

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES
MARCH 28, 2016**

Board Members Present

Richard Callow - Chairman

Dave Visintainer

Melanie Fathman

Mike Killeen

Anthony Robinson

Dave Richardson

Erin Wright

Legal Counsel

Barbara Birkicht

Cultural Resources Office Staff Present

Betsy Bradley, Director

Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator

Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner

Bob Bettis, Preservation Planner

Adona Buford, Administrative Assistant

Board Member Mike Killeen moved to approve the February 22, 2016 minutes. Members Anthony Robinson and Melanie Fathman seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

SPECIAL AGENDA ITEM

- A.** Proposed Compatible New Construction Policy
Betsy Bradley gave a short overview of the policy. Preservation Board members requested that a Public Hearing be held on the proposed policy at the April 25, 2016 Board meeting.

PRELIMINARY REVIEW

- B. 2016.0404 230-32 N. KINGSHIGHWAY BLVD. CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DIST.**

Owner: Dr. Mike Noble

Applicant: Mainline Group Architecture

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

MARH 28, 2016

Page 2 of 9

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review of exterior alterations to penthouse windows and doors.

PROCEEDINGS: On March 28, 2016, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a Preliminary Application to make exterior alterations to the 27th floor penthouse at the Park Plaza, 230 S. Kingshighway Boulevard, located in the Central West End Historic District.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), David Richardson, David Visintainer, Michael Killeen, Erin Wright, Melanie Fathman and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #69423, which sets forth the standards for residential rehabilitation in the Central West End Historic District. She testified that a number of additions and alterations had been made to the west façade of the building c. 1960: the enclosure of open terraces on the north and south by steel and glass curtain walls; and alteration of six decorative windows and projecting ledges to receive projecting glass bays.

Ms. Cameron outlined the current project, a renovation of the penthouse into a single residential unit. Exterior work includes the installation of large glazed doors on the terrace additions; the disassembly and reinstallation of the existing bay windows; and, on the east façade, the construction of similar projecting bays in place of the historic windows. Ms. Cameron stated that, while the Cultural Resources Office agreed that the work proposed for the west façade and terrace enclosures complied with the Standards, the new bays proposed for the east façade did not, and recommended that the Preservation Board withhold its approval for their construction.

Ms. Cameron introduced a letter from J. Dwyer, Chair of the Planning & Development Committee of the Central West End Association, which expressed qualified support for the proposal.

Gary Tetley, of Mainline Group Architecture, Inc., the project architect, spoke in support of the project. He testified that the alterations had been completed in the 1950s when the previously unfinished space was converted to a ballroom. He felt that the additions' Modern design was compatible with the Art Deco style

of the Park Plaza, and the additions had attained their own architectural significance as early examples of the use of glass curtain walls. He also stated that the owner needed the eastern bays for additional interior space.

James Dwyer, Chair of the Central West End Association Planning & Development Committee, testified that the Committee was in support of the alterations to the terraces and the repair of the existing west façade bays. He also said the Committee supported the changes proposed for the east elevation, with the condition that the new enclosures were identical in height and design to those of the western façade.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- The Park Plaza, at 230 S. Kingshighway Boulevard, is located in the Central West End Historic District;
- the Park Plaza was constructed in 1929 in the Art Deco style;
- alterations made to the 27th floor c. 1960 in the Modern style have attained a level of significance and are compatible with the Art Deco style of the building;
- work proposed for the north and south terraces, and the repair of existing west bay enclosures complies with the Central West End Standards; and that
- although the Standards do not allow additions to visible facades, the new bay enclosures proposed for the east façade are acceptable as they will be similar in materials and design to the Modern additions on the west façade, and their height above the street will make them only moderately visible.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant Preliminary approval for the new construction as submitted. The motion was made by Board Member Erin Wright and seconded by Mr. Visintainer. Mr. Michael Killeen opposed the motion. The motion passed (5 to 1) five to one.

APPEALS OF DENIALS

- | | | |
|-----------|------------------|--|
| C. | 2016.0022 | 4571 OAKLAND AVENUE – DEFFERRED & SUBSEQUENTLY APPROVED |
| | 2016.0023 | 1092-94 SO. KINGSHIGHWAY BOULEVARD - DEFERRED |
-

D. 2015.1792 4615 PERSHING AVENUE CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DIST.

Owner/Applicant: William Forsyth

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of a denial of a building permit application to modify front sidewalk steps and install cheek walls.

PROCEEDINGS: On March 28, 2016, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial of a building permit application to move front stairs, construct knee walls and place pavers in the front yard, at 4615 Pershing Place in the Central West End Local Historic District. The owner submitted the appeal.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), David Richardson, Erin Wright, Anthony Robinson, Melanie Fathman, Mike Killeen and David Visintainer, and were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #69423, which sets forth the standards for residential property rehabilitation in the Central West End Local Historic District. He testified that the project was not in compliance as the introduction of new knee walls, moving the front stairs and covering the majority of the front yard with paver-stone are prohibited under the Standards, as they do not allow for the alteration of historic features to and the installation of new conjectural features like the decorative knee walls.

Mr. Bettis entered into the record certified copies of Ordinances #64689, as revised by #64925, and #69423; the Board agenda and the PowerPoint presentation for 4615 Pershing Place. A letter from the Central West End Association Planning and Development Committee, in support of a compromise solution offered to the applicant which involved approving all paver-stone installation as proposed if the knee walls and stair submittal were revised, was introduced into the record.

William Forsyth, the owner, testified on his own behalf, stating that the new knee walls and pavers would be more aesthetically pleasing than the original appearance of the yard. He made a presentation that included letters of support for his project from neighbors on the street, the block association and Alderwoman Lyda Krewson.

Mrs. Forsyth also testified in support of the project.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 4615 Pershing Place is located in the Central West End Local Historic District;
- the front steps are proposed to be moved forward from their original location in the historic slope in the yard to accommodate the new decorative knee walls; and
- the standards state that when there is a predominant ground cover proposed new material should be compatible. The introduction of two types of pavers in addition to concrete walks, and over 124 square feet of the front yard would not continue the predominant presence of lawns in front of most houses on the block, but may be compatible.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the Director's denial of the building permit because members felt that the Central West End Standards did not give sufficient rationale to deny the work. The motion was made by Board Member David Richardson. Ms. Melanie Fathman seconded the motion. Mr. Visintainer opposed the motion. The motion passed (5 to1) five to one.

E. 2016.0312 2800 McNAIR AVENUE BENTON PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Gary and Diane Lindsay

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

Appeal of a denial of a building permit to convert a window to a door on a Public Façade.

PROCEEDINGS:

On March 28, 2016, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial of a building permit application to replace a window with a door, at 2800 McNair Avenue in the Benton Park Local Historic District. The owner submitted the appeal.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), David Visintainer, David Richardson, Anthony Robinson, Mike Killeen, Erin Wright and Melanie Fathman were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Andrea Gagen of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #67175, which sets forth the standards for windows in the Benton

Park Local Historic District.

Ms. Gagen entered into the record certified copies of Ordinances #64689, as amended by #64925, and #67175; the Board agenda and the PowerPoint presentation for 2800 McNair Avenue; and the building permit application. She also submitted an email from Tim Mulligan of the Benton Park Building Review Committee.

Diane Lindsay, owner and appellant, testified in support of the project and explained the need for a second door.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 2800 McNair Avenue is located in the Benton Park Local Historic District;
- the owner proposes to remove a window on the Lynch elevation and replace it with a door and transom;
- the historic district standards do not allow for the lengthening of window openings on Public Facades;
- the owner has a site-specific problem due to the interior stair configuration; and
- the proposed design for the door and transom are appropriate for the building.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the Director's denial of the building permit application to replace a door with a window, citing a site-specific access problem. The motion was made by Board Member Mike Killeen. Mr. Anthony Robinson seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

F. 2016.0288 4531 McPHERSON AVENUE CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DIST.

Owner/Applicant: Kennedy Veal LLC

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

Appeal of a denial of a building permit application to retain an installed retaining wall.

PROCEEDINGS:

On March 28, 2016, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial of a building permit application to construct a retaining wall, at 4531 McPherson Avenue in the Central West End Local Historic District. The owner submitted the appeal.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), David Visintainer, David Richardson, Anthony Robinson, Erin Wright, Mike Killeen and

Melanie Fathman were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Andrea Gagen of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #69423, which sets forth the standards historic buildings in the Central West End Local Historic District.

Ms. Gagen entered into the record certified copies of Ordinances #64689, as amended by #64925, and #69423; the Board agenda and the PowerPoint presentation for 4531 McPherson Avenue; and the building permit application.

No one was present to represent the owner.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 4531 McPherson Avenue is located in the Central West End Local Historic District;
- the retaining walls were constructed without a permit;
- the slope of the yard was altered which is not allowed under the historic district standards; and that
- the retaining walls do not meet the historic district standards in material.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the Director's denial of the building permit application, as the constructed retaining walls did not comply with the Central West End Historic District standards. The motion was made by Board Member Mike Killeen. Mr. Dave Richardson seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

G. 2016.0022 815 ANN AVENUE SOULARD HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: 815 Ann LLC – Brian Minges

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of a denial of a building permit application for exterior alterations.

PROCEEDINGS: On March 28, 2016, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial of a building permit application for interior and exterior alterations, at 815 Ann Avenue in the Soulard Local Historic District. The applicant submitted the appeal.

Board members Richard Callow, David Visintainer, David Richardson, Anthony Robinson, Erin Wright and Melanie Fathman were present for the testimony for this agenda item. Mike Killeen recused himself for this agenda item.

Andrea Gagen of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #62382, which sets forth the standards historic buildings in the Soulard Local Historic District.

Ms. Gagen entered into the record certified copies of Ordinances #64689, as amended by #64925, and #57078 amended by #62382; the Board agenda and the PowerPoint presentation for 815 Ann; and the building permit application. Ms. Gagen also submitted into the record letters of support for the project from the Soulard Restoration Group and the 7th Ward Alderman, Jack Coatar.

Mark Fanning and Brian Minges, applicants, testified in support of the project. David Sweeney, of Latrop & Gage, also testified in support of the project.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 815 Ann Avenue is located in the Soulard Local Historic District;
- infill brick work on the stair wall and demolition of the chimney was completed without a permit;
- details on the proposed windows do not comply with the Soulard Historic District standards;
- the wrought iron fence does not meet the Soulard Historic District standards for height, but may be appropriate for enclosure of a parking lot; and
- the vehicular door installation on the Ann Avenue façade of the gymnasium addition is a substantial alteration to character of the building. The garage door opening is a component that could be improved.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to conditionally overturn the Director's denial of the building permit application. The motions were as follows: Board Member David Richardson made a motion overturn the Director's Denial of the lighting, fence and removal of the chimney. Mr. Robinson seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

MARH 28, 2016

Page 9 of 9

Board Member Dave Visintainer made a motion to overturn the Director's denial of the garage door opening subject to working out design details with the Cultural Resources staff. Mr. Richardson seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

Alderman Terry Kennedy made a motion to uphold the Director's denial of the windows as submitted and directed the Cultural Resources staff to work with the applicant to make the windows compliant. Mr. Visintainer seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

Board Member Dave Visintainer made a motion overturn the Director's denial of the infill on the front stair wall. Mr. Richardson seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

Chairman Callow moved to adjourn the meeting, hearing no objection the meeting was adjourned.