

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES
APRIL 25, 2016**

Board Members Present

Richard Callow - Chairman
Dave Visintainer
Melanie Fathman
Mike Killeen
Anthony Robinson
Dave Richardson
Erin Wright
Nate Johnson
Alderman Terry Kennedy

Legal Counsel

Barbara Birkicht

Cultural Resources Office Staff Present

Betsy Bradley, Director
Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator
Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner
Bob Bettis, Preservation Planner
Adona Buford, Administrative Assistant

Board Member David Richardson moved to approve the March 28, 2016 minutes. Mr. Visintainer seconded the motion. The motion passed. Chairman Richard Callow moved to accept the current Agenda, hearing no objections, the motion passed.

PRELIMINARY REVIEWS

B. 2016.0622 2415 SOUTH 7TH STREET SOULARD HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Klitzing Welsch Associates – Joe Klitzing

COMMERCIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to demolish 2415-17 S 7th and 721 Victor Street and construct an apartment building.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

APRIL 25, 2016

Page 2 of 11

PROCEEDINGS:

On April 25, 2016, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a Preliminary Review of Demolitions of 2403, 2405, 2415-17 S. 7th Boulevard and 921 Victor Street and construction of an apartment building at 2415 S. 7th Boulevard in the Soulard Local Historic District. The Preliminary Review application was submitted by Joe Klitzing of KlitzingWelsch on behalf of Whistler One L.L. C. Board members Richard Callow (Chair), Alderman Terry Kennedy, Nate Johnson, Melanie Fathman, David Visintainer, Anthony Robinson, Mike Killeen, David Richardson and Erin Wright were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Cultural Resources Office Director Betsy Bradley described the properties proposed for demolition and the proposal for a five-story apartment building of 118 units with 89 on-site parking spaces which would extend on St. 7th from Barton to Victor Streets, and along much of Victor.

She described the Merit and non-contributing properties proposed for demolition and noted that the small industrial and commercial buildings would be difficult to convert to new uses and do not represent the mid-nineteenth century housing that is significant in the Soulard Historic District. She referred to the agenda which reviews the demolition review criteria in Ordinances #64689 and #64832 and the Soulard Historic District Standards. She also referred to the Soulard Historic District Standards for new construction and described the proposed building, identified the Model Example used for its design, and design features that reduced the visual impact of its scale.

Ms. Bradley reported that she had received two letters about this project. An email from Alderman Jack Coatar supported the proposal. Soulard Luann Denton expressed concern about the scale of the building and the difference in the scale of it and other residential properties.

Joe Klitzing, representing the applicant, spoke briefly about the project.

Lillian Thompson, a resident of Soulard, expressed concern over the visual impact of the large building and the quality of life that could be affected by so many new residents. Rick Radford, a

Soulard resident, noted concern about the effects of so many new residents and suggested that the new building be smaller.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the buildings and structures proposed for demolition are a mix of Merit resources and un-protected ones. Yet they do not convey strongly the architecture and history of the Soulard Neighborhood that has been recognized as significant as the earliest surviving residential neighborhood in the city;
- the circa 1920s buildings at 921 Victor and 2403 S. 7th are contributing resources to the Soulard Neighborhood Local and National Historic District due to their age and therefore are Merit buildings. The Victor Iron Works complex of buildings and storage yard structures are identified as contributing to the Soulard Historic district and therefore is a Merit property. The dates of construction of the later buildings on the iron works property have not been determined and could be before or after the 1929 cut-off. The 1950s building on the 921 Victor property is a non-contributing building and therefore is not in a protected category;
- the buildings are Sound, in terms of the Ordinance;
- there is no evidence that any of the buildings would have to be reconstructed to be put back into use;
- there is no evidence that the demolition of these properties would be directly related to the preservation of other buildings in need of rehabilitation;
- the locations of the properties in a National Register historic district means that historic tax credits could be used to fund rehabilitation projects, except for the building at the corner of Victor and S. 9th. Yet the nature of the buildings and the limitations of historic tax credit program standards would hamper the redevelopment of both properties for new uses in Soulard;
- the demolition of the existing buildings and construction of the proposed apartment building would have a significant effect on urban design of the block and frontage on S. 7th and Victor, in particular. The varied character of the S. 7th and Victor blockfronts would be replaced by uniform blockfronts.
- the proposed new construction is a five-story apartment building consisting of 118 units and 89 on-site parking spaces. The building responds to the intent of the New Construction section of the Soulard Historic District Standards, while not meeting every standard. An industrial building with large

windows filled with industrial sash is the Model Example for the building, which has similar fenestration;

- the building has a scale that is seldom seen in Soulard, but is on the same block as the large-scale Polar Wave complex and across the street from Humboldt School. The height of the building would approximate that of the taller portion of the Polar Wave complex. Design elements have been introduced to reduce the visual effects of the scale and height;
- the façade materials, as well as returns on non-street-facing elevations, will be two colors of brick, and meet the standards for façade materials. The materials for the fifth story and for the private facades of the building do not meet the standards;
- the design of how to handle the grade change, site work, walls and fences, accessibility, sidewalks and steps, landscaping, and lighting has not yet been determined;
- a review of the Soulard Historic District New Construction Standards indicates that the proposed new building meets the requirement to be architecturally compatible with the existing block face as to building setbacks, scale, articulation and rhythm, overall architectural character and general use of exterior materials or colors;
- the proposed construction would require a zoning change and would begin within one year; and that
- while the proposed new construction would require the demolition of Merit buildings and structures, the review of the demolition review criteria points to challenges for rehabilitation of the existing buildings. The proposed new construction is sufficient reason to approve the demolitions.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval to the proposal with the stipulations that demolition permits be approved after a building permit for the new construction has been applied for and that final drawings, site work elements, details, materials and colors be reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office staff. The motion was made by Board Member David Richardson made the motion, and seconded by Nate Johnson. The motion carried with eight members voting in favor of it.

C. 2015.2069 2212-2230 SHENANDOAH MCKINLEY HEIGHTS HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Affordable City Homes of St. Louis Inc.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

APRIL 25, 2016

Page 5 of 11

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct five detached single-family houses.

PROCEEDINGS: On April 25, 2016, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a Preliminary Application to construct five detached single-family houses, at 2212 to 2230 Shenandoah Avenue, in the McKinley Fox Local Historic District. The application was submitted by Larry Rowles, the representative of the project developer, Affordable City Homes of St. Louis, Inc. Board members Richard Callow (Chair); David Visintainer; Michael Killeen; Nathaniel Johnson; David Richardson; Melanie Fathman; Erin Wright; Anthony Robinson and Alderman Terry Kennedy were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #67901, which sets forth the standards for residential new construction in the McKinley Fox Local Historic District. She testified that the project was to be constructed on a vacant site and would include one accessible unit. The design of the buildings is based upon a historic Model Example at 2254 Shenandoah and the project was generally in compliance with the Standards. She also stated that the developer had agreed to comply with the Cultural Resources Office conditions, including full brick gables on the end units and to add a frieze board trim to the other side elevations. Ms. Cameron introduced a letter from 7th Ward Alderman Jack Coatar, in support of the project with the Cultural Resources Office's stipulations.

Larry Rowles, project representative, spoke in support of the project, and responded to questions from the Board.

Rocco Danna, Vice President of the McKinley Heights Neighborhood Association, spoke in general support of the project, but noted that the Model Example had a front parapet which these designs do not, and that such parapets were predominant in the historic district. He requested that the buildings be redesigned to include parapets.

FINDINGS OF FACTS: The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed site for construction, 2212 to 2230 Shenandoah Avenue, is located in the McKinley Heights Local Historic District;
- the proposed massing, scale, and proportions of the buildings are appropriate for its site and compatible with adjacent buildings; and that
- the design for the new building uses a Model Example, 2254 Shenandoah, as a Model Example, as required by the McKinley Heights standards; however, the proposed design deviates from the Model Example as it lacks raking parapets that flank the roof slopes.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval of the application for the new construction, with the stipulation that the front elevations be redesigned to include parapet extensions consistent with the Model Example and other buildings in the district; and that final plans and materials will be reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office. The motion was made by Board member Nate Johnson and seconded by Mr. Killeen. The motion passed with all Board Members voting in favor and none opposed.

D. 2016.0540 3333 MISSOURI AVENUE BENTON PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Lucas Singorelli
Applicant: John Killeen

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct a small single-family house.

PROCEEDINGS: On April 25, 2016, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a Preliminary Application to construct a single-family house, at 3335 Missouri Avenue, in the Benton Park Local Historic District. The application was submitted by the project developer, John Killeen.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), David Visintainer, Mike Killeen, David Richardson, Nate Johnson, Anthony Robinson, Erin Wright, Alderman Terry Kennedy and Melanie Fathman were present for the testimony for this agenda item. Board member

Michael Killeen recused himself from the discussion and vote for this project.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #67175, which sets forth the standards for residential new construction in the Benton Park Local Historic District. He testified that the project was a contemporary interpretation of a historic Model Example at 3333 Missouri Ave., was generally in compliance with the Standards.

The Benton Park Neighborhood Association submitted a letter in support of the project.

John Killeen, the property developer, spoke in support of the project.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed site for construction, 3335 Missouri Avenue, is located in the Benton Park Local Historic District;
- the design for the new building uses the Model Example as a basis for “comparison and as a source of ideas for ... new construction” and introduces contemporary design while referencing the form, scale and material of the Model Example; and that
- the proposed massing, scale, and proportions of the building is appropriate for its site and compatible with adjacent buildings. The design is compatible as a contemporary design within the context of the block and district.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval for the new construction, with the stipulation that details and specifications are submitted to the Cultural Resources Office for review and final plans and exterior materials are approved by the Cultural Resources Office. The motion was made by Board member Erin Wright and seconded by Alderman Kennedy. The motion passed unanimously.

APPEALS OF DENIALS

F. 2016.0424 1303 SIDNEY STREET SOULARD HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Rick Radford

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

APRIL 25, 2016

Page 8 of 11

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of a staff denial of a building permit application to construct two decks.

PROCEEDINGS: On April 25, 2016, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial of a building permit application to construct a two-story deck, at 1303 Sidney Street in the Soulard Park Local Historic District. The owner submitted the appeal.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), David Visintainer, David Richardson, Anthony Robinson, Alderman Terry Kennedy, Nate Johnson, Mike Killeen, Erin Wright and Melanie Fathman were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Andrea Gagen of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #62382, which sets forth the standards for appendages in the Soulard Local Historic District.

Ms. Gagen entered into the record certified copies of Ordinances #64689, as amended by #64925, and #57078 as amended by #62382; the Board agenda and the PowerPoint presentation for 1303 Sidney St.; and the building permit application.

Rick Radford, owner and appellant, testified in support of the project and explained his reasons for wanting the two-story deck. He also used a PowerPoint presentation and submitted a copy of that presentation into the record.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 1303 Sidney Street is located in the Soulard Local Historic District;
- the owner proposes to construct a two-story deck between the buildings at 1301 and 1303 Sidney St.;
- the owner owns both buildings;
- the historic district standards require that appendages be reconstructed or based on a Model Example; and that
- the proposed deck does not comply with the historic district standards.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

APRIL 25, 2016

Page 9 of 11

BOARD DECISION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the Director's denial of the building permit application to construct a two-story deck subject to scaled drawings being submitted that are pursuant to his testimony, as the deck will be minimally visible due to the narrow width of the gangway. The motion was made by Board Member Mike Killeen and seconded by Mr. Richardson. The motion passed 7-1, with Board Member David Visintainer opposed.

G. 2016.0168 4530 McPHERSON CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Jacqueline Henmi

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of a staff denial of a building permit application to replace an existing retaining wall.

PROCEEDINGS: On April 25, 2016, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial of a building permit application to construct two retaining walls, at 4530 McPherson Avenue in the Central West End Local Historic District. The owner submitted the appeal.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), David Visintainer, David Richardson, Anthony Robinson, Nate Johnson, Alderman Terry Kennedy, Erin Wright, Mike Killeen and Melanie Fathman were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #69423, which sets forth the standards historic buildings in the Central West End Local Historic District.

Mr. Bettis entered into the record certified copies of Ordinances #64689, as amended by #64925, and #69423; the Board agenda and the PowerPoint presentation for 4530 McPherson Avenue; and the building permit application.

No one was present to represent the owner or contacted the Cultural Resources Office to indicate that no one could attend the meeting.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

APRIL 25, 2016

Page 10 of 11

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 4530 McPherson Avenue is located in the Central West End Local Historic District;
- the retaining walls were constructed without a permit;
- the original slope of the front terrace had been altered previously by a non-compliant wood railroad tie retaining wall;
- the standards require that when a non-compliant wall is removed, the original grade of the property be returned if feasible; the appellant has not submitted evidence that the original grade cannot be restored;
- the standards also clearly state that if a “tie-wall” requires replacement, a more appropriate – different – material must be used; and that
- the retaining wall is highly visible and disrupts a long stretch of original earth terraces with slopes adjacent to the sidewalk.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the Director's denial of the building permit, as the constructed retaining walls did not comply with the Central West End Historic District standards. The motion was made by Board Member Mike Killeen and seconded by Mr. Visintainer. The motion passed unanimously.

SPECIAL AGENDA ITEMS

Nominations to the National Register of Historic Places

**H. Locust Street Automotive District Boundary Increase II
2722-2900 Locust Street**

ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the Missouri State Historic Preservation Office that the Locust Street Automotive District Boundary Increase II meets the requirements for the listing on the National Register. The motion was made by Board member Anthony Robinson and seconded by Mr. Visintainer. The motion passed.

I. Mansion House Center Historic District/ 200-444 N. Fourth Street

ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the Missouri State Historic Preservation Office that the Mansion House Center Historic District meets the requirements for the listing on the National Register. The motion was made by Board member Anthony Robinson and seconded by

Mr. Visintainer. Chairman Callow and David Richardson recused themselves. Mike Killeen opposed. The motion passed.

J.

ACTION:

Midwest Terminal Building/ 700-720 N. Tucker Boulevard

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the Missouri State Historic Preservation Office that the Midwest Terminal Building meets the requirements for the listing on the National Register. The motion was made by Board member Anthony Robinson and seconded by Mr. Visintainer. Chairman Callow recused himself. The motion passed.

K.

ACTION:

St. Louis Mart and Terminal Warehouse/ 1222 Spruce Street

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the Missouri State Historic Preservation Office that the St. Louis Mart and Terminal Warehouse meets the requirements for the listing on the National Register. The motion was made by Board member Anthony Robinson and seconded by Mr. Visintainer. The motion passed.