

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES
MAY 20, 2013**

Board Members Present

Richard Callow, Chairman
Aldерwoman Phyllis Young
David Visintainer
Erin Wright
Anthony Robinson
Mike Killeen

Cultural Resources Office Staff Present

Betsy H. Bradley, Director
Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator
Bob Bettis, Preservation Planner
Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner
Adona Buford, Admin. Assistant

Erin Wright called the roll. The Board approved the current agenda and the minutes of the April 22, 2013 meeting.

PRELIMINARY REVIEWS

A 2013.0517 26A & 26B MARYLAND CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner- Koplаr Properties
Applicant – Lululemon Athletica

COMMERCIAL PLAN: Preliminary review of storefront alterations.

PROCEEDINGS: Board members David Visintainer, Michael Killeen, Alderwoman Phyllis Young, Anthony Robinson and Erin Wright were present for this agenda item. Andrea Gagen made a presentation that examined the criteria for storefront alterations in City Ordinance #61177, which set forth the review standards for storefront alterations in the Central West End local historic district. She submitted letters from the Central West End Association’s Planning & Development Committee and from Alderwoman Lyda Krewson stating support of an exception for the project.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

MAY 20, 2013

Page 2 of 9

Alexandra Lerner, the architect, submitted the application and testified on her own behalf.

Sam Kopljar, the property owner, testified in support of the applicant.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the building is located in the Central West End Local Historic District;
- the proposed storefront alterations do not comply with the Central West End historic district standards;
- the proposed alterations will be removable; and
- the owner can require that the alterations be removed when the store is vacated.

BOARD ACTION:

The Preservation Board granted approval of the Preliminary Review to accommodate the storefront alterations as submitted, with the stipulation that it would be removed within two (2) weeks if the store was vacated by the applicant. The motion was made by Alderwoman Young to grant approval. Mr. Killeen seconded the motion. The motion passed with five Board Members voting in favor and none opposing the motion.

B. 2013.0761 1000 SIDNEY ST. SOULARD HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner – RPSLRD LLC

Applicant – Killeen Studio Architects

COMMERCIAL PLAN:

Preliminary review of new roof structure over patio.

PROCEEDINGS:

Board members Richard Callow, David Visintainer, Alderwoman Phyllis Young, Anthony Robinson and Erin Wright were present for this agenda item. Michael Killeen recused himself from this portion of this hearing. Andrea Gagen made a presentation that examined the criteria for new appendages in City Ordinance #62382, which set forth the review standards for a proposed roof structure in the Soulard local historic district.

Ms. Gagen submitted a letter from the Soulard Restoration Group in support of the project. She recommended that the Preservation Board deny the proposed roof structure as it is not in compliance with the Soulard Historic District Standards.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

MAY 20, 2013

Page 3 of 9

Mike Killeen, architect for the project, spoke on behalf of the owners.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the building is located in the Soulard Local Historic District;
- the proposed roof structure is an item that is not clearly addressed in the Soulard historic district standards;
- that although there is not a specific Model Example for this type of structure, the examples provided give stylistic guidance; and
- the proposed structure needs to be pulled back behind the side staircase to lessen its impact on the streetscape

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant approval of the Preliminary Review for the roof with the condition that it is held back behind the side staircase. Board Member David Visintainer made the motion to grant approval as conditioned. Alderwoman Young seconded the motion. Roll was called. The motion passed with four Board Members voting in favor of the motion and none opposing it.

NEW APPLICATION

C. 2013.0801 1157-59 S. KINGSHIGHWAY PRESERVATION REVIEW DISTRICT

Owner – KJPRZ LLC

Applicant – Aalco Wrecking Company

DEMOLITION PLAN:

New application for a demolition permit to demolish a two-story brick commercial building.

PROCEEDINGS:

Board members Richard Callow, David Visintainer, Michael Killeen, Alderwoman Phyllis Young, Anthony Robinson and Erin Wright were present for this agenda item. Cultural Resources Director Betsy H. Bradley submitted certified copies of city Ordinances #64689, as amended by Ordinance #64925, and #64832, and reviewed the criteria for demolition of a property located in a Preservation Review District. Ms. Bradley recommended the Preservation Board withhold approval of the demolition permit until zoning approval or a building permit is secured.

Mr. Michael Wheelehan, representing the owner, described the

new building proposed for the site.

Mr. Chris Colizza reported on the public meetings that Park Central Development Corporation has held with the residents of the Kings Oak neighborhood and the property owners, and some stipulations that the neighbors developed that his organization supports.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 1157-59 S. Kingshighway is located in a Preservation Review District;
- the building, designed by architect K. Jansson, was erected as the Swedish National Society Building in 1913 and was owned by the Society until the late 1960s, when the group disbanded and planned to sell the property;
- the building has the standard form of a commercial block with two storefronts located in the ground story and the upper story consisting of a large hall;
- the Swedish National Society Building has the potential to be listed in the National Register of Historic Places under the Ethnic History area of significance, and therefore is considered to be a Qualifying property and there is no potential for the property to be a contributing property in a National Register historic district;
- the commercial area on S. Kingshighway does not present any deterrent to the rehabilitation and reuse of the building;
- the reuse potential of the building is at least moderate and the zoning is Local Commercial and Office;
- the loss of the building would not have a notable impact in terms of urban design on a block front with varied character;
- new construction is proposed for the site, a two-story brick building placed at the building line that would incorporate the terra-cotta elements from the existing building, would equal the presence of the existing building in the integrity of the block face;
- it would be preferable to have the qualifying Swedish National Society Building as part of the S. Kingshighway streetscape and a new restaurant could be developed without the demolition of the Swedish National Society Building;
- representatives of the Swedish Council, an organization of Swedish Americans in St. Louis, support the proposed use of

- the terra-cotta elements on the façade of the new building;
and
- the Park Central Development Corporation has stated that the Corporation and neighborhood residents are in support of the proposal.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant approval of a demolition permit for the building at 1157-59 S. Kingshighway once a building permit for the proposed new structure is secured. The motion was made by Board Member Anthony Robinson and seconded by Mr. Killeen . The motion passed with all five Board Members voting for the motion.

APPEALS OF DENIALS

D. 2013.0391 5928 PERSHING AVENUE (Withdrawn by Applicant)

E. 2013.0591 3324-28 MISSOURI AVE. BENTON PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner – Will Liebermann

Applicant – Peter Hammond, Architect

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

Appeal of the Director’s denial of a building permit application to retain non-compliant windows on front façade.

PROCEEDINGS:

Board members Richard Callow, David Visintainer, Michael Killeen, Alderwoman Phyllis Young, Anthony Robinson and Erin Wright were present for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron submitted into the record certified copies of City Ordinances #64689, as amended by Ordinance #64925, and #64832 and the Benton Park Historic District Ordinance, #67175. She also submitted a letter from Mark F. Silver, President of the Benton Park Housing Corporation, indicating its support for the appeal.

Ms. Cameron detailed why the installed windows were not in compliance with the Benton Park Historic District Standards: while they are appropriate historic replacement units, the windows are sized two inches narrower and several inches shorter than the masonry openings, which have been adapted with additional framing above the sill and a wide brick mold. She stated that the National Park Service, which is reviewing the project for compliance with the Secretary of Interior’s Standards for historic tax credit use, is also dissatisfied with the windows,

and has indicated verbally that it will require replacement of only the first story windows on the front and south façades. The replacement units would be appropriate in height but, as the incorrectly-sized second story windows would be allowed to remain, and in order to have a uniform width of window on each façade, would still be two inches too narrow for the openings and need a wider brick mold. She recommended that the Board require that all the windows of the front and south façades, which are prominently visible, be replaced with new windows correctly dimensioned for the openings, trimmed with brick mold of historic dimension and profile.

Will Lieberman, the owner and developer of the project, testified on his own behalf, asking that he be required to replace only those windows required by the National Park Service. He conceded that the window openings had not been framed correctly, necessitating installation of incorrectly-sized windows; he contended that the deviation was not greatly noticeable. Mr. Lieberman stated that the cost of replacement for the number of windows recommended by the Cultural Resources Office could jeopardize the project. He submitted financial information concerning the costs of window replacement and the total project budget.

Mark Silver, President of the Benton Park Housing Corporation, testified in qualified support of the appeal, stating that although the Corporation was not satisfied with the windows that had been installed, it was important to the neighborhood that the project be completed.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 3324-26 Missouri Avenue is located in the Benton Park Local Historic District;
- the rehabilitation project is receiving substantial public support from the Community Development Administration and through the State and Federal Historic Preservation Tax Credit programs;
- the windows that have been installed on all facades of the building are approved historic replacement windows, but are sized incorrectly to the openings, and are not in compliance with the plans approved by the Cultural Resources Office on March 25, 2011;
- because the windows are inappropriately sized, the openings have been filled with additional framing and a

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

MAY 20, 2013

Page 7 of 9

- brick mold that is wider than the original;
- the installed brick mold does not replicate the original brick mold in dimension or profile and has been stained instead of painted, further altering the appearance of the historic window openings;
- the front and south façades are highly visible from the street; the north façade is partly screened by an adjacent property and the rear wall is not visible from the street;
- the revision of the window project proposed by the National Park Service would result in front façade windows that are incorrectly sized and with brick mold that is too wide; and
- placing all additional replacement windows on the façade would result in correctly sized windows and brick mold of historic profile on the most visible portion of the building.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the Director's denial of the building permit application to retain all the existing windows. The Appellant may retain only the windows installed on the north, south and rear façades. The Board instructed the Appellant to replace all windows on the front façade with correctly-sized historic replacement windows, and to install brick mold of appropriate size and profile on these openings. The motion was made by Board Member Anthony Robinson. Erin Wright seconded the motion. The motion passed with all five Board Members voting for the motion

**F. 2012.1934 2746 UTAH STREET PRESERVATION REVIEW DISTRICT and
(Tabled from January) NATIONAL REGISTER DISTRICT**

Owner - Kham Phao and Wandee Chareunsap represented by Pone Siharaj

Applicant – Hughes Wrecking

DEMOLITION PLAN:

Appeal of the Director's denial of a demolition permit application to demolish a two-story brick dwelling.

PREVIOUS ACTION:

On January 28, 2013, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the denial of a demolition permit application for 2746 Utah. Pone Siharaj acting with Power of Attorney for Kham Phao and Wandee Chareunsap, owners of the property, submitted the appeal. The hearing was tabled to allow the Applicant 90 days to list the property for sale. The

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

MAY 20, 2013

Page 8 of 9

Applicant was also urged by the Board to further consult with the Alderman and the Benton Park West Neighborhood Association.

PROCEEDINGS:

Board members Richard Callow, David Visintainer, Michael Killeen, Alderwoman Phyllis Young, Anthony Robinson and Erin Wright were present for this agenda item. Cultural Resources Office Director Betsy H. Bradley submitted certified copies of City Ordinances #64689, as amended by Ordinance #64925, and #64832 and reviewed the criteria for demolition of a property located in a Preservation Review District and the Gravois-Jefferson Streetcar Suburb National Register District. She noted again that Alderman Kenneth Ortman had submitted a letter in opposition to demolition of the residence, and that the Benton Park West Neighborhood had also submitted a letter opposing the demolition.

Attorney George Restovich, representing Pone Siharaj, and Mr. Siharaj, both testified in favor of the Appeal, explaining the unsuccessful attempts made to list the property for sale with a realtor, citing estimates for masonry and interior work, and describing the current physical state of the building and why demolition is proposed.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 2746 Utah, a contributing building in a National Register Historic District and therefore a Merit building, is located in a Preservation Review District;
- the building does not have any individual architectural distinction as it represents a common residential building type;
- a fire has damaged the interior, charred some of the exterior brick, likely made some of the building's mortar friable, and since the fire, additional damage has occurred that includes a void caused by the loss of a window and surrounding brick and a smaller area of loss of the rear brick wall;
- despite this damage, the building meets the definition of "sound" as set forth in the ordinances;
- the surrounding buildings on the block face indicate that there is below-grade subsidence. A quarry was located on the site of the buildings which appears to be the cause of the destabilization of some foundations on the block;
- the immediate setting in which other buildings exhibit subsidence does not strongly support rehabilitation;

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

MAY 20, 2013

Page 9 of 9

- the economic feasibility of the extensive required repairs may diminish the reuse potential of the building and would include stabilizing the foundation;
- the loss of the building would have some effect on urban design;
- the owner had a fire insurance policy that covered the current market value of the property that was determined to be \$40,000;
- the property owner's representative stated that a realtor determined that the average value of comparable properties to 2746 Utah is \$110,000;
- the applicant did not provide a detailed estimate of a full rehabilitation project, but nevertheless asserted that the cost of rehabilitation would be considerably more than the current value of the property;
- the property owner's representative did not find a realtor willing to list the property for sale unless or until work be done to stabilize it; the work required to list the property with realtors contacted by the Applicant was not further specified;
- no new construction is proposed at this time;
- if demolition would take place, the lot would be offered to the adjacent property owner as a side yard or used as a community garden; and
- the Cultural Resources Office did not receive any further communication from the Alderman or the Benton Park West Neighborhood Association indicating changes from their positions in opposition to demolition.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the Director's denial as the demolition did not meet the criteria for demolition approval set forth in Ordinance 64832. The motion was made by Board Member Michael Killeen . Mr. Visintainer seconded the motion. Roll was called. The motion passed with five Board Members voting for the motion and none voting against it.

Chairman Richard Callow moved to adjourn the meeting. Hearing no objection, the meeting was adjourned