



stated that a two-story single-family residence on the north of the site has been completed and a permit has been issued for the rehabilitation of the “worker’s cottage,” that included an L-shaped addition. However, the two-unit building originally intended for the south part of the site has now been revised to a smaller, single-family house. She stated that the new design was generally in compliance with the Benton Park standards, but noted that both side elevations will be prominently visible and recommended that the brick return a greater distance on both facades.

Curtiss Byrnes, project architect, spoke in support of the project. In response to a question from Board Member Killeen, he said he did not have the specifics of the pro forma for the project, and could not answer the effect additional brick would have on the project. He testified that the decision to change from a two-family to a single-family had been made because it was thought that a larger single-family would be more marketable. In response to a question from Board Member Vines, Mr. Byrnes stated that the new building would be centered on the lot and that the wide side yards would not be developable sites.

**FINDINGS OF FACTS:**

The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed site for construction, 3318 Lemp Avenue, is located in the Benton Park Local Historic District;
- because of the revised plan that includes a smaller single-family house in place of the two-unit building originally proposed, both side elevations will be prominently visible;
- the revised design complies with historic districts standards for new construction in Site, Mass, Scale and Façade materials;
- the revised design does not comply with the standards for Model Example, Proportion and Ratio of Solid to Void.

**BOARD DECISION:**

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant Preliminary Approval to the new design with the stipulation that the brick on both side elevation be extended to the rear; and that final drawings, materials, details and colors are reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office. The motion was made by Board Member Mike Killeen. Mr. Vines seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

**B. 2018.1385 4323-2 WESTMINSTER PL. CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DIST.**

---

Owner/Applicant: MLM Homes LLC 2 – Mark Mathis

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct multi-family building on two parcels.

PROCEEDINGS: On December 17, 2018, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider Preliminary Review application to construct a four-family building at 34323 Westminster Place, in the Central West End Historic District and in Fullerton's Westminster Place National Register District. The application was submitted by Mark L. Mathis of MLM Homes LLC 2, the developer.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), Mike Killeen, Randy Vines, David Richardson, Tiffany Hamilton, Melanie Fathman, and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #69423 which sets forth the standards for new construction in the Central West End Historic District. Ms. Cameron stated the design of the new building was intended to create the appearance of a large single-family house, compatible with other historic properties on the Place. She said the developer had worked with the neighborhood, residents of the Place and the Cultural Resources Office staff to refine the design. She recommended that the proposed front entry design be refined to replicate the appearance of a historic double-leaf entry, and recommended that the Board grant Preliminary Approval to the project with that stipulation. Ms. Cameron distributed to the Board a letter from Jim Dwyer, Chair of the Planning & Design Committee of the Central West End Association, stating other concerns with the design. In response to a question from Board Member Robinson regarding the use of siding on the rear elevation, Ms. Cameron stated that the CWE standards only specified the use of compatible materials and did not specifically require four sides of brick. In response to a question from Board Member Hamilton, she replied that there were other houses on the Place that had sided portions; and in response to a question from Board member Killeen, Ms. Cameron stated that she had not received a scaled elevation of the

streetscape, but that one would be submitted prior to final design approval.

Curtiss Byrnes, project architect, spoke in support of the project. He submitted to the Board a scaled street elevation. In response to a question from Board Member Robinson, he said that the new building would be slightly shorter than the houses to either side, as it has a 10-foot ceiling height on both stories, but contended that the difference was within the 15% the standards require.

Larry Frederick, President of the Fullerton's Westminster Place Homeowners Association, testified that the Association was in support of the recommendation of the Cultural Resources Office and the additional recommendations of the Central West End Association.

Mark Mathis, developer of the project, appeared in support but did not testify.

Ralph Wafer, representing the Planning & Development Committee of the Central West End Association, stated that the Committee recommended changes to the current design, including three dormers on the front façade; windows of the front be ganged, not separate; and that the front entry detail be refined. He also testified that the Committee recommended that the brick return on the rear elevation to the point of the recessed balconies.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed site for construction, 4323 Westminster Place, is located in the Central West End Local Historic District;
- the siting, scale, proportions, roof shape, and exterior materials comply with the Standards;
- the vast majority of structures on Westminster Place are fine single-family residences this new multi-family building -should appear to be a single-family building.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant Preliminary approval to the new design with the condition that final drawings, details, and exterior materials are approved by the Cultural Resources Office and with the following stipulations, that:

- the front elevation have three dormers;
- the front windows be paired, not single;

- the large gable roof at the rear elevation be changed to either a hipped or flat roof;
- the brick on both sides of the rear facade return to the point of the elevation that is recessed; and
- details of the front entry be further refined.

The motion was made by Board Member Anthony Robinson. Mr. Killeen seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

**C. 2018.1440 912-14 GEYER AVENUE SOULARD HISTORIC DISTRICT**

---

Owner/Applicant: 912 Geyer LLC – Eric Hankins

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to demolish alley house and construct 3 two-story single-family houses with two-car garages per unit.

PROCEEDINGS: On December 17, 2018, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a Preliminary Review application to demolish an alley house and brick privacy wall in order to construct three single-family townhomes with detached garages at 912-914 Geyer Avenue, in the Soulard Local Historic District.

The appeal was submitted by Erik Hankins, owner.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), Randy Vines, David Richardson, Tiffany Hamilton, Michael Killeen, Melanie Fathman and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bethany Moore of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the existing conditions of the alley house at 912 Geyer Avenue and the plans for the proposed new construction. Ms. Moore stated that a visual inspection of the alley house on December 11, 2018 done from the alley with access to only the east and south facades yielded that the building appeared to meet the definition of “Sound” as defined in Ordinance 64832. She also submitted into the record an engineer’s report given to the Cultural Resources Office by the applicant that examined the full interior and exterior conditions of the alley house and additions.

Ms. Moore also examined the details of the new construction including site plan, Model Example, exterior materials, setback,

surrounding historic context, etc. based on the requirements in Article 3: New Buildings of the Soulard Local Historic District Standards Ordinance #57078. The proposed new construction was compliant with the Standards in almost all areas excluding the exterior material on the facade of the west elevation of the town homes that would be visible from the street due to the adjacent parking lot. Ms. Moore noted that the Cultural Resources Office was asking for the 12 feet of brick proposed for the west elevation to be extended to cover the entirety of the facade, which is visible from the street. She recommended, because of the engineer's report on the condition of the alley house, the Preservation Board should grant preliminary approval to the demolition of the house and additions, to the brick wall and to the proposed design for the new construction, with the condition that brick extend the length of the west facade and with the stipulation that final plans and exterior materials are reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office.

Erik Hankins, the owner, testified on behalf of the project. Mr. Hankins agreed to extend the brick on the West elevation to the rear per Cultural Resources Office recommendations. He also agreed to get an approved building permit before he demolished the existing alley house, per the Preservation Board's request.

**FINDINGS OF FACTS:**

The Preservation Board found that:

- 912-914 Geyer Avenue is located in the Soulard Local Historic District;
- the alley house at 912 Geyer Avenue is a Merit building;
- the alley house is structurally deteriorated as stated in the engineer's report submitted by the applicant;
- the new construction is based on a Historic Model Example and is compatible with its surroundings.

**BOARD DECISION:**

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to approve the preliminary review for demolition of the alley house with the condition that no demolition permit be approved until a building permit was applied for; and approved construction of the townhouses with the stipulations that the brick on the west facade extend the full length of the west facade, and final plans and exterior materials are reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office. The motion was made by Board

Member Richardson and seconded by Mr. Killeen. The motion passed unanimously.

**D. 2018.1531 2720-26 MARCUS AVENUE THE VILE HISTORIC DISTRICT**

---

Owner/Applicant: First and Last Home LLC – Gerald Claunch

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to erect display home for future development in Ward 4.

PROCEEDINGS: On December 17, 2018, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a Preliminary Review application to construct a one-story home, in the Ville Historic District. The application was submitted by Mr. Gerald Claunch of First and Last Home, LLC.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), Mike Killeen, Randy Vines, David Richardson, Tiffany Hamilton, Melanie Fathman, and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #60236 as amended by #67174 which sets forth the standards for new construction in The Ville Historic District.

Ms. Cameron asked that the Board grant Preliminary Approval for the construction of a model house per execution of final design details with Cultural Resources Office staff. The developer hopes to attract interest in building more of these houses once the model is constructed. The proposed modular design varies significantly from the buildings that contribute to the Ville Historic District. However, the site on which the buildings are proposed is at the western edge of the district and the block has only one extant house. The opportunity for new investment in The Ville makes this a worthy project.

Mr. Gerald Claunch, owner and developer of the project, testified on his own behalf. He submitted a letter from Alderman Sam Moore in support of the project. He noted that his development effort is in partnership with the Mount Airy Church, which is located at Maffit and Marcus Avenues. Mr. Claunch said his goal is to build houses that will increase the population and vitality of The Ville neighborhood.

Scott Runyan, testified on behalf of the project. He stated that he will assist with the construction of the houses, which will sell for approximately \$125,000.00 - \$200,000.00 dollars.

**FINDINGS OF FACTS:**

The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed site, 2720 Marcus, is located in The Ville Local Historic District;
- the proposed building is on a vacant lot;
- most of the block is vacant property—there is little historic context;
- the proposed building is situated on the lot in an “urban” way;
- the developer seeks to build more such houses on the block, per buyer interest;
- the proposal for is for market rate construction in an area with much vacant land, far from the historic corer of The Ville. It is a good location to use contemporary building practices to attract new residents to The Ville.

**BOARD DECISION:**

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant Preliminary Approval to the proposal. The motion was made by Board member Tiffany Hamilton. Ms. Fathman seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

**APPEALS OF DENIALS**

**E.      2018.0494      2907 McNAIR AVENUE                      BENTON PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT**

---

Owner/Applicant: Modern Living LLC – Brandon Dempsey

DEFERRED PER APPLICANT’S REQUEST.

**F.      2018.1303      2907 MILTON BOULEVARD                      COMPTON HILL HISTORIC DISTRICT**

---

Owner:              Kathleen Schott  
Applicant: Retaining Wall Solutions - Josh Hric

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:              Appeal of a building permit application to replace existing retaining wall.

PROCEEDINGS:              On December 17, 2018, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to

consider an appeal of the Director's Denial to replace a retaining wall, at 2907 Milton Boulevard, in the Compton Hill Historic District. The application was submitted by Josh Hric, of Retaining Wall Solutions.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), Mike Killeen, Randy Vines, David Richardson, Tiffany Hamilton, Melanie Fathman, and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Andrea Gagen of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #57702 which sets forth the standards for retaining walls in the Compton Hill Local Historic District. She entered into the record Ordinance #64689, as revised by City Ordinance #64682, the enabling legislation; and Ordinance #57702, the Compton Hill Historic District, the Preservation Board Agenda and PowerPoint. Ms. Gagen stated that the proposed retaining wall did not comply with the historic district standards due to the material. She submitted a copy of an email in support of the project from Bill Brush, President of the Compton Hill Neighborhood Association. Based upon the standards, Ms. Gagen recommended that the Board uphold the Director's denial of the application.

Brett Schott, owner of the property, spoke on his own behalf. He noted that there were other concrete block retaining walls in the neighborhood. He stated that he would not be opposed to building a vertical wall using a non-beveled block.

Kathleen Schott, owner, also spoke on behalf of the project.

**FINDINGS OF FACTS:**

The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed site for the retaining wall, 2907 Milton Blvd., is located in the Compton Hill Local Historic District;
- the district standards do not allow concrete block as a material for walls;
- there were at least two previously approved concrete block retaining walls within the district;
- the neighborhood is not opposed to the use of concrete block as a retaining wall material.

**BOARD DECISION:**

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the Director's Denial and allow the installation of the retaining wall

with the stipulation that it be vertical and that the blocks not have a bevel. The sign for the Shenandoah elevation is not approved.

The motion was made by Board Member Killeen and seconded by Mr. Vines. The motion passed, 5-1 with Board Member Robinson in opposition.