

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES
JUNE 27, 2016**

Board Members Present

Richard Callow – Chairman
Ald. Terry Kennedy
Dave Visintainer
Melanie Fathman
Erin Wright
Mike Killeen
Anthony Robinson
Dave Richardson

Legal Counsel

Barbara Birkicht

Cultural Resources Office Staff Present

Dan Krasnoff, Director
Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator
Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner
Bob Bettis, Preservation Planner
Adona Buford, Administrative Assistant

PRELIMINARY REVIEWS

A. 2016.0978 6001-07 PERSHING AVE SKINKER-DEBALIVIERE HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: UIC – Botanical Heights Homes

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct three single family houses.

PROCEEDINGS: On June 27, 2016, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a new application for the construction of three single family houses on two vacant parcels at 6001-6007 Pershing Avenue, located in the Skinker-DeBaliviere Certified Local Historic District.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), Erin Wright, David Visintainer, Mike Killeen, Alderman Terry Kennedy, Melanie

Fathman, and David Richardson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #57688, which sets forth the standards for residential new construction in the Skinker-DeBaliviere Certified Local Historic District. He testified that the project was in compliance with the Standards and submitted into the record a letter of support from the neighborhood preservation committee.

Brent Crittenden, project architect, was present but did not testify.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed sites for construction, 6001-07 Pershing, are located in the Skinker-DeBaliviere Local Historic District on the north side of Pershing Place;
- the applicant intends to construct three two-story brick and frame dwellings with recessed wood framed porches; the design meets all requirements of the Skinker-DeBaliviere Standards for new construction; and that
- the garages will be set behind the houses and are compliant with the standards.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval for the proposed new construction with the condition that the design be developed as proposed and that final design details and materials will be reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office to ensure compliance with the Skinker-DeBaliviere Historic District standards. Board Member Anthony Robinson made the motion, Ms. Wright seconded the motion. The motion passed with none opposing.

B. 2016.0979 4176 BLAINE AVENUE NORTH I-44 HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Botanical Heights Homes – Brent Crittenden

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct a single family detached house.

PROCEEDINGS: On June 27, 2016, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a new application for the construction of a single family house on

a vacant parcel at 4176 Blaine Avenue, located in the North I-44 Certified Local Historic District.

Board members Richard Callow, Erin Wright, David Visintainer, Mike Killeen, Alderman Terry Kennedy, Melanie Fathman and David Richardson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #60370, which sets forth the standards for residential new construction in the North I-44 Certified Local Historic District. He testified that the project was in compliance with the Standards.

Brent Crittenden, project architect, was present but did not testify.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the construction site, 4176 Blaine, is located in the North I-44 Local Historic District;
- the proposed design complies with most of the requirements for new construction in the North I-44 District Standards. On the whole, given its contemporary design, the project can be considered generally in compliance with the intent of the Standards; and that
- the proposed design is appropriate for the location. The block has a mix of different architectural styles that allow the new construction to fit well with the streetscape.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval for the proposed new construction with the condition that the designs be developed as proposed and that final design details and materials be reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office to ensure compliance with the North I-44 Historic District standards. The motion was made by Board Member Erin Wright and seconded by Alderman Terry Kennedy. The motion passed unanimously.

APPEALS OF DENIALS

C. 2016.0288 4531 McPHERSON CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Veal Realty LLC – Kennedy Veal

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of a denial of a building permit application to retain a previously constructed retaining wall.

PROCEEDINGS: On June 27, 2016, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial of a building permit application to construct two retaining walls, at 4531 McPherson Avenue in the Central West End Local Historic District. The owner submitted the appeal.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), David Visintainer, David Richardson, Anthony Robinson, Alderman Terry Kennedy, Erin Wright, Mike Killeen and Melanie Fathman were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Andrea Gagen of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #69423, which sets forth the standards for historic buildings in the Central West End Local Historic District.

Ms. Gagen entered into the record certified copies of Ordinances #64689, as amended by #64925, and #69423; the Board agenda and the PowerPoint presentation for 4531 McPherson Avenue; and the building permit application. Ms. Gagen also introduced a letter from the Central West End Association's Planning and Development Committee in opposition to the project.

John Veal, representing the owner, gave a PowerPoint presentation stating there were numerous retaining walls on the street.

William Seibert, representing the Central West End Association, appeared in opposition to the project.

FINDINGS OF FACTS: The Preservation Board found that:

- 4531 McPherson Avenue is located in the Central West End Local Historic District;
- the retaining walls were constructed without a permit;

- the original slope of the front terrace had not been previously altered;
- the standards require earth terraces be preserved and shall not be altered or interrupted by the introduction of retaining walls; and that
- the retaining wall is highly visible and disrupts a long stretch of original earth terraces with slopes adjacent to the sidewalk.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the Director's Denial of the building permit, as the constructed retaining walls did not comply with the Central West End Historic District standards. The motion was made by Board Member Dave Visintainer and seconded by Board Member Melanie Fathman. The motion passed unanimously.

D. 2016.0542 2206 CHARLESS STREET MCKINLEY HEIGHTS HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Kim A. Poor

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

Appeal of a denial of a building permit application to install a security door on the front façade.

PROCEEDINGS:

On June 27, 2016, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial of a building permit application to install a non-compliant security door at 2206 Charless Street in the McKinley Heights Local Historic District. The owner submitted the appeal.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), David Visintainer, David Richardson, Anthony Robinson, Alderman Terry Kennedy, Mike Killeen, Erin Wright and Melanie Fathman were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #67901, which sets forth the standards for security bars and doors in the McKinley Heights Local Historic District.

Mr. Bettis entered into the record certified copies of Ordinances #64689, as amended by #64925, and #67901; the Board agenda and the PowerPoint presentation for 2206 Charless Street. He

also entered into the record a letter of support for the staff's denial from the McKinley Heights Neighborhood Association. He testified that the proposed security door was not based on a Model Example as required by the Standards.

Kim Poor, owner and appellant, testified on her own behalf and explained her reasons for wanting the security door. Ms. Poor stated that she wants the door for added security during construction as she works to rehabilitate this structure. She testified that she would change the door following the construction period. She also submitted several photos of other security doors in the neighborhood into the record.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 2206 Charless Street is located in the McKinley Heights Local Historic District.
- the house is currently vacant
- the owner has not provided a Model Example and security doors are not allowed on Public Facades.
- the property has suffered several break-ins while the property is waiting to be rehabilitated.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the Director's Denial of the building permit to install the security door, with the condition that the door may only be installed during rehabilitation of the building and until the property is occupied, when it must be removed and replaced with a compliant door. The motion was made by Board Member David Richardson and seconded by Mr. Killeen. The motion passed unanimously.

E. 2016.0954 4718 McPHERSON CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Daniel Hodder and Meredith Ramm

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of a denial of a building permit application to install French doors and a retaining wall.

PROCEEDINGS: On June 27, 2016, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial of a building permit application to install non-compliant French doors and retain a

non-compliant retaining wall, at 4718 McPherson Ave. in the Central West End Local Historic District. The owner submitted the appeal.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), David Visintainer, David Richardson, Anthony Robinson, Alderman Terry Kennedy, Mike Killeen, Erin Wright and Melanie Fathman were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #69423, which sets forth the standards for retaining walls and windows in the Central West End Local Historic District.

Mr. Bettis entered into the record certified copies of Ordinances #64689, as amended by #64925, and #69423; the Board agenda and the PowerPoint presentation for 4718 McPherson Ave. He also entered into the record a letter of support for the staff's denial from the Central West End Planning and Development Committee. He stated that the installed retaining wall was not compliant because it altered the original slope of the yard and it was constructed with non-compliant material. Also, that the proposed French Doors could not be approved because it involved removing an original street facing window.

Dan Hodder, owner and appellant, testified in support of the project and explained his reasons for wanting to keep the retaining wall and install the new French doors.

Bill Seibert, representing the Central West End Development Committee, spoke in support of the staff recommendation.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 4718 McPherson Avenue is located in the Central West End Local Historic District;
- the owner proposes to remove a street facing a triple-hung window and replace it with a set of non-compliant French doors;
- the Jefferson window is considered to be a Special Window under the definition of the ordinance and therefore cannot be altered under the Standards;
- the owner has installed a retaining wall without a permit.

- alteration of the original slope of the front terrace is prohibited by the Standards; and that
- the wall is highly visible and constructed of decorative concrete block, which is not an acceptable material under the Standards.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the Director's denial of both the owner's application to alter the Jefferson window and the application to retain the retaining wall, as neither complies with the Central West End Local Historic District standards. The motion was made by Board Member Melanie Fathman and seconded by Mr. Robinson. The motion passed unanimously.

F. 2016.0546 6303 & 6317-19 CLAYTON PRESERVATION REVIEW DISTRICT

Owners: Charlie's Real Estate Inv. Properties LLC and Peter A. Katsinas

Applicant: Bellon Salvage & Rehabbing Company

DEMOLITION PLAN:

Appeal of a denial of a demolition permit application to demolish two one-story commercial buildings.

PROCEEDINGS:

On June 27, 2016, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial of a demolition permit application to demolish 6303 and 6317-19 Clayton Ave. which is located in a Preservation Review district. Dan Emerson, the attorney for the owner, submitted the appeal.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), David Visintainer, David Richardson, Anthony Robinson, Alderman Terry Kennedy, Mike Killeen, Erin Wright and Melanie Fathman were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #64689 & 64832, which sets forth the standards for demolition in a Preservation Review District, and addressed the criteria to be considered for demolition of a property in a Preservation Review District.

Mr. Bettis entered into the record certified copies of Ordinances #64689, as amended by #64925, and #64832; the Board agenda and the PowerPoint presentation for 6303 & 6317-19 Ave. He also

entered into the record a letter of support for the staff's denial from the Clayton-Tamm Community Association Board. The Clayton-Tamm Board stated that the introduction of new empty lots would not be beneficial to the neighborhood.

Attorney Dan Emerson testified on behalf of the owner and explained the rationale for wanting to demolish both properties. Mr. Emerson stated that both properties have been unoccupied for the last 10 years; that there is no interest in the properties, and that the buildings have been illegally entered and demolition would promote safety of the neighborhood. He stated that following the proposed demolitions, the lots will be used as places for parking. The owner's lots across the street are covered in concrete slabs, which was shown as a model for what the property would look like following the demolition. No estimates of cost of rehabilitation were offered. No exhibit reflecting any planned development was offered. No listing of the property for sale was offered.

Don Bellon, demolition contractor, testified on the condition of the building and voiced his support for the demolition. Neighborhood residents Brian Barts, Steven Kolb, and local business owners Susan Venincasa, Rick Hagen, and Anthony Piazza testified in support of the owner's application.

Alderman Scott Ogilvie spoke in opposition to the demolition along with neighborhood residents Terry Daugherty, Valerie Haven, Neal Griffin, Mike Reichert, and Kristina Schmierer. The Alderman testified that there is demand for redevelopment throughout this corridor. He stated that 6303 Clayton is of special concern as it abuts 6301 Clayton, was built circa 1902-1903, has a high sidewalk, and that demolition would expose the foundation of 6303 to the elements, which would cause a negative impact to the adjoining property. The Alderman also testified that the buildings are sound per the Ordinance, that where the buildings sit is not a good site for parking, and that access of entry into the vacant buildings is a result of the owner's failure to secure the property.

Terry Daugherty, member of the Clayton-Tamm Neighborhood Association, stated that the Neighborhood Association voted unanimously to ask for denial of the demolition permits. Kristina Schneider testified that she sits on the Board of the Clayton-Tamm Neighborhood Association, and that the photo showing other property owned by the Appellant which consist of a lot with

concrete slabs has remained unchanged for over 10 years, and she was not in favor of concrete slabs taking the place of the buildings that are the subject of these proceedings.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 6303 and 6317-19 Clayton Ave. are qualifying structures in a Preservation Review District;
- The buildings located at 6303 and 6317-19 Clayton Ave. are sound as defined in Ordinance #64689;
- When buildings are in sound condition, the Ordinances direct the Board to consider criteria A.) the existence of a redevelopment plan adopted by ordinance; D.) neighborhood effect and reuse potential; F.) proposed subsequent construction, and G.) commonly controlled property, in order when evaluating the proposed demolition.
- Ordinance #64689 states that the demolition of Merit or Qualifying Structures shall not be approved except in unusual circumstances; no unusual such circumstances appear to be present;
- In terms of neighborhood effect, the loss of two buildings on the same block without plans to replace them with new construction will significantly affect the overall integrity of the street;
- In terms of subsequent reconstruction, the owner has not submitted any plans for redeveloping the site.
- There has been no redevelopment plan proposed nor adopted by ordinance.
- As there is no proposed subsequent construction, the loss of the building through demolition would not be mitigated through any new construction.
- No documentary evidence was presented to show that the rehabilitation of the property is financially unfeasible.
- No evidence was submitted that the neighborhood potential offers any deterrent to rehabilitation.
- As regards urban design, the evidence supports preservation of the buildings.

- The buildings are not accessory structures, nor commonly controlled property to be considered per Ordinance #64689.
- 6303 and 6317-19 Clayton Avenue are in a neighborhood with an active community with frequent rehabilitation and new construction projects, and the buildings have a fair to good chance of reuse.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the Director's denial of the demolition of 6303 & 6317-19 Clayton Avenue as neither met the criteria laid out in the Preservation Review Ordinance. The motion was made by Board Member Anthony Robinson and seconded by Alderman Terry Kennedy. The motion passed unanimously.

G. 2016.0795 1913 SIDNEY STREET BENTON PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Leslie Nillissen

Applicant: Killeen Studio Architects – Ethan Evans

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

Appeal of a denial of a building permit application to construct an attached garage.

PROCEEDINGS:

On June 27, 2016, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Staff's Denial of a building permit application to construct an attached garage, at 1913 Sidney Street in the Benton Park Local Historic District. The applicant submitted the appeal.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), Alderman Terry Kennedy, David Visintainer, David Richardson, Anthony Robinson, Mike Killeen, Erin Wright and Melanie Fathman were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Andrea Gagen of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #67175, which sets forth the standards for new construction in the Benton Park Local Historic District.

Ms. Gagen entered into the record certified copies of Ordinances #64689, as amended by #64925, and #67175; the Board agenda and the PowerPoint presentation for 1913 Sidney Street; and the building permit application.

- FINDINGS OF FACTS: The Preservation Board found that:
- 1913 Sidney Street is located in the Benton Park Local Historic District;
 - the applicant proposes to construct an attached garage building with a second-story roof deck;
 - the applicant has presented an appropriate Model Example for the proposed new construction;
 - the proposed building substantially meets the requirements for new construction in the Benton Park Historic District.

BOARD ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the Staff's Denial of the building permit for new construction. The motion was made by Board member David Richardson and seconded by Alderman Kennedy. Mike Killeen recused himself from the vote. The motion passed with none opposed.

H. 2016.0921 4130-32 DeTONTY STREET SHAW HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Botanical Heights Homes – Brent Crittenden

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of a denial of a building permit application to construct two attached town houses.

PROCEEDINGS: On June 27, 2016, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Cultural Resources Office Administrative Denial of building permit applications for the construction of two semi-detached townhouses on a vacant parcel at 4130-32 DeTonty Avenue, in the Shaw Neighborhood Local Historic District.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), Erin Wright, David Visintainer, Alderman Terry Kennedy, Melanie Fathman, Anthony Duncan, Michael Killeen and David Richardson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #59400, which sets forth the standards for residential new construction in the Shaw Neighborhood Historic District. She entered into the record certified copies of Ordinances #64689, as amended by #64925, and #59400, the Shaw Historic District Ordinance; the Board

agenda and the PowerPoint presentation for 4130-32 DeTonty; and the building permit applications.

Ms. Cameron testified that the project was generally in compliance with the Standards, with the exception of the side facades, which are proposed to be sided. While siding is acceptable on those walls not directly exposed to street view, the district Standards require that any exposed façade be composed of material compatible with the predominant original building materials in the district, which would be brick. She testified further that the staff was concerned that the walls would remain exposed until adjacent buildings were completed and there is no firm timetable for their construction.

Brent Crittenden, project developer and architect, testified that he expected the entire project to be completed by 2017 and that therefore the side walls would only be exposed for a short period of time. He indicated that he was willing to discuss alternatives for the east wall of the 4104 DeTonty, the easternmost building, which will be permanently exposed to view because of a wide side yard.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the construction site, 4130-32 DeTonty Avenue, is located in the Shaw Neighborhood Local Historic District.
- the proposed design complies with most of the requirements for new construction in the Shaw Historic District, with the exception of the siding on the side facades.
- the developer has testified that the entire project will be completed within 18 months, and has also agreed to reconsider the design of the east wall of the easternmost building, which will be permanently open to street view.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the Cultural Resources Office administrative denial of the proposed new construction and to approve the building permit applications for the townhouse buildings with the condition that all exterior materials and colors be approved by the Cultural Resources Office. The motion was made by Board Member Erin Wright and seconded by Mr. Richardson. The motion passed unanimously.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

JUNE 27, 2016

Page **14** of **14**

Commissioner Mike Killeen moved to adjourn the meeting. Mr. Robinson seconded, the meeting was adjourned.