

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES
MAY 21, 2018**

Board Members Present

Richard Callow – Chairman
Anthony Robinson
Mike Killeen
Randy Vines
David Richardson
Tiffany Hamilton
David Visintainer - **Absent**
Melanie Fathman - **Absent**

Cultural Resources Office Staff Present

Dan Krasnoff, Director
Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator
Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner
Adona Buford, Administrative Assistant

Legal Counsel

Barbara Birkicht

PRELIMINARY REVIEWS

A. 2018.0709 4481 OLIVE STREET CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Youth Learning Center – Bill Kent

COMMERCIAL PLAN: Preliminary review application to construct a temporary modular classroom building.

PROCEEDINGS: On May 21, 2018, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a Preliminary Application to construct a temporary, modular classroom building at 4481 Olive Street, in the Central West End Local Historic District. The preliminary review application was submitted by the Biome School.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), Ald. Terry Kennedy, Randy Vines, David Richardson, Tiffany Hamilton and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Dan Krasnoff of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #69423, which sets forth the standards for new construction in the Central West End Local Historic District. Mr. Krasnoff stated that proposals for temporary buildings were not contemplated in the standards. He described the project and said the school

would likely use the facility for up to seven years and in that time it would raise funds to build a permanent structure. He also said that by painting the building red and screening it with a fence the impact upon the historic district could be minimized. Mr. Krasnoff further noted that the original proposal submitted by the applicant was for demolition of a High Merit building with strong associations to the playwright Tennessee Williams. The proposal before the Board was submitted to avoid the demolition yet meet the school's short term classroom needs.

Board member David Richardson asked Mr. Krasnoff if he thought the proposal was for an ancillary structure, not a temporary building. Mr. Krasnoff replied that the definition of the proposal for the classroom building being considered was subject to interpretation, and was not obvious.

Mr. Richardson asked Mr. Krasnoff to define how long a temporary structure could be standing before it was permanent. Mr. Krasnoff said a building that was to stand for seven years was temporary.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 4481 Olive Street is located in the Central West End Local Historic District;
- the Central West End Standards for New Construction require that new buildings replicate the siting, massing, scale, street rhythm and exterior materials of adjacent buildings;
- the proposal for a modular classroom is not addressed by the standards due to the impermanent nature of the construction;
- the Biome School requires additional classroom space in order to fulfill its educational mission;
- the use of the temporary modular classroom allows time for the consideration of the future development of the school's facilities that fulfills its mission and allows for the preservation of the High Merit 4477 Olive Street building; and
- a building designed only to stand for seven years is, by definition, temporary.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant Preliminary Approval for the construction of a temporary, modular classroom building, with the stipulations that it not stand for more than seven years; there is annual consultation between the Cultural

Resources Office and the School regarding the building and the final design and landscaping details be reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office. The motion was made by Board Member David Richardson and seconded by Mr. Robinson. The motion passed unanimously.

NEW APPLICATIONS

B. 2018.0466 4220 BOTANICAL AVENUE SHAW HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Iowa Holding Group LLC – Orlando Askins

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Application to construct a single-family house.

PROCEEDINGS: On May 21, 2018, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a New Application to construct a detached, single-family house at 4220 Botanical Avenue, in the Shaw Neighborhood Local Historic District. The application was submitted by the developer, Orlando Askins of Iowa Holding Group LLC.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), Ald. Terry Kennedy, Randy Vines, David Richardson, Tiffany Hamilton and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #59400 which sets forth the standards for new construction in the Shaw Local Historic District. Ms. Cameron stated that while the developer had been responsive to some of the Cultural Resources Office suggestions and had modified the roof slope, the design was still not in compliance with the Shaw Historic Standards. She recommended that the Board withhold approval at this time to allow for further revisions. Ms. Cameron submitted into the record emails from the Alderman of the 8th Ward and the Shaw Neighborhood Improvement Association, in opposition to the current design.

Kiera Jones, representative of the applicant, testified on behalf of the project. She stated that the 3-story height of the building had received a variance from the Zoning Administration, and that the

applicant was requesting that no more than ten feet of brick be required on the side elevations.

Alderman Annie Rice stated she was testifying both as Alderman of the Ward and on behalf of the Shaw Neighborhood Improvement Association. She said she agreed with the Cultural Resources Office recommendation as the project as currently designed as it did not comply with the Shaw standards; and further, that she was unaware of the Zoning variance being granted.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed site for construction, 4220 Botanical Avenue, is located in the Shaw Neighborhood Local Historic District;
- the proposed massing, scale, height and proportions of the building do not appear to be compatible with adjacent buildings; and
- the east elevation faces a wide side yard and will expose a large extent of lap siding to street view.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to deny the permit application as the proposed new construction does not meet the Shaw Historic District Standards. The motion was made by Board member Anthony Robinson and seconded by Mr. Vines. The motion passed unanimously.

C. 2018.0512 3927 RUSSELL BOULEVARD SHAW HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Yellow Dolphin Investments LLC – Kim Susands

Applicant: Level STL – Shane Cochran

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

Application to retain slider windows installed without a permit.

PROCEEDINGS:

On May 21, 2018, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a New Application to retain three slider windows installed without a permit at 3927 Russell Blvd. in the Shaw Local Historic District. The application was submitted by Shane Cochran of Level STL.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), Ald. Terry Kennedy, Randy Vines, David Richardson, Tiffany Hamilton and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Andrea Gagen of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #59400 which sets forth the standards for new construction in the Shaw Neighborhood Historic District. She stated that the Cultural Resources Office received a complaint about work going on at this address without a permit. Upon inspection, it was observed that new metal slider windows with fixed transoms had been installed on the front façade. Ms. Gagen recommended that the Preservation Board deny the permit application to retain the windows as they do not comply with the Shaw Historic District Standards. The previous windows were non-conforming slider windows, which were not the original configuration.

Shane Cochran of Level STL, testified on behalf of the project. He stated he was matching the windows installed across the street from the project. He submitted photos of the windows.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 3927 Russell is located in the Shaw Neighborhood Local Historic District;
- the house was constructed in 1895. The original fenestration would have been a single doublehung window with a semi-circular head in each opening. This is a relatively common window type in the Shaw district;
- the Shaw Historic District Standards dictate that original detail should be left in its original form or replicated if necessary and that windows should be in the same vertical and horizontal proportions and style as in the original structures; and
- the installed non-compliant slider windows do not replicate the original windows.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to deny the building permit application to retain the slider windows as they do not comply with the Shaw Historic District Standards. The motion was made by Board member Randy Vines and seconded by David Richardson. The motion passed unanimously.

D. 2018.0460 2423 SALENA AVENUE BENTON PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Franklin C. Melton

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Retain front entry driveway constructed without permit.

PROCEEDINGS:

On May 21, 2018, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a New Application to retain a front driveway installed without a permit at 2423 Salena Street, in the Benton Park Local Historic District. The application was submitted by the developer, Franklin C. Melton.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), Ald. Terry Kennedy, Randy Vines, David Richardson, Tiffany Hamilton and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #67175 which sets forth the standards for new construction in the Benton Park Local Historic District. Ms. Cameron stated that the Office had received a complaint and upon inspection, had discovered that a driveway had been installed without a permit, and with no appropriate curb-cut or apron. The drive had changed the slope of the front yard, which is not allowed under the Benton Park Standards. She noted an adjacent driveway predated the designation of Benton Park as a local district; and that while 2423 Salena had no alley access, there appeared to be little pressure for parking on the block. Ms. Cameron stated that she had received a number of complaints regarding the driveway, which has a significant negative impact upon the appearance of the property. She recommended that the Preservation Board deny the application and require that the driveway be removed.

Frank Melton, developer and owner of 2423 Salena Street, testified on his own behalf. He denied that the driveway had changed the slope of the property and emphasized the existing driveway next door. He said further that since no parking was allowed on the opposite side of the street, off-street parking was critical. Mr. Melton testified that his contractor had told him that no permit was required, and that the curb has deteriorated so badly that a curb-cut was unnecessary. He said that he had already sold the property.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 2324 Salena Street is located in the Benton Park National Register District;
- the current driveway was constructed without a permit and without curb-cut or apron;
- the drive has altered the slope of the front yard, which the Benton Park Standards do not allow; and that
- the drive covers a significant portion of the house's front yard and has a deleterious effect upon the appearance of the house and block.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to deny the application to retain the driveway as it does not meet the Shaw Historic District Standards. The motion was made by Board member David Richardson and seconded by Mr. Vines. The motion passed unanimously.

APPEALS OF DENIALS

E. 2018.0011 4064 MAFFITT AVENUE THE VILLE HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Unfailing Love Christian Church – Jason Barney

COMMERCIAL PLAN:

Appeal of a building permit application to construct church addition to existing building.

PROCEEDINGS:

On May 21, 2018, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an Appeal of the Cultural Resources Director's Denial of an application to construct a church addition at 4064 Maffitt Avenue, in The Ville Local Historic District. The application was submitted by Jason Barney of Unfailing Love Christian Church, Inc.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), Ald. Terry Kennedy, Randy Vines, David Richardson, Tiffany Hamilton and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #60236 which sets forth the standards for new construction in The Ville Local Historic District. She entered into the record the enabling legislations, Ordinance #64689 and Ordinance #62036; the

meeting agenda; and the PowerPoint presentation; and also a letter from 4th Ward Alderman Sam Moore, indicating his support of the project. Ms. Cameron stated that the Cultural Resources Office had worked closely with the applicant to revise the initial submission, and the building now included a brick front and windows. She recommended that the Board overturn the Director's denial based upon the new design.

Jason Barney, the appellant, testified on behalf of the project.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 4064 Maffitt Avenue is located in The Ville Local Historic District;
- the proposal is to construct a church sanctuary addition to existing church buildings;
- the proposed structure is a "Tuff-Shed" prefabricated building;
- the design has been revised to include a brick front façade and additional details that improve compatibility with other structures on the block.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the Director's Denial and approve the revised design. The motion was made by Board member Hamilton and seconded by Alderman Kennedy. The motion passed unanimously.

F. 2018.0384 4240 CASTLEMAN AVENUE SHAW HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Orin Johnson and Erin Hammond

Applicant: Landscape Concepts – Jill Wallenberg

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

Appeal of a building permit application to construct a front retaining wall.

PROCEEDINGS:

On May 21, 2018, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an Appeal of the Cultural Resources Director's Denial of an application to construct a curved retaining wall at 4240 Castleman, in Shaw Neighborhood Local Historic District. The application was submitted by Jill Wallenberg of Landscape Concepts, the contractor.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), Ald. Terry Kennedy, Randy Vines, David Richardson, Tiffany Hamilton and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #59400 which sets forth the standards for new construction in the Shaw Neighborhood Local Historic District. She entered into the record certified copies of enabling legislations, Ordinance #64689 and Ordinance #62036; the meeting agenda; and the PowerPoint presentation.

Ms. Cameron stated that the district standards clearly state that walls in front of the building line are not permitted. She noted that several retaining walls had been previously constructed on the block without the approval of the Cultural Resources Office; however this portion of the block had retained its original terrace grade. She recommended that the Board uphold the Director's denial based upon the new design.

Jill Wallenberg of Landscape Concepts, the appellant, testified on behalf of the project. She stated that the reason the owner wished to install the wall was to beautify the front yard, which had been neglected by a previous owner; and to prevent the soil erosion. She submitted a number of photographs of other retaining walls in the area.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 4240 Castleman Avenue is located in the Shaw Neighborhood Local Historic District;
- the Shaw standards do not allow any walls or enclosures in front of buildings; and that
- the proposed retaining wall and grade alterations will destroy the historic terrace and will create a negative impact upon the street and historic district

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the Director's denial as it does not comply with the Shaw Historic District standards. The motion was made by Board member David Richardson and seconded by Mr. Vines. The motion passed unanimously.