

CITY OF ST. LOUIS  
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE  
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES  
FEBRUARY 23, 2015

Board Members Present

Richard Callow, Chairman  
Alderman Craig Schmid  
Nate Johnson  
Melanie Fathman  
Mike Killeen  
Anthony Robinson

Legal Counsel

Barbara Birkicht

Cultural Resources Office Staff Present

Betsy Bradley, Director  
Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator  
Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner  
Bob Bettis, Preservation Planner  
Adona Buford, Administrative Assistant

**PRELIMINARY REVIEWS**

**A.      2015.0103      5766 PERSHING                      SKINKER-DeBALIVIERE HISTORIC DIST**

---

Owner/Applicant: Kevin Logan

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct a single family dwelling.

PROCEEDINGS: On February 23, 2015, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a preliminary review application to construct a new single-family house at 5766 Pershing Avenue, in the Skinker-DeBaliviere Catlin-Tract Certified Local Historic District.

Board members Richard Callow, (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, Melanie Fathman, and Mike Killeen were present for the testimony for this agenda item. Board Member Nate Johnson recused himself

from the item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #57688, which sets forth the standards for residential new construction in the Skinker-DeBaliviere Catlin-Tract Neighborhood Local Historic District. He testified that the project generally complied with the standards and recommended that the Board grant preliminary approval to the proposal. He stated that the neighborhood association supported the project in general, but had some items of concern.

Kevin Logan was present to speak on behalf of the project.

**FINDINGS OF FACTS:** The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed site for construction, 5766 Pershing, is located in the Skinker-DeBaliviere Catlin-Tract Neighborhood Local Historic District on the south side of Pershing Place;
- the applicant proposes to construct a brick dwelling with cast concrete trim around the front windows, and meets all other standards for new construction; and
- the garage will be set behind the house and compliant with the standards.

**BOARD ACTION:**

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval for the proposed new construction, with the stipulation that final plans and exterior details be reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office to ensure compliance with the standards. The motion was made by Board Member Craig Schmid and seconded by Ms. Fathman. The motion passed with none opposed.

**B.      2015.0064      4942-44 McPHERSON      CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DISTRICT**

---

Owner/Applicant: William and Charlotte Castillo

**RESIDENTIAL PLAN:** Appeal of the Director's denial of a building permit application to wrap fourteen (14) windows and sills.

**PROCEEDINGS:** On February 23, 2015, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial of a building permit application to retain a non-compliant aluminum wrapping on window sills and brickmolds installed without a building permit on fourteen side windows, at 4242-44 McPherson in

the Central West End Local Historic District. The owner submitted the application and the appeal.

Board members Richard Callow, Alderman Craig Schmid, Melanie Fathman, Anthony Robinson, Nate Johnson, and Mike Killeen were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #69112, which sets forth the standards for residential rehabilitation in the Central West End Local Historic District. He testified that the project was not in compliance with the Standards as the installed wrapping is not allowed on sills or brickmolds on street visible windows. Mr. Bettis also testified that he had spoken with Jim Dwyer of the Central West Neighborhood Association and that they support the staff's recommendation.

Mr. Bettis entered into the record certified copies of Ordinances #64689, as revised by #64925, and #69112; the Board agenda and the PowerPoint presentation for 4942-44 McPherson.

Charlotte Castillo, the owner, testified on her own behalf, stating that she wished to retain the wrapping as installed as it would be better aesthetically with installed compliant shutters. In addition, she stated that the removal would cost extra and cause an economic hardship although she stated that she was unaware of the cost to remove

**FINDINGS OF FACTS:** The Preservation Board found that:

- 4942-44 McPherson is located in the Central West Local Historic District;
- the owner wrapped brickmolds and sills on fourteen windows on the sides and rear of the building without a building permit;
- the wrapping of sills and brickmolds is not allowed under the Standards; and that
- the owner also installed shutters that do comply with the Standards.

**BOARD ACTION:** It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the Director's denial the wrapped sills and windows on the west façade, and the single window on the east façade that faces the street. The Board overturned the Director's denial and approved the four windows on the east façade that directly faces the neighboring house, and approved the retention of those windows due to limited visibility, the fact that removal would cause an undue economic hardship on the owner, and retention of these windows was found to be in keeping with the spirit of the Ordinance.

The motion was made by Alderman Craig Schmid and seconded by Ms. Fathman. The motion passed with all Board Members voting in favor.

**C. 2014.1682 2215-27 INDIANA AVENUE MCKINLEY HEIGHTS HISTORIC DISTRICT**

---

Owner/Applicant: Donald and Virginia Graham

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of the Director's denial of a building permit application to replace fourteen (14) windows and retain a non-compliant door.

PROCEEDINGS: On February 23, 2015, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial of a building permit application to retain a non-compliant front door installed without a building permit and the proposed installation of ten front façade vinyl windows, at 2215-17 Indiana Avenue in the McKinley Heights Local Historic District. The owner submitted the application and the appeal.

Board members Richard Callow, Alderman Craig Schmid, Melanie Fathman, Nate Johnson, Mike Killeen and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #67901, which sets forth the standards for residential rehabilitation in the McKinley Heights Local Historic District. He testified that the project was not in compliance with the Standards as the installed door did not replicate the original and was not based on a Model Example. In addition the proposed vinyl windows would not replicate the existing historic ones in appearance or material.

Mr. Bettis entered into the record certified copies of Ordinances #64689, as revised by #64925, and #67175; the Board agenda, the PowerPoint presentation for 2215-17 Indiana Ave; and the building permit application.

Donald Graham, the owner, testified on his own behalf, stating that he wished to retain the new door that was installed as he cannot afford to replace it with the appropriate kind. In addition, he stated that he wanted to install the vinyl windows and wrapping on the front of the house due to cost and maintenance issues. Mr. Graham testified that he is on a fixed income and only draws a small amount of money from an adjacent rental unit and that he would be unable to afford compliant windows.

Steve Mees, representing Window World, testified that compliant, energy efficient replacement widows would cost more than the vinyl products his company carries.

Mark Reed, representing the McKinley Heights Neighborhood Association, and Rocco Danna, McKinley Heights resident, testified in support of the staff recommendation.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

FEBRUARY 23, 2015

Page 5 of 5

FINDINGS OF FACTS: The Preservation Board found that:

- 2215-17 Indiana is located in the McKinley Heights Local Historic District;
- a non-compliant door was installed without a permit on the front façade; and
- the proposed windows are vinyl; do not replicate the appearance of historic wood sash; and do not conform to the McKinley Heights Local Historic District standards.

BOARD ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the Director's Denial of the building permit application because the installed door, and proposed windows do not comply with the historic district standards. Board Member Robinson made the motion, which was seconded by Board Member Johnson. The motion passed with all Board Members voting in favor.

**SPECIAL AGENDA ITEM:**

**Public Meeting: Introduction: A Thematic Survey of Flounder Houses in St. Louis City**

Jan Cameron, Andrea Gagen and Bob Bettis made a presentation that introduced the survey project, identified the range of flounders being documented, and presented some of the survey and research methods.

This project is partially funded by a grant from the Missouri Department of Natural Resources, State Historic Preservation Office, and the National Park Service, U.S. Department of the Interior. Grant awards do not imply an endorsement of contents by the grantor. Federal laws prohibit discrimination on the basis of race, religion, sex, age, handicap or ethnicity. For more information, write to the Office of Equal Opportunity, U.S. Department of the Interior, Washington, DC 20240.

Chairman Callow motioned to adjourn to meeting. Hearing no objection, the meeting was adjourned.