

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES
FEBRUARY 25, 2019**

Board Members Present

Richard Callow – Chairman
Randy Vines
Mike Killeen
David Richardson
Anthony Robinson
Dave Visintainer
Melanie Fathman
Tiffany Hamilton - Absent
Alderman Terry Kennedy – Absent

Cultural Resources Office Staff Present

Dan Krasnoff, Director
Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator
Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner
Bethany Moore, Preservation Planner
Adona Buford, Adm. Assistant

Legal Counsel

Barbara Birkicht

PRELIMINARY REVIEWS

A. 2018.1529 2717 SIDNEY STREET FOX PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Rung Foundation Inc., - Leslie Gill

Applicant: Christner Inc. – Stacey Wehe

COMMERCIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to renovate 2-story warehouses, construct new a one-story addition, demolish three outbuildings and 1-story addition.

PROCEEDINGS: On February 25th, 2019, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a Preliminary Review Application to construct a one-story addition to a historic, three-story manufacturing building at 2717 Sidney Street, in the Fox Park Local Historic District. The application was submitted by Stacie Wehe of the Christner Partnership, project architect.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #66098, which sets forth the standards for new construction in the Fox Park District. She introduced a letters of support for the project from Alderwoman

Heather Navarro and Matthew S. McBride, President of the Fox Park Neighborhood Association on behalf of the Association.

Ms. Cameron testified that the project included the rehabilitation of the three-story Fox Brothers Manufacturing Building in compliance with the Rehabilitation standards of the historic district; and the demolition of five smaller industrial buildings on the north side of the property, that were architecturally compromised and of little architectural interest. She stated that the design of the one-story addition was being reviewed under the Preservation Board's Compatible New Construction Policy and that all required steps in review had been completed as required. She noted that the project deviates from two elements of Required Compatibility: Height and Setback; however, she stated that the Cultural Resources staff was in support of an exception to these requirements, as a one-story building was directly opposite the project site; and that the narrow setback accommodated a subtle accessibility ramp to the new main entry. Ms. Cameron also testified that the staff felt the project had three elements of Allowed Differentiation, instead of the maximum two: Color; Fenestration and Percent of Solid to Void. Ms. Cameron recommended that the Preservation Board grant Preliminary Approval to the project with the stipulation that only two Variations from Compatibility be allowed.

The architect for the project, Stacie Wehe of the Christner Partnership, testified in support of the project. She briefly discussed the history of the site, and that at one time the Fox Brothers complex had had a one-story building on the site of the proposed addition. She also stated that the owner intended to restore the main Fox Brothers; that the variety of brick colors proposed for the addition had all been drawn from other buildings in the vicinity; that the variation of window proportions and brick detailing created a playful design, and countered the staff's contention that there was a differentiation in Color. Ms. Wehe also stated that there was some contradiction in some of the Policy's requirements, particularly the Fenestration requirements and the statement that window patterns should reflect the interior patterns of use. In response to a question from Board Member Killeen, Ms. Wehe responded that the setback of the addition matched the floor lines of the existing building and the setback was necessary to provide an adequate accessible entry.

Tom Pickel, Executive Director of De Sales Community Development, tested his organization's strong support for the project and the

importance the project would have in this part of the Fox Park Neighborhood and urged the Board to approve it as presented.

Jay Reeves, Chairman of the Development and Standards Committee of the Fox Park Neighborhood Association, testified in support of the project. He commented that the Compatible New Construction Policy review had gone well. He added that, in his own opinion, the requirement that limited Allowed Differentiations to only two might be overly restrictive.

Director Krasnoff, testifying again in response to a question from Board Member Killeen, stated that as Director, he had preliminarily approved the demolition of the five ancillary structures, as they were considered to be non-contributing resources to the Fox Park Historic District.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 2717 Sidney Street is located in the Extension to the Fox Park Local Historic District;
- the property owner has requested review under the Preservation Board's Compatible New Construction Policy and all required Steps under that Policy are completed;
- the design complies with all Compatibility requirements of the Policy with the exception of Height and Setback and the CRO staff supports an exception to both these requirements;
- the design current has three Allowed Differentiations in place of the maximum two: Color; Fenestration; and Percent of Solid to Void;
- Board members disagree whether the varied colors of the brick proposed for the two street elevations amounts to a violation of Allowed Differentiation.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval to the design and to the 'Allowed Differentiations' as presented with the stipulation that final plans and exterior materials are reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office.

The motion was made by Board Member David Richardson and Mr. Robinson seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

B. 2019.0174 5344 DELMAR BLVD. CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Affinity Conway Properties, LLC – Scott Miller

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct the remaining twenty townhomes units.

PROCEEDINGS: On February 25th, 2019, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a Preliminary Review application to construct twenty two-story townhouse units at 5344 Delmar Boulevard and surrounding lots, in the Central West End Local Historic District.

Bethany Moore of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that reviewed the plans of the proposed buildings and showed photographs of the site and previously constructed townhouses existing on Delmar Place Court. She noted that the designs submitted for preliminary approval were only for the rear lots, 23-40, which would be partially screened from the street by the existing townhouse units fronting on Delmar Boulevard and that the design for the units on lots 21-22 would be re-created to match the existing units and would front on Delmar Boulevard.

Ms. Moore indicated that the design generally complied with the standards for new construction within the Central West End Local Historic District Standards. She also noted that the garages of the new units were front entry but that they were minimally visible from the street due to the existing row of townhouses in front of the lots proposed for construction.

Ms. Moore recommended that the Preservation Board grant Preliminary Approval to the project, with the stipulations regarding the west elevation.

FINDINGS OF FACTS: The Preservation Board found that:

- 5344 Delmar Boulevard and additional lots are located in the Central West End Local Historic District;
- the proposed design will be partially screened from the street by the existing row of townhouses fronting on Delmar Boulevard.

BOARD DECISION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval to the project, with the stipulation that

final drawings and exterior materials be subject to review by the Cultural Resources Office. The motion was made by Board Member David Richardson. Mr. Visintainer seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

C. 2019.0003 621-33 N. SKINKER BLVD. SKINKER-DeBALIVIERE HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Pace-Delmar LLC – Katie Matthews

Applicant: SM Wilson – Jim Hoette

COMMERCIAL PLAN: New building permit application to construct a one-story addition to a three-story manufacturing building.

PROCEEDINGS: On February 25th, 2019, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a Preliminary Review application to construct a one-story addition to a three-story manufacturing building at 612-33 N. Skinker Boulevard, in the Skinker DeBaliviere-Parkview-Catline Tract-Parkview Certified Local Historic District. The application was submitted by Lance McOlgan of the Bates Forum Studio, project architect.

Board member David Richardson recused himself from both discussion and voting.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #57688, which sets forth the standards for architectural details in the Skinker-DeBaliviere District. She introduced a letter of support for the project, signed by Nicole Blumner, Community Development Chair; Nancy Hohmann; Historic District Chair; Joann Vatcha, Commercial District Chair; and Brandon Sterling, Executive Director, of the Skinker-DeBaliviere Community Council. Ms. Cameron testified that the design being presented differs in some characteristics from that granted Preliminary Approval by the Preservation Board in March of 2017; in particular, the loss of projecting vertical bays on the Delmar façade. Ms. Cameron also stated that brick pilasters had been introduced, the proposed glass corner had been reduced in height and a corbelled cornice added that appeared to mitigate the loss of these elements, and recommended that the Preservation Board grant approval to the new design.

The architect for the project, Lance McOlgan of Bates Forum Studio, was present for questions, but did not testify.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 621-33 N. Skinker is located in the Skinker-DeBaliviere/Catlin Tract/Parkview Local Historic District.
- the new building will have a major first-floor tenant and office space above;
- the building, proposed to be 3 stories tall, will be taller than many of the historic commercial buildings to its west; however, there exists a variety of building heights in this area of Delmar, including a 3-story building and a 7-story hotel directly east as well as a 4-story building opposite the building site;
- the proposed building meets the standards for siting; roof shape and materials; and exterior materials;
- the original proposal displayed vertical bays and window ; proportions that more closely reflected historic precedent;
- this final design has shortened the glazed corner bay and added pilasters and a substantial cornice to produce a closer compatibility to the character of surrounding historic structures.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant approval to the revised design as currently presented with the stipulation that final plans and exterior materials are reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office.

The motion was made by Board Member David Visintainer and seconded by Ms. Fathman. The motion passed with five members voting in favor, none opposing and Board Member Richardson abstaining.

D. 2019.0054 2320 ALBION PLACE LAFAYETTE SQUARE HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Kimber Baro

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

Appeal of a building permit application for a non-compliant front door installed without a permit.

PROCEEDINGS:

On February 25th, 2019, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to

consider an appeal of the Director's Denial to retain a non-compliant storm door installed without a permit, at 2320 Albion Place, in the Lafayette Square Historic District. The application was submitted by the owner, Kimber Baro.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), Mike Killeen, Randy Vines, Melanie Fathman, David Richardson, David Visintainer and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bethany Moore of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #69112 which sets forth the standards for architectural details in the Lafayette Square Local Historic District. She entered into the record Ordinance #64689, as revised by City Ordinance #64925, the enabling legislation; and Ordinance #69112, the Lafayette Square Historic District, the Preservation Board Agenda and PowerPoint. Ms. Moore stated that the installed metal and glass storm door did not comply with the historic district standards due to the material. Based upon the standards, Ms. Moore recommended that the Board uphold the Director's denial of the application.

Kimber Baro, owner of the property, spoke on her own behalf. She noted that her contractor told her it was up to her if she wanted to get a permit for the door and that she had called the Building Division to inquire about a permit for the door and was incorrectly told she did not need one. Ms. Baro also stated she had done work on her property previously and did obtain an approved permit for that work. She also told the Board she had counted other metal storm doors in Lafayette Square. In response to a question by Board Member Killeen Ms. Baro stated she did not submit any documentation of financial hardship.

Suzanne Sessions, of the Lafayette Square Development Committee spoke in opposition to the retention of the storm door. Ms. Sessions stated she had seen the doors going in and had brought them to the attention of the Cultural Resources Office. She also stated that there were in fact several other metal storm doors but that those had been installed prior to the 2012 revision to the Lafayette Square Historic District Standards that prohibited such doors on the front façade in the Historic District.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

FEBRUARY 25, 2019

Page 8 of 8

Linda Pellmann, also of the Lafayette Square Development Committee spoke in opposition to the retention of the storm door as well.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the site of the storm door, 2320 Albion Place, is located in the Lafayette Square Local Historic District;
- the district standards do not allow materials other than wood to be used for doors at Public Facades;
- the installed storm door does not meet the Lafayette Square Local Historic District Standards.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the Director's denial as the storm door did not meet the requirements of the Lafayette Square Local Historic District Standards. Board Member Richardson noted in his opinion that it was clear the storm door was in violation of the Standards.

The motion was made by Board Member David Visintainer. Ms. Fathman seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.