

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES
JUNE 24TH, 2019**

Board Members Present

Richard Callow – Chairman
Randy Vines
Tiffany Hamilton
Alderman Joe Vaccaro
Anthony Robinson
Melanie Fathman

Cultural Resources Office Staff Present

Dan Krasnoff, Director
Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator
Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner
Bethany Moore, Preservation Planner
Adona Buford, Adm. Assistant

Legal Counsel

Barbara Birkicht

PRELIMINARY REVIEWS

2019.0891

4115-17 McREE AVENUE

NORTH I-44 HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Maggie and Kelly Hayden

Applicant: UIC – Lalima Chemjong-McMillan

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

Preliminary review to rehabilitate a one story house and add construct 2-story addition.

PROCEEDINGS:

On June 24, 2019, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a preliminary review application for 4115-17 McRee Avenue. The project proposes to rehabilitate a single-story brick house and to construct a two-story addition on its western elevation. 4115-17 McRee is located in the North I-44 Local Historic District. The application was submitted by Lalima Chemjong McMillan, representative of the architecture firm, U.I.C.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair); Randy Vines; Melanie Fathman; Michael Killeen; Anthony Robinson; and Alderman Joseph Vaccaro were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance

#60370, which sets forth the standards for rehabilitation and new construction in the North I-44 Local Historic District. She noted that while the house would be rehabilitated in accordance with the Standards, the addition would be of contemporary design. Ms. Cameron displayed photos of both sides of the block and noted that there had been a number of contemporary infill buildings and the block face was varied. She also stated that the architect had been responsive to staff comments regarding revisions to the design of the house's front porch and the fenestration of the addition.

Ms. Cameron recommended that the Preservation Board grant preliminary approval to the proposed project with the condition that the house's front porch have an open railing and its hood be the same size as the porch to better convey the effect of an entry porch; and with the stipulation that final design details and exterior materials are determined in consultation with Cultural Resources Office staff.

Ms. Sarah Gibson of U.I.C., the project architect, testified on behalf of the project and agreed to the proposed conditions and stipulations.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 4115-17 McRee Avenue is located in the North I-44 Local Historic District;
- the rehabilitation of 4115 McRee will conform to all the requirements of the Standards, with the exception of the lack of a front porch or stoop to acknowledge the original entry to the building;
- the design of the proposed addition complies with most of the requirements for new construction in the North I-44 District Standards deviating from them in some architectural details and the proportions of windows on the second story;
- the proposed design is generally consistent with new construction in this location. The block has a mix of different architectural styles that allow the new construction to fit with the streetscape.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval to the project, with the stipulation that the design of the front porch be modified per staff comments and subject to approval

of final plans, details and exterior materials by the Cultural Resources Office staff. The motion was made by Board member Robinson. Ms. Fathman seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

2019.0951

4169-75 LAFAYETTE AVENUE

NORTH I-44 HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: John Oberkranes and Adam Arnold

Applicant: UIC – Katherine Dorsey

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct two-story single family house.

PROCEEDINGS: On June 24, 2019, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a preliminary review application for 4169-71 Lafayette Avenue. The project proposes to construct a 2-1/2 story brick single-family house on a vacant parcel in the North I-44 Local Historic District. The application was submitted by Katherine Dorsey, representative of the architecture firm, U.I.C.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair); Randy Vines; Melanie Fathman; Michael Killeen; Anthony Robinson; Tiffany Hamilton and Alderman Joseph Vaccaro were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #60370, which sets forth the standards for new construction in the North I-44 Local Historic District. She said that house would have four sides of brick and its surrounding context was historic 4-family buildings: therefore the scale of the proposed house was generally consistent with these, although it included a partial third story. Ms. Cameron displayed photos of both sides of the block and noted that, unlike much of the historic district, there was a strong historic context along the north side of Lafayette Avenue, although the block faced Interstate 44 to the south. She said, however, that the large two-story window at the front elevation was a strong deviation from historic window proportions and that a roof deck was proposed atop the house's eastern block. Ms. Cameron recommended that the Preservation Board grant preliminary approval to the proposed project with the conditions that the size and proportion of the large window be reconsidered

and that the roof deck and its railing not be visible from Lafayette Avenue; and with the stipulation that final design details and exterior materials are determined in consultation with Cultural Resources Office staff.

Ms. Sarah Gibson of U.I.C., the project architect, testified on behalf of the project and agreed to work with the Cultural Resources staff regarding the proposed conditions and stipulations.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the construction site, 4169-75 Lafayette Avenue, is located in the North I-44 Local Historic District.
- the proposed design complies with many of the requirements for new construction in the North I-44 District Standards, such as exterior materials, scale and setbacks, but deviates from them in height, roof shape and window sizes.
- the large window proposed for the front façade does not follow any historic precedent in its size, location and proportions.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval to the project, with the stipulation that the applicant work with the Cultural Resources staff to address their concerns and subject to approval of final plans, details and exterior materials by the Cultural Resources Office. The motion was made by Board member Anthony Robinson. Mr. Vines seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

NEW APPLICATION:

2019.0734

1400-10 TOWER GROVE AVENUE

FOREST PARK SE NR DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Missouri Foundation for Health

COMMERCIAL PLAN:

New building permit application to demolish a corner commercial building and construct new building of similar design.

PROCEEDINGS:

On June 24, 2019 the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a permit for the demolition of a corner commercial building at 1400 Tower Grove Avenue in the

Forest Park Southeast neighborhood. The proposal was to replace a commercial building with a new commercial building for the Missouri Foundation for Health.

Board members Richard Callow (Chairman), Melanie Fathman, Tiffany Hamilton, Mike Killeen, Anthony Robinson, Randy Vines were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Daniel Krasnoff, Director of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #64689, as revised by City Ordinance #64925 and City Ordinance #64832 which delineates criteria for the review of demolition proposals for properties in National Register Historic Districts. He submitted a letter of support for the proposal from 17th Ward Alderman Joe Roddy and a letter from Ryan Day opposing the demolition. He said the staff recommendation is to support the proposal with the stipulation that the applicant must obtain a building permit prior to approval of a demolition permit. Mr. Krasnoff said the building proposed for demolition is a Merit structure. However, the condition of the building would make rehabilitation highly problematic. In addition, the proposed subsequent construction and the existing circumstances, in which there is Commonly Controlled property, were the basis for the Director's recommendation in support of the demolition. Mr. Krasnoff also noted the support of the neighborhood for the demolition.

Jill Nowak identified herself as the representative of the Missouri Foundation for Health and thanked the Board for their consideration. Steven Crang, Vice President of Structures for HOK spoke next. Mr. Crang said the building has severe structural deficiencies that make merely entering the structure dangerous. He said that water penetration had caused portions of the floors to collapse into the basement. In addition, the front wall of the building has separated from the support wall that extends in an east-west direction through the building. Finally, he said that the stone foundation had lost its integrity and could not adequately support the building in order for it to be rehabilitated.

Chairman Callow asked if the first time the engineer evaluated the building was November, 2018. Mr. Crang said that was correct.

Board Member Vines asked if work began on the building before the rear wall collapsed. Mr. Crang said virtually no work had begun on the building.

Imran Hanafi spoke against the demolition. He made a presentation that highlighted the architectural detail of 1400 Tower Grove and showed the rehabilitation of a deteriorated structure in the Sherman Academy neighborhood.

Ryan Day spoke against the demolition. He said the replacement building's design is inadequate.

Abdul Abdulla, Executive Director of Park Central Development, said the Forest Park Southeast Development Committee reviewed the proposal and is in support of the proposal. Committee members who supported the proposal include Guy Slay, Patrick Brown and T.J. Ernst. In addition, Mr. Abdulla described the review process of the committee.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 1400 Tower Grove Avenue is a contributing structure within a Preservation Review District and National Register Historic District;
- the building is a Merit structure;
- the front portion of the building is sound per the Ordinance;
- the building has experienced significant structural deterioration.

BOARD DECISION:

That the Preservation Board approve the demolition of 1400 Tower Grove Avenue, due to the building's structural condition and application of criteria F and G; with the stipulation that a demolition permit not be granted before the issuance of a building permit on the site.

Alderman Joe Vacarro made the motion, which was seconded by Board Member Anthony Robinson. The

motion was denied by a vote of two in favor and three opposed. Board members, Alderman Joe Vacarro and Anthony Robinson voted in favor and Board Members Melanie Fathman, Tiffany Hamilton, and Randy Vines voted against. This motion failed.

A subsequent motion was made to defer the matter to the next Board meeting.

The motion was made by Board Member Randy Vines and seconded by Ms. Melanie Fathman. A roll was called. The motion to defer the item was approved unanimously.

APPEALS OF DENIALS

2019.0339

3327 ILLINOIS AVENUE

BENTON PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Shaw Holding Group LLC – Orlando Askins

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of a denial of a building permit application to construct a two-story single family house.

PROCEEDINGS: On June 24, 2019, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an Appeal of the Director’s Denial to construct a two-story, single-family building, at 3327 Illinois Avenue, in the Benton Park Local Historic District. Board members Richard Callow (Chair), Tiffany Hamilton, Randy Vines, Melanie Fathman, Alderman Joe Vaccaro and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Andrea Gagen of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #62382, which sets forth the standards for the Benton Park Local Historic District. She entered into the record ordinances #64689 as amended by #64925, and ordinance #67175. She also entered into the record the PowerPoint and the agenda. She stated that the project generally complies with the Benton Park Standards with a few variations. She also explained that the north side of the building would have more exposure as the buildings would be approximately eleven (11) feet apart.

A letter from 9th Ward Alderman Dan Guenther in support of the staff’s recommendation was also entered into the record.

No one was present for the applicant.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed building generally complies with the Benton Park Local Historic District standards;
- the more exposed north elevation should have a longer brick return than the proposed four (4) feet.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the Director's denial of the proposed new construction with the stipulation that the brick return on the north elevation be extended to twelve (12) feet, and the condition that final details, drawings, exterior materials and colors for the house be reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office. The motion was made by Board Member Randy Vines. Ms. Fathman seconded the motion. A roll was called. The motion passed unanimously.

2019.0555

1729-31 S. 7TH STREET

SOULARD HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Timothy Badock

Applicant: Jim Hayden

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

Appeal of a denial of a building permit application to retain a wall sign painted on brick without a permit.

PROCEEDINGS:

On June 24, 2019, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an Appeal of the Director's Denial to retain signage painted without a permit, at 1729-31 S. 7th Street, in the Soulard Neighborhood Local Historic District. Board members Richard Callow (Chair), Tiffany Hamilton, Randy Vines, Melanie Fathman, Alderman Joe Vaccaro and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Andrea Gagen of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #62382, which sets forth the standards for the Soulard Neighborhood Local Historic District. She entered into the record ordinances #64689 as amended by #64925, and ordinances #57078 as amended by #62382. She also entered into the record the PowerPoint and the agenda. She stated that the signage was painted without a permit. She also stated that the signage greatly

exceeds the square footage of signage allowed under the standards, especially when combined with their existing approved signage. Ms. Gagen indicated that there was a previous illegally painted sign on that side of the building, but that the new sign covered a larger area than that sign, and that painting of unpainted masonry is not allowed under the Souldard Historic District standards.

Ms. Gagen entered into the record a letter from Marie Ceselski, 7th Ward Democratic Committeewoman in support of the Director's Denial. She also entered into the record an email from Jessica Schultz in support of the signage.

Dan Emerson, attorney for the appellant, spoke in support of the signage.

Scott Plackemeier, President of the Souldard Restoration Group, spoke in favor of upholding the Director's Denial.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the signage was painted without a permit in violation of the Souldard Neighborhood Historic District standards;
- the signage exceeds the 40 sq. ft. of signage allowed under the standards;
- the signage covers a larger arear than the previously painted illegal signage;
- Unpainted masonry cannot be painted

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the Director's denial to retain the signage. The motion was made by Board Member Melanie Fathman. Mr. Robinson seconded the motion. A roll was called. The motion passed 4-1 with Alderman Vaccaro opposed.

2019.0680

#4 HORTUS COURT

SHAW HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Anne L. Thatcher

Applicant: Stegall Construction Services - Mickey Stegall

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

JUNE 24TH 2019

Page 10 of 12

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of a denial of a building permit application to erect a five foot wood fence with rear gate.

PROCEEDINGS: On June 24, 2019, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an Appeal of the Director's Denial to retain a 5 foot horizontal wooden fence constructed without a permit, at 5 Hortus Court, in the Shaw Neighborhood Local Historic District. Board members Richard Callow (Chair); Tiffany Hamilton, Randy Vines, Melanie Fathman, Alderman Joe Vaccaro and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bethany Moore of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #59400, which sets forth the standards for fences in the Shaw Neighborhood Local Historic District. She stated that the project generally complies with the criteria for fences but that horizontal fence configurations had not previously been approved in the district and that the northeast boundary of the fence extended proud of the building line which is not allowed by the standards.

Anne Thatcher, owner, was present and gave a PowerPoint presentation outlining her reasons for choosing a horizontal fence and its location. Ms. Thatcher explained she wanted to use the horizontal configuration in order to help facilitate her garden she intends to grow in, around and on the fence. She also explained that she was confused with what "building line" meant so she lined her fence up with what she thought was the building line of her house. In addition she noted that she needed that extra space for her large dogs.

FINDINGS OF FACTS: The Preservation Board found that:

- the site of the fence is within the boundaries of the Shaw Neighborhood Certified Local Historic District;
- the material, height and configuration of the fence does not violate the standards;
- the section of the fence that sits proud of the building line does not conform to the standards.

BOARD DECISION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the Director's denial of the fence with the requirement that final

details be reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office. The motion was made by Board Member Randy Vines. Mr. Robinson seconded the motion. A roll was called. The motion passed unanimously.

2019.0696

711 SOULARD STREET

SOULARD HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Anne L. Thatcher

Applicant: Stegall Construction Services - Mickey Stegall

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of a denial of a building permit to widen a garage door and install proposed curb cut.

PROCEEDINGS: On June 24, 2019, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an Appeal of the Director's Denial to widen a garage door and construct a new curb cut where none currently exists, at 711 Soulard, in the Soulard Local Historic District. Board members Richard Callow (Chair), Tiffany Hamilton, Randy Vines, Melanie Fathman, Alderman Joe Vaccaro and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bethany Moore of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #57078, which sets forth the standards for the Soulard Neighborhood Local Historic District and St. Louis City Revised Code, Chapter 24.20.040. Ms. Moore submitted the PowerPoint, the agenda, Ord. 57078, the St. Louis City Revised Code and a letter of support for the project written by Alderman Jack Coatar into the record. She stated that the project generally complies with the Soulard Standards and that the widening of the garage door would not negatively affect the neighborhood as the building was a non-contributing resource. She also explained that there were existing curb cuts on either side of the building and that the neighborhood had expressed that they did not want to see a new curb cut in the area where two already existed on either side.

Stephen Segura, co-owner of Soulard Garage Door and Fence, was present and available to answer questions from the Board. Mr. Segura informed the Board of the process they had been through to rezone the building for their new use and that they had difficulty accessing the building due to the lack of a curb cut in

front of the vehicle door. Mr. Segura explained that due to the lack of a curb cut vehicles would park in front of the building and block their work vehicles in causing them to be unable to access their work equipment.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the site of the widening of the garage door and proposed new curb cut is within the boundaries of the Soulard Certified Local Historic District;
- the building at 711 Soulard Street is a non-contributing resource to the district and the widening of the garage door does not violate the standards;
- the location of the proposed curb cut is flanked by curb cuts on either side.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the Director's denial of the widening of the garage door and creation of a new curb cut with the stipulation that the old abandoned curb cut be filled in. The motion was made by Board Member Tiffany Hamilton. Ald. Vaccaro seconded the motion. A roll was called. The motion passed unanimously.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Director Dan Krasnoff gave a short summary of current and ongoing projects and/or activities within the City's Historic Districts.