

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS  
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE  
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES  
DECEMBER 19, 2016**

Board Members Present

Richard Callow – Chairman

Mike Killeen

Erin Wright

Anthony Robinson

David Visintainer

Legal Counsel

Barbara Birkicht

Cultural Resources Office Staff Present

Dan Krasnoff, Director

Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner

Bob Bettis, Preservation Planner

Adona Buford, Administrative Assistant

**PRELIMINARY REVIEWS**

**A.      2016.1894                      4749 GRAVOIS AVENUE                      LANDMARK #36 BEVO MILL**

---

Owner: 4749 Gravois LLC – Pat and Carol Schuchard

Applicant: Killeen Studio Architects – Michael Killeen

COMMERCIAL PLAN:                      Preliminary review of an application to construct a biergarten addition to Bevo Mill.

PROCEEDINGS:                      On December 23, 2016, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a preliminary review application to construct a frame addition to the north of Bevo Mill, City Landmark #36. The application was submitted by the project developer. Board members Richard Callow (Chair); David Visintainer; Erin Wright and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item. Board Member Michael Killeen recused himself.

Daniel Krasnoff of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation based upon sections Forty-One and Forty-Two of City Ordinance #64689, which require review of permits for demolition, rehabilitation and/or additions to City Landmarks and Landmark districts. These sections also address the review of permits where specific standards have not been approved. He indicated that the project had been amended by the applicant based upon staff recommendations; in particular, the main block of the addition had been moved further to the north of the site to mitigate the visual effect of the new structure on the Bevo Mill.

**FINDINGS OF FACTS:**

The Preservation Board found that:

- The Bevo Mill, at 4749 Gravois Avenue, is a City Landmark.
- the applicants propose an open shelter/biergarten structure, constructed with a heavy wood frame;
- the proposed addition will be constructed adjacent to the Bevo Mill, and will occupy a current parking area at the rear of the building;
- the addition will be attached to the Bevo Mill with only a ledger board and will not require any new openings; its impact upon the building itself will be small and reversible;
- the applicants have made several revisions to their original proposal that reduces its visual impact upon the City Landmark.

**BOARD DECISION:**

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval to the proposal, with the stipulation that details and specifications are submitted to the Cultural Resources Office for review and final plans and exterior materials are reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office.

The motion was made by Board Member David Visintainer and seconded by Ms. Erin Wright. The motion passed unanimously.

**APPEALS OF DENIALS**

**B.      2016.1673                      4559-61 S. COMPTON AVENUE      PRESERVATION REVIEW DIST.**

---

Owner: David L. Hart

Applicant: Signature Demolition & Trucking – Charles Jones

**DEMOLITION PLAN:**

Appeal of a staff denial of a demolition permit application to demolish a two-story mixed use building.

PROCEEDINGS:

On December 19, 2016, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial of a permit application to demolish a commercial building at 4559-61 South Compton Avenue.

This property is located in a Preservation Review District. The property owner, David L. Hart, submitted the appeal. Board members Richard Callow, David Visintainer, Anthony Robinson, Michael Killeen, and Erin Wright were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Cultural Resources Office Preservation Planner Andrea Gagen reviewed the Demolition Review Criteria in Ordinances #64689 and #64832. She noted that this building is considered to be a Qualifying building due to its age and prominent corner location, and is in an area eligible for listing in the National Register, although it is currently not so listed. She noted the intact character and stability of the neighborhood. She described the adverse effect the demolition would have on the urban design of the block, intersection, and neighborhood by eliminating a large corner building. She described the condition of the building as Sound, as defined in Ordinance #64689, but acknowledged that there were some structural concerns with the building, mainly due to the tree falling on the building earlier in the year, and that the building had been condemned. She also reported that although insurance information had been submitted, no bid from a contractor concerning costs for repairs had been received from the appellant.

Ms. Gagen entered into the record certified copies of Ordinances #64689, as revised by #64925, and #64832; and the Preservation Review District Ordinance #64832; the Board agenda; and the PowerPoint presentation for this property. She also submitted photos and insurance claim estimate and settlement provided by the appellant. Papers containing costs related to the demolition of the building and a copy of the City's Notice of Condemnation were submitted by the appellant for review by Preservation Board members at the meeting and made available at this time and are part of the record.

David L. Hart, owner, testified on his own behalf. He stated that the damage to the building was much worse than the photos showed, and that there was additional mold damage to the interior because of the open roof.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

DECEMBER 19, 2016

Page 4 of 5

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- No redevelopment plan adopted by ordinance is relevant to this review;
- 4559-61 South Compton Avenue is a contributing property to the Dutchtown neighborhood. It is considered a Qualifying building under the ordinance;
- the Cultural Resources Office believes the building is Sound under the definition by the ordinance. The owner has not submitted a report from a structural engineer;
- the historic character of the area surrounding the building has is intact, with little vacancy and structures that are generally well-maintained;
- the building is located in a stable neighborhood with good reuse potential;
- no evidence of economic hardship has been submitted.
- the building has a prominent position at the corner of South Compton and Mt. Pleasant Avenues. The loss of this building would negatively impact the rhythm and balance of two streetscapes.
- there is no proposed use of the property should demolition be approved other than green space; and that
- Ordinance #64689 states that the demolition of buildings in several categories shall not be approved except in unusual circumstances that shall be expressly noted and no such circumstances have been identified.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the Director's denial of the demolition application of 4559-61 South Compton Avenue and recommended appropriate steps be taken to stabilize and preserve the building. The motion was made by Board Member David Visintainer and seconded by Ms. Erin Wright. The motion passed with a vote of 3-2, with Chairman Callow breaking the tie. Board Members Robinson and Killeen voted in opposition of the motion.

**C.      2016.1743                      5344 CABANNE AVENUE                      VISITATION PARK HISTORIC DIST.**

---

Owner: Jermell Williams

Applicant: Impact Development LLC – Alexander Killingham

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

Appeal of a staff denial of a building permit application to construct a front retaining wall.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

DECEMBER 19, 2016

Page 5 of 5

PROCEEDINGS:

On December 19, 2016, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial of a building permit application to retain two retaining walls constructed without a permit, at 5344 Cabanne Ave. in the Visitation Park Local Historic District. The owner submitted the appeal.

Board members Richard Callow, Mike Killeen, Erin Wright, Anthony Robinson, and David Visintainer were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #60942, which sets forth the standards for residential buildings in the Visitation Park Local Historic District.

Mr. Bettis entered into the record certified copies of Ordinances #64689, as amended by #64925, and #60942; the Board agenda and the PowerPoint presentation for 5344 Cabanne.

Jermell Willams, the property owner, spoke on his own behalf.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 5344 Cabanne Avenue is located in the Visitation Park Local Historic District;
- the slope of the front terrace has been altered.
- the walls are highly visible and constructed of decorative concrete block, which is not an acceptable material under the historic district standards;
- the owner believed that the contractor had acquired a permit for the retaining walls; and that
- the historic context for the 5300 Cabanne block is severely compromised due to demolition and the poor condition of existing building stock.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the Director's Denial of the building permit application due to the loss of historic context on the block. The motion was made by Board Member Erin Wright and seconded by Mr. Anthony Robinson. The motion passed unanimously.