

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS  
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE  
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES  
MAY 22, 2017**

Board Members Present

Richard Callow – Chairman  
Anthony Robinson  
David Visintainer  
David Richardson  
Mike Killeen  
Erin Wright

Cultural Resources Office Staff Present

Dan Krasnoff, Director  
Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator  
Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner  
Bob Bettis, Preservation Planner  
Adona Buford, Administrative Assistant  
Legal Counsel  
Barbara Birkicht

**PRELIMINARY REVIEWS**

**A. 2017.0541 4301 MARYLAND AVENUE CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC**

---

Owner/Applicant: MLM on Maryland LLC - Mark Mathis

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct a ten-unit condominium building.

PROCEEDINGS: On May 22, 2017, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a preliminary review application to construct a ten-unit condominium building at 4301 Maryland Avenue, in the Central West End Local Historic District. The application was submitted by the developers, Lauren and Mark Mathis.

Board members Richard Callow, Anthony Robinson, Mike Killeen, David Richardson, Mike Killeen, Erin Wright and David Visintainer were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #69423, which sets forth the standards for residential new construction in Central West End. He testified that the project complied with the standards and recommended that the Board grant preliminary approval to the proposal. He stated that the Central West End

Planning & Development Committee was in support of the recommendation of the Cultural Resources Office.

Lauren and Mark Mathis, the owners, were present to speak on behalf of the project.

Jim Dwyer, representing the Central West End Planning and Development Committee, stated that the committee supported the project with the following conditions:

1. Eliminate the shed roof on the Maryland entry porch,
2. Fabricate all metal elements, submitting for prior review and approval,
3. Simplify the roofline with a continuous brick parapet wall and replace the shed roof with a flat roof over the balconies,
4. Increase the balcony depths by 12 inches,
5. Use flat panel siding rather than lapped siding,
6. Add additional windows on the west elevation,
7. Provide lighting specifications for garage lighting, including Kelvin temperature.
8. Provide a detailed landscape plan.

Imran Hanafi, local resident, spoke against certain aspects of the design.

**FINDINGS OF FACTS:**

The Preservation Board found that:

- The proposed site for construction, 4301 Maryland Avenue, is located in the Central West End Local Historic District;
- The siting, scale, proportions, roof shape, and exterior materials comply with the Standards;
- The building's floor heights, water-table, and foundation do not line up with the neighboring property due to the ground floor garage;
- The setback along Maryland cannot be followed due to the shape of the parcel;
- The Central West End, Planning and Development Committee support the project subject to several changes and clarifications.

**BOARD DECISION:**

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval for the proposed new construction with the eight

additional changes suggested by the Central West End, Planning and Development Committee, and with the stipulation that final documents, exterior details and materials will be reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office to ensure compliance with the standards. The motion was made by Board Member Richardson and seconded by Mr. Visintainer. Board Members Richardson, Visintainer and Wright voted in favor of the motion. Board Member Robinson voted against the motion and Board Member Killeen abstained.

**B. 2017.0765 1817 SO. 10<sup>TH</sup> STREET SOULARD HISTORIC DISTRICT**

---

Owner/Applicant: French Town Dog Park Association

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct gazebo and storage shed at dog park.

PROCEEDINGS: On May 22, 2017, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a Preliminary Review application to erect a wood storage shed and two metal prefabricated pavilions on the grounds of the Frenchtown Dog Park, located at 1817 S. 10<sup>th</sup> Street, in the Soulard Neighborhood Local and National Register Historic District. The application was submitted by the Frenchtown Dog Park Association.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), Mike Killeen, David Richardson, Anthony Robinson, Erin Wright and David Visintainer were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #57078, which sets forth the standards for site improvements and yard structures in the Soulard Neighborhood Local Historic District.

Ms. Cameron stated that the proposed structures did not comply with the standards for yard structures, which required that they be based on a Model Example. She noted, however, that the structures would not be highly visible from the street and recommended that the Board grant an exception to the standards with conditions of color and landscape screening.

Julia Mittelstadt, representative of the Frenchtown Dog Park Association, spoke in support of the project.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- The proposed site for construction, 1817 S. 10<sup>th</sup> Street, is located in the Soulard Local Historic District;
- The three new structures proposed for the site do not follow any Model Example, as required by the Soulard historic district standards and the pavilions are of metal, a material that is prohibited under the standards;
- The dog park is located at the western edge of the Soulard District, adjacent to Interstate 55. The northern third of its frontage runs along S. 10<sup>th</sup> Street; the rest fronts along the north-south alley between S. 10<sup>th</sup> and Menard Streets and is visible only from the western terminus of Emmet Street;
- The scale of the structures is appropriate; and all will be sited at the western edge of the park, adjacent to the highway;
- If the structures are dark in color and appropriately screened with landscaping, they will not have a significant visual effect upon the historic district streetscape.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to Board grant preliminary approval to the proposed installation, with the stipulation that all materials be dark in color; the shed be screened from street views with appropriate landscaping and final drawings, materials and colors will be reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office. The motion was made by Board Member Visintainer. Mr. Richardson seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

**APPEALS OF DENIALS**

**C.      2017.0234      1930 VIRGINIA AVENUE      COMPTON HILL HISTORIC DISTRICT**

---

Owner: Sidney Holding Group LLC – Sharon Behlmann

Applicant: Gateway Architectural – Jason Plough

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

Appeal of a denial of a building permit application to construct a new two-story two-family building.

PROCEEDINGS:

On May 22, 2017 the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of a Director’s Denial to construct a two-family residence at 1930 Virginia Avenue.  
Board members Richard Callow (Chairman), David Richardson,

Anthony Robinson and David Visintainer, Mike Killeen, and Erin Wright were present for the testimony for this agenda item. Andrea Gagen of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #57702, which sets forth standards for new construction in the Compton Hill Historic District. She entered into the record the ordinances, agenda item and the PowerPoint presentation, as well as feedback from the Compton Hill Reservoir Square Residents Association.

Jason Plough, of Gateway Architecture, spoke on the developers behalf.

Lucy Vogt, neighborhood resident, spoke in favor of the project.

**FINDINGS OF FACTS:**

The Preservation Board found that:

- The proposed site for the new two-family building is within the boundaries of the Compton Hill Certified Local Historic District.
- The alignment of the fenestration on the front façade of the building does not follow historic examples.
- The south side of the building is visible due to the one-story building to the south, and the north elevation will be partially visible.
- The cement board siding proposed for the sides and rear of the building are not compatible in type and texture with the predominant original building materials used in the neighborhood.

**BOARD DECISION:**

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the Director's denial of the new construction. The motion was made by Board member Anthony Robinson. Mr. Visintainer seconded the motion. The motion passed 4-1.

**D. 2017.0658 4239 SHENANDOAH AVE. SHAW HISTORIC DISTRICT**

---

Owner/Applicant: James Kinnard and Alesha Scott

**RESIDENTIAL PLAN:**

Appeal of a denial of a building permit application to retain non-compliant door and sidelights installed without a permit.

**PROCEEDINGS:**

On May 22, 2016, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial of a building permit

application to retain a non-compliant door and two sidelights, at 4239 Shenandoah Ave. in the Shaw Neighborhood Local Historic District. The owner submitted the appeal.

Board members Richard Callow, Mike Killeen, David Richardson, Anthony Robinson, Erin Wright and David Visintainer were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #59400, which sets forth the standards for commercial and non-residential buildings in the Shaw Neighborhood Local Historic District.

Mr. Bettis entered into the record certified copies of Ordinances #64689, as amended by #64925, and #59400; the Board agenda and the PowerPoint presentation for 4239 Shenandoah Ave.

Alesha Scott, the owner, spoke on her own behalf.

**FINDINGS OF FACTS:**

The Preservation Board found that:

- 4239 Shenandoah Avenue is located in the Shaw Neighborhood Local Historic District;
- The house was constructed in 1905 and had the original entryway configuration intact;
- The Shaw Historic District Standards dictate that original detail should be left in its original form or replicated if necessary;
- The installed non-compliant entry configuration does not replicate the original.

**BOARD DECISION:**

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the Director's Denial of the building permit, as the entryway does not comply with the Shaw Historic District Standards. The motion was made by Board Member Anthony Robinson. Ms. Wright seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

**E. 2016.0023 1092-94 S. KINGSHIGHWAY BLVD. FOREST PARK SOUTHEAST  
NATIONAL REGISTER DISTRICT**

---

Owner/Applicant: Drury Development Corporation – Carmody MacDonald P.C.

**DEMOLITON PLAN:**

Appeal of a demolition permit application to demolish a two-story four-family brick building.

**PROCEEDINGS:**

On May 22, 2017 the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to

consider an appeal of a Director's Denial to demolish a four-family residential building at 1092-94 S. Kingshighway Boulevard. Board members Richard Callow (Chairman), David Richardson, Anthony Robinson and David Visintainer, Mike Killeen, and Erin Wright were present for the testimony for this agenda item. Andrea Gagen of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #64689, as revised by City Ordinance #64682, which delineates criteria for the review of demolition proposals for properties in Preservation Review Districts and/or those listed on the National Register of Historic Places. She entered into the record the ordinances, agenda item and the PowerPoint presentation, as well as a letter of opposition to the proposal from the 17<sup>th</sup> Ward Alderman, Joseph Roddy, and two emails from residents in opposition to the demolition. She also entered into the record a condition assessment report in regards to its current structural condition, a bid from CATCO for cleaning and restoration services, and a current estimate of rehabilitation provided by the owner.

Donald Carmody, legal representative of the owner, testified on the owners behalf. He asserted that the building was not architecturally significant and was not sound. He also asserted that rehabilitating the building was not economically feasible. Mr. Carmody entered into the record a copy of a Notice of Condemnation for the property.

Jon Knobloch, manager of operations for Drury Development, discussed the rehabilitation costs, and the rents vs. rehabilitation using tax credits.

Vince Miller, Vice President of Drury Development, stated that the building did not have "good bone structure." He also stated that the building had not been marketed.

**FINDINGS OF FACTS:**

The Preservation Board found that:

- The building proposed for demolition, 1092-94 S. Kingshighway Boulevard, is a Merit building as a contributing resource to the Forest Park Southeast National Register Historic District;
- The building is part of an intact block face and "holds the corner" at S. Kingshighway Boulevard and Oakland Avenue;
- No redevelopment plan has been submitted for the property, and no plans for its reuse have been submitted to the Preservation Board;

- The building has suffered a partial collapse at its west elevation and roof damage due to a fire and deferred maintenance;
- The bids submitted by the owner for rehabilitation are much higher than most rehabs completed in the City of St. Louis;
- The building is located in the Forest Park Southeast neighborhood which has seen an increase in development and rehabilitation;
- State and Federal Historic Tax Credits would be available to assist in the restoration of the historic building.

**BOARD DECISION:**

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to Board upheld the Director's denial of the demolition due the building's status as a "Merit" structure, and that it is considered sound under the definition of Ordinance #64832. Board member Visintainer made the motion, which was seconded by Board Member Robinson. The motion passed with none opposed.

An applicant may request review of the above provisional decision to the Planning Commission. Such requests shall be in writing and delivered by certified or registered mail, within thirty (30) days of receipt of this letter to the Planning Commission in care of the Director of the Planning Office at 1520 Market Street, Suite 2000 St. Louis, MO 63103. A copy of the request must also be sent to the Director of the Cultural Resources office located at the same address and noted above.