

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES
FEBRUARY 22, 2016**

Board Members Present

Richard Callow - Chairman
Alderman Terry Kennedy
Melanie Fathman
Anthony Robinson
Mike Killeen

Legal Counsel

Barbara Birkicht

Cultural Resources Office Staff Present

Betsy Bradley, Director
Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator
Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner
Bob Bettis, Preservation Planner
Adona Buford, Administrative Assistant

Alderman Terry Kennedy moved to approve the January 25, 2106 minutes. Anthony Robinson seconded the motion; the motion passed unanimously.

PRELIMINARY REVIEWS

A. 2016.0201 345 N. WHITTIER/4205 MARYLAND CENTRAL WEST END HD

Owner/Applicant: Metropolitan St. Louis Sewer District

DEMOLITION PLAN: Demolish one house and one commercial building for construction of a sewer pumping station with landscaping.

PROCEEDINGS: On February 22, 2016, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a Preliminary Review for the proposed Demolition of a house at 4205 Maryland Avenue and a commercial building at 345 Whittier Street for construction of MSD's Gaslight Square Sewer Improvement Project. The project area is located in the Central West End Historic District. The Metropolitan Sewer District

submitted the application on behalf of the property owners, Felita Middleton (4205 Maryland Avenue) and Charles and Regina Bass (345 Whittier), with whom the MSD testifies are under sales contracts, however, they have not closed on the properties. This agenda item was heard previously as a Preliminary Review, and is returning for a new Review as MSD wishes to bring this matter to the Board again based on developments that have occurred since that time, including the facts that it has come to agreement with Charles and Regina Bass for the sale of their property, it has developed an enhanced landscape plan for the project, and it has met with the neighborhood where the project is located. Board members Richard Callow (Chair), Alderman Terry Kennedy, Melanie Fathman, and Mike Killeen were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Cultural Resources Office Director Betsy Bradley reviewed the Demolition Review Criteria in the Central West End Historic District Standards, Ordinance #64923, and others in Ordinance #64689, as amended by Ordinances #64925. She noted that both buildings are Merit buildings by definition, yet do not have any special architectural quality, and that the loss of the buildings would have an effect on the immediate setting, the urban fabric, and the historic district. She described the proposed landscape plan for the site.

Mr. Brad Nevois spoke on behalf of MSD, and explained why the proposed project is located where it is, showed a map of the service area, and confirmed that MSD has signed agreements with the two property owners. He stated that closing on the two parcels would be contingent on approval for the demolition of the buildings. When asked if there is a "Plan B," he stated that any alternative plan would be at a larger cost and no less intrusive.

Ms. Regina Middleton, the owner of 4205 Maryland Avenue, stated her support of the project and her willingness to sell her property so the sewer problem could be fixed with the new pump station.

Mr. Jim Dwyer spoke primarily about the nature of the consultation of MSD with the Central West End Planning & Development Committee, with which he has been dissatisfied. He requested that the Board grant Preliminary Approval to the

demolitions only subject to the condition that a binding legal agreement be executed by all parties, including the neighborhood association, prior to the demolitions occurring, approving all aspects of MSD's project.

Mr. Jeff Winzerling also spoke about the nature of MSD's consultation with the neighborhood and stated that the project as currently proposed did not adequately compensate the neighborhood for the loss of historic buildings and supported Mr. Dwyer's proposal.

In response to other testimony, Mr. Nevois reminded those in attendance that this is a public project to be implemented with public money and stated that the consultation had been mischaracterized. He also stated that MSD had improved the proposed landscaping of the property and was not be willing to add major elements to what is proposed at this time.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the Metropolitan St. Louis Sewer District has carefully sited the project for maximum efficiency and to solve serious sewer problems and this need justifies the demolition of properties in a historic district;
- the two properties proposed for demolition, 345 Whittier and 4205 Maryland, are Merit properties in the Central West End Historic District. Nevertheless, neither property exhibits any special character or exceptional architectural significance;
- the condition of the buildings is not known to be a reason for demolition. They are considered to be Sound in terms of Ordinance 64689;
- the proposed construction would have a presence, but not an intrusive presence at the corner of Maryland and Whittier as most of the pumping station would be below grade, the above-grade portion would be adjacent to the alley, and landscaping and fencing would reduce the visibility of the above-ground component;
- MSD proposed the use of fencing, privacy fencing, a border of shrubs and a bio retention cell to landscape the site and screen the utilitarian components of the site. As the terrace is very low-pitched on the north side of Maryland near Whittier, there would be no pronounced disruption of that feature.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

FEBRUARY 22, 2016

Page 4 of 10

- MSD has responded to some of the suggestions of the neighborhood group regarding the landscaping component of the project; and that
- as the Preservation Board cannot delegate its authority to a neighborhood group, the Cultural Resources Office, as usual, will review and approve the landscaping plan.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant Preliminary Approval for the demolitions of the buildings at 4205 Maryland and 345 Whittier for the Gaslight Square Sewer Improvement Project with the stipulations that the Cultural Resources Office is directed to conduct a final consultation with the neighborhood association and further that the Cultural Resources Office's review and approval of the final landscape plan be required of MSD, and that no demolition permit be issued until MSD holds title to the properties to be demolished. Board Member Alderman Kennedy made the motion, which was seconded by Melanie Fathman. The motion carried with three members voting in favor of it.

B. 2015.1943 2300 PESTALOZZI BENTON PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: 2300 Pestalozzi, LLC

Applicant: Killeen Studio Architects – Mike Killeen

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct five attached single-family houses.

PROCEEDINGS: On February 22, 2016, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a Preliminary Application to construct two semi-detached townhouses, at 2222-24 Dolman Street, in the Lafayette Square Local Historic District. The application was submitted by the developer, John Muller.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), Michael Killeen, Alderman Terry Kennedy and Melanie Fathman were present for the testimony for this agenda item. Board member Anthony Robinson came in during the testimony.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance

#69112, which sets forth the standards for residential new construction in the Lafayette Square Local Historic District. She testified that the project was in compliance with the Standards, followed a Historic Model Example at 2000-02 Rutger Street, and in addition, was a duplicate of a recent building at 1232-34 Dolman, approved by the Preservation Board in 2012. She also testified that Suzanne Sessions, Vice President of the Development Committee of the Lafayette Square Restoration Committee (LSRC) had indicated to Ms. Cameron that the Committee supported the project, with the condition that a roundel window be inserted in the front gable, to more closely follow the Historic Model Example.

John Muller, project developer, spoke in support of the project. He agreed to add the roundel window as requested by the LSRC.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed site for construction, 1219 Dolman Street, is located in the Lafayette Square Local Historic District.
- the applicants have proposed a Historic Model Example for the new building which has been approved by the Cultural Resources Office.
- the same Historic Model Example was approved for 1232-34 Dolman Street by the Preservation Board in 2012.
- the new building will contribute to filling out the east side of the block and its larger scale will be a complementary addition to the two-story, three-bay detached houses that currently predominate along Dolman Street.
- the installation of a roundel window on the front façade will more closely follow the Historic Model Example.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant approval of the Preliminary Application for the new construction, with the stipulation that final plans and materials will be reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office. Board Member Killeen made the motion, which was seconded by Alderman Kennedy. The motion passed with all Board Members voting in favor and none opposed.

C. 2016.0313 1222-24 DOLMAN LAFAYETTE SQUARE HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Diversified Real Estate Group, LLC – John Mueller

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct two attached single-family townhouses.

PROCEEDINGS: On February 22, 2016, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a Preliminary Application to construct two semi-detached townhouses, at 2222-24 Dolman Street, in the Lafayette Square Local Historic District. The application was submitted by the developer, John Muller.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), Michael Killeen, Alderman Terry Kennedy and Melanie Fathman were present for the testimony for this agenda item. Board member Anthony Robinson came in during the testimony.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #69112, which sets forth the standards for residential new construction in the Lafayette Square Local Historic District. She testified that the project was in compliance with the Standards, followed a Historic Model Example at 2000-02 Rutger Street, and in addition, was a duplicate of a recent building at 1232-34 Dolman, approved by the Preservation Board in 2012. She also testified that Suzanne Sessions, Vice President of the Development Committee of the Lafayette Square Restoration Committee (LSRC) had indicated to Ms. Cameron that the Committee supported the project, with the condition that a roundel window be inserted in the front gable, to more closely follow the Historic Model Example.

John Muller, project developer, spoke in support of the project. He agreed to add the roundel window as requested by the LSRC.

FINDINGS OF FACTS: The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed site for construction, 1219 Dolman Street, is located in the Lafayette Square Local Historic District.

- the applicants have proposed a Historic Model Example for the new building which has been approved by the Cultural Resources Office.
- the same Historic Model Example was approved for 1232-34 Dolman Street by the Preservation Board in 2012.
- the new building will contribute to filling out the east side of the block and its larger scale will be a complementary addition to the two-story, three-bay detached houses that currently predominate along Dolman Street; and that
- the installation of a roundel window on the front façade will more closely follow the Historic Model Example.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant approval of the Preliminary Application for the new construction, with the stipulation that final plans and materials will be reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office. Board Member Killeen made the motion, which was seconded by Alderman Kennedy. The motion passed with all Board Members voting in favor and none opposed.

APPEALS OF DENIALS

D. 2015.2025 815 ANN AVENUE SOULARD HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: 815 Ann LLC – Brian Minges

Applicant: Landmark Sign Company - Jim Lisardi

COMMERCIAL PLAN:

Appeal of a staff denial of a building permit application to erect two wall signs.

PROCEEDINGS:

On February 22, 2016, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial of a building permit application to install two non-illuminated signs, at 815 Ann Avenue in the Souldard Local Historic District. The applicant submitted the appeal.

Board members Richard Callow, Alderman Terry Kennedy, Anthony Robinson, Mike Killeen and Melanie Fathman were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Andrea Gagen of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance

#62382, which sets forth the standards historic buildings in the Soulard Local Historic District.

Ms. Gagen entered into the record certified copies of Ordinances #64689, as amended by #64925, and #57078 amended by #62382; the Board agenda and the PowerPoint presentation for 815 Ann; and the building permit application. Ms. Gagen also submitted into the record letters of support for the signs from the Soulard Restoration Group and the 7th Ward Alderman, Jack Coatar.

Jim Lisardi of Landmark Sign Co., applicant, testified in support of the project. Mr. Lisardi also entered two photos of the proposed signs into the record.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 815 Ann Avenue is located in the Soulard Local Historic District;
- the proposed sign on Ann Avenue conforms to the historic district standards;
- the proposed sign facing 7th Street is 2.5 feet x 31 feet for a total of 77.5 sq. ft., 37.5 sq. ft. larger than the 40 sq. ft. allowed under the historic district standards; and
- the proposed 7th Street sign would be located on a windowless expanse of brick on the sign of the gym, facing the parking lot and 7th St.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the Director's Denial of the building permit, as the Board believed the sign was appropriate to the scale wall facing 7th Street. Board Member Alderman Kennedy made the motion, which was seconded by Board Member Killeen. The motion passed unanimously.

E. 2016.0002 815 ANN AVENUE SOULARD HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: 815 Ann LLC – Brian Minges

COMMERCIAL PLAN: Appeal of a staff denial of a building permit application to insert a street-facing garage door as part of a residential conversion.

PROCEEDINGS: On February 22, 2016, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to

consider an appeal of the Director's Denial of a building permit application for exterior alterations, at 815 Ann Avenue in the Soulard Local Historic District. The owner submitted the appeal.

Board members Richard Callow, Alderman Terry Kennedy, Anthony Robinson, Mike Killeen and Melanie Fathman were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Ms. Gagen entered into the record certified copies of Ordinances #64689, as amended by #64925, and #57078 amended by #62382; the Board agenda and the PowerPoint presentation for 815 Ann; and the building permit application. Ms. Gagen also submitted into the record letters of support for the project from the Soulard Restoration Group and the 7th Ward Alderman, Jack Coatar. No one was present for the owner

BOARD DECISION:

Due to the fact that no one was present for the owner or applicant, as the result of a family emergency, the Board made the decision to defer the decision on the matter.

The Preservation Board deferred the Director's Denial of the building permit until the March meeting, as there was no one present for the owner or applicant. Board Member Fathman made the motion, which was seconded by Board Member Robinson. The motion passed unanimously.

F. 2016.0027 2111 GRAVOIS AVENUE MCKINLEY HEIGHTS HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Affordable Auto Credit Inc. – Anthony Zanti

COMMERCIAL PLAN: Appeal of a staff denial of a building permit application to erect four wall signs and one ground pole sign.

PROCEEDINGS: On February 22, 2016, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial of a building permit application to retain signage, at 2111 Gravois Avenue in the McKinley Heights Local Historic District. The owner submitted the appeal.

Board members Richard Callow, Alderman Terry Kennedy, Anthony Robinson, Mike Killeen and Melanie Fathman were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Andrea Gagen of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #67901, which sets forth the standards for signage in the McKinley Heights Local Historic District.

Ms. Gagen entered into the record certified copies of Ordinances #64689, as amended by #64925, and #67901; the Board agenda and the PowerPoint presentation for 2111 Gravois; and the building permit application.

Anthony Zanti, owner and appellant, testified in support of the project.

Rocco Danna, resident of McKinley Heights, spoke in opposition to the signage.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 2111 Gravois Avenue is located in the McKinley Heights Local Historic District;
- the owner proposes to retain a double-sided pole sign, 3 non-illuminated walls signs and 2 vinyl window clings.
- the proposed pole sign exceeds the 15 foot height limit set by the standards;
- the proposed signage totals 230.5 sq. ft., which is significantly above the 50 sq. ft. allowed under the historic district standards; and
- the large wall signs and the pole sign were existing signs that were refaced.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the Director's Denial of the building permit for the pole sign, the 2 large wall signs and the 2 vinyl window clings. The Board upheld the Director's Denial of the "Financing Available" wall sign. Board Member Fathman made the motion, which was seconded by Board Member Killeen. The motion passed unanimously.