

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES
MAY 18, 2015**

Board Members Present

Alderman Terry Kennedy, Acting Chairman

Melanie Fathman

Mike Killeen

Erin Wright

Nate Johnson

Anthony Robinson

Legal Counsel

Barbara Birkicht

Cultural Resources Office Staff Present

Betsy Bradley, Director

Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator

Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner

Bob Bettis, Preservation Planner

Adona Buford, Administrative Assistant

Board member Mike Killeen made a motion to nominate Alderman Terry Kennedy as acting Chairman, in the absence of Chairman Callow. Board member Nate Johnson seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

Mr. Killeen moved to approve the April 28, 2015 minutes. Ms. Fathman seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

Mr. Johnson moved to approve the current Agenda, Ms. Wright seconded the motion. This motion passed unanimously.

PRELIMINARY REVIEWS

A. 2015.0746 5539-51 PERSHING AVENUE CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: 5539 Pershing LLC

Applicant: Klitzing Welsch Architects

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

MAY 18, 2015

Page 2 of 14

COMMERCIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct a multi-story apartment building.

PROCEEDINGS: On May 18, 2015, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a Preliminary Review of a proposal to construct a five-story apartment building at 5539-51 Pershing Avenue, in the Central West End Local Historic District. Joseph Klitzing submitted the application on behalf of 5539 Pershing LC.

Board members Alderman Terry Kennedy (Chairman pro tem), Mike Killeen, Nate Johnson, Melanie Fathman, Erin Wright, and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony.

Betsy Bradley of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined sections of Ordinance #69423, the revised Rehabilitation and New Construction Standards for the Central West End Historic District. She stated that the property has been used as a pool and tennis club and a non-historic changing room structure would be the only building to be demolished for the new building. She testified that the proposed building, although it does not meet the standards for height, would have a height considered to be compatible within the immediate context where there are other five- and six-story apartment buildings. It would also be wider than the three-story flats that predominate on the blockfront, but the design of the new building would not be incompatible with the consistent blockfront created by these closely-spaced buildings. The proposed reconstruction of the terrace of the blockfront at this property and the adherence to the setback line meet the standards for location. The design complies in materials and fenestration. Ms. Bradley recommended approval of the project at this preliminary stage. She reported that Alderwoman Krewson and the Planning & Development Committee of the Central West End Association communicated their support of the project.

Joe Klitzing presented a board of the north elevation, which was not included in the elevations submitted for review and noted it would be similar to that of the side elevations with recessed balconies and cement board cladding.

FINDINGS OF FACTS: The Preservation Board found that:

- 5539-51 Pershing Avenue is located in the Central West End Historic District;

- the proposed five-story apartment building is contemporary in design and has a modulated façade that includes an off-center main entrance and circulation tower bay;
- the proposed five-story apartment building, although it does not meet the requirement in the standards for a new building height to be within 15 percent of the blockface, will face three buildings across Pershing, and another one to the west, of a height comparable to that proposed. Therefore the proposed height is considered to be compatible within the immediate context;
- the building, to be positioned on the terrace that unites the blockfront, will have floor levels similar to those of the building to the west;
- the building will have a street frontage wider than the buildings on the blockface but comparable to the properties mentioned above. Because the existing buildings on the blockfront present such a strong, unified street wall, the wider frontage of this building will not be a distinctly new visual element;
- the building will maintain the setback line and have projecting and recessed areas of the façade as do other buildings on the blockfront;
- the exterior materials proposed for the building include approximately half of the façade in two shades of brick with the color change related to the modulation of the bays. Cement board panels in two colors are proposed for the upper portions of the building. Accent materials include stone banding, metal balconies and aluminum or clad wood windows. Most of these materials are used widely in the district; similar panels have been approved on other contemporary designs;
- the fenestration both evokes existing patterns and is contemporary in design, and therefore compatible;
- the balconies on the apartment building are comparable to those on other buildings of contemporary design; and
- no accessory buildings or new curb cuts are proposed.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant approval of the Preliminary Review of the proposed new construction, with the condition that final drawings and exterior materials will be submitted to the Cultural Resources Office for review and

approval. Board member Melanie Fathman made the motion to grant approval, which was seconded by Board member Nate Johnson. The motion passed with all Board Members voting in favor of the motion and none opposing

B. 2015.0747 1024 MISSISSIPPI AVENUE LAFAYETTE SQUARE HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Errin R. Braddock

Applicant: Steve Coffey

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct an attached patio cover, fence .

PROCEEDINGS: On May 18, 2015, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a Preliminary Review for the construction of a street fence, barbecue/kitchen area and a patio cover to be constructed in the rear yard of 1024 Mississippi Avenue, located in the Lafayette Square Local and National Register Historic District. J. Steven Coffey, project architect, submitted the application. Board members Alderman Terry Kennedy (pro tem chair), Michael Killeen, Melanie Fathman, Erin Wright, Nathaniel Johnson and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the review criteria in City Ordinance #69423, Revised Rehabilitation and New Construction Standards for Ordinance #58768, which established the Lafayette Square Historic District. She stated that the owner wishes to have a permanent outdoor barbecue/kitchen and covered patio area at the rear of his property at the corner of Mississippi and LaSalle Street. He prefers not to enclose his yard with a privacy fence and gate, and is therefore proposing a street fence at the side property line, which will connect to a brick screen wall to hide the barbecue from view. As the fence would be only 4-1/2 feet in height and without a gate, Ms. Cameron noted that everything in the yard was therefore considered to be visible under the Standards. She agreed that the proposed location of the barbecue seemed the best alternative in this small yard, and that it would not be visible from the street. However, Ms. Cameron stated that the design, scale, materials and location of the glass-roofed patio

cover were not in compliance with the Standards and unlike any historic appendage in the District. She said she had discussed with the architect a pergola-like design with a flat roof as a way of reducing the scale and visibility of the structure, a suggestion that the owner did not wish to pursue. She recommended that the Board grant preliminary approval to the screen wall and fence: while they did not strictly follow a Historic Model Example, their design was generally compatible with other fences in the district. However, she recommended that the Board withhold preliminary approval of the proposed patio cover, which in design, scale and materials and location, was not in compliance with the requirements of the Standards.

J. Steven Coffey, architect, spoke in support of the project. He submitted photos of other appendages in the district which he felt were similar to what the owner was proposing. He stated that the design of the patio cover, and its glass roof, were intended to allow the property owner a sheltered area in his rear yard and to cover existing entries to the house and basement on that side. He stated the height of the roof ridge was required so that it could be attached to the house above the window heads, and that the glass roof would allow light into the windows that it covered.

Keith Houghton, Vice President of the Lafayette Square Restoration Committee [LSRC] and its Development Committee, stated that he had not had the opportunity to review the project prior to the meeting; but that it appeared the fence was appropriate. He stated that the patio cover was unacceptable and could not be supported by the LSRC.

Errin Braddock, owner of the property, spoke on his own behalf. He submitted additional photos of other properties in the Square and stated that the patio structure as designed would allow him to be able to enjoy his rear yard and grill.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 1024 Mississippi Avenue is a contributing resource to the Lafayette Square Historic District;
- because it is not behind a privacy fence, all elements of the rear yard are considered to be visible under the definition of the Standards;

- the small rear yard and corner location of the property present challenges for providing modern conveniences; Although the short brick wall is not based on a Historic Model Example, it will effectively screen the permanent barbecue;
- and given the limited size of the rear yard and its visibility, is the most appropriate means to hide it from street view;
- the fence is not based on a Historic Model Example as required by the Standards, but will be predominantly wrought-iron, a traditional material for street fences in the Square. With appropriately designed and scaled posts, fence can be considered appropriate; and that
- the proposed patio cover does not follow a Historic Model Example as the Standards require and is far from consistent in design, materials or scale with historic appendages in the district.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval to the proposed fence and screening wall with final details to be approved by the Cultural Resources Office; and to withhold preliminary approval for the proposed patio cover until a design is submitted that complies with a Historic Model Example. The motion was made by Board Member Melanie Fathman and seconded by Board Member Anthony Robinson. The motion passed with none opposed.

C. 2015.0558 4232 W. DR. MARTIN L. KING DRIVE THE VILLE HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Vandeventer Place, L.P.

Applicant: Edward English

COMMERCIAL PLAN:

Preliminary review to construct a fifty-four (54) unit senior living apartment building.

PROCEEDINGS:

On May 18, 2015, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a preliminary review application to construct a 54 unit independent senior living apartment building at 4232 West Dr. Martin Luther King Drive, in the Ville Local Historic District. The application was submitted by the architect on behalf of the developer.

Board members Mike Killeen, Alderman Terry Kennedy, Melanie Fathman, Nate Johnson, Erin Wright and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #67175, which sets forth the standards for residential new construction in the Ville Historic District. He testified that the project appeared generally to comply with the standards and recommended that the Board grant preliminary approval to the proposal. He stated that the Alderman was in support of the project.

Nancy Rodney, representing the developer, was present to speak on behalf of the project.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 4232 West Dr. Martin Luther King Drive, the proposed site for the 54 unit senior apartment building, is located in the Ville Local Historic District;
- the proposed design complies with all the requirements for new construction in the Ville Historic District Standards; and
- final material choices have not been made, but the applicant intends to comply with the requirements of the Historic District Standards.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval for the proposed new construction, with the stipulation that final plans and exterior details will be reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office to ensure compliance with the standards. The motion was made by Board Member Wright and seconded by Board Member Robinson. The motion passed with none opposed.

D. 2015.0639 4332 MCPHERSON AVENUE CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Matthew D. Foster

Applicant: Layne Do Construction Services

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

Preliminary review to construct a single family house.

PROCEEDINGS:

On May 18, 2015, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a preliminary review application to construct a single

family house at 4332 McPherson Avenue, in the Central West End Local Historic District. The application was submitted by Killeen Studios, the project architect, on behalf of the owner, Mathew Foster.

Board members Alderman Terry Kennedy, Melanie Fathman, Nate Johnson, Erin Wright and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item. Board Member Mike Killeen recused himself from this from this agenda item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #69423, which sets forth the standards for residential new construction in Central West End. He testified that the project appeared generally to comply with the standards and recommended that the Board grant preliminary approval to the proposal. He stated that the Alderman was in support of the project.

Mike Killeen, representing the owner, was present to speak on behalf of the project.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed site for construction, 4332 McPherson Avenue, is located in the Central West End Local Historic District;
- the siting, scale, proportions, fenestration, details and exterior materials comply with the Standards, and
- final material choices have not been made, but the applicant intends to comply with the requirements of the Historic District Standards.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval for the proposed new construction, with the stipulation that final plans and exterior details will be reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office to ensure compliance with the standards. The motion was made by Board Member Johnson and seconded by Board Member Fathman. The motion passed with none opposed.

APPEALS OF DENIALS

E. 4343 MCPHERSON AVENUE CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DISTRICT

Withdrawn per Applicant's request.

**F. 2015.0060 744 SOUTH 4TH STREET SOUTH. 4TH STREET COMMERCIAL
2015.0062 750 SOUTH 4TH STREET NATIONAL REGISTER DISTRICT**

Owner: 800 4th Street LLC – Terrence McDonald

Applicant: Bellon Salvage and Rehabbing – Don Bellon

DEMOLITION PLAN: Appeal of a denial of a demolition permit application to demolish two commercial buildings.

PROCEEDINGS: On May 18, 2015, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial of demolition permits for two commercial buildings at 744-46 and 750-52 S. 4th Street. The buildings, owned by Terrence C. McDonald, 800 4th Street LLC, are contributing properties in the South Fourth Street Commercial Historic District listed in the National Register of Historic Places.

Board members Alderman Terry Kennedy (Chairman pro tem), Mike Killeen, Nate Johnson, Melanie Fathman, Erin Wright, and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony.

Betsy Bradley of the Cultural Resources Office submitted certified copies of Ordinances #64689, #64832 and # 64925, the long agenda item and her PowerPoint presentation into the record of this appeal. She noted that the district was listed in the National Register in 2006 when the properties were owned by another entity. Ms. Bradley reviewed all of the demolition review criteria, addressing both buildings. She noted the different conditions of the buildings and challenges in their rehabilitation and reuse. She concluded by noting that no unusual circumstances were known that would suggest that demolition should be approved for either 744-46, a High Merit building or 750-52, a Merit building.

Winthrop B. Reed, representing Mr. McDonald, made a PowerPoint presentation and supplied printed copies for the record. He noted the failed Chivvis project for the buildings, the

banners of which remain on the front of 744-46; the challenging location of the buildings in maintaining them secure; and the attempts that have been made to eliminate the frequent tagging that mars the buildings. He stated that, even though listed in the National Register, the buildings are not particularly distinctive and that in particular the 1950 building, 750-52, is undistinguished. He noted the high visibility of the buildings to drivers exiting I-64 into downtown. While Mr. Reed agreed that the buildings met the definition of sound in Ordinance #64689, the buildings are in poor condition. He presented cost estimates from McClain Construction for renovations to the buildings without any interior finishes. The proposal for 744-46 was \$501,228 and for 750-52 was \$416,630. Mr. Reed also provided figures with a 20 percent reduction based on the use of historic tax credits.

Mr. McDonald spoke about his history with the properties and assessment of the area for reuse of the buildings. While he presented no firm plans, he reported that he would like to do something with 744-46, and stated that this would be easier to accomplish with 750-52 demolished. The removal of 750-52 would allow better access to 744-46 to assess its condition and stabilization needs, and would eliminate a property that occupies so much of the lot that support services cannot be located on it. He spoke of perhaps being able to save 744-46 and also of possibly erecting a new building on the site of 750-52.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 744-46 S. 4th is an important contributing property in the South Fourth Commercial Historic District, one that clearly conveys the historical and architectural significance of the National Register historic district. It is considered to be High Merit Building;
- 750-52 S. 4th, while officially a contributing property in the South 4th Commercial Historic District, was built considerably later than the rest of the buildings in the district. Its value in the streetscape may be more important than its individual significance as a commercial/industrial building. It is considered to be a Merit Building;
- both buildings are Sound, in terms of the Ordinance;
- 744-46 displays deferred maintenance and a small collapse at the S. 4th Street cornice line that will expand if not repaired;
- 750-52 is unsecured and exposed to unauthorized occupation and vandalism;

- the buildings in the South Fourth Street Commercial Historic District are located in a highly visible area with a varied character;
- both buildings are important in the streetscape assembly, as well as for its integrity and density;
- the small size of 744-46 allows the rest of the parcel behind the building to be used for parking and thereby could afford some income to the owner;
- the availability of parking on the sites, and on the now cleared block to the south also owned by the appellant, supports the assertion that there is some reuse potential for the buildings;
- the reversal of the deteriorated conditions and rehabilitation for new use should be considered in terms of the availability of state and/or federal historic tax credits;
- for both buildings, the criteria for commonly controlled property and accessory structures are not applicable;
- while the owner presented general possibilities for the buildings, the lack of a firm plan for the demolition of 750-52 followed by new construction and a commitment to the rehabilitation of 744-76 makes the proposal too tenuous to be the basis of the approval of demolition; and that
- Ordinance #64689 states that the demolition of buildings in the High Merit and Merit categories shall not be approved except in unusual circumstances that shall be expressly noted and no such circumstances have been identified.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the Director's Denial of the demolition of 744-76 and 750-52 S. 4th Street, located in the South Fourth Street Commercial National Register Historic District. Board member Mike Killeen made the motion, which was seconded by Board member Nate Johnson. The motion passed with all six Board Members voting in favor of the motion and none opposing it.

G. 2015.0533 3107 SHENANDOAH AVENUE COMPTON HILL HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: John Colbert and Jan R. Clinite

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of a building permit application to replace the finial on top of roof structure.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

MAY 18, 2015

Page 12 of 14

PROCEEDINGS:

On May 18, 2015, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial of a building permit application to install a larger turret cap, at 3107 Shenandoah in the Compton Hill Local Historic District. The owner submitted the appeal.

Board members Alderman Terry Kennedy, Erin Wright, Mike Killeen, Anthony Robinson, and Melanie Fathman were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Andrea Gagen of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #57702, which sets forth the standards for residential rehabilitation in the Compton Hill Local Historic District. She testified that the project was not in compliance with the Standards as the proposed turret cap would be larger than the original cap and noticeably alter the appearance of the building.

Ms. Gagen entered into the record certified copies of Ordinances #64689, as revised by #64925, and #57702; the Agenda as presented, the PowerPoint presentation for 3107 Shenandoah; and the building permit application. She also submitted into the record an email from Alderman Jack Coatar supporting the project.

Jan Clinite, one of the owners of the property, testified on her own behalf, stating the reasons they believed the proposed cap was the best solution to their water infiltration problem. She submitted a packet of information into the record, including a letter from the Compton Hill Neighborhood Improvement Association. Alderman Jack Coatar testified in support of the project. Mrs. Clinite's husband, John Colbert, acknowledged his support of the project and his wife's testimony.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 3107 Shenandoah is located in the Compton Hill Local Historic District;
- the existing turret has a water infiltration problem related to the small slate tiles at the peak which attempts at repair have not corrected;
- the proposed turret cap replicates the design of the original, but not its size; and that

- due to the difficulty and cost in replacing the small slate tiles on that area of the roof, the larger cap is intended as a practical solution to the turret's water problem.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the Director's Denial of the building as the proposed turret cap will not have a significant impact on the character of the building. Board Member Killeen made the motion, which was seconded by Board Member Robinson. The motion passed with all Board Members voting in favor.

SPECIAL AGENDA ITEM

Landmark Petition to Designate 3130 Hickory Street, Ward 19
Maya Angelou Birthplace, as a City Landmark.

PETITIONERS:

Rhonda M. Wright

PROCEEDINGS:

On May 18, 2015, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a proposed City Landmark Designation.

Board members, Alderman Terry Kennedy (Chairman pro tem), Melanie Fathman, Nate Johnson, Erin Wright, Mike Killeen and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Chairman Pro Tem Alderman Kennedy moved to convene as a public hearing to hear a presentation regarding a Petition to designate the Maya Angelou Birthplace as a Landmark. Ms. Fathman seconded the motion. The hearing was opened.

Ms. Betsy Bradley, Director of the Cultural Resources Office presented a PowerPoint presentation and the Petition and recommended support of the proposed landmark.

BOARD ACTION:

Board Member Anthony Robinson moved to approve the Petition to designate the Maya Angelou Birthplace as a Landmark. Ms. Fathman seconded the motion, which passed with six Board Members voting in favor of the motion and none voting against it.

Anthony Robinson moved that a Board Bill be prepared to send to the Board of Aldermen designating the site as a Landmark. Ms.

Fathman seconded the motion. The motion passed with six Board Members voting in favor of the motion and none voting against it.