

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES
FEBRUARY 27, 2017**

Board Members Present

Richard Callow – Chairman

Anthony Robinson

David Visintainer

David Richardson

Mike Killeen

Ald. Terry Kennedy

Melanie Fathman

Legal Counsel

Barbara Birkicht

Cultural Resources Office Staff Present

Dan Krasnoff, Director

Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator

Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner

Bob Bettis, Preservation Planner

Adona Buford, Administrative Assistant

PRELIMINARY REVIEWS

A. 2017.0040 44 MARYLAND PLAZA CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Koplak Properties

Applicant: Sara Hentz

COMMERCIAL PLAN: Preliminary review of façade alterations to retail storefront.

PROCEEDINGS: On February 27, 2017 the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a Preliminary Review request to make façade alterations to a two-story commercial building at 44 Maryland Plaza, in the Central West End Historic District.

Ms. Sara Hentz submitted the application on behalf of the building owner, Koplars Properties.

Board members Richard Callow (Chairman), Michael Killeen, Erin Wright, Melanie Fathman, David Richardson and Alderman Terry Kennedy were present for the testimony for this agenda item. Board member Anthony Robinson entered during the first applicant's testimony.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #61177, which sets forth standards for repair and rehabilitation of historic commercial buildings in the Central West End Historic District.

She noted that the proposed alterations were not in compliance with these standards and, in the case of the storefront alterations, were not reversible. Ms. Cameron submitted a letter of opposition to the proposal from Mr. James Dwyer, Chair of the Central West End Planning & Development Committee.

Bob Koplars, the building owner, testified in support of the project. He stated that his company had invested substantially in the rehab of all this building and the two adjacent buildings in Maryland Plaza and in the fountain work which had attracted notable commercial entities to the historic district. He stated that the proposed tenant represented a unique opportunity for St. Louis to have an up-and-coming retail establishment that had stores in major U.S. cities, and it would have a transformative effect upon the Central West End and the City. He said that 44 Maryland Plaza was a "black hole" and some changes were necessary in order for retail to survive in that location. Mr. Koplars stated that contrary to the plans previously submitted, they were reducing the area of the openings being enlarged. He stated that the prospective tenant would prefer the changes be made, but could not definitely say that they would not locate here if they were not approved. Mr. Koplars also stated that the owner and the tenant felt the grills proposed for the second story were important, but were willing to stipulate that they would be removed at the end of the lease.

James Dwyer, Chair of the CWE Planning & Development Committee, spoke against the proposal. He read his letter, previously submitted, into the record. Mr. Dwyer stated that he had looked at other locations for the tenant and all were not mall-front designs, but several were adapted to historic buildings and

he could see no reason for them not to do so here. In response to a question from Board Member Robinson, he stated that the Committee had three main areas of concern: the shutters; the height of the bulkheads; and the muntins for the shop windows, but were willing to support increasing the height of the entry.

Erin Ross, of Suit Supply, testified in support of the project. She stated that in response to some early comments, they had made revisions to make the changes to the façade more subtle. They had agreed to keep the horizontal dimensions of the shop windows and door, and were lowering the bulkheads about 1-1/2 feet; that it was not a branding decision, but a marketing one to make a more enticing retail space. Ms. Ross also stated that several of the glass tiles beneath the shop windows were damaged and might indicate structural concerns so it might be better to reduce the sill height. She also testified that the damage to the window frames from the grills would be repaired and indicated that their design team felt very strongly about the shop window mullions but she suggested that they would stipulate they be removed at the end of the lease.

Mr. Dwyer stated his committee's concern about the precedent of accepting the alterations because they would only be temporary; and repeated that the standards require that historic facades are to be maintained.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 44 Maryland Plaza is a contributing resource to the Central West End Local Historic District;
- The proposed alterations would diminish the historic character of the building and detract from its Streamline Modern style;
- Alterations to the storefront will not be reversible. The mounting method proposed for the grills or panels at the second story windows will have no permanent impact upon the historic glass façade;
- It appears that in other cities, the proposed tenant has sustained a successful business within existing structures without the necessity of such substantial alterations to historic buildings.

BOARD ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to withhold approval of the Preliminary Review at this time as the proposed storefront alterations do not comply with the Central West End Local Historic District standards. The motion was made by Board Member David Richardson. Mr. Robinson seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

APPEALS OF DENIALS

B. 2016.1799 48 WASHINGTON TERRACE CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DIST.

Owner: Thomas M. Ward

Applicant: Patriot Sunrooms and Home Solutions

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of a denial of a building permit application to install a prefabricated metal sunroom on the rear.

PROCEEDINGS: On February 27, 2017, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial of a building permit application to install a sunroom, at 48 Washington Terrace, in the Central West End Certified Local Historic District and the Kingsbury-Washington Terrace Landmark Historic District. The owner submitted the appeal.

Board members Richard Callow, Mike Killeen, David Richardson, Anthony Robinson, Erin Wright, and Melanie Fathman were present for the testimony for this agenda item. Alderman Kennedy was not present for this portion of the hearing.

Andrea Gagen, of the Cultural Resources Office, made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #69423, which sets forth the standards for residential buildings in the Central West End Local Historic District and City Ordinance #56581 governing the Kingsbury-Washington Terrace Landmark Historic District.

Ms. Gagen entered into the record certified copies of Ordinances #64689, as amended by #64925, #69423 and #56581, the Board Agenda, the PowerPoint presentation for 48 Washington Terrace and the building permit application.

The applicant, Joe Scognomiglio of Patriot Sunrooms, spoke on the owner's behalf. Michael T. Ward, the owner, also spoke on his own behalf.

James Dwyer spoke on behalf of the Central West End Association, in support of the Cultural Resources Office's recommendation.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 48 Washington Terrace is located in the Central West End Certified Local Historic District and the Kingsbury-Washington Terrace Landmark Historic District;
- The proposed sunroom is constructed of glass and bronze metal sitting on a 10" high insulated deck with a 4" perimeter curb;
- The sunroom is of a Victorian era design, while the main house is has Tudor detailing;
- The sunroom, although on the rear elevation is visible from Clara Ave., as it is on a corner lot and proposed to be at the 2nd story of the building.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the Director's Denial of the building permit, as the sunroom does not meet the Central West End and Kingsbury-Washington Terrace Historic District standards. The motion was made by Board David Richardson to uphold the Director's Denial of the building permit, but send the application back to the staff with the directive to work with the applicant to reach an acceptable compromise and refine the plan design including, but not limited to looking at the color, location, ornamentation and style of the proposed sunroom. Mr. Killeen seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

Board member Mike Killeen moved to adjourn the meeting, hearing no objection, the meeting was adjourned.