

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES
MAY 20TH, 2019**

Board Members Present

Richard Callow – Chairman
Randy Vines
Mike Killeen
Ald. Joe Vaccaro
Anthony Robinson
David Richardson

Cultural Resources Office Staff Present

Dan Krasnoff, Director
Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator
Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner
Bethany Moore, Preservation Planner
Adona Buford, Adm. Assistant

Legal Counsel

Barbara Birkicht

PRELIMINARY REVIEW

2019.0706

3671-81 LINDELL BOULEVARD

CITY LANDMARK #89

Owner: BrandonView, LLC

Applicant: Alvah Levine, Architect

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to convert an apartment building and garage.

PROCEEDINGS: On May 20, 2019, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a Preliminary Review application to install new openings on the Masonic Temple, at 3671 Lindell Boulevard, City Landmark #89. The request for Preliminary Review was submitted by Alvah Levine, principal of Levine Associates, the project architect.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), Randy Vines, Alderman Joseph Vaccaro, Anthony Robinson, Mike Killeen, and David Richardson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #64689 as modified by Ordinance #64925, which sets forth the

requirements for consideration of alterations to City Landmark structures.

Ms. Cameron stated that the building's use would change: it will be converted to apartments and therefore additional windows are required—however, the main ceremonial spaces would be preserved. She discussed the prominent site of the building with three highly visible facades and stated that the architect had worked to blend the new openings into the existing fenestration. The proposal also includes a number of recessed balconies, which do not project beyond the building face and are proportional in dimension to other openings.

Ms. Cameron recommended that the Preservation Board grant Preliminary Approval to the proposed alterations with the stipulation that details and specifications are submitted to the Cultural Resources Office for review and final plans and materials are approved by the Cultural Resources Office.

Brian Hayden, owner of the building, spoke in support of the project. He stated that the project would receive no public funding and the additional openings are critical to the success of the project. He confirmed that there would be no change to the lobby, the 3-story assembly room, or the auditorium and would use the existing corridors. In response to a question from Board Member Richardson as to whether they had contacted Grand Center, Mr. Hayden replied that they were waiting for the Preservation Board decision first. In response to a question from Alderman Vaccaro, he stated that he had not yet presented the project to the ward Alderman for the same reason.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the Masonic Temple, at 3681 Lindell Boulevard, is a City Landmark;
- due to its prominent location at Lindell and N. Spring, all sides of the Masonic Temple are street-visible. The primary elevation faces south on Lindell; the west elevation faces N. Spring Avenue;
- the applicant proposes a number of new openings on all facades in order to accommodate the building's conversion to apartments;

- several windows are proposed to be added above the Lindell portico: these will hardly be noticeable given their relatively small size and position above the projecting portico;
- the rear elevation, while not a street-facing façade, is visible from Olive and N. Spring because of the scale of the building and its position on a Entries to the parking garage will be from the rear and will be minimally visible from the street;
- the new openings have been placed to be sympathetic to the building's established fenestration pattern.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board grant preliminary approval to the proposed design, with the stipulation that details and specifications are submitted to the Cultural Resources Office for review and final plans and exterior materials are reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office. The motion was made by Board Member Vines and seconded by Board Member Richardson. The motion passed 4-1, with Alderman Vaccaro voting in opposition.

APPEALS OF DENIALS

2018.0957

3318 LEMP AVENUE

BENTON PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Rubicon Corporation – Matthew Hartig

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

Appeal of a denial of a building permit application to construct a single family house.

PROCEEDINGS:

On May 20, 2019, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to review a request for reconsideration of a condition placed by the Preservation Board on its preliminary approval of the construction of new single-family house at 3318 Lemp Avenue, located in the Benton Park Local and National Register Historic District. The application was submitted by the Mathew Hartig, representative of the developer, Rubicon Corporation.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), Randy Vines, Alderman Joseph Vaccaro, Anthony Robinson, Mike Killeen, and David Richardson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #67175, which sets forth the

standards for new construction in the Benton Park Historic District. She testified that the Preservation Board had previously granted Preliminary Approval to the design with the stipulation that both side elevations would be brick, and the applicant was asking permission to revise the design to 25-foot returns. Ms. Cameron displayed photos of the site and context, and noted that the side elevations of the new house, because of the width of the side yards, would be street-visible. She recommended that the Preservation Board sustain its original condition.

Mathew Hartig, representative of the developer, spoke on his own behalf. He submitted three bids for the additional brick, which ranged from \$37,440 to \$43,800. Mr. Hartig submitted revised drawings showing a new plan, which recessed the rear two-thirds of the building to allow a 2-foot setback at each side elevation, between brick and siding. In response to an inquiry from Board Member Killeen, Mr. Hartig stated that he had not brought the new design to the neighborhood or the Alderman, but that they had approved the original proposal.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed site for construction, 3318 Lemp Avenue, is located in the Benton Park Local Historic District;
- the revised design complies generally with most of the historic districts standards for new construction;
- the revised design does not comply with the standards for exterior materials, as the side elevations, highly visible, will be predominantly sided.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to sustain the original condition of the previous preliminary approval pending receipt of evidence of neighborhood and Aldermanic support. The motion was made by Board member Michael Killeen and seconded by Alderman Vaccaro. The motion passed unanimously.

2019.0110

405 N. EUCLID AVENUE

CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: 405 Euclid LLC – Steve Brinkman

Applicant: Up Down STL, LLC

COMMERCIAL PLAN: Appeal of a building permit application to install 2 wall signs and one illuminated roof sign.

PROCEEDINGS: On May 20 2019, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an Appeal of the Cultural Resources Director’s Denial of an application to install two (2) wall signs and one (1) roof sign on the building at 405 N. Euclid Avenue, in the Central West End Historic District. The appeal was submitted by the applicant.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), Randy Vines, Alderman Joseph Vaccaro, Anthony Robinson, Mike Killeen, and David Richardson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Andrea Gagen of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #69423, which sets forth the standards for windows in the Central West End Historic District. She entered into the record certified copies of the enabling legislations; Ordinance #56768 as amended by Ordinance #69423; the meeting agenda; and the PowerPoint presentation.

Ms. Gagen stated that signage did not meet the historic district standards. She stated that roof sign did have precedent in that location. She recommended that the Preservation Board uphold the Director’s Denial for the two (2) end signs as they did not meet the Central West End Historic District standards, , but that the roof sign could be approved under a separate permit. She also noted that the Board should deny painting the windows black. Ms. Gagen also entered into the record letters from 28th Ward Alderwoman Heather Navarro and a letter from James Dwyer, Chair of the Central West End Association Planning & Development Committee, both in support of the staff’s recommendation.

Joey Akers, representative of Up Down, spoke in support of the project.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

MAY 20TH, 2019

Page 6 of 6

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 405 N. Euclid Avenue is located in the Central West End Historic District;
- the proposed signs do not meet the historic district standards;
- there is precedent for a roof sign in the proposed location;
- the windows being painted black are not in keeping with the historic district standards.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the Director's Denial of the sign uphold the Director's Denial of the proposed wall signs, with the exception to the proposed rooftop sign, and to deny painting of the windows black. The motion was made by Board Member Richardson and seconded by Board Member Vines. The motion passed 3-2, with Alderman Vaccaro and Board Member Robinson voting in opposition.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Director Dan Krasnoff gave a short summary of current and ongoing projects/activities within the City's Historic Districts.