

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES
APRIL 28, 2014**

Board Members Present

Alderman Craig Schmid
Anthony Robinson
Melanie Fathman
David Richardson
Dave Visintainer
Nate Johnson
Mike Killeen
Erin Wright

Legal Counsel

Barbara Birkicht

Cultural Resources Office Staff Present

Betsy H. Bradley, Director
Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator
Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner
Bob Bettis, Preservation Planner
Adona Buford, Administrative Assistant

Board member David Richardson, as acting chairman, called the roll. Alderman Craig Schmid moved to approve the current Agenda. Mr. Killeen seconded. Mr. Visintainer moved to approve the March 2014 minutes. Ms. Wright seconded the motion. Both motions passed. The date of the next Preservation Board meeting was announced to be May 19, 2014.

PRELIMINARY REVIEWS

A. 2014.0419 1315 DOLMAN ST. LAFAYETTE SQUARE HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Vedad & Asmira Alagic
Applicant: Edin Coralic, LLC

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct a single-family dwelling.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

APRIL 28, 2014

Page 2 of 13

PROCEEDINGS:

On April 28, 2014 the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a Preliminary Review for a proposal for a new two-story single-family house at 1315 Dolman St., in the Lafayette Square Local Historic District. The architect, Edin Coralic, submitted the application.

Board members David Richardson, acting Chairman, Alderman Craig Schmid, Erin Wright, Nate Johnson, David Visintainer, Michael Killeen, Melanie Fathman, and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the section of City Ordinance #69112, which sets forth the standards for new residential construction in the Lafayette Square Local Historic District. He testified that the project was generally in compliance with the Standards.

Vedad Alagic, the owner, testified on behalf of the project.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 1315 Dolman St. is located in the Lafayette Square Local Historic District on a block of Dolman where significant demolition has taken place;
- the applicant has proposed an Historic Model Example for the new house, 2331 Hickory, which has been approved by the Cultural Resources Office;
- the applicant proposes to construct a dwelling with a façade that is the mirror image of the façade of the example, and replicate its entrance, fenestration pattern, recessed entry, and cornice design;
- the applicant proposes all four sides of the house to be brick, to use scored concrete as the foundation, and to meet the materials and design requirements for the entrance and windows;
- the siting of the house would be in alignment with the historic four-family and new construction to the north; and
- the finished project would include a fence and garage to be built behind the house.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

APRIL 28, 2014

Page 3 of 13

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant Preliminary approval of the proposed new construction, with the condition that the design be developed as proposed and that design details will be reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office to ensure compliance with the district standards. Board Member Visintainer made the motion to grant approval, which was seconded by Board Member Robinson. The motion passed unanimously with seven board members voting.

B. 2014.0516 4100 LINDELL BLVD. 4100-4300 LINDELL HISTORIC DISTRICT
2014.0517 4108 LINDELL BLVD. 4100-4300 LINDELL HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: St. Louis Housing Authority

Applicant: TLG 4100 Lindell Partners

COMMERCIAL PLAN:

Preliminary review to demolish 4108 and rehabilitate 4100 Lindell Blvd.

PROCEEDINGS:

On April 28, 2014, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider the Preliminary Review of the demolition of a building at 4108 Lindell and the rehabilitation of the building at 4100 Lindell for commercial and residential uses. The properties are located in the 41XX-43XX Lindell Local Historic District and a Preservation Review District. The Lawrence Group, on behalf of TLG 4100 Lindell Partners LLC, submitted the application. The LLC has just closed on the purchase of both properties.

Acting Chairman David Richardson, Alderman Craig Schmid, Anthony Robinson, Erin Wright, Melanie Fathman, Nate Johnson, David Visintainer and Michael Killeen were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Cultural Resources Office Director Betsy Bradley made a presentation that examined criteria for demolition set forth in Ordinances 64689 and 64832 for Preservation Review Districts, as there are no demolition criteria in the 41XX-43XX Lindell Local Historic District Standards. She also reviewed the standards for new construction, which for this local district are those of the Central West End Form Based Zoning overlay, and the standards for the

rehabilitation of an existing commercial building in the 41XX-43XX Lindell Local Historic District Standards.

Steve Smith spoke on behalf of the Lawrence Group and explained the history of the project, and stated that with only 11 off-street parking spaces, the project would not be financed. He also stated that the demolition of 4108 Lindell, which has a severe mold problem, would make rehabilitation of the building particularly costly, and the parking that could be placed on that lot was essential to making the 4100 Lindell project viable. Mr. Smith reported that the variances needed for the project will be considered by the Board of Adjustment on May 7, 2014.

Brooks Goedeker, representing the Park Central Development Corporation active in the 17th Ward, stated that during the Development Committee's consideration of the project, no one objected to the demolition of 4108 Lindell.

Harold Karabell, representing the West Pine Laclede Neighborhood Association, stated that the group supported this proposal for 4100 Lindell and did not object to the demolition of 4108 Lindell.

Michael Allen, representing the Modern STL organization, read a statement presenting the organization's support of the recommendation of the Cultural Resources Office regarding the denial of the proposed demolition of 4108 Lindell. He stated that Modern STL recognizes the importance of all Mid-Century Modern buildings on Lindell as they provide context for the most significant buildings and collectively define the importance of the architecture on Lindell Boulevard.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

Concerning the proposed demolition of 4108 Lindell, the Preservation Board found that:

- 4108 Lindell, an office building erected in 1948, is a Merit property located in the 4100-4300 Lindell Local Historic district and a Preservation Review District;
- there is currently no Redevelopment Plan adopted by ordinance that includes this property;
- the office building has the appearance of being sound, in terms of the definition of the ordinance;

- recent rehabilitation projects indicate that properties in the local historic district are undergoing upgrading;
- the reuse potential of this modest commercial building is supported by the variety of uses allowed in the existing zoning (H, Area Commercial) and the nature of Lindell Boulevard;
- the economic feasibility of the rehabilitation of 4108 is affected by the extensive mold in the building and cost of that remediation, as well as the fact that historic tax credits are not likely to be available to help finance a rehabilitation project, although there is more latitude in interior changes in a non-tax credit project;
- 4108 Lindell has a role in urban design and its loss would affect the intact rhythm and continuity, as well as density and integrity, of the block and local historic district;
- the owner is proposing, as new construction, a surface parking lot edged by a masonry street wall;
- the standards for new construction in the 4100-4300 Lindell Local Historic District defer entirely to the Central West End Form Based District Standards;
- the proposed surface parking lot would require variances from the Board of Adjustment of the city of St. Louis, and not this body, as it is not allowed per the Central West End Form Based District Standards Applicability Section and would not meet the three-story minimum height standard for new construction;
- the criteria for subsequent new construction is not met as the proposed redevelopment of the site would not comply with current zoning requirements, would not equal or exceed the contribution of the structure to the integrity of the existing streetscape and block face and would not meet the local historic district standards for new construction;
- the commonly-controlled property criteria, meant to support existing businesses and uses, is not met although providing parking for new uses resulting from a rehabilitation project is similar in intent; and
- the accessory structure criterion is not applicable.

Concerning the rehabilitation of 4100 Lindell, the Preservation Board found that:

- 4100 Lindell is located in the 41XX-43XX Lindell Local Historic District, which has standards for the rehabilitation of existing commercial buildings;
- many of the project components have not been provided in enough detail at this time to assess whether they meet the standards;
- the proposed canopy-sheltered ATM facility extending from the rear, south, façade of the building meets the standards for an addition in its small scale; the design of the canopy can not yet be assessed for meeting the standards;
- the proposal of two curb cuts on Sarah, where there are currently none, does not meet the local historic district standards. As Sarah is a secondary street, and as the existing alley-only access to the parking lot is somewhat unusual, new curb cuts are possible but the ratio of curb cut to sidewalk should be further studied; and
- landscaping of the parking area and along the proposed street wall on 4108 should be reviewed with the Cultural Resources Office in order to meet the standards and requirements.

Concerning the overall project, the Board found that:

- the recently adopted Preliminary Review Policy that mandates the consideration of a project as it moves from general to specific approvals, suggests that the adoption of a Redevelopment Plan by ordinance and the approval of variances needed per the Form Based Zoning overlay might well be resolved prior to the Preservation Board's consideration of any formal application ; and
- that the applicant made a credible argument for the strength of the overall project, the hardships that would be involved with both the redevelopment of 4108 Lindell due to the unavailability of historic tax credits and the remediation of extensive mold, and the

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

APRIL 28, 2014

Page 7 of 13

difficulty of going forward with the rehabilitation of 4100 Lindell without sufficient parking.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant Preliminary approval of the proposed demolition of 4108 Lindell and rehabilitation of 4100 Lindell, subject to the following conditions:

- that a redevelopment plan for the project that includes the demolition of 4108 Lindell must be approved prior to the approval of a demolition permit for that property;
- that a building permit for the rehabilitation of 4100 Lindell must be applied for prior to the approval of a demolition permit for 4108 Lindell, and
- the Cultural Resources Office must approve the proposed landscaping of the parking lot and the terrace in front of the street wall.

The motion was made by Alderman Schmid and seconded by Mr. Robinson. The motion passed with five Board Members voting in favor of the motion and Board Members Killeen and Johnson voting against it.

The motion was made by Alderman Craig Schmid and seconded by Mr. Robinson. The motion passed with five Board Members voting in favor of the motion and Board Members Mike Killeen and Nate Johnson voting against it.

C. 2014.0400 5010-32 GRAVOIS AVE. ST. LOUIS CITY PARK

Owner: City of St. Louis Parks Division

Applicant: Sebilj Fountain c/o Samir Niksic & Sadik Kukic and Alderwoman Carol Howard

COMMERCIAL PLAN:

Preliminary review to construct three (3) monument structures in a City park

PROCEEDINGS:

On April 28, 2014, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a preliminary application to construct three monument structures at 5010-5032 Gravois Avenue, a City Park located in Ward 14 and the Bevo Mill Neighborhood, at the intersection of Gravois and Morgan Ford Avenues.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

APRIL 28, 2014

Page 8 of 13

Board members, David Richardson (Acting Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, Erin Wright, David Visintainer, Michael Killeen, Anthony Robinson, Melanie Fathman and Nate Johnson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the requirements of Ordinance 64689, Part VI — Public Structures, Monuments and Fixtures, Section 52, which states that all structures constructed in public parks shall be submitted to the Preservation Board for approval. She reported that the project appeared to be appropriate in scale and materials for the park.

Hon. Carol H. Howard, 14th Ward Alderwoman, testified on behalf of the project, stating that the project had neighborhood support.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed site for the monuments, 5010-5032 Gravois, is a City Park, recently-acquired and minimally improved, with no permanent structures;
- the site is directly south of Bevo Mill and the Bevo Mill Commercial District National Register District, but at some distance beyond a large intersection, and therefore will have minimal impact upon these historic resources;
- The proposed structures, while tall, are of a scale that appears appropriate for the site.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to convey to the Board of Public Service the Preservation Board's approval of the proposed project. The motion was made by Board member Erin Wright. Alderman Craig Schmid seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

APPEALS OF DENIALS

D. 2014.0318 2416 N. NEWSTEAD AVE. THE VILLE HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Virgil Properties, LLC
Applicant: Amigo Construction

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

APRIL 28, 2014

Page 9 of 13

COMMERCIAL PLAN: Appeal of a denial of a building permit application to enclose window openings with concrete block.

PROCEEDINGS: On April 28, 2014, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's denial of a building permit application to block several existing windows on a one-story brick commercial building at 2416 N. Newstead Avenue, in The Ville Local Historic District.

Board members, David Richardson (Acting Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, Erin Wright, David Visintainer, Michael Killeen, Anthony Robinson, Melanie Fathman and Nate Johnson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined The Ville Historic District Ordinance #60236, which sets forth the standards for rehabilitation in the local historic district. She testified that the standards required that architectural details on existing structures be compatible in design with existing details, and that the closure of these openings would have a negative effect upon the architectural character of this historic building. She reported that the Cultural Resources Office had received a complaint about the work and when it investigated, discovered the Building Division had issued an interior-only permit that mistakenly included exterior work to block in window openings. This permit was not referred to CRO. The Building Division rescinded the permit and the contractor was told to stop work immediately; however, the contractor did not stop, but completed blocking the windows. Ms Cameron also stated that the plans that were erroneously approved showed the windows being closed with brick, recessed 2 inches from the façade; the windows are closed with concrete masonry units, set even with the façade plane, and painted white.

Ms Cameron entered into the record submitted certified copies of City Ordinances #64689, 64932 and #60203; the Board agenda and the PowerPoint presentation for 2416 N. Newstead Avenue; and the building permit application,

including all construction documents.

Brian Virgil, owner of the building, testified on behalf of the project. He stated that several of the openings on both the north and west street façades had been closed for many years; that the renovations were for a full-service grocery that will occupy the building and security is a major concern. He also stated that the blocked openings were an improvement to the deteriorated windows that were there and that many of the building in the immediate vicinity of his building have been demolished in the last few years.

Marco Felix, of Amigo Construction, the contractor for the project, testified on his own behalf. Although he was told by the City by phone on Friday to stop all work, he said that he did not understand who was calling, and therefore did not stop work until the building inspector visited the site the following Monday. He also identified on photographs all the recent work that he had completed.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 2416 N. Newstead Avenue is a contributing building in The Ville Local Historic District;
- alterations made to the exterior of the building are not in compliance with the requirements of the historic district standards, and have resulted in significant alterations to the historic character of the building;
- although several of the openings were closed years ago, four original openings were closed as part of this project.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the Director's denial of the building permit application to block up the windows, but approved restoration of the two windows to either side of the main entry; installation of a new entry door of appropriate design; and painting of the remaining block closures (not including the terra cotta trim) a dark red color compatible with the original brick of the building. The motion was made by Alderman Craig Schmid. Ms. Fathman seconded the motion. The motion carried 6 to 1 with Mr. Killeen in opposition.

E. 2014.0375 4049 BOTANICAL AVE. SHAW HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: James H. Yemm

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of a denial of a building permit application to remove cornice on front façade.

PROCEEDINGS: On April 28, 2014, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial of a building permit application to remove a metal cornice and rebuild the front parapet at 4049 Botanical in the Shaw Neighborhood Local Historic District. The owner submitted the application and the appeal.

Acting Chairman David Richardson, Alderman Craig Schmid, David Visintainer, Erin Wright, Michael Killeen, Melanie Fathman, , Nate Johnson, and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the section of City Ordinance #59400, which sets forth the standards for residential rehabilitation in the Shaw Neighborhood Historic District. He testified that the project was not in compliance with the Standards as the removal of the original cornice without replacement is not allowed.

Mr. Bettis entered into the record certified copies of Ordinances #64689, #64932, #59400; the Board agenda and the PowerPoint presentation for 4049 Botanical; and the building permit application, including all construction documents.

James Yemm, the owner and appellant, testified on his own behalf, stating that the he could not afford to replace the cornice.

FINDINGS OF FACTS: The Preservation Board found that:

- 4049 Botanical is located in the Shaw Local Historic District;
- the property owner applied for a building permit to remove a damaged metal cornice;

- the proposed porch alterations do not conform to the Shaw Historic District Standards, would be highly visible from the street, and would have a negative effect upon the historic character and appearance of the building, and
- the two-family building is one of several investment properties owned by the applicant.

BOARD ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the Director's denial of the building permit. Board member Killeen made the motion, which was seconded by Board Member Fathman. The motion passed unanimously.

SPECIAL AGENDA ITEMS

Nominations to the National Register of Historic Places.

F. Bellefontaine Cemetery – 4947 W. Florissant Avenue

ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to direct staff to prepare a report for the Missouri State Historic Preservation Office that Bellefontaine Cemetery meets the requirements of Criterion C for Landscape Architecture. The motion was made by Board Member Fathman and seconded by Ms. Wright. The motion passed unanimously.

G. Woodward & Tiernan Printing Co. Bldg. – 1519 Tower Grove

ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to direct staff to prepare a report for the Missouri State Historic Preservation Office that the Woodward & Tiernan Printing Company Building meets the requirements of National Register Criteria C, Architecture. The motion was made by Alderman Craig Schmid and seconded by Mr. Robinson. The motion passed unanimously.

H. General Electric Supply Corp. Bldg. – 2653 Locust Street

ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to direct staff to prepare a report for the Missouri State Historic Preservation Office that the General Electric Supply Corp. Building meets the requirements of National Register Criteria C, Architecture. The motion was made by Board

Member Erin Wright and seconded by Mr. Johnson. The motion passed 6 to 1 with Mr. Robinson abstaining.

I. Dr. George Ashe Bronson Residence – 3201 Washington Ave

ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to direct staff to prepare a report for the Missouri State Historic Preservation Office that the Dr. George Ashe Bronson Residence meets the requirements of National Register Criteria C, Architecture. The motion was made by Alderman Craig Schmid and seconded by Mr. Robinson. The motion passed unanimously.

Acting Chairman David Richardson moved to adjourn the meeting. Hearing no objection, the meeting was adjourned.