

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES
FEBRUARY 24, 2020**

Board Members Present

Richard Callow – Chairman
Randy Vines
Mike Killeen
Ald. Joe Vaccaro
Anthony Robinson

Cultural Resources Office Staff Present

Dan Krasnoff, Director
Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator
Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner
Bethany Moore, Preservation Planner
Adona Buford, Adm. Assistant

Legal Counsel

Barbara Birkicht

PRELIMINARY REVIEWS

A. 2019.1877 3005,3007, 3009 MISSOURI AVE BENTON PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Aesh Design – Patrick Weber
Applicant: MSW Properties LLC, - Patti Aleto

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct three (3) 2-story townhouses.

PROCEEDINGS: On February 24, 2020, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a Preliminary Review Application to construct three attached townhouses on three vacant parcels in the Benton Park Local Historic District.

Commissioners: Richard Callow (Chairman), Michael Killeen, Alderman Joe Vaccaro, Anthony Robinson and Randy Vines were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #67175, which delineate criteria for the review of new construction in the Benton Park Historic District.

Ms. Cameron analyzed pictures of the site where the construction is proposed, the context of the built environment on the block and the design of the attached houses. She explained that another developer had proposed developing the site but was unsuccessful and noted that MSW, LLC is now the developer of the site, led by Patti Aleto.

Ms. Cameron explained the standards in the ordinance and stated that the proposal is almost entirely compliant. She observed that siding on the north façade will be exposed because the adjacent house is only one-and-a-half stories tall.

Patrick Weber, architect for the project, spoke in support. Mike Killeen asked if there was a drawing that showed the north façade and how much of the siding would be exposed because the building to the north is only one-and-a-half stories in height. Mr. Weber said he did not have such a drawing.

Tim Mulligan, from the Benton Park Neighborhood Association submitted a letter of support for the project to the Preservation Board. He reiterated support for the project in his brief remarks to the Board.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed site for construction, 3001-09 Missouri Avenue,
is located in the Benton Park Local Historic District,
- the proposed design for the new building follows an appropriate Model Example,
- the design has been revised after consultation with the Cultural Resources Office staff, and now generally complies with the Benton Park Standards for new construction.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to approve the design for the project per the following stipulations: the final design includes no visible siding on the northeast corner of the building and that provisions 1-4 from the Benton Park Association letter are appropriately addressed. The motion was made by Commissioner Mike Killeen and seconded by Commissioner Randy Vines. The motion was approved unanimously.

B. 2020.0564 5720 DeGIVERVILLE CENTAL WEST END HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Pearl Capital Management LLC
Applicant: Trivers Associates - Joel Fouss

COMMERCIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct a mixed use development/multi-family/commercial/retail w/parking.

PROCEEDINGS: On February 24, 2020, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to

consider a Preliminary Review Application to construct an apartment building at 5720 DeGiverville Avenue in the Skinker-DeBaliviere, Parkview, Catlin Tract Certified Local Historic District.

Commissioners Richard Callow (Chairman), Michael Killeen, Alderman Joe Vaccaro, Anthony Robinson and Randy Vines were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Dan Krasnoff of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #57688, which delineate criteria for the review of new construction in the Skinker DeBaliviere, Parkview, Catlin Tract Certified Local Historic District.

Mr. Krasnoff analyzed pictures of the site where the construction is proposed, the context of the built environment on the block and the design of the apartment building. He discussed review criteria found in Skinker-DeBaliviere, Parkview, Catlin Tract Certified Local Historic District. He noted that another new construction mixed-use building on the north side of DeGiverville Avenue is not within the boundaries of the historic district. Mr. Krasnoff said the project is thoughtfully designed and the only concerns he has are the size of balcony openings and the details of the design of the apartments that are accessed from the street at the western end of the first story on DeGiverville.

Joel Fuoss, representing the Trivers architecture firm was available to answer questions. Commissioner Mike Killeen asked for an explanation of the materials on the façade of the building. Mr. Fuoss replied that the materials are a combination of grey brick, metal panels and cedar panels. The Preservation Board found that:

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

- 5720 DeGiverville is located in the Skinker-DeBaliviere Local Historic District,
- the contemporary design is appropriate to the context. The new building is mixed-use with retail on the first floor and apartments above,
- the design seeks to minimize differences in height and massing with the house to the west through the use of reduced height, setbacks and material changes,
- the building will relate to another structure by the same developer on the north side of DeGiverville and with a new

apartment building at the northeast corner of the same intersection,

- the proposed building complies with nearly all standards,
- the design of large balconies is worthy of further consideration.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval to the design with the stipulation that final plans and exterior materials are reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office. The motion was made by Commissioner Randy Vines. Commissioner Mike Killeen seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously.

C. 2020.0152 2800-10 S. JEFFERSON AVE. BENTON PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: 2800 S. Jefferson LLC – Andrew Sandler

Applicant: JEMA – Jonathan McKee

PROCEEDINGS:

On February 24, 2020, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a Preliminary Review Application to construct an apartment building at 2800 South Jefferson Avenue in the Benton Park Local Historic District.

Commissioners: Richard Callow (Chairman), Michael Killeen, Alderman Joe Vaccaro, Anthony Robinson and Randy Vines were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #67175, which delineate criteria for the review of new construction in the Benton Park Historic District.

Ms. Cameron analyzed pictures of the site where the construction is proposed, the context of the built environment on the block and the design of the apartment building. She discussed review criteria found in both the Benton Park standards and the Contemporary Construction Policy. She noted the aspects of the design that are contemporary in nature and aspects of the design that are based upon an Historic Model Example.

The developers of the project, Drew Sandler and Kyle Howerton addressed the Preservation Board, as did architect John Mueller, of Jema

Design. They spoke in favor of the project and described the process by which the site was identified and the design was developed.

Commissioner Mike Killeen asked if any aspects of the Benton Park neighborhood committee's suggestions were included in the design being presented. John Mueller said piers between ground floor windows have been changed to brick, translucent glass will shield the parking and a brick pattern on the ground floor are all revisions to the design based upon neighborhood feedback. They also will consider wrapping the south and east facades with brick.

Tim Mulligan, from the Benton Park Neighborhood Association submitted a letter of support for the project subject to desired alterations within their letter as follows.

1. South and east elevations of building are proposed to have corrugated metal siding. Committee recommends utilizing brick on south elevation for approximately thirty feet from the front (S. Jefferson) façade.
2. On east elevation, similar concern. Recommend utilizing brick along alley and siding above.
3. Regarding store front glass along the S. Jefferson elevation, we would like to see brick columns continue down from second floor to add masonry massing element along ground floor.
4. Regarding store front glass along the garage space, we do not want to see cars or bicycles parked. Provide translucent glass along this space. Alternate concept would be to provide show windows, where displays could be exhibited.
5. Should additional space in garage be required for utilities or mechanical-electrical-plumbing use, the number of parking stalls in garage will coincide with number of apartment units.

Mr. Mulligan reiterated that the neighborhood association would like to see brick wrapped on the south and east elevations.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 2800-10 S. Jefferson Avenue is located in the Benton Park Local Historic District,
- the balcony proposed at 3327 Missouri does not comply with the Benton Park Standards, which do not allow a deck at a Semi-Public Façade,
- the applicant has requested review under the Preservation Board's Compatible New Construction Policy,
- the applicant has selected Fenestration and Decorative Elements as the two Allowed Deviations under the Policy,

- the design of 2800-10 S. Jefferson complies with the requirements of the Policy with the exception of Material, in regard to the use of corrugated metal siding on the south and rear elevations. As this type of siding was commonly used as a secondary material on 19th and early 20th century industrial buildings, the Cultural Resources Office staff feels that it is appropriate.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval to the project with the stipulation that brick “wrap” the three bays that comprise the northern third of the alley façade and the western one-third of the south façade; and that final drawings, exterior materials and colors be reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office. The motion was made by Commissioner Anthony Robinson and seconded by Commissioner Randy Vines. The motion was approved unanimously.

APPEALS OF DENIALS

D. 2019.1895 3011 & 3015 McNAIR AVE. BENTON PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: New Solutions Development LLC – Greg Crawford

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

Appeal of a building permit application to construct two 2-story single family houses.

PROCEEDINGS:

On February 24, 2020 the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an Appeal of a Director’s Denial to construct two, two-story single-family attached townhouses; at 3011 & 3015 McNair Avenue in the Benton Park Local Historic District. Commissioners Richard Callow (Chair), Randy Vines, Mike Killeen, Alderman Joe Vaccaro, and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item. Andrea Gagen of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #67175, which sets forth the standards for the Benton Park Local Historic District. She entered into the record Ordinance #64689 as amended by Ordinance 64925; Ordinance #67175, the Benton Park Historic District ordinance, as well as the Board’s agenda and her PowerPoint presentation.

Ms. Gagen stated that although the original plans had been revised, the proposed building still deviated substantially from the Model Example. In addition, she stated that there was an insufficient brick return on the north elevation and a number of smaller details that needed to be addressed.

No one appeared for the applicant/owner.

Timothy Mulligan, Chairman of the Benton Park Neighborhood Association's Building Review Committee, stated that they could not support the project at this time as the Committee had not had a chance to review the project.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 3011 and 3015 Missouri are located in the Benton Park Local Historic District,
- the proposed design for the new buildings is based on an appropriate Model Example; however, the buildings vary significantly from that Model Example,
- the proposed building deviates from Model Example in proportions, detailing, arch size, entry, foundation treatment & parapet design,
- the brick return on the north side of the building is not sufficient,
- there are a number of smaller details that need to be addressed.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the Director's denial of the new construction. The motion was made by Commissioner, Alderman Vaccaro and seconded by Commissioner Mike Killeen. The motion passed unanimously.

E. 2020.0210 5260 WESTMINSTER PLACE CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Mark Wade and Darlene Blair

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

Appeal of a denial of a building permit application to replace front porch roof shingles and copper flashing.

PROCEEDINGS:

On February 24, 2020, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial to retain a front porch roof replaced without a permit, at 5260 Westminster Place, in the Central West End Local Historic District. The appeal had previously been heard at the January 27, 2020 meeting but came back before the Board because the stipulations of the previous decision were not met.

Commissioners Richard Callow (Chair), Randy Vines, Mike Killeen, Anthony Robinson, and Alderman Joe Vaccaro were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bethany Moore of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that gave a quick recap of the appeal and the Preservation Board's decision at the January meeting to overturn the Director's denial if an approval letter was obtained from the neighborhood association. Ms. Moore stated that the work that was done without a permit did not meet the Standards.

Mark Wade, owner of the property, spoke on his own behalf. He stated that after the January meeting he got a letter of support from what he thought was his neighborhood association and was then told by Cultural Resources Office staff that it was not from the correct group. He stated he then was directed to speak to Jim Dwyer of the Central West End Neighborhood Association Planning and Development Commission. He stated that he was told that after looking at his project the committee decided they were not in opposition of the project but would not write a letter of support. Because of this Mr. Wade stated he was at a dead end with the process and was coming to the Board for further direction.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the site of the work done without a permit, 5260 Westminster Place, is located in the Central West End Local Historic District,
- the Central West End standards for Roofs require historic or original roofing material or an approved substitute material to be used on visible roof sections,
- the front porch roof is a visible roof section,
- GAF Timberline in Hickory is not a substitute material approved by the Cultural Resources Office,

- the Central West End Neighborhood Association Planning and Development Committee was not opposed to the project.

BOARD DECISION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the Director's Denial for the project and allow it to stand as constructed. The motion was made by Commissioner Mike Killeen and seconded by Commissioner Randy Vines. The motion passed unanimously.

F. 2019.2004 3008 MISSOURI AVENUE BENTON PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Cassandra Short and Timothy Dowling
Applicant: Renewal by Andersen

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of a denial of a building permit application to replace four arched windows with flat-headed windows on front façade.

PROCEEDINGS: On February 24, 2020, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an Appeal of the Director's Denial to install windows at a public facade, at 3008 Missouri Avenue, in the Benton Park Local Historic District. Commissioners Richard Callow (Chair), Randy Vines, Alderman Joe Vaccaro, and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Andrea Gagen of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #67175, which sets forth the standards for windows at Public Facades in the Benton Park Local Historic District. She entered into the record ordinances #64689 as amended by #64925, and ordinance #67175. She also entered into the record the PowerPoint and the agenda. She stated that proposed windows did not replicate the original segmental arch windows.

Beth Hoechst, of Renewal by Andersen, the applicant, testified in support of the project. She stated there was a significant cost difference between the segmental arch and flat head windows. Cassie and Tim Dowling, the owners, testified on their own behalf.

Timothy Mulligan, of the Benton Park Neighborhood Association, testified that if they were allowed to change to flat-head windows, they needed to be installed accurately.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 3008 Missouri Avenue is located within the Benton Park Local Historic District,
- the original windows at 3008 Missouri appear to have had a segmental arch top sash,
- the interior window openings were previously altered to make them flat head openings,
- the proposed windows duplicate the existing, non-conforming windows and therefore do not meet the Benton Park Historic District standards,
- there was not enough information presented that the difference between the flat-head and segmental-arch windows constituted a hardship.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to table the item until the next meeting to allow the applicant to provide evidence of their financial hardship in this matter and also to allow them to shop around to see whether they can put in arched windows per the Standards. The motion was made by Commissioner Mike Killeen and seconded by Commissioner Randy Vines. The motion passed unanimously.

G. 2020.0098 6211 DELMAR BLVD. SKINKER-DeBALIVIERE HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Pace-Delmar Associates LLC – Kate Matthews

Applicant: Bill Yount Signs & Electric – John Wilk

COMMERCIAL PLAN:

Appeal of a denial of a building permit application to install six illuminated signs, two blade, four wall.

PROCEEDINGS:

On February 24, 2020, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an Appeal from the Director’s Denial to erect two illuminated blade signs and four illuminated wall signs for the building at 6211 Delmar Boulevard, located in the Skinker-DeBaliviere/Catlin Tract/Parkview Local Historic District.

Commissioners Richard Callow (Chair), Randy Vines, Michael Killeen, Alderman Joe Vaccaro, and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Andrea Gagen of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that reviewed the sign designs and their locations on the proposed building. She entered into the record Ordinance #64689 as amended by Ordinance 64925; Ordinance #57688, the Skinker-DeBaliviere/Catlin Tract/Parkview Historic District ordinance, amended by Ordinance 70821, the new historic standards, as well as the Board's agenda and her PowerPoint presentation. Ms. Gagen stated that the original application had been revised to two illuminated blade signs and two halo-lit wall signs. While the signs still did not comply with the district sign standards in their number, lighting and size, it was an improvement over the original submission. She recommended that the Preservation Board uphold the Director's Denial. After hearing testimony from the applicant, Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office asked if the blade signs could have a dark face with white lettering.

Ms. Gagen submitted into the record certified copies of the new proposal.

Gary Potts of Professional Permits, CVS & Pace-Delmar LLC Representative, testified that the proposed signs were much closer in size to the district sign standards, and that they needed the drive-thru pharmacy signs for directional purposes. He was in agreement to reversing the colors on the drive-thru pharmacy signs.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 6211 Delmar is located in the Skinker-DeBaliviere Local Historic District,
- the proposed signs are not in compliance with the Sign Standards in number, size, & lighting,
- the new proposal reduces the size, number of signs and only the blade signs are internally illuminated,
- the reversal of the blade signs to a dark background with white letters is preferable.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the Director's denial and to approve the new sign proposal

submitted by the appellant, with the stipulation that the lettering on the blade sign be white and the background be a dark color. The motion was made by Commissioner Mike Killeen and seconded by Commissioner Randy Vines. The motion passed unanimously.