

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES
MAY 19TH, 2014**

Board Members Present

Richard Callow, Chairman
Alderman Craig Schmid
Anthony Robinson
David Richardson
Dave Visintainer
Nate Johnson
Erin Wright

Legal Counsel

Barbara Birkicht

Cultural Resources Office Staff Present

Betsy H. Bradley, Director
Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator
Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner
Bob Bettis, Preservation Planner
Adona Buford, Administrative Assistant

Chairman Richard Callow called the roll. Seven (7) members were present. Alderman Craig Schmid moved to approve the current Agenda and the April 28, 2014 minutes. Ms. Wright seconded the motion. The motion passed.

PRELIMINARY REVIEWS

A.	2014.0431	5570 S. BROADWAY -154 E. ELWOOD ST.	SOUTH BROADWAY BLUFFS LANDMARK DISTRICT
-----------	------------------	--	--

Owner: City of St. Louis Parks and Recreation

Applicant: Access Engineering, LLC & Great Rivers Greenway

COMMERCIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct a new biking/pedestrian trail in Bellerive & Sister Marie Charles parks.

PROCEEDINGS: On May 19, 2014, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to

consider a preliminary application to construct a biking and pedestrian trail through Bellerive Park, at 5570 S Broadway and improvements to Sister Marie Charles Park, at 154 E. Elwood Street; both are located in Ward 11 and the Carondelet Neighborhood. Bellerive Park is also located within the boundaries of the South Broadway Bluffs, City Landmark #43.

Board members Richard Callow (Chairman), David Richardson, Alderman Craig Schmid, Erin Wright, David Visintainer, Anthony Robinson and Nate Johnson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the requirements of Ordinance 64689, Part II — Existing historic districts and landmarks, which states that the Preservation Board shall consider whether the proposed work will adversely affect characteristics of the Landmark that were the basis for its designation. She also addressed the requirements of Part VI — Public Structures, Monuments and Fixtures, Section 52, which states that all structures constructed in public parks shall be submitted to the Preservation Board for approval. Ms Cameron stated that the proposed trail in Bellerive Park appeared to require substantial re-grading, retaining walls and fencing and the removal of a historic stone stair, proposals that would be counter to the requirements of Ordinance #64689; she also mentioned that the plans submitted to the Cultural Resources Office were insufficient to completely assess the changes and suggested that at least a portion of the stair be retained.

Ms Cameron also reported that the project for Sister Marie Charles Park appeared to be appropriate in scale and materials and recommended approval.

Marie Dennis of Access Engineering LLC, engineers for the project, made a presentation explaining how the work proposed for the two parks within Great Rivers Greenway's framework plan, Building the River Ring, and showed renderings of the proposed retaining walls, fencing and entry columns. She also discussed a proposal to retain approximately the upper third of the historic stair as an appendage to the new trail.

Tom Purcell, of the Carondelet Community Betterment Federation, expressed support for the project and its importance to the Carondelet neighborhood plan.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

MAY 19, 2014

Page 3 of 10

Tom Villa, 11th Ward Alderwoman, testified on behalf of the project, stating that the project had neighborhood support.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed projects are located in Bellerive Park and Sister Marie Charles Park, both City Parks and that Bellerive Park is within the boundaries of City Landmark #43;
- Bellerive Park is a significant urban space with historic buildings and structures that must be carefully considered in any proposed alterations;
- while the proposed trail will have a negative impact upon the existing typography of Bellerive Park, the trail will be an amenity to the neighborhood and to the City;
- the stone steps on the southern end of Bellerive Park are an important historic resource in the park;
- Sister Marie Charles Park is a recently created park with minimal improvements, and the proposed changes will have a positive effect upon its existing infrastructure.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to direct the Cultural Resources Director to convey to the Board of Public Service the Preservation Board's approval of the proposed project for Sister Marie Charles Park, and to direct the Applicants to continue to work with the Cultural Resources Office to further refine the proposal for Bellerive Park, with the intent to mitigate the impact of the trail, stair, its lookouts, handrails and gateway as much as possible. The motion was made by Alderman Schmid. Mr. Richardson seconded that motion. The motion passed unanimously.

B. 2014.0549 212 N. KINGSHIGHWAY CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Chase Park Plaza Hotel

Applicant: Aras, LLC – Sara Hentz

COMMERCIAL PLAN:

Preliminary review for a master plan for retail storefronts on Maryland Plaza façade and small portion of the Kingshighway façade.

PROCEEDINGS:

On May 19, 2014, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider the Preliminary Review of a master plan for storefronts and changes to two entrances at 212 N. Kingshighway and 230-232 N.

Kingshighway, a property located in the Central West End Certified Local Historic District. Sara Hentz of Aras, LLC submitted the application on behalf of the Behringer entity involved with the current improvement of the property.

Board members Richard Callow (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, David Richardson, Anthony Robinson, Erin Wright, Nate Johnson, and David Visintainer were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Cultural Resources Office Director Betsy Bradley made a presentation that provided an overview of the elements included in the master plan and stated how they met the Central West End Historic District Standards.

Alderman Lyda Krewson expressed support for the concept and urged that the changes made to the building be done in the manner expected for the Park Plaza building and in compliance with the historic district standards.

Dan Tate, of TRI Architects, explained the reasons behind some of the proposed changes. He noted that in response to concerns raised by the Central West Association Planning and Development Committee, the proposed steps would be dark gray granite and the project designers were looking at a more ornate and appropriate handrail design. He explained that the proposed changes to the garage building are intended to draw pedestrians from the eastern portion of the block to the new retail space by providing visual evidence of activity.

James Dwyer reported on the review of the project by the Central West Association Planning and Development Committee and stated that the committee recognized the overall project as an opportunity for the neighborhood. He noted that there is no precedent on the building for projecting steps and the location of the building line has not been determined for the consideration of the steps. He stated that the Committee felt that aluminum might not be the most appropriate material for the storefronts and the Committee asked that bronze be considered. The Committee supported the notion of the café at the garage building doors, but would like to see more details about the canopy proposed at that location. Overall the Committee supports the staff recommendation for approval at the preliminary review stage, but requested that the proposed exterior stairs to the new storefronts not be indicated as approved and that storefront and railing design be evaluated for appropriateness.

Ralph Wafer, also a member of the Central West Association Planning and Development Committee, addressed the design of the storefronts in particular. He stated that the proposed storefronts were not representative of creative contemporary design that the Historic District standards allows, and that the use of the often-used 2-inch wide framing components was to common for the Park Plaza building. He also questioned the desirability of replicating the divisions in the transom windows in the storefronts.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 212 N. Kingshighway and 230-232 N. Kingshighway are properties located in the Central West End Certified Local Historic District;
- the proposed installation of storefronts would cause the loss of only a small portion of the historic masonry and base veneer as historic fabric and would not expand the extent of previous storefront use of the street-level portion of the hotel building;
- in general, the scale, proportions, details and exterior materials comply with the standards in that they are in keeping with the presence of the historic masonry portion of the building and would appear to be compatible new elements, as allowed for in the standards;
- some elements of the proposal warrant further consideration, including the appropriateness of the projecting steps and the design of the handrails and show window design, as well s the material and dimensions of the opening framing elements;
- the proposed use of the entrance to the garage would introduce a new type of commercial use for that portion of the façade, but is within the guidance provided by the historic district standards for appropriate new storefront infill although more detail of the proposed design will be needed prior to approval; and that
- changes to the two pedestrian entrances are appropriate for the building and meet the historic district standards.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval for the master plan with the stipulation that the appropriateness of the projecting steps and the design of the handrails and window design be further studied with the

understanding that the Cultural Resources Office will review and approve all applications for actual work that meets the master plan. The motion was made by Board Member Nate Johnson and seconded by Mr. Richardson. The motion passed unanimously.

C. 2014.0564 701 RUSSELL BLVD. SOULARD HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: South Side Property, LLC – Mike Jabbar

Applicant: Wiedemeier Architects – Joe Wiedemeier

COMMERCIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to replace an existing gas station with a new gas station.

PROCEEDINGS: On May 19, 2014 the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a Preliminary Review for a proposal for a new gas station and convenience store and pump canopy at 701 Russell Blvd., in the Soulard Local Historic District. The architect, Joe Wiedermeier, submitted the application.

Board members Richard Callow(Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, Erin Wright, Nate Johnson, David Visintainer, and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the section of City Ordinance #62382, which sets forth the standards for new construction in the Soulard Local Historic District. He testified that the project was generally in compliance with the Standards.

Joe Wiedermeier, the architect, testified on behalf of the project.

FINDINGS OF FACTS: The Preservation Board found that:

- 701 Russell Blvd. is located in the Soulard Neighborhood Local Historic District;
- the applicant has not provided a single Model Example for the proposed new construction, although the design draws substantially from buildings in the historic district;
- the mass, scale, proportions, ratio of solid-to-void, façade materials and roof type all comply with the Soulard historic district standards;
- the building is proposed to be set at the back of the lot and given the use and location within the district the fact that it

does not hold the building line with the rest of the block seems appropriate; and

- the canopy structure will have simple pipe supports or simple brick columns to match the gas station across Russell and therefore will be as compatible as possible.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant approval of the proposed new construction, with the condition that the design be developed as proposed and that design details will be reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office to ensure compliance with the district standards. The motion was made by Board Member Erin Wright. Alderman Schmid seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously with five board members voting.

APPEALS OF DENIALS

D. 2014.0154 1409 MONROE ST. MURPHY-BLAIR NATIONAL REGISTER DIST.

Owner: Marvin & Frances Nikolaisen
Applicant: Upgrade Wrecking – L.C. Price

DEMOLITION PLAN: Appeal of a denial of a demolition application to demolish a 2.5 story brick house, constructed circa 1870.

PROCEEDINGS: On May 19, 2014, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's denial of a demolition application for 1409 Monroe Street, located in the Murphy-Blair National Register District, and a Preservation Review District.

Board members Richard Callow (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, Erin Wright, David Visintainer, Anthony Robinson and Nate Johnson were present for the testimony for this agenda item. Board Member Wright left the meeting during the appellant's testimony.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office introduced into the record certified copies of Ordinances #64689; as amended by #64925 and #64832, her presentation, the PowerPoint and the Board agenda. She then made a presentation that examined the requirements of Ordinance 64689, Part X — Demolition Reviews,

which states that for buildings within a Preservation Review District, the Preservation Board shall consider specific criteria when assessing whether a demolition should be approved. Ms Cameron stated that the building was one of the older buildings in the district and the City; that the main block of the building appeared sound under the definition of the ordinance; and that a tree had been allowed to grow into the foundation of the rear ell which had caused the collapse of one wall. She stated that the building was a contributing resource to the Murphy-Blair National Register district, and that loss of any contributing building would have a serious effect upon the National Register eligibility of this fragile district.

Ms Cameron also reported she had discussed the demolition proposal with Sean Thomas, Executive Director of the Old North St. Louis Restoration Group, who indicated that it was not in support of the demolition of the building.

Marvin Nikolaisen, owner of the building testified on his own behalf. He stated his family had owned the building for 125 years, and mentioned all the work he had done to the building, problems he had had with tenants over the years and stressed the condition of the rear of the building, where the tree had impacted the foundation. He stated that he was not intending to spend any more money on the building, but would install a plaque after demolition that would record that his family once lived there.

FINDINGS OF FACTS

The Preservation Board found that:

- 1409 Monroe is a contributing resource to the Murphy-Blair National Register Historic District and therefore is considered a Merit building under the definitions of Ordinance #64689;
- the building dates from ca. 1855 and is one of the oldest extant building in the historic district and the City;
- the main block of 1409 Monroe is considered Sound under the definition of the ordinance;
- the rear ell of 1409 has sustained a partial collapse due to the incursion of a volunteer tree that has impacted its foundation; the tree has been growing for many years and in that time, no steps have been taken to remove it;
- federal and state historic tax credits are available to assist in the rehabilitation of the building; and that

- relatively recent development in the vicinity indicates that reuse potential for a rehabilitated structure would be fair to good; and that
- demolition of the building would constitute a loss to the Murphy-Blair district which is already fragile and in danger of losing its eligibility for the National Register.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the Director's Denial of the demolition application for 1409 Monroe Street. The Board recommended that the appropriate steps be taken to stabilize and preserve the building. The motion was made by Board Member Nathaniel Johnson. Alderman Craig Schmid seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously with four Board members voting.

E. 2014.0468 5277 WASHINGTON PLACE CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Stan & Carol Kwasny

Applicant: Glandt Roofing Company, LLC – Greg Glandt

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

Appeal of a denial of a building permit application to replace a red slate roof with black slate roof.

PROCEEDINGS:

On May 19, 2014, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial of a building permit application to install non-compliant roofing at 5277 Washington, in the Central West End Local Historic District. The owner submitted the application and the appeal.

Board members Richard Callow, Alderman Craig Schmid, David Visintainer, Erin Wright, Nate Johnson, and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the section of City Ordinance #69423, which sets forth the standards for residential rehabilitation in the Central West End Local Historic District. He testified that the project was not in compliance with the Standards as the removal of the historic red slate and replacement with black slate, is not allowed.

Mr. Bettis entered into the record Certified copies of Ordinances #64689 and #69423; the Board agenda, the PowerPoint presentation for 5277 Washington; and the building permit application, including all construction documents.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

MAY 19, 2014

Page 10 of 10

Stan Kwasny, the owner and appellant, testified on his own behalf, stating that he and his wife preferred the aesthetics of the black slate versus the original red. Greg Glandt, the contractor spoke in favor of the applicants. James Dwyer spoke on behalf of the Central West End Neighborhood Association, but did not make a recommendation.

FINDINGS OF FACTS

The Preservation Board found that:

- 5277 Washington is located in the Central West End Local Historic District;
- the existing historic roof is red slate and the owner is proposing to install black slate. The original red colored slate is important to the historic character of the house;
- the roof was hail damaged and the owner is replacing the roof with the assistance of an insurance claim; and that
- the owner began the project without a building permit. The back half of the roof was replaced prior to the work being stopped by the Building Division.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the Director's denial of the building permit application because the material itself is the same and only the color is different. The motion was made by Alderman Craig Schmid. Mr. Robinson seconded the motion. The motion passed with five Board Members voting in favor of the motion.

A motion was made by Chairman Richard Callow to adjourn the meeting. Hearing no objection, the meeting was adjourned.