

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES
FEBRUARY 24, 2014**

Board Members Present

Richard Callow, Chairman

Alderman Craig Schmid

Anthony Robinson

David Richardson

Melanie Fathman

Dave Visintainer

Nate Johnson

Mike Killeen

Cultural Resources Office Staff Present

Betsy H. Bradley, Director

Bob Bettis, Preservation Planner

Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner

Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator

Chairman Richard Callow called the roll. Alderman Craig Schmid moved to approve the minutes, and the current Agenda. Mr. Richardson seconded the motion. The minutes and the current Agenda were approved.

PRELIMINARY REVIEWS

A. 2014.0118 2828-34 OHIO AVENUE GRAVOIS-JEFFERSON STREETCAR SUBURB

Owner: LRA – Land Reutilization Authority

Applicant: DeSales Community Housing Corp. - Thomas Pickel

COMMERCIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to demolish 5 row-houses for new residential construction.

PROCEEDINGS: On February 24, 2014, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider the Preliminary Review for the demolition of a group of five row-houses at 2828-2834 Ohio. DeSales Community Housing Corporation proposes the demolition of this property to prepare the site for subsequent new construction. The row-houses are in

the Gravois-Jefferson Streetcar Suburb National Register Historic District and are in a Preservation Review District.

Board members Richard Callow (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, Anthony Robinson, David Richardson, Melanie Fathman, David Visintainer, Nate Johnson and Michael Killeen were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Cultural Resources Office Director Betsy H. Bradley reviewed the demolition review criteria as set forth in City Ordinances #64689, as amended by Ordinance #64925, and #64832. Ms. Bradley made a presentation that examined criteria for demolition and presented the plans of the DeSales Community Housing Corporation and the schematic drawings of the new construction proposed for the site of the building under consideration for demolition.

Thomas Pickel, representing the DeSales Community Housing Corporation, described the project, the estimated cost for rehabilitation of the row-houses and project funding in great detail.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the buildings proposed for demolition are located in the Gravois-Jefferson Streetcar Suburb National Register Historic District and a Preservation Review District;
- the group of row-houses, constructed before 1875, now consists of four identical units and the northern-most one, to which an addition for commercial use extends to the front. All of the row-houses are considered to be contributing buildings in the Gravois Jefferson Streetcar Suburb National Register Historic District nomination;
- the buildings are in sound condition in terms of the ordinance definition;
- the block fronts of the 2800 block of Ohio are relatively intact and this group of houses is the only one, in addition to one other owned by LRA, that is not occupied and addressing this group of buildings would improve the stability of the block;
- the row-houses have a presence in the blockfront at a mid-block location;
- DeSales Community Housing Corporation has had to alter its plans from rehabilitation to demolition followed by new construction for this group of buildings due to its inability to get project funding;

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

FEBRUARY 24, 2014

Page 3 of 18

- the proposed new construction would eliminate any possible significant gap in the streetscape should these buildings continue to deteriorate and ultimately need demolition;
- the three new buildings are proposed to be compatible with the existing streetscape;
- as DeSales Community Housing Corporation redeveloped the properties immediately to the north on Ohio, it has been committed to keeping and improving housing in the neighborhood; and
- DeSales Community Housing Corporation hopes to begin the new construction during the fall of 2014.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval of the proposed demolition, with the conditions that final drawings and exterior materials will be reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office, as part of the review of the project under Section 106 of the National Historic Preservation Act of 1966, as amended, and evidence has been provided that DeSales Community Housing Corporation has closed on the Low Income Housing Tax Credit financing through the Missouri Housing Development Commission. The motion was made by Board member David Richardson and seconded by Alderman Craig Schmid. The motion passed with seven Board Members voting in favor of the motion and none opposing it.

B. 2014.0111 2842 MAGNOLIA AVENUE FOX PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: DeSales Community Housing Corp. - Thomas Pickel

COMMERCIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to demolish 1 house for new residential construction.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

FEBRUARY 24, 2014

Page 4 of 18

PROCEEDINGS:

On February 24, 2014, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider the Preliminary Review for the demolition of one dwelling at 2842 Magnolia. DeSales Community Housing Corporation proposes the demolition of this property to prepare the site for subsequent new construction.

Board members, Richard Callow (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, Anthony Robinson, David Richardson, Melanie Fathman, David Visintainer, Nate Johnson and Michael Killeen were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

The property is in the Fox Park Local Historic District, the St. Francis de Sales National Register Historic District, and a Preservation Review District.

Cultural Resources Office Director Betsy H. Bradley reviewed the demolition review criteria as set forth in City Ordinances #64689, as amended by Ordinance #64925, #64832 and #66098, the Fox Park Local Historic District Construction and Restoration Standards. Ms. Bradley made a presentation that examined criteria for demolition and presented the plans of the DeSales Community Housing Corporation and the schematic drawings of the new construction proposed for the site of the building under consideration for demolition.

Thomas Pickel, representing the DeSales Community Housing Corporation, described the project, and its funding, in greater detail.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 2842 Magnolia is located in the Fox Park Local Historic District, the St. Francis de Sales National Register Historic District, and a Preservation Review District;
- 2842 Magnolia was constructed prior to 1875 but has been altered over time; it is considered to be an historic building in the Fox Park Local Historic District even though it is categorized as non-contributing to the National Register district;
- the building is in sound condition under the definition of the ordinance;
- the loss of the existing building would have an effect on the urban design of Magnolia blockfront;

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

FEBRUARY 24, 2014

Page 5 of 18

- the uneven condition of buildings on the block does not strongly support private rehabilitation of such a small dwelling in poor condition;
- the demolition of 2842 Magnolia is considered in the larger DeSales project for the 2800 block of Magnolia, including the rehabilitation of 2829 Magnolia, across the street;
- as the DeSales project includes the rehabilitation of 2829 Magnolia, the demolition of 2842 Magnolia meets a condition for the approval of demolition in the Fox Park Local Historic District Standards; and
- the DeSales project includes the construction of three new buildings on the south side of Magnolia at 2842 and 2846, the construction of which is planned to begin during the fall of 2014.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval of the proposed demolition, with the conditions that final designs for the new construction are reviewed by the Board and evidence has been provided that DeSales Community Housing Corporation has closed on the Low Income Housing Tax Credit financing through the Missouri Housing Development Commission. The motion was made by Board member David Richardson and seconded by Alderman Craig Schmid. The motion passed with seven Board Members voting in favor of the motion and none opposing it.

C. 2013.2118 5805 LINDELL BOULEVARD SKINKER DEBALIVIERE HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: David P. Conner
Applicant: Mark D. Conner

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct new single family dwelling on vacant lot.

PROCEEDINGS: On February 24, 2014 the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a Preliminary Review for a proposal for a new two-story single-family house at 5805 Lindell Boulevard, in the Skinker-DeBaliviere-Catlin Tract-Parkview Local Historic District. The developer, Mark D. Conner submitted the application.

Board members, Richard Callow (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, David Richardson, David Visintainer, Nate Johnson, Melanie Fathman, Michael Killeen and Anthony Robinson were

present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Andrea Gagen of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the section of City Ordinance #57688, which sets forth the standards for new residential construction in the Skinker-DeBaliviere Local Historic District. She testified that the project was generally in compliance with the Standards.

Mark D. Connor, project developer, testified on behalf of the project. He showed the Board a color rendering of the proposed house.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 5805 Lindell Blvd. is located in the Skinker-DeBaliviere Certified Local Historic District;
- the proposed site for construction is a large vacant lot located on the north side of Lindell Blvd, across from Forest Park;
- the applicant has proposed to construct a two-story brick dwelling with stone trim, and meets all other standards for new construction; and that
- the garage wing, while set back from the main façade, is used to approximate the massing of the neighboring buildings.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval of the Preliminary Review of the proposed new construction, with the condition that the design be developed as proposed and that design details will be reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office to ensure compliance with the district standards. Board Member Fathman made the motion to grant approval, which was seconded by Alderman Schmid. The motion passed unanimously with seven board members voting.

D. 2014.0062 4384-86 OLIVE BOULEVARD CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Fenix Fund LLC – Marcus Adamonis

REDISENTIAL PLAN:

Preliminary review to construct a two-family dwelling on vacant lot.

PROCEEDINGS:

On February 24, 2014, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider Preliminary Review of an application to construct a two-

family home at 4384-86 Olive St, located in the Central West End Certified Local Historic District.

Board members Richard Callow (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, Anthony Robinson, David Richardson, Melanie Fathman, David Visintainer, Nate Johnson and Michael Killeen were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office submitted into the record certified copies of City Ordinances #64689, as amended by Ordinance #64925, and #64832 and the Central West End Historic District Ordinance, #69423. Mr. Bettis analyzed the proposed two-family dwelling in the context of the Central West End Historic District Standards. He recommended that the Board grant preliminary approval of the project subject to review of the final details, materials and drawings by the Cultural Resources Office.

Anthony Duncan, architect for the project, testified on behalf of the owner.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 4384-86 Olive is located in the Central West End Certified Local Historic District;
- the property is at the very edge of the district;
- the 4300 block of Olive has sustained extensive demolition of its original fabric and the construction of a number of buildings of varied mass, scale and height has created an inconsistent block face;
- the owner and architect have worked with staff to redesign the project in order to get it closer into compliance with the historic district standards;
- the setback of the proposed building conforms to the building line of the block;
- the floor levels of the building align with those of adjacent buildings;
- the proposed penthouse is set back several feet from the front of the building and will not be street visible; and
- that staff has not seen an example of the proposed material on the side of the building. However, the distance between the neighboring houses and the proposed brick returns will minimize its visibility from Olive Street.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant Preliminary Approval of the application to construct the new house. The

motion was made by Board member David Visintainer and seconded by Mr. Johnson. The motion passed seven to zero.

E. 2013.2036 1000 SIDNEY STREET SOULARD HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: RPSLRD, LLC

Applicant: Killeen Studio Architects - David Lisinski

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: New building permit application to enclose a roofed patio structure.

PROCEEDINGS: On February 24, 2014, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider Preliminary Review of an application to enclose a patio at 1000 Sidney St, located in the Soulard Certified Local Historic District.

Board members Richard Callow (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, Anthony Robinson, David Richardson, Melanie Fathman, David Visintainer and Nate Johnson were present for the testimony for this agenda item. Mike Killeen recused himself from the item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office submitted into the record certified copies of City Ordinances #64689, as amended by Ordinance #64925, and #64832 and the Soulard Historic District Ordinance, #62382. Mr. Bettis detailed why the proposed patio enclosure was not in compliance with the Soulard Historic District Standards. He recommended that the Board deny preliminary approval of the project subject because.

Mike Killeen, the architect, and Jon Vieluf, the owner testified asking that the Board grant Preliminary Approval of the proposed design.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 1000 Sidney St. is located in the Soulard Certified Local Historic District;
- the project is being brought back to the Board to consider a revised design, an approach that a Board member suggested might be acceptable;
- the proposed enclosure with vinyl tent walls does not comply with Soulard Historic District Standards and is not based on a Model Example, as required by those standards;

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

FEBRUARY 24, 2014

Page 9 of 18

- the vinyl tent walls are proposed for seasonal use;
- the proposed walls will be a dark color and will be placed behind the columns and decorated arched elements. the door has been moved to the west side to limit its visibility; and
- the enclosure will be constructed on a Semi-Public facade and two sides of it will be highly visible from Sidney Street.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant Preliminary Approval of the application to enclose the patio with vinyl tent walls. The motion was made by Board member Nate Johnson and seconded by Mr. Robinson. The motion passed six to zero.

NEW APPLICATIONS

F. 2014.0046 4150 BLAINE AVENUE NORTH I-44 HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Garden District Commission – Thomas Pickel

Applicant: UIC – Sarah Gibson

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

New application to construct a single family dwelling on vacant lot.

PROCEEDINGS:

On February 24, 2014, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a building permit application to construct a two-story single-family house at 4150 Blaine Avenue in the North I-44 Certified Local Historic District.

Board members, Richard Callow (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, Anthony Robinson, Nate Johnson, David Richardson, Melanie Fathman, David Visintainer and Michael Killeen were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the North I-44 Historic District Ordinance #60370, which sets forth the standards for new residential construction in the local historic district. She reported this was the first house of a planned seven-house development on this block of Blaine that had received the Preservation Board's preliminary approval at its August 27, 2013 meeting. This approval was conditioned with the requirement that the developer reconsider the proposed exterior materials, which did not comply with the Historic District Standards. The current application does not address this

requirement, and specifies a material similar to that in the original proposal.

Sarah Gibson testified on behalf of UIC, the developer and designer of the project. She indicated that the developer wants to provide smaller, less-expensive residential options and that the use of brick on the front elevation would threaten a price-point, which was already high because of geothermal heating and cooling and other energy-saving amenities. Ms. Gibson also testified that the project had received the support of the neighborhood and the McRee Town Development Corporation.

FINDINGS OF FACTS

The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed site for construction, 4150 Blaine, is located in the North I-44 Local Historic District, and is the first of a seven-building development on this site;
- the developer proposes at this time to construct one two-story house with a combination of exterior façade materials, including cement fiberboard clapboard siding;
- the front and side façades of the house will be dominated by cement fiber board panels installed in a tiered and asymmetrical arrangement; the front façade will have a rectangular area surrounding the entry that will be sided with cement clapboards with a 4-inch exposure;
- the design of the house received a conditional preliminary approval by the Preservation Board at its August 2013 meeting, with the requirement that the applicant address an alternative to the non-compliant exterior materials proposed at that time. Neither of the materials indicated for this house meet the direction provided in the historic district standards for new construction;
- as the building is the first in a group of seven new buildings, its exterior materials are important for compatibility with the larger district, as well as the immediate new construction; and
- that while the developer stated that substituting other materials for the proposed cement fiber board panels would make the project's price-point unattainable, this assertion was unaccompanied by any documentation.

BOARD ACTION:

After due consideration and after weighing each piece of evidence and making a determination of the credibility of the witnesses,

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

FEBRUARY 24, 2014

Page 11 of 18

the Board has made a determination as to the substance and credibility of the evidence and exhibits.

The Preservation Board denied the application as submitted and directed the applicant to propose compliant exterior building materials for the new construction. The motion was made by Board member Anthony Robinson and seconded by Alderman Craig Schmid. The motion passed five to two, with Board members Mike Killeen and Nate Johnson opposing the motion.

G.	2014.0201	5100 S. BROADWAY AVENUE	CITY LANDMARK #43 and
	2014.0067	5224 S. BROADWAY AVENUE	SOUTH BROADWAY BLUFFS

Owner/Applicant: McBride & Sons Homes – Jennifer Balsley

COMMERCIAL PLAN: New building permit application for grading, site work and residential construction.

PROCEEDINGS: On February 24, 2014, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a building permit application and the Preliminary Review for the construction of six 2-story townhouse buildings to complete a project started in 2005 on a property located in the South Broadway Bluffs City Landmark District. McBride & Son Homebuilders has applied for a building permit for grading and site work for the new units, and that application affords the opportunity to consider the new buildings as a Preliminary Review.

Board members Richard Callow (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, Anthony Robinson, Melanie Fathman, David Visintainer, Nate Johnson and Michael Killeen were present for the testimony for this agenda item. David Richardson recused himself from the discussion of and voting on this agenda item.

Cultural Resources Office Director Betsy H. Bradley noted that City Ordinances #64689, as amended by Ordinance #64925, sets forth the jurisdiction of the Preservation Board to review changes proposed to City Landmark sites. She reviewed the history of the stalled project, first reviewed by the Preservation Board in November 2005, and the reasons stated for the designation of the South Broadway Bluffs City Landmark District, for which there are no specific Historic District Standards. Ms Bradley also presented six architectural design changes that would make the design of

the new buildings more compatible with the design of the existing building, a design previously approved by the Preservation Board:

1. Move the traditional design towards the contemporary style of the existing building through the use of different styles and types of doors and windows;
2. Place brick at the west corners of the corners of the end buildings, perhaps moving brick from the recessed areas of the façades, so that the buildings have brick elements that related to similar elements on the existing building;
3. Use cement board siding or panels rather than vinyl;
4. Add a full-length deck at the main story of the east elevations facing the bluffs, to minimize the uniform effect of siding and add some character to this elevation;
5. Change the standing seam metal roof over the garage extensions to the same roofing material as the main structures; and
6. Add additional landscaping to screen the view of the garage doors from Broadway.

Brennen Soval of Husch Blackwell, representing McBride & Son, stated that the applicant seeks approval of the proposal as presented because the firm feels that the project is in compliance with all the review and code requirements. He addressed the architectural suggestions and stated that McBride & Son commits to extending the brick for five feet around the western corners of the buildings and to use cement board, rather than vinyl, siding on the other elevations. He stated that patios and decks had been designed for each unit at all levels and that glass railings would be used on such features which are options to be presented to home buyers. He stated that evergreen plants have been added to the landscape plan between the parking area and S. Broadway. While McBride & Son would be amenable to using glass front doors, it prefers not to change the standing-seam roof material visible on the S. Broadway sides of the buildings. He stated that the developer feels that the Minimal-Traditional design of the buildings fits into the context of S. Broadway.

Alderman Thomas Villa spoke in favor of the project, noting how rare new housing starts are in Ward 11.

Karla Ambos, representing most of the occupants of the completed condominium building on the site, spoke in favor of the project. She also supported most of the suggested architectural changes but stated that she felt that there was no

need for the new buildings to be contemporary in style. Four other residents of the building who were at the meeting stood in support of Ms. Ambos' statement.

Thomas Purcell spoke in support of the McBride firm as a developer and the construction of new non-institutional housing on the bluffs.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the property is located within the boundaries of City Landmark #43, the South Broadway Bluff Area;
- the designation of the landmark area of the Bluffs was to protect the bluffs and no specific standards have been adopted for the landmark district;
- the proposed new construction completes a project reviewed and approved by the Preservation Board in 2005, on which construction began in 2007;
- many of the parameters of the project, such as the placement of the buildings has already been determined and clearly serve the intentions of the Landmark designation; and
- suggestions have been made in support of the concept that the new buildings should be architecturally compatible so as to appear clearly to be part of the same development as the existing one.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant approval of the building permit application and Preliminary Review of the proposed new construction subject to the condition that Applicant continue to work with Staff on design and material details to make the new buildings blend with the existing building. Preservation Board members asked that the changes include adding five feet of brick return on the western corners of the buildings; using cement board siding rather than vinyl siding; and including conifers in the landscaping between the new construction and S. Broadway, pursuant to the testimony of the Applicant. The motion was made by Board member Nate Johnson and seconded by Ms. Fathman. The motion passed with six Board Members voting in favor of the motion and none opposing it.

APPEAL OF DENIALS

H. 2013.2110 3120 HAWTHORNE BLVD. COMPTON HILL HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Lindsay D. Barth

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

FEBRUARY 24, 2014

Page 14 of 18

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of a denial of a building permit application for alterations to a four-season room.

PROCEEDINGS: On February 24, 2014, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an Appeal of the Director's Denial of an application to retain a rebuilt enclosed side porch, located in the Compton Hill Certified Local Historic District.

Board members, Richard Callow (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, David Richardson, David Visintainer, Nate Johnson, Melanie Fathman, Michael Killeen and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Andrea Gagen of the Cultural Resources Office submitted into the record certified copies of City Ordinances #64689, as amended by Ordinance #64925, and the Compton Hill Certified Local Historic District Ordinance, #57702. Ms. Gagen also submitted into the record the agenda item and presentation. The Cultural Resources received a letter from the Compton Heights Neighborhood Betterment Association stating their approval of the project, subject to certain conditions. This letter was submitted into the record.

The owner, Lindsay D. Barth, DPM, FACFAS, testified in his own behalf. He also made a PowerPoint presentation.

FINDINGS OF FACTS: The Preservation Board found that:

- 3120 Hawthorne is located in the Compton Hill Certified Local Historic District;
- the changes to the porch were completed without a permit;
- the existing porch is somewhat wider than the previous porch and the window configurations and exterior detailing were changed;
- while the previous porch was not historic, the proportion of the window openings more closely matched the existing windows on the front of the house. There were also no muntins in the windows, which made the windows more transparent;
- the new detailing is compatible with the existing structure and the side windows have limited visibility from the street; and
- that the window in the porch wall facing the street is the element of the porch that keeps it from being compliant.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

FEBRUARY 24, 2014

Page 15 of 18

BOARD ACTION:

After due consideration and after weighing each piece of evidence and making a determination of the credibility of the witnesses, the Board has made a determination as to the substance and credibility of the evidence and exhibits. The Preservation Board overturned the Director's denial to retain a rebuilt enclosed side porch on the condition that the front-facing window be removed and be replaced with two casement windows with an exterior mullion between them. The motion was made by Board Member Anthony Robinson and seconded by Mr. Visintainer. The motion passed unanimously with seven members voting.

I. 2014.0017 5739 McPHERSON AVENUE SKINKER DEBALIVIERE HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Edward N. Hecker

Applicant: MicroGrid Solar – James West

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

Appeal of a denial of a building permit application to install solar panels.

PROCEEDINGS:

On February 24, 2014, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial of a building permit application for installation of street visible solar panels at 5739 McPherson, in the Skinker-DeBaliviere Neighborhood Local Historic District. The contractor submitted the application and the owner submitted the appeal.

Board members, Richard Callow (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, David Visintainer, Melanie Fathman, Nate Johnson, and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the section of City Ordinance #57688, which sets forth the standards for residential rehabilitation in the Skinker-DeBaliviere Neighborhood Historic District as well as the Solar Panel Installation Policy for Local Historic Districts. He testified that the project was not in compliance with the Standards as the solar array will be installed on a street visible side of the roof.

Mr. Bettis entered into the record certified copies of Ordinances #64689 and #57702, and the Solar Panel Installation Policy; the Board agenda, the PowerPoint presentation for 5739 McPherson; and the building permit application, including all construction documents.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

FEBRUARY 24, 2014

Page 16 of 18

Edward Hecker, the owner and appellant, testified on his own behalf, and Ben Gooden, the contractor also testified.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 5739 McPherson, constructed in 2005, is located in the Skinker-DeBaliviere Local Historic District;
- the proposed array would be on the street-facing roof slope, a location specifically noted as not compliant with the visual compatibility standards for solar panel installation;
- the visual compatibility solar panel installation policy applies to modern as well as historic buildings located in local historic districts; and
- that the owner is also proposing to install solar panels on the garage roof which will not be visible, and that installation can be approved.

BOARD ACTION:

After due consideration and after weighing each piece of evidence and making a determination of the credibility of the witnesses, the Board has made a determination as to the substance and credibility of the evidence and exhibits.

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the Director's denial of the building permit, as the solar panels do not comply with the Skinker-De Baliviere Historic District Standards or the Solar Panel Installation Policy for Local Historic Districts. The motion was made by Board member Nate Johnson and seconded by Mr. Robinson. The motion passed with five Board Members voting in favor of the motion and none opposing it.

J. 2014.0072 3023 ALLEN AVENUE COMPTON HILL HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: GreenStone Investments LLC – Shario Mansuri

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

Appeal of a denial of a building permit application for alterations to front door and porch.

PROCEEDINGS:

On February 24, 2014, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial of a building permit application to retain alterations to front door and alter front porch at 3023 Allen, in the Compton Hill Neighborhood Local Historic District. The owner submitted the application and the appeal.

Board members, Richard Callow (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, David Visintainer, Melanie Fathman, Nate Johnson, and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the section of City Ordinance #57702 which sets forth the standards for residential rehabilitation in the Compton Hill Neighborhood Historic District. He testified that the project was not in compliance with the Standards as the altered door does not comply, and proposed porch modifications do not maintain the appearance of the original historic door and porch as required by the standards, which require a porch to be maintained as originally constructed.

Mr. Bettis entered into the record Ordinances #64689 and #57702; the Board agenda and the PowerPoint presentation for 3023 Allen; and the building permit application, including all construction documents.

Shariq Mansuri, the owner and appellant, testified on his own behalf, stating that he purchased the building in a nearly complete rehabilitated state and was following approved permits for interior work

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 3023 Allen is located in the Compton Hill Local Historic District;
- one of the two original front doors was bricked in without a permit; and
- that the proposed porch alterations do not conform to the Compton Hill Historic District Standards and do not represent an accurate historic porch configuration which requires a porch to be maintained as originally constructed.

BOARD ACTION:

After due consideration and after weighing each piece of evidence and making a determination of the credibility of the witnesses, the Board has made a determination as to the substance and credibility of the evidence and exhibits.

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the Director's denial of the building permit, as the proposed alterations do not comply with the Compton Hill Historic District Standards. The motion was made by Board member David Visintainer and seconded by Mr. Richardson. The motion

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

FEBRUARY 24, 2014

Page 18 of 18

passed with six Board members voting in favor of the motion and none opposing it.

SPECIAL AGENDA ITEMS

Discussion of a Preservation Board Conflict of Interest Policy

Discussion of an Initial draft: Preservation Board Preliminary Review Policy

ACTION: Postponed until the next regularly scheduled hearing.