

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES
APRIL 24, 2017**

Board Members Present

Richard Callow – Chairman
Anthony Robinson
David Visintainer
David Richardson
Mike Killeen
Ald. Terry Kennedy
Melanie Fathman

Cultural Resources Office Staff Present

Dan Krasnoff, Director
Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator
Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner
Bob Bettis, Preservation Planner
Adona Buford, Administrative Assistant

Legal Counsel

Barbara Birkicht

PRELIMINARY REVIEWS

A. 2017.0333 1116 MISSOURI AVENUE LAFAYETTE SQUARE HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Pulte Group

Applicant: Killeen Studio Architects – Mike Killeen

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct attached townhouses on 4-acre vacant lot.

PROCEEDINGS: On April 27, 2017, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a Preliminary Application to construct 62 townhouses in attached groups of 2-4 units, at 1116 Missouri, a 4-plus acre site in the Lafayette Square Local Historic District. The application was submitted by the Pulte Group.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), Michael Killeen, Alderman Terry Kennedy, Melanie Fathman, David Richardson, Anthony Robinson and David Visintainer were present for the testimony for this agenda item. Board members Killeen and Richardson recused themselves because they were members of the project's development team. They did not participate in the hearing testimony, the questioning of persons testifying or the discussion after testimony was completed.

Daniel Krasnoff, of the Cultural Resources Office, made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #69112, which sets forth the standards for residential new construction in the Lafayette Square Local Historic District. Letters of support and opposition were entered into the record. He testified that the project complied with many, but not all of the Standards. Mr. Krasnoff summarized the proposal and showed images of the development site and the surrounding area. He explained the reasoning for the staff recommendation and aspects of the proposal that were non-compliant.

Mr. Krasnoff noted changes from the proposal heard by the Board at its March meeting: that new model examples were proposed, that the extension of LaSalle Street did not provide auto access to Mackay Place and that a new street was proposed that bisected the center of the site.

Matthew Segal, of the Pulte Group, introduced the project.

George Stock, the engineer for the project, spoke next. He summarized the site planning for the project in his PowerPoint presentation. In particular, he explained the decision to close the extension of LaSalle Street from allowing auto access to Mackay Place, to create the new street in the center of the site and to deal with the large sewer pipe that extends through the site.

Mike Killeen, the project architect, then spoke. He outlined the evolution of the design of the project, explained the decision to use new model examples and discussed the way the design of dormers, cornices and lintels could add design variety to the houses.

Board Member Visintainer asked if the proposal includes the installation of historic street lighting. Matt Segal said that the developer was open to installing the street lighting if it was the community's desire.

Board Member Visintainer asked if there would be a tree lawn on Mackay, Chouteau and Missouri. George Stock said there are areas where there are no tree lawns in the vicinity. He said a green strip of 12"-18" could likely be installed on the streets surrounding the site.

Alderman Kennedy asked if there was an alley at the south end of the site. George Stock said there is such an alley, but that it is

located on the adjoining property owner's land, and not on the site under consideration by the Board.

Alderman Kennedy asked about trash collection. George Stock said he would need to confer with the Refuse Department.

Alderman Christin Ingrassia spoke in favor of the project.

Sara Davis spoke in favor of the project.

Katy Joiner spoke in favor of the project.

Jarrad Holst spoke in favor of the project.

Shelby Hewerdine spoke in favor of the project.

Mary Hannah spoke in favor of the project.

Peter Hulse spoke in favor of the project.

Alderman Kennedy asked if Mr. Hulse listed the property. Mr. Hulse said he was and that there was a competing proposal for the site. Mr. Hulse said the project fit with zoning, the developer has developed a plan that is suitable and that the townhouses are a suitable product for the site.

Board Member Robinson asked about previous offers for the site. Mr. Hulse said there was a contract for the site a number of years ago that was not executed and there was a proposal for apartments.

Suzanne Sessions, of the Lafayette Square Restoration Committee, spoke against the project. She read her written statement into the record.

Tom Dahms spoke against the project.

Lynn Neighbors spoke against the project.

Linda Weiner spoke against the project.

Board Member Robinson asked what is suburban about the project. Ms. Weiner said the center road was like a mews and not much like a street. In suburbia all the houses look alike.

Elizabeth Odell spoke against the project.

Bob Bishop spoke against the project.

Keith Houghton spoke against the project. He provided a detailed analysis of the Historic District Standards and compared the project to those standards as well as a previously proposed development in the Shaw neighborhood.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- The proposed site for construction, 1116 Missouri Avenue, is located at the northern edge of the Lafayette Square Local Historic District;
- The site is a large, vacant 4-acre parcel that previously had an industrial use. The site fronts on Chouteau Avenue to the north; Missouri Avenue to the east; a vacant, wooded parcel on the south; and Mackay Place on the west;
- The design does not comply with the following standards for new construction in the Lafayette Square Historic District;
- Units on the interior of the site do not conform to site planning requirements;
- There are new curb cuts proposed;
- The rear elevations would be sided, although the HME has four sides of brick;
- Sidewalks are not proposed on both sides of the extension of LaSalle Street.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval with the stipulation that the rear facades be brick, sidewalks be placed on both sides of the extension of LaSalle Street and that final plans and details be approved by the Cultural Resources Office. The motion was made by Board member Anthony Robinson. Alderman Terry Kennedy seconded the motion.

Mr. Robinson said the project lacks variety but that the code allows for the design submitted.

Board Member Visintainer said the project was “cookie-cutter” and he desires that the development have a wider variety of house types than is being proposed.

Board Member Robinson said the Historic District Standards should be revised to reflect the development of larger sites.

Board Member Robinson revised his original motion. The new motion called for preliminary approval of the project with the rear facades being brick, sidewalks be constructed on all sides of the extension of LaSalle Street, the two-unit structures be revised in

design to add design variety and that final details be approved by the Cultural Resources Office.

The motion was approved with Board Members Melanie Fathman, Alderman Terry Kennedy and Anthony Robinson voting in Favor. Board Member David Visintainer voted no. Board Members Mike Killeen and David Richardson abstained.

B. 2017.0532 2232 S. GRAND BOULEVARD COMPTON HILL HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: South Grand Development, LLC

Applicant: HOK – Barb Anderson-Kerlin

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct a 5 story multi-family apartment building.

PROCEEDINGS: On April 24, 2017, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Section 5. E of Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to review on a preliminary basis a proposal to demolish a two-story YMCA building to construct a five-story apartment building in the Compton Hill historic district. Board members Richard Callow (Chairman); Alderman Terry Kennedy; David Visintainer; Michael Killeen; Anthony Robinson and Melanie Fathman were present for this presentation. Board member David Richardson recused himself from participation in discussion or vote on this application.

Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator, represented the Cultural Resources Office and submitted photographs and a map of the site and surrounding area, as well as streetscape and elevations drawings of the proposed building. She made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #57702, which sets forth standards for new construction in the Compton Hill Historic District; and the sections of Ordinance #64689, the City's Preservation District Ordinance, which set forth standards for demolition review. She noted that demolition of the YMCA building had been previously approved by the Board for a different project in 2006, at which time the Preservation Review District ordinance was not in effect; that a Redevelopment Plan had been passed for the project, but did not specifically state that the building was to be demolished; and that the YMCA had continued to deteriorate since the time of the first review. She also noted that while the proposed building design was not fully in

compliance with the Compton Hill Historic District Standards, it met many of the requirements and would be a significant beneficial contribution to the streetscape of South Grand Avenue.

Josh Udelhofen of Altus Properties, project developer, spoke in support of the project, stating that the new building would improve the South Grand streetscape. He also described the difficulties of reusing the YMCA, as it was built to a specific purpose with many levels and additions.

Jonathan Wirth of HOK, the architect for the project, showed photos of the roof and interior of the YMCA that illustrated its current condition. He then proceeded to describe the analysis of the surrounding context and architecture performed by HOK and described the proposed building, site plan and exterior materials.

Alderman Ingrassia spoke to indicate her support for the project, and testified that the developers had completed a wide public outreach.

Kelly White, a Compton Heights resident, spoke of her concern with the size and density of the proposed building, and effects on traffic. She also stated that the north side of the building should be all brick.

David Grelle, also a Compton Heights resident, testified that he had similar concerns to Ms. White.

Rachel Presley, a member of the board of the South Grand Commercial Improvement District, stated her support for the project and felt it was a forward-looking design; however, the windows should follow the historic district standards.

Chris Sherman, a resident of Compton Heights whose rear property is directly adjacent to the project site, expressed some concerns regarding visitor parking and traffic but was supportive of the project and pleased with the efforts of the developer.

Ron Chunn stated he had been a Compton Heights resident for fourteen years, and was concerned about the effect the new building would have on the neighborhood. He mentioned the number of units, that the building was to contain rentals, not

condominiums; but his biggest objection was to the building design that was not compatible with the historic buildings of the neighborhood.

Bill Brush testified that he had owned the building directly adjacent to the project site on the east at Shenandoah and was concerned about the parking area behind the building, how it was to be operated, and stated that he would like to see the building be entirely brick.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- The proposed site for the new apartment building is within the boundaries of the Compton Hill Certified Local Historic District;
- The YMCA building is considered to be a “Merit” building under the Preservation Review Ordinance as it has “Neighborhood Significance” within the Compton Hill Certified Local District;
- The existing YMCA building was considered for demolition by the Preservation Board in 2006, at which time the demolition of the building was accepted if the proposed replacement building was a viable project;
- Since that time, the building has continued to deteriorate and no viable proposals have been submitted for its rehabilitation;
- The proposed five-story apartment building is a contemporary design that is compatible in height, scale, and exterior materials with other multi-story buildings along Grand Avenue. Its design complies with most requirements for new construction in the Compton Hill Historic District Standards.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval with the stipulations that:

- the windows of street-facing elevations comply with the historic district standards;
- the north wall of the building be masonry in its entirety; that street-facing section of the south wall also be entirely masonry;
- the secondary façade material meet historic district guidelines;

- demolition of the existing building not be granted until the owners have received a building permit for the new structure; and;
- final plans and exterior materials are approved by the Cultural Resources Office staff.

The motion was made by Board member Mike Killeen. Mr. Robinson seconded the motion. Board Member David Richardson abstained. The motion passed with five voting in favor and one abstention.

C. 2017.0540 1408 TOWER GROVE AVENUE FOREST PARK SE NAT'L REG. DIST.

Owner: Missouri Foundation for Health

Applicant: HOK – Barb Anderson-Kerlin

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to demolish a four-family building and rehab adjacent properties.

PROCEEDINGS: On April 24, 2017, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a Preliminary Review for the demolition of a four-unit residential building at 1408-10 Tower Grove Avenue, in the Forest Park Southeast National Register Historic District. The building proposed for demolition is a contributing building to the Historic District.

The architect for the project, HOK, submitted the item for review, along with the prospective building owner, the Missouri Foundation for Health. Board members Richard Callow (Chair), David Visintainer, Melanie Fathman, Mike Killeen, Anthony Robinson and David Richardson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Mr. Krasnoff submitted Ordinance 64689 and Ordinance 64832, into the record. In addition letters from 17th Ward Alderman Joe Roddy, Park Central Development, Washington University and members of the public were entered into the record. Mr. Krasnoff briefly highlighted the staff recommendation: support for the demolition of 1408-10 Tower Grove Avenue and opposition to demolition of the shed structure on the east side of the Columbia Iron Works.

He discussed the criteria for review in the ordinance. The building at 1408-10 Tower Grove is a Merit structure. The structure is "sound." The conditions in the area include buildings that are occupied and some that are vacant. The loss of the building would create empty space along Tower Grove Avenue. However, that stretch of Tower Grove Avenue already has a large amount of vacant land. The building at 1408-10 Tower Grove Avenue, though "contributing" is not particularly distinctive in design. Though no new structure is proposed on the site of the four-family building, the proposal includes the rehabilitation of the main Columbia Iron Works facility. It was recommended that the Board require that the shed structure be maintained.

David Richardson asked Mr. Krasnoff to explain his categorization of the shed and four-family structures in terms of the ordinance. Mr. Krasnoff said that the four-family building must be considered contributing, because it is listed in the National Register designation. Mr. Krasnoff said the evaluation of the shed structure as contributing was based upon the staff analysis of its eligibility for the National Register, based upon the ordinance.

Mr. Richardson asked about the meaning of Criterion G, Commonly Controlled Property. Mr. Krasnoff agreed that the purchase of the property in this case did not apply to that criterion because the Missouri Foundation for Health did not already own property adjacent to the proposed demolition of 1408-10 Tower Grove Avenue.

Jill Nowak, of The Missouri Foundation for Health spoke in favor of the project. She emphasized the desire of the organization to create a new home for itself, make a healthy building from an unhealthy one and to provide opportunities to improve health outcomes for the Forest Park Southeast community. She explained the logic of rehabilitating the commercial building at Tower Grove and Vista, but to demolish the four-family structure at 1408-10 Tower Grove Avenue.

David Richardson asked about financing for the project. Ms. Nowak answered that that the project will be financed, instead of being funded by the endowment. She explained that they did

not find it advantageous to use historic tax credits to rehabilitate the four-family building.

Board Member Mike Killeen asked about use of the corner commercial building and ways to re-use the four-family building at 1408-10 Tower Grove Avenue. Ms. Nowak said the building would be used for programmatic activities and that reuse of the four-family building conflicted with the plans of the Missouri Foundation for Health.

Board Member David Visintainer asked how many parking spaces would be lost if the shed were preserved. Staff from HOK said it was estimated that ten spaces would be lost.

Jeff Davis, of HOK, spoke in favor of the project. He provided an overview of the program for the rehabilitation of the Columbia Iron Works and the plan for development of the rest of the site.

David Yates, of HOK, spoke in favor of the project. He explained the plan to rehabilitate the Columbia Iron Works and the building at the corner of Vista and Tower Grove.

Adam Kepka, a resident of the Forest Park Southeast neighborhood, spoke against the project. He presented a petition with more than 20 signatures opposing the demolition of 1408-10 Tower Grove Avenue.

Board Member David Visintainer asked if he supported demolition of the shed. Mr. Kepka said he was more concerned about the Tower Grove Avenue streetscape than preservation of the shed.

Ron Coleman, Neighborhood Improvement Specialist for the 17th Ward, spoke against the project. He spoke for Alderman Roddy and Park Central Development. He said both the Alderman and Park Central oppose demolition of the four-family building on Tower Grove Avenue.

Imran Hanafi spoke against the proposed demolition.

Maude Essen, a Forest Park Southeast resident, spoke against the project. She said it is important to not eliminate residential structures in the neighborhood.

FINDINGS OF FACTS: The Preservation Board found that:

- 1408-10 Tower Grove Avenue is within a Preservation Review District and National Register Historic District;
- The building is “sound.”
- The building is a Merit structure;
- No unusual circumstances justified the demolition of the building at 1408-10 Tower Grove Avenue;
- Demolition of the shed should only take place upon application of a permit to rehabilitate the rest of the Columbia Iron Works buildings.

BOARD DECISION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to deny preliminary approval for the demolition of 1408-10 Tower Grove Avenue. Demolition of the shed should only take place upon application of a permit to rehabilitate the rest of the Columbia Iron Works buildings.

The motion was made by Board Member Mike Killeen. Mr. Robinson seconded the motion. The motion carried with five members voting in favor and none opposed.

**D. 2017.0539 4212, 4136, 4121-23 & 4125-27 McREE AVE., NORTH 1-44 HISTORIC DISTRICT
4133-35 & 4145 LAFAYETTE AVENUE**

Owner: McRee Garden Apartments II LLC
Applicant: UIC – Brent Crittenden

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to demolish a four-family building and rehab adjacent properties.

PROCEEDINGS: On April 24, 2017, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a Preliminary Review for the demolitions of 4121, 4125-27, 4236 & 4212 McRee Avenue and 4133-35 & 4145 Lafayette Avenue in the Liggett Meyers National Register Historic District/North I-44 Local Historic District.

The architect/developer of the project UIC/CDO submitted the item for review. Board Members Richard Callow (Chair), David Visintainer, Melanie Fathman, Mike Killeen, Anthony Robinson and

David Richardson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Daniel Krasnoff, of the Cultural Resources Office, submitted Ordinances 64689, 64832 and 60370 into the record. In addition letters of support from 17th Ward Alderman Joe Roddy, 19th Ward Alderman Marlene Davis and the Botanical Heights Neighborhood Association were entered into the record.

Mr. Krasnoff highlighted the staff recommendation in support of the proposal. The proposal also includes the rehabilitation of fourteen (14) contributing structures to the North I-44 Local Historic District/Liggett and Meyers National Register Historic District.

Brent Crittenden, of UIC/CDO spoke in favor of the project.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- The buildings proposed for demolition are located within the North I-44 Local Historic District and Liggett Meyers National Register Historic District;
- The buildings are “Merit” structures;
- 4136 McRee was condemned in 2011. Staff denied demolition;
- 4125 McRee was declared an emergency condemnation in 2011. Never wrecked;
- 4133 Lafayette was condemned in 2011. Staff denied demolition;
- 4145 Lafayette was condemned for occupancy in 1999;
- The buildings have suffered significant disinvestment.
- The demolished buildings would be replaced by new structures;
- The developer has sought and shown difficulty in financing the rehabilitation of the buildings proposed for demolition.
- The developer is proposing to rehabilitate fourteen (14) contributing structures;
- The developer has an impressive development record and has been instrumental in the revitalization of the District.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval to the proposed demolitions per the application of building permits for new buildings on the sites as shown in the preliminary proposal. The motion was made by

Board Member Mile Killeen. Mr. Robinson seconded the motion. The motion carried with five members voting in favor and none opposed.

APPEAL OF DENIAL

E. 2017.0214 2205 LYNCH STREET BENTON PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Thomeczek Enterprises, LLC - Peggy Ladd

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of a denial of a building permit application to demolish a two-story single family house.

PROCEEDINGS: April 24, 2017 the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of a Director's Denial to demolish a single family stone house at 2205 Lynch Avenue.

Board members Richard Callow (Chairman), Melanie Fathman, David Richardson, Anthony Robinson and David Visintainer were present for the testimony for this agenda item. Board member Mike Killeen recused himself from the agenda item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #64689, as revised by City Ordinance #64682, which delineates criteria for the review of demolition proposals for properties in Preservation Review Districts and/or those listed on the National Register of Historic Places, and 67175 which delineates criteria for demolition in the Benton Park Local Historic District. He entered into the record a letter of opposition to the proposal from the Benton Park Neighborhood Association Building Review Committee. He also entered into the record a letter from Frontenac Engineering in regards to its current structural condition, a proposed construction budget and a current estimate of rehabilitation provided by the owner.

Peggy Ladd, the owner, testified on her own behalf. She entered in to the record several photographs showing the interior and exterior condition.

FINDINGS OF FACTS: The Preservation Board found that:

- The building proposed for demolition, 2205 Lynch Street, is a High Merit resource to the Benton Park Local Historic District;

- 2205 Lynch is a Missouri German stone house, dating from c. 1860, and is an important property to the Benton Park district and to the City. While it has been altered, these alterations have not seriously affected its historic character;
- 2205 Lynch has suffered a collapse at its west elevation, bringing into question its potential to be rehabilitated. At this time, information regarding stabilization or reconstruction costs has not been submitted by the applicant and the viability of the building's rehabilitation is unknown;
- Although no measures have been undertaken to protect or stabilize the wall, the building has not sustained any further collapse in the last six months and therefore clearly meets the ordinance definition of soundness;
- State and Federal Historic Tax Credits would be available to assist in the restoration of the historic building.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the Director's denial of the demolition due the building's status as a "High Merit" structure, and that it is considered sound under the definition of Ordinance #64832. The motion was made by Board member David Visintainer. Mr. Robinson seconded the motion. The motion passed with none opposed.

An applicant may request review of the above provisional decision to the Planning Commission. Such requests shall be in writing and delivered by certified or registered mail, within thirty (30) days of receipt of this letter to the Planning Commission in care of the Director of the Planning Office at 1520 Market Street, Suite 2000 St. Louis, MO 63103. A copy of the request must also be sent to the Director of the Cultural Resources office located at the same address and noted above.