model Example; and
- that the developer agreed at the meeting to widen the front block of the house so that the two-story sided portion will appear to be an addition, and thereby mitigate the effect of the siding.

BOARD ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant Preliminary approval of the proposed new construction, subject to reconsideration of the design with regard to the north elevation,

and with the condition that final drawings and exterior materials will be submitted to the Cultural Resources Office for approval. The motion was made by Alderman Schmid. Ms. Wright seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously with four members voting.

APPEALS OF DENIALS

D. 2013.1865 4520 McPHERSON AVENUE CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: MG Star II LLC – Goran Stosovic

Applicant: Anthony Duncan Architect

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of the Director’s denial of a building permit application to construct a dormer and a three-story deck at rear of building.

PROCEEDINGS: Board members, Richard Callow (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, Anthony Robinson, Erin Wright, and David Richardson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the section of City Ordinance #69423, which sets forth the standards for residential rehabilitation in the Central West End Historic District. She testified that the project was not in compliance with the Standards as the roof slope was to be altered with the addition of a large gabled dormer and three-story rear deck that would be visible from the street. She stated that the building permit application had been administratively denied due to ordinance time limitations, and to allow the applicant to present the project to the Planning and Development Committee of the Central West End Neighborhood Association.

Ms Cameron entered into the record Ordinances #64689 and #69423; the Board agenda and the PowerPoint presentation for 4520 McPherson; and the building permit application, including all construction documents.

Anthony Duncan, architect for the project, testified for the appeal. He stated that the building, originally a single-family, had been converted previously to four small apartments; that the large dormer was required for new 2-story units on the second floor; that if necessary, some of the chimneys could be retained and the dormer could be clad with a different material. He further stated that the amenity of a deck at each story was required in order for the units to be viable.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

DECEMBER 16, 2013

Page 8 of 9

FINDINGS OF FACT:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 4520 Maryland Avenue is located in the Central West End Local Historic District;
- three chimneys are proposed to be removed;
- because of the wide side yards, the proposed gable dormer and three-story deck will be visible from Maryland Avenue; the dormer significantly alters the roofline of the building and the deck follows no historic example and is much larger in scale than historic porches; and
- that the project deviates from the Standards in that visible roof slopes may not be altered, visible chimneys may not be lowered or removed; and that decks that are visible from the street must be of a shape and scale similar to that a historic porch and be screened to limit visibility.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the Director's denial of the building permit application for exterior alterations. The motion was made by Board member Erin Wright. Alderman Schmid seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously with four members voting.

E. 2013.1962 2327 GRAVOIS AVENUE MCKINLEY HEIGHTS HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: MHK Realty LLC – Mr. Khan

Applicant: Bill Yount Signs – Bob Williams

COMMERCIAL PLAN:

Appeal of the Director's denial of a building permit application to replace an existing illuminated ground sign.

PROCEEDINGS:

Board members, Richard Callow (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, Anthony Robinson, Erin Wright, and David Richardson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Andrea Gagen of the Cultural Resources Office submitted into the record certified copies of City Ordinances #64689, as amended by Ordinance #64925, and the McKinley Heights Local Historic District Ordinance, #67901. Ms. Gagen detailed why the proposed item was not in compliance with the McKinley Heights Local Historic District Standards. He recommended that the Board deny the permit as proposed.

Bob Williams of Bill Yount Signs, the applicant, testified on behalf of the owner, asking that the Director's denial be overturned as

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

DECEMBER 16, 2013

Page 9 of 9

the owner feels that the sign is necessary for a successful business.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 2327 Gravois Av. is located in the McKinley Heights Local Historic District;
- the existing sign was grandfathered in when the local historic district was established;
- the proposed sign would be approximately 6 ft. x 10 ft., set on a 2 ft. base; and
- that the proposed sign would exceed the square footage allowed under the McKinley Heights Historic District Standards by 85 sq. ft.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to Board uphold the Director's denial of the sign as the proposed sign would exceed the square footage allowed under the McKinley Heights Historic District Standards by 85 sq. feet. The motion was made by Board member Erin Wright. Alderman Schmid seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously with four members voting.

SPECIAL AGENDA ITEM

Consideration of a Preservation Board conflict of Interest Policy.

Betsy Bradley presented a Policy to the Preservation Board for approval. Board Member David Richardson asked that page 3 of the Conflict of Interest Policy be revised before an approval be granted. Ms. Bradley agreed to make the necessary revisions.